

OF IGNORANCE.

THE TWENTY-SEVENTH ARTICLE.

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

OR that ignorance is the mother and cause of true devotion and obedience.

M. HARDING.

Master Jewel had great need of articles for some shew to be made against the catholic church, when he advised himself to put this in for an article. Verily, this is none of the highest mysteries, nor none of the greatest keys of our religion, as he saith it is, but untruly, and knoweth that for an untruth. For himself imputeth it to D. Cole, in his replies to him, as a strange saying by him uttered in the disputation at Westminster, to the wondering of the most part of the honourable and worshipful of this realm³. If it were one of the highest mysteries and greatest keys of the catholic religion, I trust the most part of the honourable and worshipful of the realm would not wonder at it. Concerning the matter itself I leave it to D. Cole. He is of age to answer for himself. Whether he said it or no, I know not. As he is learned, wise, and godly, so I doubt not but, if he said it, therein he had a good meaning, and can shew good reason for the same, if he may be admitted to declare his saying, as wise men would the laws to be declared, so as the mind be taken, and the word spoken not always rigorously exacted⁵.

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Here M. Harding allegeth no doctor but Doctor Cole. And touching the matter itself, he thinketh this error well excused, for that it is not the principal key of his religion. Howbeit, he that in most honourable assembly doubted not openly to pronounce these words, "I tell you, ignorance is the mother of devotion," was thought then to esteem the same as no small key of his religion. Verily, it appeareth by the whole practice and policy of that side, they are fully persuaded that without deep ignorance of the people it is not possible for their church to stand.

Therefore they chase the simple from the scriptures, and drown them in ignorance, and suffer them utterly to know nothing, neither the profession they made in baptism, nor the meaning of the holy mysteries, nor the price of Christ's blood, nor wherein or by whom they may be saved, nor what they desire of God, either when they pray together in the church or when they privately pray alone.

"They shut up the kingdom of heaven before men; and neither will they enter themselves, nor suffer others that would enter." And, as it is written by the prophet Esay: *Dicunt videntibus, Nolite videre*: "They say unto them that see, Stop your eyes, and see no more." "As the people is, such is the priest; and as the priest is, such is the people." "The blind is set to guide the blind."

Thus they welter in darkness and in the shadow of death. And yet, as it is written in the book of Wisdom: *Non satis est illis errasse circa scientiam Dei; sed in magno viventes inscitie bello, tot et tanta mala pacem appellant*: "They

[³ See before, pages 57, 78.]

[⁴ H. A. 1564 omits this reference. It appears in H. A. 1565.]

[⁵ H. A. 1564 and H. A. 1565 add August. de

Trin. Lib. 1. cap. iv.

Hæc mea fides est, quoniam hæc est catholica fides. This is my faith, forasmuch as this is the catholic faith.]

thought it not sufficient to be deceived and blinded in the knowledge of God; but, living in such a war of ignorance, all these evils they call peace," and make the people believe it is obedience, catholic faith, and devotion; or rather, as Irenæus writeth against the Valentinian heretics: "*Veritatis ignorantiam cognitionem vocant*¹: "Ignorance of the truth and blindness they call knowledge."

By these policies they over-rule the church of God, and keep the people in obedience; even as the Philistines, after they had once shorn off Samson's hair and bored out his eyes, notwithstanding the strength and sturdiness of his body, were able to lead him whither they listed at their pleasure. "For he that walketh in the dark knoweth not whither to go."

In the council of Toledo in Spain it is written thus: *Mater omnium errorum ignorantia*²: "Ignorance is the mother (not of devotion, but) of all errors." Like as St Augustine also saith: *Erat...in illis regnum ignorantia, ...id est, regnum erroris*³: "There was in them the kingdom of ignorance; that is to say, the kingdom (not of devotion, but) of error."

St Hierome saith: *Scripturarum ignorantia Christi ignorantia est*⁴: "The ignorance of the scriptures is the ignorance of Christ."

And St Gregory saith: *Qui ea, quae sunt Domini, nesciunt, a Domino nesciuntur*⁵: "Whoso know not the things that pertain unto the Lord, be not known of the Lord."

But above all others these words of the ancient learned father Origen are specially worthy to be noted: *Dæmonibus est super omnia genera tormentorum, et super omnes pœnas, si quem videant verbo Dei operam dare, scientiam divinæ legis et mysteria scripturarum intentis studiis perquirentem. In hoc eorum omnis flamma est: in hoc uruntur incendio. Possident enim omnes, qui versantur in ignorantia*⁶: "Unto the devils it is a torment above all kinds of torments, and a pain above all pains, if they see any man reading the word of God, and with fervent study searching the knowledge of God's law and the mysteries and secrets of the scriptures. Herein standeth all the flame of the devils: in this fire they are tormented." For they are seized and possessed of all them that remain in ignorance.

To be short, Moses wished that all the whole people might have understanding, and be able to prophesy. St Paul wished that the whole people might daily more and more increase in the knowledge of God, and saith: "Whoso continueth in ignorance, and knoweth not, shall not be known."

God, the God of light and truth, remove all ignorance and darkness from our hearts; that we may fly⁷ the spirit of error, and know the voice of the great Shepherd; that we grow into a full perfect⁸ man in Christ Jesu, and be not blown away with every blast of vain doctrine; that we may be able to know the only, the true, and the living God, and his only-begotten Son Jesus Christ: to whom, with the Father and the Holy Ghost, be all honour and glory, for ever and ever. Amen.

