# OF READING THE SCRIPTURES.

### THE FIFTEENTH ARTICLE.

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

OR that the lay-people was then forbidden to read the word of God in their own tongue.

OF THE PEOPLE'S READING THE BIBLE IN THEIR OWN TONGUE .-ARTICLE XV. H. A. 1564.]

### M. HARDING. THE FIRST DIVISION.

That the lay-people was then forbidden to read the word of God in their own tongue, I find it not. (204) Neither do I find that the lay-people was then, The two hunor at any other time, commanded to read the word of God in their own tongue, fred and fourth unbeing vulgar and barbarous. By vulgar and barbarous tongues I understand, as truth. For before, all other beside the three learned and principal tongues, Hebrew, Greek, knoweth the people was and Latin: which, as they were once native and vulgar to those three peoples, commanded so now to none be they native and vulgar, but common to be obtained by learn-to read the scriptures, ing, for meditation of the scriptures, and other knowledge.

#### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

M. Harding fully dischargeth this whole matter in one word. "I find it not," saith he, "that the lay-people was then forbidden to read the word of God in their own tongue." Howbeit, some others of his side thought sometimes they had surely found it, and were able to allege these words: Nolite sanctum dare canibus: "Give not holy things to dogs;" and thereof necessarily to conclude that the lay-people, whom in respect of themselves they called dogs, might not once touch the holy scriptures. But M. Harding saith plainly, he findeth it not. This short answer touching the demand is sufficient, if he knew what were sufficient. All the rest is made up only in words, as shall appear.

He addeth further: "Neither do I find that the lay-people was then, or at any other time, commanded to read the word of God in their own tongue, being vulgar and barbarous." First, this stopple of commanding is whole mertinent unto the question. Secondly, all other tongues, three only excepted, are without just cause condemned for barbarous. Thirdly, this exception of the people's reading in their vulgar tongue is only a bare shift and a quarrel without savour. For in what tongue can the vulgar people read and understand any thing, saving only in their own common and vulgar tongue? But, as the emperor Tiberius used sometimes to send certain of his nobles into his corn. Tacit. out provinces and far countries, to rule there as viceroys and lieutenants under in Tiberio. him, and yet, that notwithstanding, would not suffer them to go thither, or in any wise to depart from Rome9; even in like sort M. Harding, notwithstanding he would seem to license the lay-people to read God's word, yet he limiteth them either to the Greek, or to the Latin, or to the Hebrew tongue, wherein he is well assured they cannot read it.

[8 Wholly, 1565.]

[ C. Corn. Tacit. Annal, Lib. 1. cap. lxxx.]

<sup>[\*</sup> Attained, H. A. 1564. But H. A. 1565, Obtained.] [7 Though, 1611.]

Deut. vi.

But, that the people was in old times willed to read the scriptures, and that in such tongues as they were able to understand, it is evident, and appeareth many ways. And of infinite testimonies and good proofs only to touch a few, God saith thus unto his people: "Hearken, O Israel:...let the words that I speak to thee this day rest in thy heart: thou shalt shew them unto thy children: thou shalt think of them sitting in thy house, and walking in thy journey, and when thou goest to rest, and when thou risest: thou shalt bind them as a mark unto thy hand: thou shalt have them as a token before thine eyes: thou shalt write them on the posts of thy doors, and at the entry of thy gates."

ut libros comparetis3: "I warn you and beseech you to get books." Again he

saith: Audite, seculares omnes: comparate vobis biblia, anima pharmaca.

Corn. Agrip. de Vanit. Scient August. in

As it is noted by a writer of late years, it was decreed in the first council of Nice, that no christian man should be without the bible in his house1. St Augustine saith unto the people: Nec solum sufficiat, quod in ecclesia divinas cap. Jejunii. lectiones auditis; sed etiam in domibus vestris aut ipsi legite, aut alios legentes requirite2: "Think it not sufficient that ye hear the scriptures in the church; but also in your houses at home, either read yourselves, or get some other to read unto you." St Chrysostom saith unto his people: Admoneo, et rogo,

Chrysost. in Johan.

Chrysost in Epist ad coloss. Hom. aliud vultis, vel novum testamentum acquirite, apostolum, evangelia, Acta, con-

Hieron, in

Epit. Paul.

Sanct. cap. i.

tinuos et sedulos doctores4: "Hear me, ye men of the world: get ye the bible, that most wholesome remedy for the soul. If ye will nothing else, yet at the least get the new testament, St Paul's epistles, and the Acts, that Orig. in Esal. may be your continual and earnest teachers." Origen saith: Utinam...omnes faceremus illud, quod scriptum est, Scrutamini scripturas5: "I would to God we would all do as it is written, 'Search the scriptures.'" St Hierome, speaking of the company of women that was at Bethleem with Paula, saith thus: Non licebat cuiquam sororum ignorare psalmos, et non de scripturis sanctis quotidie aliquid discere6: "It was not lawful for any one of all the sisters to be ignorant of the psalms, nor to pass over any day without learning some part of the scriptures." In these examples, notwithstanding some cavil perhaps might be made to the contrary, yet very reason will lead M. Harding to think that these fathers meant the people should read the scriptures in their own known Basil de Spir and vulgar tongues. St Basil saith: Quantum ferre potest humana natura, possumus esse similes Deo; similitudo autem illa sine cognitione nulla est; cognitio autem constat ex doctrina; initium autem doctrinæ sermo est; sermonis autem partes syllabæ et voces7: "We may become like unto God, as far forth as the weak nature of man can bear. But this likeness cannot be without knowledge; neither this knowledge without doctrine. And the beginning of doctrine is speech; and the parts of speech be words and syllables." The resolution hereof is this: The people, without understanding the particular words and syllables, cannot know the speech: not knowing the speech, they cannot attain this doctrine; and without this doctrine they cannot be like unto God.

#### M. HARDING. THE SECOND DIVISION.

They that treat of this article, concerning the having of the scriptures in a 1. vulgar tongue for the laity to read, be of three sundry opinions. Some Three sundry judge it to be utterly unlawful that the bible be translated into any cerning the

<sup>[1</sup> Et Nicena synodus decretis suis cavit, ne quis e numero Christianorum sacris bibliorum libris careret. -Corn. Agrip. De Incert. et Vanit. Scient. Col. 1584. cap. c. fol. Bb. 11.]

<sup>2</sup> Perhaps the following is the passage intended: ... non vobis debet sufficere, quod in ecclesia lectiones divinas auditis, sed in domibus ... lectioni divinæ debetis insistere. - August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. Ad Fratr. in Erem. Serm. lvi. Tom. VI. Append. col. 366. Most of the sermons included under the above title are spurious.]

<sup>[3</sup> Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. In Joan. Hom. liii. Tom. VIII. p. 314.]

<sup>[4</sup> Id. in Epist. ad Coloss. cap. iii. Hom. ix. Tom. XI. p. 391.]

<sup>[5</sup> Orig. Op. Par. 1733-59. In Isai. Hom. ii. 2. Tom. III. p. 109.]

<sup>[6</sup> Hieron. Op. Par. 1693-1706. Ad Eustoch. Epist. lxxxvi. Epit. Paul. Tom. IV. Pars 11. col. 682; where nec licebat.]

<sup>[7</sup> Basil. Op. Par. 1721-30. Lib. de Spir. Sanct. cap. i. 2. Tom. III. p. 2.]

scriptures to be had in a vulgar tongue of the common people. Some think it good it be translated, so 2. that respect be had of time, and of place, and of persons. Some be 3. that respect be had of time, and of place, and of persons. of the opinion, that the holy scriptures ought to be had in the mother and native tongue of every nation, without any regard of time, place, or persons. \* The first . This is the opinion is holden of few, and commonly misliked. \* The third is maintained by the church of all the sects of our time, the Swenkfeldians excepted, who would the scriptures • This was to be in no regard. The second is allowed best of those that seem to be of the judgment most wisdom and godliness, and to have most care for the health of the church, all the old who have not severed themselves from the faith which hath continued from the fathers. beginning. Here that I say nothing of the first opinion, as they of the third is none of these. reprove the moderation of the second, so they of the second cannot allow the generality of the third.

### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Here are laid out three sundry opinions. The first utterly barreth all and every of the lay-people from every parcel of the scriptures. The third giveth all men leave to read all parts thereof without exception. Between these two extremes the second opinion is a mean.

The first hereof, saith M. Harding, is commonly misliked. Yet, nevertheless, it appeareth by him, in the fourteenth division of this article, it is the very practice and opinion of the church of Rome: which church, as he saith, hath already condemned all the new translations, and not allowed the old, neither in the Gotthian tongue translated by Ulphilas, nor in the Sclavon tongue translated by St Hierome; nor hath devised any other translation of her own. Hereby it is plain, that the opinion and practice of the church of Rome is commonly misliked, and holden of few.

The third opinion, that all men indifferently may read the scriptures without restraint, as M. Harding saith, is holden only by certain sects, and is too Notwithstanding this generality seemed good to Christ, his apostles, and to all the old doctors of the church, as it shall appear. Wherefore it followeth that Christ, his apostles, and all the old doctors, by M. Harding's judgment, were sectaries and heretics.

The second opinion is a mean between both, and is holden by M. Harding, and by certain others, that have not at any time altered their faith: notwithstanding men say M. Harding hath altered more than once, and therefore may hardly be allowed to pass in this number. Yet is this opinion of all others eccounted the best. Howbeit, whereas all men are indifferently and equally inheritors to God's word; to bind the same only unto a few, and that with such restraint of times and places, it must needs be thought some great Partiality. St Paul saith: Quæcunque scripta sunt, ad nostram doctrinam scripta Rom. xv. sunt; ut per patientiam et consolationem scripturarum spem habeamus: "All that is written in the scriptures is written for our instruction, that by patience and comfort of the scriptures we may have hope." St Basil saith: "The Basil in scripture of God is like an apothecary's shop, full of medicines of sundry sorts, that every man may there choose a convenient remedy for his disease8. Augustine saith: Deus in scripturis, quasi amicus familiaris, sine fuco loquitur August. ad cor doctorum et indoctorum<sup>9</sup>: "Almighty God in the scriptures speaketh, Volus. as a familiar friend, without dissimulation, unto the hearts both of the learned and also of the unlearned." Wherefore, the word of God being so universal, meet for all diseases, for all wits, and for all capacities; for M. Harding to improper 10 the same only unto a few, it is both far greater dishonour unto God, and also far greater injury unto God's faithful people, than if he would in like manner improper and inclose the sun-beams, to comfort the rich, and

[9 Ea quæ aperta continet [scriptura], quasi amicus familiaris, sine fuco ad cor loquitur doctorum atque indoctorum. - August. Op. Ad Volus. Epist.

<sup>[8</sup> Πάσα γραφή θεόπνευστος καὶ ώφέλιμος, διά τουτο συγγραφείσα παρά του Πνεύματος, ίν, όσπερ εν κοινῶ τῶν ψυχῶν ἰατρείω, πάντες ἄνθρωτοι το Ιαμα τοῦ οἰκείου πάθους ἕκαστος ἐκλεγώμεθα. exxxvii. 18. Tom. II. col. 409.] -Id. Hom, in Psalm. i. 1, Tom. I. p. 90.]

<sup>[10</sup> Improper: appropriate.]

prorsus me-ditatione promuntur. not the poor; to shine upon some, and not upon all. This mean way is no way: it is weighed out, not by the scriptures or holy fathers, but only by policy and worldly reason.