(* * *)

[¹ Iren. Op. Par. 1710. Contr. Hær. Lib. II. cap. xiv. 7, p. 135; where *agnitionem*.]

[² *Ignorantia mater cunctorum errorum*.—Concil. Tolet. IV. cap. 24. in Crabb. Concil. Col. Agrip. 1551. Tom. II. p. 201.]

[³ August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. In Psalm. xxxiii. Enarr. i. 8. Tom. IV. col. 213.]

[⁴ ...*ignoratio scripturarum ignoratio Christi est*.—Hieron. in Corp. Jur. Canon. Lugd. 1624. Decret.

Gratian. Decr. Prim. Pars, Dist. xxxviii. can. 9. col. 190.]

[⁵ Gregor. Magni Papæ I. Op. Par. 1705. Reg. Pastor. Prim. Pars, cap. i. Tom. II. col. 3.]

[⁶ Orig. Op. Par. 1733-59. In Num. Hom. xxvii. 8. Tom. II. p. 378; where *in isto uruntur*. See before, page 57, note 14.]

[⁷ Flee, 1565.]

[⁸ Perfite, 1565.]

Iren. Lib. II. cap. xix.

Judg. xvi.

John xii.

Concil. Tolet. IV. can. 24.

August. in Psal. xxxiii. Conc. I.

Dist. 38. Si Juxta.

Gregor. in Pastor. Lib. I. cap. I.

Orig. in Num. Hom. 27.

Num. xi.

1 Thess. iv.

1 Cor. iv.

John x.

Eph. iv.

THE CONCLUSION,

EXHORTING M. JEWEL TO STAND TO HIS PROMISE².

Thus your challenge, M. Jewel, is answered. Thus your negatives be avouched. Thus the points you went about to improve, by good authority be proved, and many others by you over rashly affirmed clearly improved. Thus the catholic religion, with all your forces laid at and impugned, is sufficiently defended. The places of proofs which we have here used are such as yourself allow for good and lawful: the scriptures, examples of the primitive church, ancient councils, and the fathers of six hundred years after Christ. You might and ought likewise to have allowed reason, tradition, custom, and authority of the church without limitation of time. The manner of this dealing with you is gentle, sober, and charitable. Put away all mists of blind self-love, you shall perceive the same to be so. The purpose and intent towards you, right good and loving, in regard of the truth, no less than due, for behoof of christian people, no less than necessary; that you hereby might be induced to bethink yourself of that wherein you have done unadvisedly, and stayed from hasty running forth, pricked with vain favour and praise of the world to everlasting damnation, appointed to be the reward at the end of your game; that truth might thus be tried, set forth and defended; and that our brethren be led, as it were by the hand, from perilous errors and danger of their souls, to a right sense and to surety.

Now it remaineth that you perform your promise: which is, that, if any one clear sentence or clause be brought for proof of any one of all your negative articles, you would yield and subscribe. What hath been brought, every one that wilfully will not blindfold himself may plainly see. If some haply, who will seem to have both eyes and ears, and to be right learned, will say hereof, they see ne hear nothing, no marvel. The favour of the part whereto they cleave, having cut off themselves from the body, the despite of the catholic religion and hatred of the church, hath so blinded their hearts, as, places alleged to the disproof of their false doctrine being never so evident, they see not, ne hear not, or rather they seeing see not, ne hearing hear not. Verily, you must either refuse the balance which yourself have offered and required for trial of these articles, which be the scriptures, examples, councils, and doctors of antiquity; or, the better weight of authority swaying to our side, that is, the truth found in the ancient doctrine of the catholic church, and not in the mangled dissensions of the gospellers, advisedly return from whence unadvisedly you have departed; humbly yield to that you have stubbornly kicked against, and embrace wholesomely that which you have hated damnably.

Touching the daily sacrifice of the church, commanded by Christ to be done in 1. remembrance of his death, that it hath been (and may be well and godly) celebrated without a number of communicants with the priest together in one place, which you call private mass, within the compass of your six hundred years after Christ: That the communion was then sometimes (as now also it is and may be) 2. ministered under one kind: Of the public service of the church, or common prayers 3. in a tongue not known to all the people: That the bishop of Rome was sometime 4. called universal bishop, and both called and holden for head of the universal church: That by ancient doctors it hath been taught, Christ's body to be really, substan- 5. tially, corporally, carnally or naturally in the blessed sacrament of the altar: Of 6. the wondrous, but true being of Christ's body in more places at one time; and of 7. the adoration of the sacrament, or rather of the body of Christ in the sacrament,— we have brought good and sufficient proofs, alleging for the more part of these

[² From H. A. 1564; being not given in the editions of Jewel.]

articles the scriptures, and for all, right good evidence out of ancient examples, 8. 9. councils, or fathers. Concerning elevation, reservation, remaining of the accidents 10. 11. without substance, dividing the host in three parts, the terms of figure, sign, 12. 13. token, etc. applied to the sacrament, many masses in one church in one day, the 14. 15. reverent use of images, the scriptures to be had in vulgar tongues for the common people to read, which are matters not specially treated of in the scriptures by express terms; all these have been sufficiently avouched and proved, either by proofs by yourself allowed, or by the doctrine and common sense of the church.