#### THE THIRD DIVISION. M. HARDING.

That the scriptures be not to be set forth in the rulgar tongue to be read of all sorts of people, every part of them, without any limitation of time, Five consideraplace, and persons, they seem to be moved with these considerations. tions why the scriptures are First, that it is not necessary; next, that it is not convenient; thirdly, not to be set forth for all that it is not profitable; fourthly, that it is dangerous and hurtful; sorts of people and lastly, although it were accorded the common people to have without limitation. liberty to read the bible in their own tongue, yet that the translations of late years made by those that have divided themselves from the catholic church be not to be allowed, as worthily suspected not to be sound and assured.

### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

These deep considerations were never devised neither by Moses, nor by

Christ, nor by the apostles, nor by any the ancient fathers; but are brought in only now at last by them that of long time have deceived the world by ignorance, and yet labour by the same to deceive it still. Christ saith: Qui John iii. male agit odit lucem: "He that doth ill flieth the trial of the light." And M. Harding's own Amphilochius saith: Naturalis providentia est male errantium, auferre de medio testimonia veritatis<sup>1</sup>: "It is the natural provision of them Amphiloch. in Vita Vincent. that be wilfully deceived, to convey out of sight all proofs and testimonies of

the truth." So the Philistines, the better to keep the Jews thrall and in sub-1 Sam. xiii. jection, utterly bereaved them of all manner weapon and artillery, and left them naked; and, no doubts, bare them then in hand, as M. Harding doth now the people of God, that it was neither necessary, nor convenient, nor profitable for them to have armour. Verily, Chrysostom saith: "It is more necessary, more convenient, and more profitable for the lay-people to read God's word, than for monks, or priests, or any others." Thus he writeth: Hoc est, quod om-Chrysost in Matt. Hom. 2. nia quasi una quadam peste corrumpit, quod lectionem divinarum scripturarum ad solos putatis monachos pertinere; cum multo vobis magis, quam illis, sit neces-

meditatione promuntur<sup>2</sup>: "This is it that, as it were with a pestilence, infecteth all things, that ye think the reading of the scriptures pertaineth only unto monks; whereas it is much more necessary for you than for them. It is more wickedness to think God's law is superfluous, than if ye should never read it. these be the words that no doubts come from the study of the devil."

saria.... Itaque multo est gravius atque deterius, rem superfluam esse putare legem Dei, quam illam omnino non legere. Hæc enim verba sunt, quæ de diabolica prorsus

Thus much therefore we learn here by Chrysostom, that these M. Harding's Dediabolica profound considerations "come from the study and closet of the devil."

#### M. HARDING. THE FOURTH DIVISION.

First, that the common people of all sorts and degrees ought of necessity to read all the holy scriptures in their own tongue, they say they could never find it hitherto in the same scriptures. Irenœus writeth, that the apostles Lib. iii. adverpreached to the aliens and barbarous people the faith of Christ, even sus Hæreses, to those that were aliens and barbarous in language, and saith, that, having heard the gospel preached, they believed in Christ; and, keeping the order of tradition which the apostles delivered unto them, had their salvation and faith written in their heart without print, pen, or ink, and utterly without letters. And further he sheweth that, if the apostles had left to us no scriptures at all, yet we should be saved by the tradition which they left to them whom they committed their churches unto, as many nations of aliens be saved by the same<sup>3</sup>.

<sup>[1</sup> The reference is probably incorrect: the editor has been unable to discover the passage intended.]

ii. Tom. VII. p. 30.] [3 Quid autem si neque apostoli quidem scriptu-[2 Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. In Matt. Hom. ras reliquissent nobis, nonne oportebat ordinem sequi

Tradi-

Hilarius likewise, declaring that the mystery of God's will and the expectation of the blessed kingdom is most and chiefly preached in the three tongues in which Pilate wrote on the cross our Lord Jesus Christ to be king of the Jews, confesseth notwithstanding, that "many barbarous nations have attained and gotten the true knowledge of God by the preaching of the apostles, and the faith of the churches remaining amongst them to that day 1." Whereby he doth us to understand that the unlearned barbarous people had their faith without letters or writing, whereof they had no skill, by tradition and preaching, as well as the other nations who were holpen by the benefit of the learned tonques. Hebrew, Greek, and Latin.

#### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Touching this first consideration, M. Harding imagineth shadows of himself, and fighteth stoutly against the same. Therefore he may soon attain the victory. For we say not that the common people of all sorts and degrees ought of necessity to read all the holy scriptures. This is only M. Harding's fantasy: we say it not; we know some are blind, and many unlearned and cannot read. But thus we say, that in the primitive church whosoever would and could read, might lawfully read without controlment. Therefore St Augustine saith, as it is before alleged: Aut ipsi legite, aut alios legentes requirite6: August in

"Either read yourselves, or get some other to read unto you."

I grant, at the first preaching and publishing of the gospel certain barbarous nations that received the faith of Christ had neither books nor letters. were they not therefore ignorant, or left at large to believe they knew not what. They had then certain officers in the church, which were called catechista, whose duty was continually and at all times to teach the principles of the faith, not by book, but by mouth. Of these mention is made in the Acts of the Acts xix. Apostles, in the council of Nice7, and clsewhere. This office bare Origen, that Concil Nic. 1. ancient learned father<sup>8</sup>. This doctrine Dionysius calleth θεοπαράδοτα λόγια, Orig. Cate-"Oracles or instructions given from God;" and saith, "They passed from one to Euseb. Lib. another, not by writing, but by mouth, έκ νοὸς εἰς νοῦν, from mind to mind." "Dionys in Neither did these traditions contain any secret or privy instructions or inventions Eccles. Hierarch, of men, as it is imagined by some, but the very self-same doctrine that was contained written in the scriptures of God. And in this sort the gospel itself and the whole religion of Christ was called a tradition. So Tertullian calleth Tertull de the articles of the faith "an old tradition 10." So the faith of the holy Trinity in Heret. the council of Constantinople is called a tradition 11; and the faith of two sundry Constant. vi. natures in Christ in the same council is called apostolorum...viva traditio<sup>12</sup>, "the Act & Act & Fad. Act.

lively tradition of the apostles." So it is written in Socrates: Credimus in Socrat. Lib.

unum Deum Patrem, secundum evangelicam et apostolicam traditionem<sup>13</sup>: "We ii. cap. x.

traditionis, quem tradiderunt iis quibus committebant occlesias? Cui ordinationi assentiunt multæ gentes berbarorum, eorum qui in Christum credunt, sine charta et atramento scriptum habentes per Spiritum n cordibus suis salutem, et veterem traditionem dili-Genter custodientes.—Iren. Op. Par. 1710. Contr. Hær. Lib. III. cap. iv. 1, 2. p. 178.]

[4 Quia his maxime tribus linguis sacramentum Voluntatis Dei, et beati regni expectatio prædicatur: ex quo illud Pilati fuit, ut in his tribus linguis regem Judæorum Dominum Jesum Christum esse præscriberet. Nam quainvis multæ barbaræ gentes Dei cognitionem secundum apostolorum prædicationem et manentium hodie illic ecclesiarum fidem adeptæ sint: tamen &c .- Hilar. Op. Par. 1693. Prolog. in Lib. Psalm. 15. col. 9.]

[\* Peoples, H. A. 1564.]

See before, page 670, note 2.]

7 The 14th canon of the Nicene council has reference to catechumens: περί τῶν κατηχουμένων και παραπεσόντων, κ.τ.λ.--Concil. Nic. can. 14, in Coucil. Stud. Labb. et Cossart. Lut. Par. 1671-2. Tom. II. col. 36. Probably Jewel meant to infer that as there were catechumens, there must be cate-

[8 Euseb. in Hist. Eccles. Script. Amst. 1695-1700. Lib. vt. capp. iii. xix. pp. 165, &c. 180.]

[9 Dionys, Areop. Op. Antv. 1634. De Eccles. Hierarch. cap. i. 4. Tom. I. pp. 234, 5.]

[10 There are in the treatise named several passages which Jewel may be supposed to have had in his mind. The following is one: Superest ergo uti demonstremus, an hæc nostra doctrina, cujus regulam supra edidimus, de apostolorum traditione censeatur, et ex lioc ipso, an ceteræ de mendacio veniant. Tertull. Op. Lut. 1641. De Præscr. Hæret. 21. p. 238. See also ibid. 28, 37. pp. 241, 5.]

[11 Agath. Epist. i. in Concil. Constant. 111. Act. IV. in Concil. Stud. Labb. et Cossart. Tom. VI. col.

[12 Id. ibid. cols. 635, 6.]

13 Socrat. in Hist. Eccles. Script. Lib. 11. cap. x. p. 72.]

Tradition.

Basil. de Spirit. Sanct. 2 Thess. ii.

Cypr. ad Pomp.

believe in one God the Father, according to the tradition of the gospel and of the apostles." So St Basil calleth it a tradition "to believe in the Father, the Son, and the Holy Ghost<sup>1</sup>." Therefore St Paul saith: Tenete traditiones, quas accepistis, sive per sermonem, sive per epistolam: "Keep the traditions that ve have received either by mouth or else by letter." By these words the doctrine of the apostles is called a tradition. And for this cause St Cyprian saith: Unde est ista traditio? An de dominica et evangelica veritate descendens, an de apostolorum mandatis atque literis veniens<sup>2</sup>? "From whence is this tradition? whether cometh it from our Lord and from his gospel, or else from the epistles and commandments of the apostles?"

Thus were the barbarous nations instructed by tradition and by mouth, and were made perfect<sup>3</sup> in every point and parcel of the faith, and, as Irenæus saith, "had their salvation by the Holy Ghost written in their hearts; and Iren. Lib. iii. cap. iv. Scriptam hawere as much bounden unto the same as unto any writings and letters of the apostles4." Of such lively and clear doctrine St Paul saith: "Christ was set tem per Spiri-tum in corout, and crucified before the eyes of the Galathians." And therefore he saith dibus suis. Gal. iii. Phil. i. to the Philippians: "My prayer is, that your charity may yet more and more abound in all knowledge and in all understanding." And thus, notwithstanding they were barbarous, yet were they able to render an account of all the 1 Pet. iii. 1ren. Lib. iii. religion and faith in Christ. For thus Irenæus writeth of them: Si quis illis cap. iv. annuntiaret ea, quæ ab istis hæreticis inventa sunt, statim clauderent aures5: "If any man would shew those barbarous nations what things these heretics have invented, they would stop their ears and not abide it." Likewise, if a man would shew them of the profanation of Christ's holy mysteries, of transubstantiation, of real and fleshly presence, and of other like horrible disorders that now are holden

Iren, in eod. cap.

and defended in the church of Rome, as Irenæus saith, fugerent longo longius, ne audire quidem sustinentes blasphemum colloquium5; "they would flee away as far as they were able, and would not abide the hearing of such blasphemous Thus were these nations sufficiently instructed, notwithstanding they were barbarous and wanted books. But they of M. Harding's side neither will teach the people, as their duty

Matt. xxiii.

is, nor suffer them to read the holy scriptures and to teach themselves. Christ may justly say to them, as he did sometimes unto others the like: "Wo be unto you, ye scribes and Pharisees: ye shut up the kingdom of heaven before men; and neither do ye enter yourselves, nor suffer others that would enter."