12. As for your twelve last articles, which you put in by addition to the former, for shew of your courage and confidence of the cause, and to seem to the ignorant to have much matter to charge us withal, as it appeareth; they report matter (certain excepted) of less importance. Some of them contain doctrine true, I grant, but over curious, and not most necessary for the simple people. Some others be through the manner of your utterance perverted, and in terms drawn from the sense they have been uttered in by the church: which, by you being denied, might of us also be denied in regard of the terms they be expressed in, were not a sleight of falsehood, which might redound to the prejudice of the truth, therein worthily suspected. Verily to them all we have said so much, as to sober, quiet, and godly wits may seem sufficient.

Now this being so, what you mind to do, I know not; what you ought to do, I know right well. I wish you to do that, which may be to your own and to the people's soul-health, that, being by you and your fellows deceived, depend of you to the setting forth of the truth, to the procuring of a godly concord in Christ's church, and finally to the glory of God. This may you do by forsaking that, which perhaps seemeth to you truth, and is not; that which seemeth to you learning, and is but a flourish or varnish of learning; that which seemeth to you clear light, and is profound darkness; and by returning to the church, where, concerning the faith of a christian man, is all truth, and no deceit, right learning, and the very light, even that which lighteneth every man coming into this world, which is there to be found only, and not elsewhere, forasmuch as the head is not separated from the body.

O that you would once mind this seriously, M. Jewel! As for me, if either speaking, writing, or expending might further you thereto, I should not spare tongue nor pen, nor any portion of my necessary things, were it never so dear. I would gladly pour out all together to help you to attain that felicity. But, O Lord, what lets see I whereby you are kept from that good! Shame, wealth of your estate, your worldly acquaintance, beside many others. But, sir, touching shame, which always irketh those that be of any generosity of nature, if you call your better philosophy to counsel, you shall be taught not to account it shameful to forsake error for love of truth, but rather wilfully to dwell in error after that it is plainly detected. As for the wealth of your estate, which some assure you of, so long as you maintain that part, I cannot judge so evil of you, but that you think how fickle and frail these worldly things be, and how little to be esteemed in respect of the heavenly estate which remaineth to the obedient children of the church, as the contrary to the rebels, apostates, and renegades. Touching your acquaintance, what shall the familiarity of a few deceived persons stay you from that felicity which you shall achieve with the love and friendship of all good men, of whose good opinion only riseth fame and renown, and also with the rejoicing of the angels in heaven?

This your happy change the better and wiser sort of men will impute to grace mightily by God's power in you wrought, which sundereth light from darkness, and maketh light shine out of darkness. Neither shall they judge that inconstancy, where is no change in will, but only in understanding. Where the will remaining one, always bent to the glory of God, the deceived understanding is by better instruction corrected and righted; there is not inconstancy to be noted, but amendment to be praised. Neither shall you in this godly enterprise be alone. Many both of old time and of our days have gone this way, and have broken the ice before you: Eusebius of Cæsarea in Palæstina, Beryllus of Bostra in Arabia, and Theodoritus of Cyrus in Persie; who forsook heinous heresies against Christ,

John I.

Luke xv.

Gen. I.

2 Cor. iv.

and by grace returned to the catholic faith again. So have done in our time Georgius Wicelius, Fridericus Staphylus, Franciscus Balduinus¹, and many more.

Thus having called to my mind the considerations that are like to withhold you from yielding to the catholic faith, from returning to the church, and from performing your promise; I find no bands so strong, to keep you fast in the chair of pestilence, which this long time you have sitten in; that through God's grace working humility and denial of yourself in your heart, whereof I spake in my preface, you should not easily loose and be in liberty, where you might clearly see the light spread abroad over the whole church, and espy the darkness of the particular sects of your new gospel which you lived in before.

But, all this notwithstanding, peradventure your heart serveth you to stand stoutly according to the purport of your challenge, in the defence of the doctrine you have professed, and for which you have obtained a bishoprick, thinking great scorn to be removed from the same by any such means as these to you may seem. And now perhaps you enter into meditation with yourself and conference with your brethren to frame an answer to this treatise, and by contrary writing to fortify your negatives. Well may you so do. But to what purpose, I pray you? Well may you make a smoke and a smother, to darken the light for a time; as men of war are wont to do, to work a feat secretly against their enemies. But that cannot long continue. The smoke will soon vanish away, the light of the truth will eftsoons appear. Well may you shut the light out of a few houses by closing doors and windows; but to keep away the bright sun from that great city which Matt. v. is set on high upon a hill, do what ye can, therein all your travail, your devices, and endeavours shall be vain and frustrate.

As iron by scouring is not only not consumed, but kept from rust and canker and is made brighter, so the church by the armours and hostility of heretics is not wounded, but through occasion strengthened, stirred to defence, and made invincible. When it is oppressed, then it riseth; when it is invaded, then it overcometh. When by the adversaries' objections it is checked and controlled, then it is acquitted and prevaieth. Wherefore talk, preach, and write against the doctrine of the church whiles ye will, ye shall but spurn against the stone, whereat ye may break your shins, and be crushed to pieces, the same not moved. Matt. xxi. Ye shall but kick against the prick. Ye shall but torment your own conscience Acts ix. condemned in your own judgment, as witting that ye resist the church, and, for the Tit. iii. life to come, increase the heap of everlasting damnation. All the reward ye shall win hereby is the vain favour of a few light and unstable persons by you deceived; whom the blasts of your mutable doctrine shall move and blow away from God's floor the church, like chaff, the good and constant people remaining still, like weighty Matt. iii. and sound wheat.