Iren. Lib. iii. Of such Irenæus speaketh in the next chapter following: Hoc.....non est

sanantium, nec vivificantium, sed magis gravantium, et augentium ignorantiam..... Et multo verior hic lex invenitur, maledictum dicens omnem, qui in errorem mittit cecum in via7: "This is not the part of them that would heal, or give life; but rather of them that augment the burden, and increase ignorance. And herein is the law well verified, 'Accursed is he that leadeth the blind out of his way.'"

Deut. xxvii.

#### M. HARDING. THE FIFTH DIVISION.

That it is not convenient nor seemly all sorts of persons without exception to be admitted to the reading of the holy scriptures, I need to say nothing: every reasonable man may easily understand the causes by himself. This is certain, divers chapters and stories of the old testament contain such matter as occasion of evil thoughts is like to be given, if women, maidens, and young men be permitted to read them. Gregory Nazianzene, whom the Greeks called the Lib. i. Theolodivine, saith, moved with great considerations, that it is not the part give.

The word of God offereth occasion of ill thoughts. Nazianzene contention and reason-ing, and not of reading.

<sup>[1 ...</sup> αὐτὴν δὲ τὴν ὁμολογίαν τῆς πίστεως εἰς Πατέρα καὶ Υίὸν καὶ ἄγιον Πνεῦμα, ἐκ ποίων γραμμάτων ἔχομεν; κ. τ. λ. — Basil. Op. Par. 1721-30. Lib. de Spir. Sanct. cap. xxvii. 67. Tom. III. pp.

<sup>[2</sup> Cypr. Op. Oxon, 1682. Ad Pomp. Epist. lxxiv. p. 211; where utrumne de dominica, auctoritate descendens, and atque epistolis.]

<sup>[3</sup> Perfite, 1565, 1609.]

<sup>[4</sup> See before, pages 672, 3, note 3.]

<sup>[5</sup> Quibus si aliquis annuntiaverit ea, quæ ab hæreticis adinventa sunt, proprio sermone eorum colloquens, statim concludentes aures, longo longius fugient, ne audire quidem, &c .- Iren. Op. Par. 1710. Contr. Hær. Lib. 111. cap. iv. 2. p. 178.]

<sup>[6</sup> These, 1565, 1609.]

<sup>[7</sup> Id. ibid. cap. v. 2. p. 179; where his lex invenietur, and mittat.]

of all persons to reason of God and of godly things, neither behoveful the same be done in all times and places, nor that all things touching God be meddled withal8. Which advertisement taketh no place, where all be admitted to the curious reading of the scriptures in their own vulgar tongue.

### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

M. Harding saith: "It is not convenient nor seemly that all the people should read the holy scriptures." As if he would say in plainer wise: It is not meet nor seemly that God should speak unto every of the poor simple people without exception. Howbeit, God himself saith not so, but rather the contrary. St Augustine saith, as it is alleged before: "God speaketh as a August ad familiar friend unto the heart both of the learned and also of the unlearned?" 3. Loquitur "For he hath no acceptation or choice of persons." If it be not seemly for the ad cor et doctorum, et inpeople of God to read and to know God's holy will, for whom then is it doctorum. seemly? The danger of fantasies and ill thoughts, that may thereby be moved. is but a fantasy. The prophet David saith: Eloquia Domini eloquia casta: Psal, xii. "The words of God be holy and chaste words." Again he saith: "Whereby Psal. cxix. shall a young man amend his life?" He answereth, not by fleeing, but "by keeping thy holy words."

And may we think that M. Harding meaneth any good faith, that, to the intent, as he saith, to pull young men from evil thoughts, thus withdraweth them from the reading of God's word, which every where reproveth sin; and nevertheless giveth them leave to read Ovid, Terence, Propertius, and such others, which for the most part are nothing else but examples and schools of sin? Verily, if God's holy word be a provocation of ill thoughts, which blasphemous words I marvel M. Harding can utter without horror, the world thinketh that many unmarried priests in the church of Rome are as much inclined to the same, as any woman, maiden, or young man. For it is not a gown or a cap that mortifieth the affections of the mind.

Nazianzene speaketh not of reading the scriptures, but of contentious disputing Nazianz.

Theol. Lib. i. and reasoning of God or godly things; which, as St Paul saith, oftentimes Theol. Lit worketh "the subversion of the hearers." And in this sense St Cyprian seemeth to say: De Deo etiam vera dicere periculosum est: "Of God it is dangerous cyprian. to speak, yea, although ye speak the truth." Hereof M. Harding maketh up a very slender reason: It is not seemly for every man to contend and dispute of God; ergo, it is not seemly for the lay-people to read the scriptures. grant, the rabbins did not amiss to restrain the people from reading certain chapters of the old testament until they were grown in years and judgment. For the scriptures of God are not all of one sort. Some parts be easy, some parts be hard; some meet for beginners, some meet for them that know more; but all meet and made for the people of God. Yet were it great folly and want of discretion to begin first with the hardest. So Justinian the emperor in Procession appointeth an order for the reading of the laws, what books and titles he would have read the first year, what the second, and so forth 10. For otherwise, whoso would wade without order should lose his time.

But whereas M. Harding saith, "It is not seemly nor convenient the scriptures should be read of all persons without exception;" it had been good skill, and some credit unto his cause, if he could have told us plainly, out of all the whole people, what persons he thinketh meet to be excepted. If he say old men, that were much unseemly. If he say children, St Paul saith Timothy 2 Tim. iii. was brought up from his childhood in the scriptures, and never thought it unconvenient. If he say the unlearned, Chrysostom answereth: Nihil opus est syllogismis: rustici aniculæque intelligunt: "To understand God's word we

Tom. I. p. 56.]

<sup>[</sup> Οὐ παντός, ω οὖτοι, τό περί θεοῦ φιλοσοφείν, ού παντός ... προσθήσω δε, οὐδε πάντοτε, οὐδε πασιν, φοδο πάντα, κ. τ. λ. — Gregor. Nazianz. Op. Par. 1778-1840. Adv. Eunom. Orat. xxvii. Theol. i. 3. Tom, I. p. 489.]

<sup>[9</sup> August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. Ad Volus. Epist. exxxvii. 18. Tom. II. col. 409. See before, page 671, note 9.] [10 Corp. Jur. Civil. Amst. 1663. Digest. Præf. i.

Cyril. contr. Julian. Lib. vi.

Nazianz. in Funeb. Orat. de Gorgon.

Hieron. in Epitaph. Paul. Cyril. contr.

Lib. vii. 1 Cor. i.

Confess. Lib. viii. cap. xii. Acts viil.

• These others were the scribes and Pharisees, and others of

that genera-For Christ saith: "These mysteries be hidden from the wise, and revealed to the little

Matt. xi.

Isai. vi.

cap. xlviii. 2 Cor. iv.

> [1 ... άλλ' ὅτι γυναῖκας τὸ θεῖον ἡμῶν ὀνίνησι κήρυγμα, φιλοψογίας καὶ τοῦτο ποιεῖται πρόφασιν.—Cyril. Alex. Op. Lut. 1638. Contr. Julian. Lib. vi. Tom, VI. p. 209. Conf. ibid. p. 206.]

[2 The passage intended is probably the following: ... τῷ θυσιαστηρίῳ προσπίπτει μετά τῆς πίστεως, καὶ τὸν ἐπ' αὐτῷ τιμώμενον ἀνακαλουμένη μεγάλη τῆ βοῆ, καὶ πάσαις ταῖς κλήσεσι, καὶ πασῶν αὐτὸν τῶν πώποτε δυνάμεων ὑπομνήσασα, σοφή γάρ ἐκείνη καὶ τὰ παλαιά καὶ τὰ νέα, κ.τ.λ.-Gregor. Nazianz. Op. Par. 1778-1840. In Laud.

Gorgon. Orat. viii. 18. Tom. I. p. 229. But it may

thus wilfully to abuse it.

need no syllogisms, or knowledge of logic: husbandmen and old women do understand it." If he say women, this same was it that Julianus, the wicked emperor, charged the Christians withal, for that their women were so skilful in

the scriptures<sup>1</sup>: but Nazianzenus answereth for his sister Gorgonia, that she was skilful both in the old testament and also in the new2. If he say maidens, St Hierome answereth, that "all the maidens about lady Paula were forced daily to learn the scriptures<sup>3</sup>." If he say young men or boys, Cyrillus answereth: In sacris literis educati, fiunt postea religiosissimi, quamvis non æque eloquentes4:

"Being brought up in the scriptures, afterward they become most godly men. albeit perhaps not so eloquent." If he say the poor, St Paul answereth: Non multi genere nobiles: at Corinth, among them that first received the gospel, "there were not many of great birth, or much wealth." If he say heretics,

St Augustine, being inclined to the heresy of the Manichees, by reading the scriptures was converted<sup>5</sup>. If he say heathens, St Luke will say that queen Candace's chamberlain, being an heathen, read the scriptures without control-

Now, if neither old men nor children, nor the learned nor the unlearned, nor women nor maidens, nor young men nor boys, nor the poor nor the rich, nor heretics nor heathens, be excepted from the reading of God's word, what other sort of men then is there that M. Harding would have excepted? If it be convenient for every of these to read the scriptures, for whom then is it not convenient?

#### M. HARDING. THE SIXTH DIVISION.

And the scripture itself, say they, sheweth plainly, that of convenience the scrip-

tures ought not be made common to all persons. For Christ affirmeth the same with his own words, where he saith to his apostles: "Unto you it is given Luke viii. to know the secrets of the kingdom of God; but to \* others 6 in parables; that when they see they should not see, and when they hear they should not under-(205) They to whom it is given to know these secrets be none other than the apostles and their successors or disciples. They to whom this is not given, but The two hundered and fith must learn parables, be they for whom it were better to be ignorant of the mysteries

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

if they set little by them, which we see commonly done among the common people.

than to know them; lest they abuse them, and be the more grievously condemned

It were much better for M. Harding not to know the word of God, than

They, unto whom Christ would not open the secrets of the kingdom of heaven, were not the common sort of the lay-people, as M. Harding supposeth, but the bishops, the priests, the doctors, the scribes, and the Pharisees, and other like reprobates, whom God had given over in the hardness of their hearts; as it is plain by the words that Christ allegeth out of the prophet Esay: "O Lord, harden the heart of this people, stop their ears, blind their eyes, lest happily they be converted, and so be saved." that ancient father Irenæus immediately after the apostles' time expounded it, Iren. Lib. iv. and applieth thereto these words of St Paul: In quibus Deus hujus seculi exceecavit corda infidelium, ut non fulgeat illis illuminatio evangelii gloriæ Dei: "In whom

God hath blinded the hearts of them that be unfaithful, that the brightness of

be doubted if these words would bear the sense Jewel appears to put upon them. See, however, for proofs of Gorgonia's study of the scriptures, ibid. 11, 13. pp. 224, 6.

<sup>[3</sup> Hieron. Op. Par. 1693-1706. Ad Eustoch. Epist. lxxxvi. Epit. Paul. Tom. IV. Pars 11. col. 682. See before, page 670.] [4 Cyril. Alex. Op. Contr. Julian. Lib. vii. Tom.