The arguments and reasons you shall make against the doctrine of the church may haply persuade some of the worldly-wise, who be fools in God's judgment, as the reasons of them that have commended infamous matters have persuaded some. Of whom one praised the fever quartan; another drunkenness; another baldness; another unrighteousness; and in our time, one ignorance, and another foolishness. Which by the authors hath been done only for an exercise of wits, and rather to the wondering than corrupting of the readers. Would God of all the writings of your sect against the catholic faith, which be no less beside reason and truth, the intent were no worse, the danger ensuing no greater! And as, for commendation of those unseemly and unworthy things, those rhetoricians have not brought good and true reasons, but only a probability of talk; right so for confirmation of your negative divinity, and of many new strange and false doctrines, you have no sure proofs, but shadows, colours, and shews only, that perhaps may dazzle blear eyes, and deceive the unlearned; but the learned-wise, and by any ways godly-wise, will soon contemn the same. For they be assured, how probably soever you teach or write, that the church, always assisted and prompted by the Holy Ghost the Spirit of truth, in points of faith erreth not, and that against truth, already by the same Spirit in the universal church taught and received, no truth can be alleged.

Phavorinus.
Synesius.
Glaucus apud
Platonem.
Cornelius
Agrippa.
Erasmus.

[¹ H. A. 1565 adds Nocolaus Villagagno after Balduinus.]

As he is very simple, who, being borne in hand by a sophister, and driven by force of sophistical arguments to grant that he hath horns, thinketh so in deed, and therefore putteth his hand to his forehead; so whosoever through your teaching fall from the catholic church into the errors of our time, from the straitness of christian life into the carnal liberty of this new gospel, from devotion into the insensibility which we see the people to live in, from the fear of God to the desperate contempt of all virtue and goodness; hereby they shew themselves to be such as have unstable hearts, which be given over to the lusts of their flesh, which have no delight ne feeling of God, which, like Turks and epicures seeking only for the commodities and pleasures of this world, have no regard of the life to come. But the godly sort, whose hearts be established with grace, who pant and labour to live after the Spirit, continually mortifying their flesh, whose delight is to serve God, who be kept and holden within the fear of God, though they give you their hearing, and that of constraint, not of will, yet will not they give you their liking nor consenting.

Wherefore, M. Jewel, seeing we have performed that which you have over boldly said we were not able to do; seeing for proof of these articles we have brought more than you bare your hearers in hand we had to bring; seeing you perceive yourself herein to have done more than standeth with learning, modesty, or good advice; seeing, in case of any one clause or sentence for our part brought, you have with so many protestations promised to yield and to subscribe unto us; seeing, by performing your promise, you may do so much good to the people and to yourself; seeing, nothing can be justly alleged for keeping of you from satisfying your promise, and returning to the church again; seeing so great respects both of temporal and of heavenly preferments invite you and call you from parts and sects, where you remain with most certain danger of your soul, to the safe port of Christ's church; seeing by so doing you should not do that which were singular, but common to you with many others, men of right good fame and estimation; finally, seeing, if you shall (as always for the most part heretics have done) continue in the profession of your untrue doctrine, and travail in setting forth erroneous treatises for defence of the same, you shall gain thanks of no other but of the lightest and worst sort of the people, and persuade none but such as be of that mark; we trust you will upon mature deliberation in your sadder years change the counsel which you liked in your youth; we trust you will examine better by learning the new doctrine which you with many others were drawn unto by sway of the time, when by course of age you wanted judgment; we trust you will call back yourself from errors and heresies advisedly, which you have maintained rashly, and set forth by word and write¹ busily, and therein assured yourself of the truth confidently. Thus shall your error seem to proceed of ignorance, not of malice. Thus shall you make some recompence for hurt done. Thus shall you in some degree discharge yourself before God and men: thus shall you be received into the lap of the church again, out of which is no salvation, whither being restored you may from henceforth, in certain expectation of the blessed hope, lead a life more acceptable to God, to whom be all praise, honour, and glory. Amen.

Tit. ii.

[¹ Write: used apparently for writing.]

AN ANSWER TO M. HARDING'S CONCLUSION.

As the rest of your book, M. Harding, may in many respects seem very weak, so is there no part thereof more weak than your triumph at the end, before the conquest. Ye say, ye have fully answered the offer, which you call a challenge, and have avouched the negatives, and have fully proved all that lay in question by scriptures, by examples of the primitive church, by old councils, and by ancient fathers. Whereby it appeareth ye have some good liking in that ye have done. It had been more modesty to have left the commendation and judgment thereof unto your reader; who, comparing your proofs with the answers, and laying the one with² the other, might be able to judge indifferently between both. For it may well be thought that while ye ran alone ye were ever the foremost, and that, making your own award, ye would hardly pronounce against yourself.

The proofs that ye have shewed us are common and known, often alleged and often answered, and now brought in as a company of maimed soldiers, to make a shew. But from you, and from such conference and help of fellows, your learned friends looked for some fresher matters.

That ye charge me with ambition, and self-love, and seeking of praise, although it be the weakest of all other your shifts, yet it is an affection incident unto the children of Adam; and some men suspect that M. Harding is not fully empty of the same. But he that made the heart is only meet to search and to judge the heart. As for me, as I am nothing, so I know nothing. "God forbid that I should glory in any thing, saving only in the cross of Jesus Christ." Gal. vi.