VI. p. 234.] [5 August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. Confess. Lib.

vIII. cap. xii. 29. Tom. I, col. 156.] [6 Other, H. A. 1564.]

the gospel of the glory of God may not shine unto them;" and likewise these words: Tradidit illos Deus in reprobum sensum: "God hath delivered them over Rom. i. into a reprobate understanding." And in the end he compareth them with Pharao and antichrist<sup>7</sup>. So likewise Dionysius the Carthusian, whose authority I trow M. Harding will not deny, saith of them: Justo [Dei] judicio negata est Dionys. Carthus. in illis [prædicatio evangelii] tanquam indignis intelligentia spirituali8: "The preach-Luc. cap. viii. ing of the gospel was denied unto them by the just judgment of God, as unto men unworthy of any spiritual understanding."

Thus M. Harding, the better to win his purpose, is contented to say that all the people of God, himself only with a few others excepted, are blind, reprobate, accursed of God, forsaken, and left in hardness of their hearts, unworthy of spiritual understanding, given over into a wicked mind, like to Pharao, like to antichrist. So much is the simple lay-people beholden to him, But Gerson, a doctor of M. Harding's own company, saith: Licet judicium et conclusiones fidei Gul. Gerson. Quæ veritates auctoritative spectent ad prælatos et doctores; tamen ad alios quam ad theologos de necessitate potest deliberatio pertinere, sicut et cognitio super his, quæ fidem respiciunt: ita dendæ sint. etiam, ut ad laicos hoc possit extendi, et plus aliquando quam ad multos clericorum<sup>9</sup>: "Albeit the judgment and the conclusions of faith pertain by authority unto the prelates and doctors; yet the consideration and weighing of the same may pertain as well unto others, as also knowledge touching those things that pertain unto the faith; which knowledge and judgment may also be extended unto the lay-people, and that better oftentimes than to many priests." Panormitane saith: Magis credendum est laico afferenti scripturas, quam papæ et Abbas concilio generali10: "We ought more to believe a lay-man, if he bring the authority of the scriptures, than the pope and a general council."

By these it is evident, that God hath not excluded the lay-people that believeth in him from the understanding of his holy secrets. Hugo Cardinalis expoundeth these words in this wise: Vobis datum est: vobis qui libenter auditis, Hugo Card. et fidem habetis 11: "Unto you it is given: unto you that are glad to learn, and ""L have faith." And the very ordinary gloss saith thus: Vobis qui fideles estis; closs. Ord. sed Pharisæis incredulis sancta non sunt danda12: "Unto you that are faithful it is given; but unto the unfaithful Pharisees holy things may not be given." And where M. Harding saith, The knowledge of the 13 mysteries pertaineth only unto the apostles of Christ and to their successors; pleaseth it thee, good reader, to understand, that by M. Harding's own decree the successors of the apostles be neither priests, nor deacons, nor monks, nor friars, nor cardinals, but only bishops. For so it is limited by Anacletus: Episcopi... apostolorum Anaclet. Domini, presbyteri vero septuaginta duorum discipulorum locum tenent 14: "Bishops Dist. 21. are in the place of the apostles; and priests are in the place of the threescore and twelve disciples." Thus M. Harding hath taken great pains to shut

out both himself and the greatest part of his clergy and all the whole people

[7 Iren. Op. Par. 1710. Contr. Hær. Lib. IV. cap. xxix. pp. 266, 7.]

from the mysteries 15 of the kingdom of heaven.

[8 Dionys. Carthus. in Nov. Test. Col. 1532. In Evang. Luc. Enarr. cap. viii. Art. xx. Tom. I. fol. 174. 2; where spiritualis.]

[9 Denique sequitur ex his omnibus, quod judicium et quæstiones fidei licet auctoritative spectent ad prælatos et doctores, spectare tamen non potest ad alios quam theologos deliberatio, sicut et cognitio super his quæ fidem respiciunt, ita etiam ut ad laicos multos hoc posset extendi, et plus aliquando quam ad multos clericorum. — Gerson. Op. Antw. 1706. Decl. Verit. quæ Cred. sunt. Cor. iv. Tom. I. col. 26.]

[10 Nam in concernentibus fidem etiam dictum unius privati esset præferendum dicto papæ, si ille moveretur melioribus auctoritatibus novi et veteris testamenti quam papa. — Panorm. (N. de Tudesch.) sup. Decretal. Lib. Venet. Nur. et Basil. 1476-8. Lib. 1. Tit. vi. Tom. I. fol. k. 2. See also Catal. Test. Verit. Genev. 1608. col. 1889; where the words cited very nearly resemble those in the text.]

[11 Hugon. de S. Charo Op. Col. Agrip. 1621. Evang. sec. Luc. cap. viii. Tom. VI. fol. 177.2; where adhibetis.]

[12 Bibl. cum Gloss. Ord. et Expos. N. de Lyra. Basil. 1502. Luc. cap. viii. Pars V. fol. 146. 2; where quia.

[13 These, 1565.]

[14 This passage does not appear in the distinction cited. But see Anaclet. Epist. iii. in Crabb. Concil. Col. Agrip. 1551. Tom. I. p. 63; where domini apostolorum presbyteri quoque.]

[15 Mystery, 1565.]

To read

THE SEVENTH DIVISION. M. HARDING.

the It is reported by sundry (206) ancient writers of great authority, that among Hebrew. the people of Israel the seventy elders only could read and understand The two hun- the mysteries of the holy books that we call the bible 1. For, whereas in Psalm. ii. dred and the letters of the Hebrew tongue have no vocals, they only had the sixth unskill to read the scripture by the consonants; and thereby the rulgar people St Hilary saith no such were kept from reading of it (207) by special providence of God, as it is thought. The two hun- that precious stones should not be cast before \*swine, that is to say, such as

be not called thereto, as being for their unreverent curiosity and impure life unseventh untruth, misreporting God's worthy. divine providence.

\* The people swine.

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Notwithstanding M. Harding's allegation were true, yet St Hilary's judgment

Hilar, in Psal. ii. Hieron, ad

Damas.

touching the Hebrew tongue were not great. For, writing upon the same psalm. he much mistaketh this Hebrew word bereschith1, as a man unskilful in that language; and St Hierome reproveth him likewise for mistaking this Hebrew But M. Harding, as otherwise his wont is, much misreporteth his author. For St Hilary saith no such thing. Thus only he saith, that these three-score and twelve doctors or elders were men of great knowledge; and therefore alloweth well of their judgment. Touching the first invention and use of the pricks, it is thought the rabbins

themselves do not agree. Some say they were delivered to Moses in the mount: some say they were invented by Esdras; some by the Tabarites, which were the canonists of the Jews, or doctors of traditions. Howbeit, whatsoever it were the case is not much material. But to say that in all the whole country of Jewry, a few only excepted, no man was able to read the Hebrew tongue, in M. Harding, being so well learned in the same, it must needs be thought either a great oversight or else some other greater fault.

For he knoweth that God commanded every of the people to write the words Deut. xt. of the law in the posts of their doors and in the borders of their coats. Likewise Deut. xxiv.

God commanded that whose would put away his wife should first write a bill of divorce, and so put her from him. If M. Harding will say: Some one or other of these learned elders or doctors might write it for them; yet it is written thus in [1] Macc.xiii. the book of the Machabees: Capit populus Israel scribere in tabulis: "The

Esth. ix. Jer. li. Bar. i.

Luke xvi.

Acts viil.

John xix.

people of Israel began to write in their tables." It is written of Mardocheus. that "he wrote all that happened;" that Hieremy wrote the plagues that were coming; and that Baruch wrote the words of Hieremy. And in the gospel the wicked steward saith unto the debtor: "Take thy bill, sit down and write." Now let M. Harding consider, how could all these write, unless they could read; and, if they could not read, to what end should they write? Verily it appeareth not that 2 Kings xxiii. any of these was of the three-score and twelve elders. Likewise king Josias

Luke iv.

found the book of the law in a wall, and read it. When Christ read and expounded the prophet Esay in the synagogue, the people marvelled not at his reading, (for that was common,) but only at his exposition. Philip said unto the chamberlain: Intelligis ea quæ legis? "Understandest thou that thou And when Christ suffered upon the cross, St John saith: Hunc titulum multi Judæorum legerunt: "Many of the Jews read that title." wherefore did the rabbins take order that none of the lay-people, before they came to certain years of age, should read either the first chapter of Genesis. orig. in cant. or the book of Canticles, or certain chapters of the prophet Ezechiel<sup>3</sup>, if in Prolog. page of all the people understood the project.

none of all the people understood the pricks or vowels, nor could read any

[1 Nam idem Moyses, quamvis veteris testamenti verba in litteris condidisset, tamen separatim quædam ex occultis legis secretiora mysteria septuaginta senioribus, qui doctores deinceps manerent, intimaverat. ...Ambiguitatis autem linguæ Hebraicæ unum afferemus exemplum... Bresith verbum Hebraicum est. Id tres significantias in se habet, id est, in principio, et in capite, et in filio.... Sed perfecta horum septuaginta

interpretum auctoritas manet.-Hilar. Op. Par. 1693. Tractat. in Psalm. ii. 2, 3. cols. 28, 9.]

[2 ... Hilarius in Commentariis Matthæi ita posuit : Osanna, Hebraico sermone significatur, redemptio domus David. - Hieron. Op. Par. 1693-1706. Ad Damas. Epist. Tom. IV. Pars 1. col. 145.]

[8 Orig. Op. Par. 1733-59. In Cant. Canticor. Prolog. Tom. III. p. 26.]

thing at all? If there were nothing else, yet this thing only is sufficient to To read descry M. Harding's error. The rabbins say that in every town within the whole country of Israel there was a school; and that in Jerusalem there were Hebrew, found an hundred schools. And will M. Harding have us believe that in so Paul. Phag. many schools there was not one scholar able to know his letters? Howbeit in he taketh it for no inconvenience, whatsoever may help to serve his turn.

But in the old times the pricks or vowels were not found; therefore, saith he, the people could not read. So likewise in old times the Greek tongue Gerald Lil. was written without accents, as it is evident until this day by sundry books and old marble stones that are so written. Yet notwithstanding men were then able to read the Greek tongue without accents. Certainly M. Harding knoweth that even now not only the learned of the Jews, but also the very children of ten years of age, are able to read without pricks or vowels.

Yet, notwithstanding, saith M. Harding: This was done by God's secret providence<sup>6</sup>, lest the lay-people should read God's word, and so precious stones should be thrown before swine. This doubtless was done by God's provision, that it might appear in what regard M. Harding hath the people of God; that is, by his own confession, as unpure and unclean beasts, and filthy swine, and none otherwise.

#### M. HARDING. THE EIGHTH DIVISION.

Here I need not to spend time in rehearing the manifold difficulties of these holy letters, through which the reading of them to the simple and unlearned people, having their wits exercised in no kind of learning, their minds occupied in worldly cares, their hearts carried away with the love of things they lust after, is not Bernard, super very profitable. As the light shineth in vain upon blind eyes (saith a holy Bernard callfather), so to no purpose or profit is the labour of a worldly and worldly and natural man taken for the attaining of things that be of the Spirit. Verily, among that is void other, this incommodity is seen by daily experience hereof to proceed, that, of the of God. People, such as ought of right to take least upon them, be now become censurers. Therefore this place is and judges of all, despisers of the more part, and, which is common to all plied. heretics, mockers of the whole simplicity of the church, and of all those things they thich the church useth as pap or milk to nourish her tender babes withal; but that that it were better for them not to read than by reading so to be puffed any despised temples. that it were better for them not to read, than by reading so to be puffed up, despised. Which evil cometh not of the scripture, but of their own and made insolent. malice and evil disposition.

## THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

The lay-people is occupied in worldly affairs: Ergo, saith M. Harding, they may not be suffered to read the scriptures: as if he would say: They are in the midst of diseases; therefore they may use no physician. They are in the throng of their enemies; therefore they must be left naked without weapon. But the godly-learned fathers have evermore reproved this reason, and thought it childish. St Chrysostom saith thus unto the lay-people: Lectio divinarum Chrysost. in Scripturarum vobis magis necessaria est, quam monachis 9: "The reading of the Matt. Hom. 2. scriptures is more necessary for you than it is for monks." And, touching worldly cares, the world well seeth that the bishop of Rome and his cardinals, and others of that profession, are no less troubled therewith than they that are most deeply drowned in the world. St Gregory, being by the emperor advanced 10 to the bishopric of Rome, writeth thus of himself: Sub colore epi- Greg. Lib. i.

```
Levit. cap. xxiii. fol. z. 6. 2.]
```

<sup>[4</sup> Four hundred, 1565; found hundred, 1609.] [6 ... synagogæ et ædes concionatoriæ ... olim passim in Israel in omnibus locis institutæ erant, at...in suis...locis scholas et synagogas haberent... Amplius quoque referunt Hebræi Hierosolymis olim tantum fuisse studium legis divinæ, ut ultra quadringentas publicas scholas et synagogas habuerint, in quibus lex Dei docebatur.—Tharg. ex Chald. in Lat. Yers. add. Annot, aut. P. Fag. Argent. 1546. In

<sup>[6</sup> Provision, 1565.]

<sup>7</sup> The editor has not been able to find these words.]

<sup>[8</sup> Censors, 1565, 1609, and H.A. 1564.]

<sup>[9</sup> Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. In Matt. Hom. ii. Tom. VII. p. 30. See before, page 672.]

<sup>[10</sup> Avanced, 1565.]

Scientia inflat. Greg. Lib. i. Rpist. 7, et Epist. 25.

scopatus ad seculum retractus sum; in quo tantis terræ curis inservio, quantis me in vita laica nequaquam deservisse reminiscor1: "Under the colour of my bishopric, I am drawn back into the world; wherein I am so much troubled with worldly cares, as I do not remember the like when I lived in the world." again he saith: "Tanta me...occupationum onera deprimunt, ut ad superna animus nullatenus erigatur2: "So many cares and businesses3 do press me down, that I can in no wise lift my mind up to heaven." Yet Gregory, in comparison of his successors, might undoubtedly seem a saint: for as now they have one foot in the church, and another in the world; or rather, not one foot in the church, but both heart and body in the world.

Yet notwithstanding, by M. Harding's doctrine, these only must have the supreme judgment and exposition of God's word; and whatsoever they say Alb. Pigh. Lib. vi. cap. xiii. therein, it ought to stand in more weight than the judgment of a general council, or the determination of the whole world 4.

He addeth further: "Knowledge bloweth up the heart, and increaseth pride:" 1 Cor. viii. thus saith M. Harding, being himself learned and full of knowledge: I will not use his own conclusion; ergo, full of pride. But thus he saith, even as Epime-Tit L nides the poet said: Cretenses semper mendaces: "The men of Creta be ever liars," being himself a man of Creta, and therefore by his own judgment a liar, as others were.

This slothful quarrel against the knowledge of God might be maintained by great antiquity. For St Hierome and St Augustine say, there were men then in their time of the same judgment herein that M. Harding is now. St Hierome saith: Inertiæ se et otio et somno dantes, putant peccatum esse, si scripturas Epist. ad Tit. cap. i. legerint; et eos qui in lege Domini meditantur die ac nocte, quasi garrulos inutilesque contemnunt<sup>5</sup>: "Giving themselves to sleep and slothfulness, they think it sin to read the scriptures; and such as both day and night are studious in the law of God they despise as prattlers and vain men." Likewise St Augustine: Sunt quidam homines, qui, cum audierint quod humiles esse debent, demittunt se,

August. in Psal. cxxx. [et] nihil volunt discere, putantes, quod si aliquid didicerint superbi futuri sint, et remanent in solo lacte; quos scriptura reprehendit6: "There be certain men that, when they hear they must be humble, abase themselves, and will learn nothing, fearing that, if they attain to any knowledge, they shall be proud; and so they remain still only in milk; but the scripture of God reproveth them. The old learned father Irenæus, expounding these words of St Paul, Scientia Iren, Lib, ii.

cap. xlv.

Phil. iii.

l Cor. xiii.

Hieron, in

inflat, writeth thus: Paulus ait, Scientia inflat:...non quod veram scientiam de Deo culparet; alioqui se ipsum primum accusaret7: "St Paul saith, 'Knowledge puffeth up the mind;' not for that he found fault with the true knowledge of God; otherwise he should first of all others have reproved himself;" for he was learned. And St Chrysostom saith: Hoc omnium malorum causa est, quod scripturæ igno-Chrysost. in Epist. ad Col. Hom. 9. rantur8: "This is the cause of all ill, that the scriptures are not known." But they that read the scriptures despise such superstitious orders and

idolatrous deformities as have been used, which M. Harding calleth the milk and simplicity of the church. Verily, and they that see the light despise the darkness; and they that know the truth despise falsehood? St Paul, after he once understood Christ, despised all that he had been trained in before as filth and dung. And therefore he saith: "When I was a child, I spake as a child, and had understanding as a child; but, after that I once became a man, I

Lib. 1. Indict. 1x. Ad Theoctist. Epist. v. Tom. II. col. 491; where ad seculum sum reductus in qua.] [2 Id. ibid. ad Anastas. Patr. Ant. Epist. xxvi. col. 516. See also ad eund. Epist. vii. col. 494.] <sup>3</sup> Business, 1565, 1609.] [4 The whole chapter referred to is an argument for what is here asserted; but see particularly Alb. Pigh. Hierarch. Eccles. Col. 1538. Lib. vr. cap. xiii. foll. 248, 9, 51. In the leaf last cited Pighius declares: Ab ejus [apostolicæ sedis] judicio nullam provocationem cadere, etiam ad quæcunque concilia, nec posse etiam ab orbe universo ejus retractari sententiam.]

[1 Gregor. Magni Papæ I. Op. Par. 1705. Epist.

<sup>[5</sup> Hieron. Op. Par. 1693-1706. Comm. in Epist. ad Tit. cap. i. Tom. IV. Pars 1. cols. 418, 9.] [6 August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. In Psalm. cxxx.

Enarr. 12. Tom. IV. col. 1468; where quia humiles, dimittunt, putantes quia, superbi erunt, and reprehendit scriptura.]

<sup>[7</sup> Iren. Op. Par. 1710. Contr. Hær. Lib. 11. cap. xxvi. 1. p. 154; where Paulus clamavit, quia veram, and alioquin.] [8 Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. In Epist. ad Cor.

cap. iii. Hom. ix. Tom. XI. p. 391.] [\* Falsehead, 1565.]

avoided (and despised) the things that pertained to a child." Whoso despiseth superstition and idolatry despiseth the things that should be despised; and in consideration of the dangers he hath escaped he saith with the prophet David:

Anima nostra, sicut passer, erepta est de laqueo venantium: "Our soul is delivered Psal. exxiv. as a sparrow from the snares of hunters 10."

Touching that danger that is here surmised, undoubtedly the knowledge of God inflameth not nor bloweth up the heart, but rather cooleth it and maketh it humble. And for that cause God said unto Moses: "Let the king read this Deut. xvii. law all the days of his life, that he may learn to fear the Lord his God," &c.; et ne elevetur cor ejus in superbiam, "and that his mind be not blown up with pride." For the nature and force of God's word is to turn the heart: Lex Domini Psal xix. convertens animas. Therefore Cyrillus saith: "Young men that use to read contr.Julian. God's word funt postea religiosissimi11, afterward become (not proud or disdainful, but) most virtuous and godly." So Theodoretus saith unto the emperor Jovinian: "The knowledge of heavenly things is behoveful for a godly prince. For so shall your heart be (not puffed up with pride, but) truly and indeed in the hand of God12." Likewise St Augustine saith: Lectio assidua purificat omnia, August. &c. [Et] qui vult cum Deo semper esse, semper debet orare et legere 13: "Continual de Temp. Serm. 1. reading cleareth and purgeth all things. Whoso will ever be with God must evermore pray and read." Therefore Chrysostom saith: Fieri non potest, ut qui Chrysost in jugiter cœlestis doctrinæ verba excipit nihil patiatur 14: "It cannot possibly be 2 ad Tim. 5. but the man that continually receiveth the words of the heavenly doctrine must of force be moved," and feel somewhat in his heart.

## M. HARDING. THE NINTH DIVISION.

The dangers and hurts which the common people's reading of the scriptures in their own language bringeth, after the opinion of those that reprove the same, be great, sundry, and many. I will here as it were but touch a few of them, leaving the whole matter itself to the judgment of the church. First, seeing the poison of heretics doth most infect the common people, and all heretics draw their venom out of the bible, under pretence of God's word; it is not thought good by these men to let every curious and busy body of the vulgar sort to read and examine Curious busy the bible in their common language. \*Yet they would not the learned, discreet, vulgar sort.

A contradiction. For how can the

Again, if heresy spring of wrong understanding, not of the scriptures how can the sober layman (as Hilarius saith, "heresy is of understanding, not of scripture; and the scriptures, if seemse, not the word, is a crime" 15), who shall sooner fall to 16 heresy than the common they be not translated into his barbarous welgar to believe, that the unlearned people should understand that which the best-learned tongue?

The Trinitate, Again, if heresy spring of wrong understanding, not of the scriptures how can the sober layman read the scripture; if they be not translated into his barbarous vulgar to believe, that the unlearned people should understand that which the best-learned tongue?

The Trinitate, Again, if heresy spring of wrong understanding, not of the scriptures how can the sober layman read the scripture; if they be not they be n

## THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

O what dangerous cases here are imagined, and all to fray the people from God's word! If the ignorant read the scriptures, saith M. Harding, they will prove heretics. For heretics suck their venom out of the scriptures. The conclusion hereof is this: Every of the people may safely read M. Harding's word; but God's word they may not read. There is no manner danger in M. Harding's book; but God's book is full of dangers. The reason hereof it is hard to guess, unless it be for that God's book is full of truth, and M. Harding's book is full of error.

[10 The hunters, 1565, 1609.]

[11 Cyril. Alex. Op. Lut. 1638. Contr. Julian, Lib.

VII. Tom. VI. p. 234.]

est: et sensus, non sermo fit crimen.—Hilar. Op. Par. 1693. De Trin. Lib. 11. 3. col. 789.]

[16 Into, H. A. 1564.]

<sup>[18</sup> This address is recorded by Theodoret in his history; but it is the commencement of a letter written by Athanasius. Πρέπουσα θεοφιλεῖ βασιλεῖ φιλομαθής προαίρεσις και πόθος τῶν οὐρανίων οὐτω γαρ ἀληθῶς καὶ τὴν καρδίαν ἔξεις ἐν χειρὶ Θεοῦ.—Athanas. Op. Par. 1698. Ad Jovian. De Fid. 1. Tom. I. Pars II. p. 780. Conf. Theodor. in Hist. Eccles. Script. Amst. 1695-1700. Lib. IV. cap. iii. p. 153.]

<sup>[13</sup> August. Op. Serm. ccciii. 2. Tom.V. Append. col. 508; where frequenter debet. This sermon is not really Augustine's: it would seem to have been taken from Alcuin, Lib. de Virt. et Vit.]

<sup>[14</sup> Οὐ γάρ ἐστιν, οὐκ ἔστι τοσαύτην φιληκοίαν καὶ τοσοῦτον πόθον διαπεσεῖν.—Chrysost. Op. In 11. Epist. ad Tim. cap. ii. Hom. v. Tom. XI. p. 691.]
[15 De intelligentia enim hæresis, non de scriptura

Danger in reading. Acts xxiv.

That he here calleth heresy is the everlasting and manifest truth of God; which, when it was first preached and published by St Paul, was likewise even then called heresy. For thus St Paul answereth in his own defence: Secundum hanc sectam, quam vocant hæresim, colo patrium Deum: "According to this sect, which they call heresy, I worship the God of my fathers."

But if the lay-people, whom M. Harding for his pleasure calleth curious busy-bodies of the vulgar sort, may easily be led into heresies by reading the scriptures, for that they be unlearned; how then happened it that M. Harding himself, being a man so deeply trained in all kind of learning, could so lightly be led into the same? I trow, he was then no curious busy-body. Doubtless he was none of the vulgar sort.

In the primitive church, and long after the apostles' time, there were sundry sects and sorts of heresies, as it is plain by St Augustine, Epiphanius, Theodoretus, and others. Yet, that notwithstanding, the ancient fathers then evermore called upon the people, and exhorted them to read the scriptures, to the intent they might the better avoid heresies. For Irenæus, writing against the heretics Iren Lib iii. called Valentiniani, saith thus: Hac...omnia contulit eis scripturarum...Dei ignorantia1: "All this befell unto them, because they knew not the scriptures." As Christ

also saith unto the Sadducees: Erratis nescientes scripturas: "Ye are deceived

cap. xii.

Matt. xxii.

Hieron. in Epist. ad Ephes. Lib. iii. cap. iv.

Chrysost. ad Heb. Hom. 8.

(not because ye know, but) because ye know not the scriptures." So St Hierome saith: Omni studio legendæ nobis sunt scripturæ,...ut probati trapezitæ sciamus, quis numus probus sit, quis adulter2: "We must read the scriptures with all diligence, that, as being good exchangers, we may know the lawful coin from the copper." So Chrysostom: Manichæi et omnes hæreses decipiunt simplices. si habuerimus sensus animæ exercitatos ad discretionem boni et mali, poterimus hujusmodi discernere. Quomodo autem fiunt sensus nostri exercitati? Ex usu scripturarum, et frequenti auditione3: "The Manichees and all heresies deceive the simple. But, if we have the senses of our minds practised to discern good and ill, we may be able to discern them. But how may our senses become practised? By the use of the scriptures, and often hearing." Likewise saith Theophylact: Illis, qui scrutantur divinas scripturas, nihil potest illudere. Illæ enim sunt lucerna, qua fur deprehenditur4: "Nothing can deceive them that search the holy scriptures. For that is the candle whereby the thief is espied." judgment had the old catholic fathers of reading the holy word of God. that a blind man can better avoid dangers than he that seeth, or that a naked man in the midst of his enemies can better acquit himself than he that is armed, it seemeth a very unsensible and an unlikely doctrine.

Theophyl.

#### M. HARDING. THE TENTH DIVISION 5.

Whereas Luther would the scriptures to be translated into every vulgar tongue, for that they be light and easy to understand, he is confuted by the scripture itself. For both St Peter and also St Paul acknowledgeth in them to be great difficulties, by occasion whereof some misconstrue them to their own damnation; 2 Pet. iii. some understand not what things they speak, nor of what things they affirm; 1 Tim. i. and to some the gospel that St Paul preached is hidden, even to them which 2 cor. iv. perish. If the scriptures were plain, how erred Arius? how Macedonius? how Eunomius? how Nestorius? how many more, men of great learning? specially seeing they all took occasion of their errors of the scriptures on trightly understanded?

Luther saith that St Hierome was overseen in the understanding of the scripture, that St Augustine erred in the same, that St Ambrose, Cyprian, Hilary, Basil, and Chrysostom, the best-learned doctors of Christ's church, were oftentimes deceived. And yet in the preface of his book, De Captivitate Babylonica, he speaketh of them very honourably, and granteth that they have laboured in the Lord's vineyard worthily,

<sup>[1</sup> Iren. Op. Par. 1710. Contr. Hær. Lib. 111. cap. xii. 12. p. 198.]

<sup>[2</sup> Hieron. Op. Par. 1693-1706. Comm. Lib. 111. in Epist. ad Ephes. cap. iv. Tom. III. Pars 1. col. 378; where scripturæ sunt.]

<sup>[3</sup> Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. In Epist. ad Hebr. cap. v. Hom. viii. Tom. XII. pp. 88, 9.]

<sup>[4</sup> Theophyl. Op. Venet. 1754-63. In Luc. Comm. cap. xvi. Tom. I. p. 421.]

<sup>[5</sup> Harding here does little more than copy from Alfonso de Castro. See Alfons. de Castr. adv. Omn. Hær. Col. 1539. Lib. 1. cap. xiii. fol. 28.]

<sup>[6</sup> Scripture, 1565, and H. A. 1564.]

and that they have employed great diligence in opening the scriptures. If these, Scripture's being of so excellent learning, after long exercise in the holy letters, after long study hard. and watch, after long and fervent prayer, after mortification of themselves, and purgation of carnal affections, were deceived, as he witnesseth; how can he say they are clear, plain, and easy to be understanded? And if these worthy fathers were deceived in one point or two, is it not likely the common people may be deceived in many; specially their diligence and study not being comparable to theirs, and their lives not being such as the cleanness of their inward affects might lighten their understanding, and the anointing of God might teach them?

### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Certain places in the scriptures have evermore been judged dark, both for many other causes, and also for the matter itself, and for the deep mysteries therein contained; which thing D. Luther also hath confessed in sundry places. But unto them that have eyes and cannot see, and delight more in darkness John xii. than in the light, the sun-beams may seem dark. The prophet Osee saith: Rom. xi. Rectæ viæ Domini; prævaricatores autem corruent in eis: "The ways of the Lord Hos. xiv. be straight; but the wicked shall fall in them." Therefore Cyrillus saith: Ea, Cyril. in quæ perspicua sunt, difficilia fiunt hæreticis? "The things, that of themselves of themselves in the straight in the perspicua sunt, difficilia fiunt hæreticis?" "The things, that of themselves in the straight in are plain, unto heretics are made dark."

But in these cases the Spirit of God is bound neither to sharpness of wit nor to abundance of learning. Oftentimes the unlearned seeth that thing that the learned cannot see. Christ saith: "I thank thee, O Father, the Lord of Matt. xi. heaven and earth, for that thou hast hidden these things from the wise and the politic, and hast revealed the same unto the little ones." Therefore Epiphanius saith: Solis Spiritus sancti filiis facilis est omnis scriptura et dilucida 11: "Only to Epiph. the children of the Holy Ghost all the holy scriptures are plain and clear."

Hereof M. Harding seemeth to conclude thus: There be certain dark places in the scriptures; ergo, the scriptures are full of darkness. This is a guileful kind of reasoning, known unto children, called fallacia a secundum quid ad simpliciter. In like form of argument he might have said: Albertus Pighius Alb. Pigh. in Priv. Miss. granteth there be certain errors in the mass 12; ergo, the mass is full of errors. Or thus: The cardinals themselves confess there be certain abuses in the In Conc. church of Rome 13; ergo, the church of Rome is full of abuses. Certainly, cardinal. notwithstanding a few certain places in the holy scriptures be obscure, yet generally "the scriptures are a candle to guide our feet;" generally "God's com-Past exix. mandment is light, and lighteneth the eyes;" and therefore generally the word of Psal. xix. God is full of comfort. Therefore Chrysostom saith: Omnia clara et plana sunt chrysost. in \* scripturis divinis: quæcunque necessaria sunt manifesta sunt 14: "All things 2 Thess. 3. are clear and plain in the holy scriptures. Whatsoever thing there is necessary for us is also manifest." So saith Clemens Alexandrinus: Audite qui estis longe: Clem. Alex. audite, qui prope: nullis celatum est verbum. Lux est communis: omnibus illucescit Adhort. ad hominibus: nullis 15 est in verbo Cimmerius 16: "Hearken, ye that be far off: hearken, ye that be near. The word of God is hid from no man: it is a light common unto all men: there is no darkness in God's word." So Irenæus: Scripturæ...in Iren. Lib. i.

> μενα, άγνωστα δὲ τοῖς μὴ εἰληφόσι Πνεύματος άγίου δωρεάν και χάριν. - Epiph. Op. Par. 1622. Lib. 11. Hær. lxix. 43. Tom. I. p. 766. Also... οράτε ...υίοι τῆς ἀγίας τοῦ Θεοῦ ἐκκλησίας, και ὀρθοδόξου πίστεως, ὅτι οὐδὲν ἐν τῆ θεία γραφῆ σκολιὸν, κ. τ. λ.—Ibid. 60. p. 787.]

> [18 Alb. Pigh. Explic. Cathol. Contr. Par. 1586. De Miss. Priv. Controv. v1. fol. 123. 2. See before, page 7. [13 Concil. Delect. Cardinal. in Crabb. Concil.

Col. Agrip. 1551. Tom. III. pp. 819, &c.]

[14 Chrysost. Op. In 11. Epist. ad Thessal. cap. ii. Hom. iii. Tom. XI. p. 528.] [15 Nullus, 1565.]

16 Clement. Alex. Op. Oxon. 1715. Cohort. ad Gent. 9. Tom. I. p. 72.]

<sup>[7</sup> Luther. Op. Witeb. 1552, &c. De Captiv. Babyl. In several parts of this treatise Luther refers to and speaks with respect of the fathers. See especially Tom. II. foll. 66, 7.]

<sup>[\*</sup> Scriptures, 1565.]

There is some error here; as there are not 14 books of Cyril upon John: the passage meant is probably the following: Σκληρά πως έστι τοις άσυperous del τα σοφά. - Cyril. Alex. Op. Lut. 1638. In Joan. Evang. Lib. Iv. cap. iii. Tom. IV. 380. Conf. Op. Insig. Cyril. in Evang. Joan. Par. 1508. Lib. Iv. cap. xiii. fol. 94. 2.]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> [10 Themself, 1565.]

The reference to Epiphanius is not precise: probably the following passage may be that intended: Αλλά ίστι θεία τα ρήματα Πνεύματι άγίφ λεγό-

Hom. 9.

Hieron. in Psal. Ixxxvi.

Pulgent. in Serm. de

Gregor. in Epist. ad Leandr.

aperto [sunt] et sine ambiguitate; et similiter ab omnibus audiri possunt1: "The scriptures are plain and without doubtfulness, and may be heard indifferently of Orig in Exod. all men." So the old father Origen: Clausum est negligentibus; invenitur autem a quærentibus, et pulsantibus2: "It is shut from the negligent; but it is opened unto them that seek and knock for it." So St Hierome: Dominus...per evangelium suum loquutus est, non ut pauci intelligerent, sed ut omnes3: "The Lord hath spoken by his gospel; not that a few should understand him, but that all." saith Fulgentius: In scripturis divinis abundat, et quod robustus comedat, et quod parvulus sugat4: "In the scriptures of God there is plenty sufficient both for the strong to eat, and also for the little one to suck." To be short, so St Gregory saith: Est flumen,...in quo...agnus ambulet, et elephas natet5: "It is a flood, wherein the little lamb may wade, and the great elephant may swim."