But, where it pleaseth you so horribly to pronounce your definitive sentence, that everlasting damnation shall be the end of our game, I might well answer you with St Paul: *Nolite ante tempus judicare*: "Judge not before the time." It seemeth overmuch for you so unadvisedly to take upon you the office and person of Christ without commission. For St John saith: "God hath given all judgment (not unto M. Harding, but) unto Christ his Son;" who, no doubt, will inquire further of your judgment. Your own Gelasius saith: *Neminem gravare debet iniqua sententia*³: "A wrongful sentence may hurt no man." It behoveth us patiently to wait for the judgment-seat of God. "In that day all the secrets of darkness shall be revealed." The wicked and ungodly cried out against the prophet David: *Non est salus ipsi in Deo ejus*: "He hath no health, he hath no comfort in his God." But David turned himself unto God, and said: "O Lord, thou receivest me; thou art my glory; thou liftest up my head." If damnation be the end of all their travails, that seek only the glory of God and the truth of his gospel, where then shall they be that so wilfully have dishonoured the name of God, and have burnt his gospel without cause, and have condemned it as open heresy? Certainly, "renegades, infidels, liars, blasphemers, and idolaters shall have their portion in the lake that flameth with fire and brimstone." The Lord's mouth hath spoken it. This doubtless shall be the end of their game. 1 Cor. iv. 1 Cor. v. John v. Gal. vi. 1 Cor. iv. Psal. iii. Rev. xxi.

Now, say you, it remaineth that I perform my promise. Yea, verily; but, notwithstanding all that ye have hitherto said, much more it remaineth that you begin again and assay better to prove your purpose; that is, that ye leave your surmises and guesses, and allege one or other sufficient clause or sentence for any of these matters that ye say ye have proved. For that ye have hitherto shewed us, as unto any indifferent reader it may soon appear, is over weak, and will not serve.

I grant, ye have alleged authorities, sundry and many, such as I knew long before; with what faith, I doubt not but by conference it may soon appear.

² To, 1565, 1609.]

³ ...neminem potest iniqua gravare sententia.—
Gelas. Papa in Corp. Jur. Canon. Lugd. 1624.

Decret. Gratian. Decr. Sec. Pars, Caus. xi. Quest.
iii. can. 46. col. 938.]

Verily, M. Harding, I never denied but you were able to misreport the ancient learned doctors of the church, and to bring us the names and shadows of many fathers. The heretics of all ages were likewise able to do the same. But what credit may we yield to such allegations? What error was there ever so plain, what abuse so horrible, but ye have been able to maintain the same by some colour of scriptures and fathers? Ye have defended your holy water by the example of Elizeus, and by the words of the prophet Ezechiel; your pardons by the prophet Esay; the open filthiness and abomination of your stewes by the name and authority of St Augustine¹. Such credit ye deserve to have, when ye come to us in the name of holy fathers.

2 Kings iv.
Isai. xl.
August. de
Ordine.

Ye say, ye have shaken down all the holds of our side; and that whosoever² seeth it not, is stark blind and seeth nothing. So easily and with so small ado this whole matter is brought to pass. So Julius Cæsar, sometime to declare the marvellous speed and expedition of his victory, expressed the same briefly in these three words: *Veni: vidi: vici*: "I came to them: I saw them: I conquered them."

Here, in few words to traverse the special points and corners of your whole book, and to shew by what force and engines ye have achieved this enterprise: first, you have proved your private mass by women, boys, children, laymen, fables, dreams, and visions: your half-communion by sick folk, deathbeds, infants, and madmen. Of Christ's institution, of the scriptures, of the certain practice of the apostles, of the general and known use of the primitive church, of the ancient councils, of the old canons, of the holy catholic fathers, saving only your bare guesses, you bring nothing. Of your unfruitful manner of praying in a strange unknown tongue, ye allege neither authority nor example: touching the supremacy of Rome, which is the keep and castle of your whole religion, ye wander far and wide, and many times beside the way; yet have ye not found any ancient father that ever intitled the bishop of Rome either the universal bishop of the whole world, or the head of the universal church. Thus ye proceed with your real presence; and so forth with the rest.

You entreat uncourteously the holy fathers with such your translations, expositions, and constructions, not as may best express their meaning, but as may best serve to further your purpose. Ye rack them, ye alter them, ye put to them, ye take from³ them, ye allege sometime the end without the beginning, sometime the beginning without the end: sometime ye take the bare words against the meaning: sometime ye make a meaning against the words. Ye imagine councils that were never holden, and canons of councils that never were seen. Ye bring forged pamphlets under the names of Athanasius, Anacletus, and other godly fathers, by whom you well know, and cannot choose but know, they were never made. Your greatest grounds be surmises, guesses, conjectures, and likelihoods. Your arguments be fallacies, many times without either mood or figure; the antecedent not agreeing with the consequent, nor one part joined with another. Your untruths be so notorious and so many, that it pitieth me in your behalf to remember them. But the places be evident, and cry corruption, and may by no shift be denied. And, to forget all other your inconstancy touching the former times, even now in this self-same book which ye wish us to receive, and so to receive as the rule and standard of our faith, ye say and unsay, ye avouch and recant; and either of forgetfulness, or for that ye mislike your former sayings, you are often contrary to yourself. Ye have sought up a company of new petit doctors, Abdias, Amphilocheus, Clemens, Hippolytus, Leontius, and such others, authors void of authority, full of vanities and childish fables. And no great marvel: for whoso wanteth wood is often driven to burn turfs. It had been good ye had brought some other doctors to prove the credit of these doctors. Ye make no difference between silver and dross, between corn and chaff, between old and new, between true and false. Ye say: Christ shed his blood in-

Art. 17,
Div. 4. & 7.

[¹ August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. De Ord. Lib. II. |
Disp. I. cap. iv. 12. Tom. I. col. 335.]