Thus, notwithstanding certain clauses and sentences in the holy scriptures be hard and dark, yet by these holy fathers' judgments the scriptures generally are easy and clear.

But M. Harding upon a false position maketh up the like conclusion. thus he saith: The scriptures are dark; therefore the people may not read them. Verily, as he would violently take the scriptures from the simple, because, as he saith, they understand them not; so by the same force he may take the scriptures from all the old doctors and learned fathers, because, as it appeareth by their dissension, and by M. Harding's own confession, they understood them not.

#### M. HARDING. THE ELEVENTH DIVISION.

And, lest all the unlearned lay-people should seem hereby utterly rejected from hope of understanding God's word without teaching of others, it may be granted, that it is not impossible a man (be he never so unlearned) exercised in long prayer, accustomed to fervent contemplation, being brought by God into his inward cellars, may from thence obtain the true understanding and interpretation of the holy scriptures, no less than any other always brought up in learning. what sort St Antony, that holy and perfect man, the eremite of Egypt, was: who, as St Augustine writeth, without any knowledge of letters, both bros de Doctriconned<sup>7</sup> the scriptures by heart with hearing, and understood them wisely with thinking8. And that holy man whom St Gregory speaketh of, who, lying bedrid many years for sickness of body, through earnest prayer and devout meditation obtained health of mind and understanding of the scriptures, never having learned letters; so as he was able to expound them to those that came to visit him, who, coming unto him with pretence to bring comfort, through his heavenly knowledge received comfort. But among the people, how great number is there of lewd losels, gluttons, and drunkards, whose belly is their god, who follow their unruly lusts? Is it to be thought this sort of persons may, without meditation and exercise of prayer, pierce the understanding of the scriptures, and of those holy mysteries which God hath hidden (as Christ confesseth) from the learned and [1564.] wise men—and opened unto little ones?

### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

M. Harding alloweth these, whom he calleth curious busy-bodies of the vulgar sort, to attain to the understanding of God's word, not by reading, but only by

[1 Iren. Op. Contr. Hær. Lib. 11. cap. xxvii. 2. p. 155; where possint.]

[2 ...apostolus...aperit pauca de multis: ut clausum sit quiden negligentibus, inveniatur autem a pulsantibus, et quærentibus aperiatur. - Orig. Op. Par. 1733-59. In Exod. Hom. ix. 1. Tom. II. p. 162.]

<sup>3</sup> Hieron, Op. Par. 1693-1706. Breviar, in Psalt. Psalm. lxxxvi. Tom. II. Append. col. 350; where evangelia sua.]

[4 ... in verbo Dei abundet quod perfectus comedat, abundet etiam quod parvulus sugat .- Fulgent. Op. Par. 1623. Serm. de Confess. col. 484.]

[5 Gregor, Magni Papæ I. Op. Par. 1705. Ad Leandr. Epist. cap. iv. Præf. Expos. B. Job. Tom. I.

cols. 5, 6; where fluvius. See before, page 331.] [6 This reference is not in H.A. 1564. It appears. in H.A. 1565.]

[7 Canned, 1565, and H. A. 1564.]

[8 ... ab Antonio sancto et perfecto viro Ægyptio monacho...qui sine ulla scientia litterarum scripturas divinas et memoriter audiendo tenuisse, et prudenter cogitando intellexisse prædicatur; aut ab illo servo barbaro christiano...qui litteras quoque ipsas, nullo docente homine, in plenam notitiam orando ut sibi revelarentur, accepit, triduanis precibus impetrans ut etiam codicem oblatum, stupentibus qui aderant, legendo percurreret. — August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. De Doctr. Christ. Prolog. 4. Tom. III. Pars 1. col. 3.]

special revelation and miracle, and none otherwise; and that, within the space of a thousand years, one or two only, and no more. For so St Antony attained August in unto the knowledge thereof, utterly without any book, or reading, or any other book christ. help of understanding<sup>9</sup>. So that sick man lying bed-rid, of whom St Gregory maketh that worthy mention. So that barbarous and utterly unlearned slave, August in that suddenly by revelation was taught to read?. And so likewise perhaps M. eod. Prolog. Harding himself, being so long a time and so earnest a preacher of the same gospel and truth of God that he now so wilfully condemneth, without either book, or reading, or other conference, only upon the change of the prince, and none otherwise, understood that thing that before he could not understand, and by miracle and revelation upon the sudden was wholly altered unto the contrary.

True it is, flesh and blood is not able to understand the holy will of God Matt. xvi. without special revelation: therefore Christ gave thanks unto his Father, "for Matt. xi. that he had revealed his secrets unto the little ones," and likewise "opened Luke xxiv. the hearts of his disciples, that they might understand the scriptures." Without this special help and prompting of God's holy Spirit, the word of God is unto the reader, be he never so wise or well-learned, as the vision of a sealed book. But this revelation is not special unto one or two, but general to all them that be the members of Christ, and are endued with the Spirit of God. St Chrysostom saith generally unto all the people: Audite, quotquot estis mundani, chrysost in et uxoribus præestis ac liberis, quemadmodum vobis apostolus Paulus præcipiat Hom. 9. legere scripturas, idque non simpliciter, neque obiter, sed magna cum diligentia 10: "Hearken, all ye men of the world, that have wives and children, how St Paul The people commanded the apostle of Christ commandeth you to read the scriptures, and that not by slightly, or as by the way, but with great diligence." Again he saith: Domi scriptures. biblia in manus sumite:...domi vacemus divinarum scripturarum lectioni 11: "Take Gen. Hom. 29. the bible into your hands in your houses at home. At home in our houses let

us apply the reading of holy 12 scriptures." So likewise saith St Hierome: Hic Hieron in Epistad Col.

The bible into your hands in your houses at home. At home in our houses let

Use the bible into your hands in your houses at home. At home in our houses let

Epistad Col.

Epistad Col.

Epistad Col.

Epistad Col. - Ostenditur, verbum Christi, non sufficienter, sed abundanter etiam laicos habere cap. iii. debere, et docere se invicem, vel monere13: "Here we are taught, that the laypeople ought to have the word of God, not only sufficiently, but also with abun-\* dance, and to teach and counsel others."

. But amongst these busy-bodies of the vulgar sort M. Harding findeth a great number of losels, gluttons, and drunkards, whose belly is their god. he nameth the part; but he meaneth the whole. For even so writeth Hosius, one of the chief of that company: Non est consilium in vulgo, non ratio, non Hos. Lib. ii. discrimen 14: "In this vulgar sort there is neither counsel, nor reason, nor discre-contr. Brent. And further 15, he calleth the flock of Christ belluam multorum capitum 16, "a wild beast of many heads;" as M. Harding also a little before calleth them In the seventh swine; and others call them filthy dogs. Even so the Pharisees judged and spake of the simple people that followed Christ: Turba ista, que non novit legem, maledicti sunt: "These rabbles of rascals, that (are unlearned and) know not John vii. the law, are accursed." In such regard they have them whom St Paul calleth cives sanctorum et domesticos Dei; "citizens with the saints, and of the house-Eph. iihold of God."

If looseness of life be a just cause to banish the people from the word of God, it is commonly thought that the cardinals and priests in Rome live as loosely as any others. St Bernard of the priests of his time writeth thus: Non est jam Bernard in dicere, Ut populus, sic sacerdos: quia nec sic populus, ut sacerdos 18: "We may not Conv. Paul. now say, As is the people, so is the priest. For the people is not so wicked as

```
[ See before, note 8.]
   [10 Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. In Epist. ad
Coloss. cap. iii. Hom. ix. Tom. XI. p. 390.]
```

<sup>[14</sup> Id.in cap. ix. Gen. Hom. xxix. Tom. IV. p. 281.] [18 The holy, 1565.]

<sup>[18</sup> Hieron. Op. Comm. in Epist. ad Coloss. cap. iii. Tom. V. col. 1074.]

<sup>[14 ...</sup> non est in vulgo consilium, non ratio, non .

disciplina, non diligentia.-Hos. Op. Col. 1584. De Legit. Jud. Rer. Eccles. Lib. 11. Tom. I. p. 457.]

<sup>[15</sup> Farther, 1565.]

<sup>[16</sup> Et ex hujus tu beluæ multorum capitum judicio pendere principes potius vis, &c. ?-Id. ibid.]

<sup>[17</sup> In the sixth division, 1565.]

<sup>[18</sup> Bernard. Op. Par. 1690. In Conv. S. Paul. Serm. i. 3. Vol. I. Tom. 111. col. 956.]

is the priest." Therefore, by M. Harding's judgment, the priests ought no less to be banished from God's word than the rest of the people.

#### M. HARDING. THE TWELFTH DIVISION.

And whereas learned men of our time be divided into contrary sects, and write bitterly one against another, each one imputing to other mistaking of the scriptures; if amongst them, who would seem to be the leaders of the divided into people, be controversies and debates about the understanding of the scriptures, how may the common people be thought to be in safe case out of all danger of errors, if by reading the bible in their own tongue they take the matter in hand?

If any man think I slander them, for that I say they be divided into contrary sects, let him understand their own countrymen (I mean them of Germany, and special setters forth of this new doctrine) report it in their books, and complain lamentably of it. Namely, Nicolaus Amsdorffius, in his book intituled Publica Confessio puræ doctrinæ Evangelii, &c. Also Nicolaus Gallus, in his book of Theses and Hypotyposes; who acknowledgeth the strifes and debates that be amongst them to be not of light matters, but of high articles of christian doctrine. even so be his words in Latin: Non sunt leves inter nos concertationes de rebus levibus, sed de sublimibus doctrinæ christianæ articulis, de lege et evangelio, The same man, in the last leaf of his foresaid book, with great vehemency reporteth: Hæreses permultas esse præ manibus, plerasque etiamnum hærere in calamo: "that very many heresies be already in hand, and many as yet stick in the pen;" as though he meant they were ready to be set forth.

Of late there have been put forth in print two great books, one by the princes of Saxony, the other by the earls of Mansfield, chief maintainers of the Lutherans, in which be recited eleven sects, and the same as detestable heresies condemned: they are contained in this catalogue or roll: Anabaptistæ, Servetiani, Stancariani<sup>2</sup>, Antinomi, Jesuitæ, Osiandriani, Melanchthonici, Majoristæ, Adiaphoristæ, Suencfeldiani, Sacramentarii. Albeit the Jesuits have wrong to be numbered among them. Thus 3 much is confessed of the sects and controversies of our new gospellers by their own princes, that stand in defence of the confession of

Auspurge, and by two of the Lutheran superintendents4.