[² Whoso, 1565.]

[³ Fro, 1565.]

deed and verily at his last supper; and that at the same instant of time he offered himself in his body likewise in heaven indeed and verily before God his Father⁴. And these ye call necessary points of the christian faith.

These are the contents of your book: this is the substance of your proofs. Thus, I fear me, ye know ye dally, and deal not plainly: thus ye know ye abuse the patience and simplicity of your reader. And did you imagine, M. Harding, that your book should pass only among children, or that it should never be examined and come to trial? or did you think that only with the sound hereof ye should be able to beat down and to vanquish the truth of God?

As for your eloquence and furniture of words, as it serveth well to make the matter more saleable in the sight of the simple, so it addeth but small weight unto the truth. Wise men are led with choice of matter, not with noise of words; and try their gold, not only by the sound, which often deceiveth, but also by the touchstone and by the weight. Although your eloquence may work miracles in the ears of the unlearned, that cannot judge, yet it cannot turn neither water into wine, nor darkness into light, nor error into truth. There is no eloquence, there is no colour against the Lord.

Whereas it liketh you so bitterly, as your manner is, to call us heretics, and to say, we sit in the chair of pestilence, and that the people learneth of us dissolution of manners and liberty of the flesh, and walketh utterly without sense or fear or care of God; it standeth not with your credit thus with manifest untruths and common slanders to inveigle your reader. Balach, when he saw he could not prevail against the people of God by force of arms, he began to rail against them, and to curse them, thinking that by such means he should prevail.

Num. xxii.
& xxiii.

But it is not always heresy that an heretic calleth heresy. Athalia, when she understood that Joas, the right inheritor of the crown of Juda, was proclaimed king, flew in her fury into the temple, and cried out, "Treason, treason." Yet was it not king Joas, but she herself that had wrought the treason. The Arian heretics called the true Christians, that professed the faith of the holy Trinity, sometime Ambrosians, sometime Johannites, and sometime Homousians; allowing only themselves to be called catholics. The Valentinian heretics condemned all others as gross and earthly, and themselves only they called ghostly. The sheep oftentimes seemeth to stray without the fold, whiles the wolf lurketh and preyeth within. Verily, M. Harding, whoso hateth the intolerable outrage of your abuses, and pitieth the miserable seducing and mocking of the people, and mourneth for the reformation of the house of God, and desireth to tread in the steps of the ancient catholic godly fathers, whose doctrine and ordinances ye have forsaken, and with all submission and humility of mind referreth the whole judgment and order hereof unto the undoubted word of God, he may not rightly be called an heretic.

2 Kings xi.

Touching looseness of life, I marvel ye can so soon forget either your church of Rome, where, as St Bernard said in his time, "from the head to the foot there was no part whole⁵;" or the pope's holiness' own palace, where, as the same St Bernard saith, *mali proficiunt, boni deficiunt*⁶, "the wicked grow forward, the godly go backward."

Bernard. in
Convers.
Paul.

De Consid.
Lib. iv.

Verily, we have neither stews, nor concubines, nor courtezans set out and decked as ladies, nor priests nor prelates to wait upon them, as, by your own friends' confession, there are in Rome⁷. There is no virtue, but we advance⁸ it: there is no vice, but we condemn it. To be short, a light wanton amongst us, if she were in Rome, might seem Penelope.

In Concil.
Delect. Card.

Ye say, there are none but a few light unstable persons of our side: and therefore of good-will and friendship ye counsel me to return to you again. But a few, say you? and the same unstable and light persons? Surely, M. Harding, if you could behold the wonderful works that God hath wrought in the kingdoms

[⁴ See before, pages 713, 8, 9.]

[⁵ Bernard. Op. Par. 1690. In Convers. S. Paul. Serm. l. 3. Vol. I. Tom. 111. col. 956. See before, page 382, note 10.]

[⁶ Id. De Consid. Lib. iv. cap. iv. 11. Vol. I.

Tom. 11. col. 439. See before, page 382, note 9.]

[⁷ Suggest. Delect. Card. in Crabb. Concil. Col. Agrip. 1551. Tom. III. p. 823. See before, page 728.]

[⁸ Advance, 1565.]

of England, France, Denmark, Polonia, Suecia, Bohemia, and Scotland, and in the noble states and commonweals of Germany, Helvetia, Prussia, Russia, Lituania, Pomerania, Austria, Rhetia, Vallis Tellina, &c., ye would not greatly find fault with the number, nor think that they, whom it hath pleased God in all these kingdoms and countries to call to the knowledge and feeling of his holy gospel, are so few. And if ye could also consider the extremity and cruelty of your side, and the abundance of innocent blood that so constantly hath been yielded for the testimony of the truth, ye would not so lightly call them either unstable or light persons. Certainly they whom you seem so lightly to esteem are kings, princes, magistrates, councillors, and the gravest and greatest learned fathers of Christendom. If it please God of his mercy to bless and increase that he hath begun, within few years ye shall find but few that will so lightly be deceived and follow you. In all countries they flee from you and forsake you. Ye can no longer hold them, but either by ignorance or by force and tyranny. The people, whom it liketh you to call dogs and swine, are neither so beastly nor so unsensible and void of reason, but that they are able now to espy them by whom they so often have been deceived. They are able now to discern the truth from falsehood¹, and the true Shepherd from a stranger, and lament your pitiful case, that are so suddenly fallen back, and welter so miserably in your error.

Whereas you in so earnest sort, and with such protestation of friendship, counsel me to leave Christ and to follow you; as your counsel, joined with truth, were very wholesome, so, standing with manifest untruth, it is full of danger, and the more vehement the more dangerous. Certainly, heretics and infidels, to increase their factions, have evermore used the like persuasions. But we may hear no counsel against the counsel of God. Aristotle sometime said: "Socrates is my friend, and so is Plato; but the friendship of truth is best of all." We cannot bear witness against God: we cannot say good is ill and ill is good, light is darkness and darkness is light. We cannot "be ashamed of the gospel of Christ: it is the mighty power of God unto salvation."

Rom. i.

And with whom then would ye have us to join? Examine the weight and circumstance of your counsel. Whom should we flee? whom should we follow? Leave affection, leave favour of parts, and judge uprightly. Would ye have us to join with them that have burnt the word of God, and scornfully call it a shipman's hose and a nose of wax? That maintain manifest and known errors? That call God's people dogs and swine? That say: "Ignorance is the mother of true devotion?" That force the people to open idolatry? That forbid lawful marriage, and license concubines and common stewes? That have devised unto themselves a strange religion, without either scriptures, or ancient councils, or old doctors, or example of the primitive church? That have turned their backs to God? That have deceived the people? That have made the house of God a cave of thieves? Whom so many kingdoms and countries and infinite thousands of godly people have forsaken? From whom the Holy Ghost by express words hath commanded us to depart? For so it is written: "Come away from her, O my people, that ye be not partakers of her sins, lest ye be also partakers of her plagues."

Rev. xviii.

Would ye counsel us, M. Harding, to forsake the word of life, and the company of all them that have given their bodies and blood for the testimony of Christ, and to join with these?

Ye say: "We may have the example and company of one Staphylus, and Balduinus, and Wicelius, that have done the like." Ye might also have added the example and company of Judas the traitor, of Julianus the renegade, and of others the like, of whom St Peter saith: "They are turned back to feed upon their vomit as shameless dogs, and to wallow again in their mire as filthy swine." I will say nothing of you, M. Harding. Notwithstanding, ye know whose examples ye have followed. Tertullian saith thus: *Christus ait, Fugite de civitate in civitatem. Sic enim quidem argumentabatur: sed et ipse fugitivus*²: "Christ said,

2 Pet. ii.

Tertull. de
Fug. in
Persec.[¹ Falshead, 1565.][² Immo, inquit, quia præceptum adimplevit, fugiens de civitate in civitatem. Sic enim voluit qui-

dam, sed et ipse fugitivus, argumentari.—Tertull. Op. Lut. 1641. De Fug. in Persec. 6. p. 693.]

Flee from city to city: so there is one that used to reason; but he himself was a fugitive."

I consider well their doings, and stand in horror of their ends: some such of your side have died in miserable desperation, with terrible witness against themselves, that they had wrought against their own conscience; as it is faithfully testified unto the world. One of these three, as it is reported and openly published by them that know him best, hath altered his whole faith seven times within the space of seventeen years, and therefore is well resembled to the old apostata Ecebolius³. St Peter saith: "It had been better for them never to have ^{2 Pet. ii.} known the way of righteousness, than, having once received knowledge, afterward to turn away from the holy commandment." "It is an horrible thing to fall ^{Heb. x.} into the hands of the living God." St Paul saith: "Whoso hath once received ^{Heb. vi.} the light of God, and hath felt the sweetness of the heavenly gift, and hath been partaker of the Holy Ghost, and hath once tasted of the good word of God, and afterward falleth away, it is not possible for such a one to be renewed by repentance." I wish you in God and unfeignedly, M. Harding, to beware hereby. These words and examples are marvellous horrible.

Although these and such others can deny God, yet "God cannot deny him- ^{2 Tim. ii.} self." "What," saith St Paul, "if certain of them be fallen away? Shall their ^{Rom. iii.} infidelity make frustrate the faith of God? God forbid. For God is true; and all men are liars."

Of your person, as I promised, I will say nothing. God's works be wonderful. "He calleth whom he will, and whom he will he maketh hard." He called Paul ^{Rom. ix.} from his horse, Elizæus from the plough, the apostles from their nets, and the thief on the cross, upon the sudden.

But if some simple one or other of them whom you so uncourteously have despised should say thus unto you: M. Harding, not long sithence ye taught us the gospel, even in like sort and form in all respects as it is taught us now. We remember both your words, and also the manner and courage of your utterance. Ye told us of the paper walls and painted fires of purgatory: ye said Rome was the sink of Sodom: ye said your mass was a heap of idolatry, and the mystery of iniquity: ye wished your voice had been equal with the great bell of Oseney, that ye might ring (as ye then said) in the dull ears of the deaf papists. No man was so vehement and so earnest as you. The whole university and city of Oxford, the cross at Paul's, and other like places of great concourse, can well record it. Ye bade us then believe you upon your credit; and we believed you. The prince died: another was placed. Suddenly ye had quite forgotten all that ye had taught us before, and had as suddenly learned other things, all contrary to the former, which ye told us ye never knew before; and yet, with one face and one conscience, ye required us earnestly to believe you still, even as we had done before. As though your bare word were the rule of our faith, and whatsoever you should say, true or false, we simple people were bound of necessity to believe you. Howbeit, we think, if ye tell us truth now, then ye deceived us before; if ye told us truth before, then ye deceive us now. And thus it cannot be denied but this way or that way ye have deceived us. And how may we know whether you speak as you think, or dissemble with us now, as ye did before? Surely St James sheweth us, that "a man of double ^{James i.} mind is ever unconstant in all his ways." We marvelled how ye could attain to all this doctrine, specially in so short a time, but most of all in such perfection. For the scriptures are large, and we hear say the councils are sundry, the doctors' volumes are long and many. So suddenly in seven days to read them all, and so to read them, it was not possible. You may by your eloquence persuade us many things. But this one thing ye can never persuade us. You wanted time: it is not credible: it was not possible. Therefore ye must needs say ye were taught these things even as the prophets were, by revelation.

If any of all your old hearers would thus put you in remembrance, alas! what answer could you make him?

[³ Socrat. in Hist. Eccles. Script. Amst. 1695-1700. Lib. III. cap. xiii. p. 151.]

But it was not you, M. Harding: it was the time. If the time had been one, you had still continued one. But ye were forced to know that ye knew not, and to think that ye thought not, and so to believe that ye believed not. Howbeit, St Hilary saith: *Quæ ex necessitate est, fides non est*¹: "Forced faith is no faith."

Ye say, whosoever shall attempt to answer your book shall sweat in vain: his labour shall be as was the commendation of baldness, or of ignorance, or of folly; as a flourish, as a smoke, as a smother, and as I know not what. The force of your eloquence is so invincible, no truth is able to withstand it. Such affiance ye would seem to have in the beauty of your cause.

Here, I beseech you, give me leave once again to put you in reinembrance of the contents and substance of your travails. Think you in sooth, M. Harding, or would ye have us to think, that your maimed allegations, your untrue translations, your wrested expositions, your councils never holden, your canons never not² made nor seen, your epistles never written, your Amphilocheus, your Abdias, your Clemens, your Leontius, your Hippolytus, and other like fabulous pamphlets and forgeries so lately found out, so long lacked and never missed, your additions, your diminutions, your alterations, your corruptions of the doctors, your contrarieties and contradictions against yourself, your surmises, your guesses, your dreams, your visions, your elenchs³, your fallacies, your silly syllogisms, without either mood or figure or sequel in reason; and, to conclude, your untruths, so plain, so evident, so manifest, and so many, can never be answered? Is simple truth become so weak? Or is error and falsehood⁴ grown so strong?

O M. Harding, you know right well the weakness of your side. No man seeth it better than yourself. If you will dissemble and say ye see it not, open your eyes; behold your own book, and you shall see it. You have forced the old doctors and ancient fathers to speak your mind, and not their own. And therefore they are now your children: they are no fathers: they are now your scholars: you have set them to school: they are no doctors. You should have brought some truth for proof of your purpose: the world will not now be led with lies.

These be cases, not of wit, but of faith; not of eloquence, but of truth; not invented or devised by us, but from the apostles and holy fathers and founders of the church by long succession brought unto us. We are not the devisers thereof, but only the keepers; not the masters, but the scholars. Touching the substance of religion, we believe that the ancient catholic learned fathers believed: we do that they did: we say that they said. And marvel not, in what side soever ye see them, if ye see us join unto the same. It is our great comfort that we see their faith and our faith to agree in one. And we pity and lament your miserable case, that, having of yourselves erected a doctrine contrary to all the ancient fathers, yet would thus assay to colour the same, and to deceive the people only with the names and titles of ancient fathers.

St Cyprian saith: "Lies can never deceive us long. It is night until the day spring: but, when the day appeareth, and the sun is up, both the darkness of the night, and the thefts and robberies that in the darkness were committed, are fain to give place⁵." Now the sun is up: your smother is scattered. God with his truth will have the victory. The heavens and the earth shall perish; but the word of God shall never perish.

O M. Harding, O fight no longer against God. It is hard to kick against the spur. To maintain a fault known, it is a double fault. Untruth cannot be

[¹ Perhaps the following passage is that intended: Si ad fidem veram istiusmodi vis adhiberetur, episcopalis doctrina obviam pergeret, &c.—Hilar. Op. Par. 1693. Ad Constant. August. Lib. 1. 6. col. 1221. Conf. Tractat. in Psalm. lxx. 24. col. 182; and De Trin. Lib. VIII. 12. cols. 953, 4.]

[² Not, 1611.]

[³ Elenchs: proofs.]

[⁴ Falshead, 1565.]

[⁵ Atque hæc est...vera dementia, non cogitare... quod mendacia non diu fallant; noctem tamdiu esse quamdiu illucescat dies, clarificata autem die, et sole oborto, luci tenebras et caliginem cedere, et quæ grassabantur per noctem latrocinia cessare.—Cypri. Op. Oxon. 1682. Ad Cornel. Epist. lix. p. 133.]

shielded but by untruth. Error cannot be defended but by error. "And the mouth that speaketh untruth killeth the soul."

God direct our hearts, that we be not ashamed of his gospel, but that we may see it, and be seen to see it! God make us the vessels of his mercy, that we may have pity of Sion, and build up again the broken walls of his Hierusalem, to the honour and glory of his holy name! Amen.

Vigilius contra Eutychem, Lib. I.

Hæc est fides et confessio catholica, quam apostoli tradiderunt, martyres roboraverunt, et fideles huc usque custodiunt⁶:

"This is the faith and catholic profession, which the apostles have delivered, the martyrs have confirmed, and the faithful keep until this day."

FINIS.

[⁶ Vigil. adv. Eutychem. in Cassandr. Op. Par. 1616. Lib. iv. p. 547; where *confessio*, and *nunc usque*.]