No man hath so exactly declared to the world the number and diversity of the sects of our time which hath sprung out of Martin Luther, as Fridericus Staphylus, a man of excellent learning, one of the emperor's council that now is; who might well have knowledge herein, forasmuch as he was a diligent student ten years at Wittenberg among the chief doctors of them, and for that time was of their opinion, and afterward by consideration of their manifold disagreeings and contentions within themselves induced to discredit them, and through the grace of God reduced to a whole mind, and to the catholic faith, and now remaineth a perfect member of the church. This learned man in his apology sheweth, that out of Luther have sprung three divers heresies or sects; the (208) anabaptists, the sacramentaries, and the confessionists, who made confession of their faith in open diet, before the emperor Charles, the princes, and states of Germany at Auspurge, anno Domini 1530, and for Protestants. baptists sprang not of protestation of the same there are called protestants. Now he proveth farther by Luther, but testimony of their own writings, that the anabaptists be divided into six sects; were reproved (200)

The two hundred and eighth un-For the ana-(209) the sacramentaries into eight sects; (209) the confessionists, and they which and conproperly are called protestants, into twenty sects, every one having his Luther. The two hundred and proper and particular name to be called and known by?. ninth un-truth, inlamentable division of learned men into so many sects in the countries flamed with where the gospel (as they call it) hath these forty years, and is yet most basely's

slander

A vile

renegade.

[ Out, H.A. 1564.]

[3 This, 1565, and H. A. 1564.]

<sup>[2</sup> H. A. 1564, omits Stancariani. The word is found in H. A. 1565.]

<sup>[4</sup> All that is here said, together with the quotations, may be found almost literally in Staphylus. See F. Staph. Apol. Col. 1562. Pars III. De Luter. Concord. foll. 136, 140-2. Conf. the English transla-

tion by Stapleton, Antw. 1565. foll. 78, 80, 1.]

<sup>[5</sup> H.A. 1564, omits out. It appears in H.A. 1565.]

<sup>[6</sup> Further, H.A. 1564.]

<sup>[7</sup> F. Staph. Apol. Geneal. sen Post. M. Luter. foll. 173, &c. Staphylus professes to reckon up more sects than are here mentioned.]

<sup>[8</sup> Busely, 1565, and H. A. 1564.]

handled, may be a warning to the governors of Christendom, that they take good advisement how they suffer the rude and rash people to have the scriptures common in their own tongue.

#### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Here M. Harding, by the help of one Staphylus, a shameless renegade, hath made a long discourse of such differences in doctrine as he imagineth to be among them that profess the gospel. And, indeed, as the imperfection and want that is in man is naturally inclined unto some division, and that oftentimes in such cases wherein ought to be greatest unity; even so the heretics and the enemies of the truth have evermore used to take hold thereof, the more to discredit and to deprave the whole. At the first preaching of the gospel by the apostles of Christ and other holy fathers, there grew up immediately with the same sundry sorts of sccts, to the number of fourscore and ten, as they are reckoned in particular by St Augustine<sup>9</sup>, all flowing out of one spring, all pro-August ad Quodyultd. fessing one gospel, and all known by the name of Christ.

Yea, sometimes the very lights of the world, and the pillars of the church, seemed to be divided by some dissension amongst themselves; St Peter from Gal. ii. St Paul, St Paul from Barnabas, St Cyprian from Cornelius, St Augustine from Acts xv. St Hierome, St Chrysostom from Epiphanius, the east part of the world from the west, doctors from doctors, fathers from fathers, church from church, and saints from saints. And hereof the heretics in old time, and other sworn enemies of God, took occasion, as M. Harding now doth, to deface the whole profession of the gospel, calling it a puddle and a sink of dissension. For these causes the heathens laughed at the Christians, and pointed at them in the market-places socrat, Lib. i. with their fingers 10. So the renegade Julianus the emperor, the better to cloke cap. vi. his own infidelity, said that Peter and Paul could not agree, Luke and Matthew dissented in Christ's genealogy; and that therefore the whole gospel of Christ socrat Lib. was nothing else but error 11.

Oftentimes of malice against God they feigned dissension to be where as none was. So Marcion the renegade devised a great book of contrarieties between Tertul. contrarieties the new testament and the old 12. The false apostles said that St Paul dissented of deinceps. from all the rest of his brethren, and oftentimes from himself. Even so, and with like truth, M. Harding seemeth now to charge the gospel of Christ with like dissension, following therein both the example and doctrine of Staphylus the renegade, that hath wilfully forsaken Christ, and is returned again to his old 2 Pet. ii. vomit. And being able so sharply to behold how some one man hath in some case dissented from another, yet is he not able to see how much he himself hath dissented from himself.

But, having this eloquence and skill so largely to amplify these small quarrels of so little weight, what would he have been able to do if it 13 had been in the primitive church, and had seen all those hot and troublesome dissensions that then were able to shake the world? What clouds and colours might he then have cast, to scorn at Christ, and to bring his gospel out of credit?

Doubtless, as he saith now all these diversities spring only from Doctor Luther, so would he then have said, all these former diversities and sundry forms of heresies sprang only from Christ. And hereof he would have concluded, as he doth now, that the rude and rash people should in no wise be suffered to read the scriptures.

Howbeit, touching these thirty-four several sects that Staphylus by his inquisition and cunning hath found out in Germany, it must needs be confessed they are marvellous poor and very simple sects. For in that whole country, where they are supposed to dwell, they have neither name to be known by, two or three

<sup>[</sup> Augustine enumerates 88 heresies .- August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. Ad Quodvultd. Lib. de Hær. Tom. VIII. cols. 4, 5. But in some copies two or three more are added.—Ibid. cols. 27, 8. apud not.] [10 Socrat. in Hist. Eccles. Script. Amst. 1695-1700. Lib. 1. cap. vi. p. 12.]

<sup>[11</sup> Id. ibid. Lib. 111. cap. xxiii. pp. 161, &c. This chapter is a confutation of what Libanius had said in praise of Julian. See also before, page 532, notes 6, 7.] [18 Tertull. Op. Lut. 1641. Adv. Marcion, Lib. 1.

<sup>19. &</sup>amp;c. Lib. IV. 1, &c. pp. 443, &c., 501, &c. [13 He, 1565.]

sion.

only excepted, nor church to teach in, nor house to dwell in. But Staphylus may have leave to speak untruth, for that he hath not yet learned to speak otherwise.

Hereof M. Harding may conclude thus: The learned sometimes mistake the scriptures, and are deceived; ergo, the learned ought to be banished from reading the scriptures. For all these fantastical imaginations of opinions and sects pertain only to the learned sort, and nothing to the lay-people.

And that the learned, either through ignorance or through affection, may be misled no less than others, it may easily appear both by all these former examples, and also by these words of God in the book of Exodus: Nec in judicio plurimorum

Exod. xxiii.

acquiesces sententiæ: "In judgment thou shalt not hearken to the mind of the more." Which words Lyra expoundeth thus: Plurimorum, id est, doctorum1: "Of the more, that is to say, of the learned sort."

Acts xvii.

Certainly the learned fathers have evermore thought that, in such perilous times of dissension in judgment, it is most behoveful for the people to have recourse unto the scriptures. When Paul and Silas preached at Berrhæa, the people there daily searched and considered the scriptures, to know whether that they preached were true, or no. Chrysostom, expounding these words, "When ye shall see the abomination of desolation standing in the holy place," writeth

thus: Ideo mandat, ut Christiani ... volentes firmitatem accipere fidei veræ, ad nullam Chrysost, in Op. Imp. Hom. 49. rem fugiant nisi ad scripturas: alioqui, si ad alia respexerint, scandalizabuntur, et peribunt, non intelligentes quæ sit vera ecclesia; et per hoc incident in abominationem desolationis, quæ stat in sanctis ecclesiæ locis2: "Therefore he commandeth that christian men, that will be assured of the true faith, resort unto nothing else but only unto the scriptures: for else, if they have regard to any other thing, they shall be offended, and shall perish, not knowing which is the true church; and by mean thereof they shall fall into the abomination of desolation, that standeth in the holy places of the church." In like sort writeth Origen upon the same

place: Anima [imperita verbi justitia] ... quia facile seducuntur, non possunt

inseducibiliter permanere in conspectu abominationis desolationis stantis in loco

Orig. in Matt. cap. xxiv.

sancto3: "The souls that be unskilful of the word of justice, because they are easily deceived, cannot stand without error in the sight of the abomination of desolation standing in the holy place." St Hierome saith: In adventu Messie.... Hieron in Proph. Nah. cap. iii. populus, qui sub magistris ... fuerat consopitus, ... ibit ad montes scripturarum; ibique invenient montes Mosen, ... montes prophetas, montes novi testamenti. ... Et in talium montium ... lectione versatus, si non invenerit qui ... doceat, ... tamen illius studium comprobabitur, quod confugerint ad montes 1: "At the coming of Christ the people that was laid asleep under their teachers shall go to the mountains of the scriptures: there shall they find these mountains, Moses, the prophets, and the new testament. And, being occupied in the reading of these

Basil. Moral. 26. cap. i. Chrysost. in Matt. Hom.

"The holy scriptures are able both to confirm the godly, and also to confound the ungodly." So Chrysostom: Nec ipsis omnino [ecclesiis] credendum est, nisi ea dicant vel faciant, quæ convenientia sint scripturis6: "We may in no wise believe the churches themselves, unless they say and do such things as be agreeable to the scriptures."

mountains, notwithstanding they find no man to teach them, yet shall their goodwill be well allowed, for that they have fled unto the mountains." So St Basil: Divinæ scripturæ faciunt ad certitudinem bonorum, et ad confusionem malorum<sup>5</sup>:

<sup>[1</sup> Lyra does not appear to use the exact words ascribed to him; but, referring to the Hebrew word rabbim here employed, he says: Item significat idem quod magnos vel magistros: et sic accipitur in secunda parte auctoritatis, &c.-Bibl. cum Gloss. Ord. et Expos. N. de Lyra, Basil. 1502. Exod. xxiii. Pars I.

fol. 171, 2.] [2 Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. Op. Imp. in Matt. Hom. xlix. ex cap. xxiv. Tom. VI. p. cciv.]

<sup>[3</sup> Omnis enim qui lacte alitur, imperitus est verbo justitiæ ... Istæ sunt ergo animæ quæ ... quia facile, &c.-Orig. Op. Far. 1733-59. In Matt. Comm. Ser.

<sup>43.</sup> Tom. III. p. 862.]

<sup>[4</sup> Hieron. Op. Par. 1693-1706. Comm. in Naum Proph. cap. iii. Tom. III. col. 1590; where adventu ergo Christi, inveniet, hujuscemodi montium, tunc et illius, and quia confugerit.] [5 "Οτι δεὶ πᾶν ρημα ή πρᾶγμα πιστοῦσθαι τῆ

μαρτυρία της θεοπνεύστου γραφης είς πληροφορίαν μέν των άγαθων, έντροπήν δέ των πονηρών.-Basil, Op. Par. 1721-30. Moral, Reg. xxvi. Tom. II. p. 256.1 [6 Chrysost. Op. Op. Imp. in Matt. Hom. xlix. ex cap. xxiv. Tom. VI. p. ccix; where sunt.

### M. HARDING. THE THIRTEENTH DIVISION 7.

The peril of it is known by sundry examples both of times past and also of this present age. For out of this root hath sprung the sect of the Valdenses, otherwise called Pauperes de Lugduno. For Valdo, a merchant of Lyons, their first author, of whom they were named Valdenses, being an unlearned layman, procured certain books of the scripture to be translated into his own language, which when he used to read, and understood not, he fell into many errors. Of the same well-spring issued the filthy puddles of the sects called Adamitæ, or Picardi, Bogardi, and Turelupini; and of late years, beside the same sect of Adamites, newly revived, also the anabaptists and Suenckfeldians. Wherefore that edict or proclamation of the worthy princes Ferdinando and Elizabeth, king and queen of Spain, is of many much commended, by which they gave strait commandment, that under great penalties no man should translate the bible into the rulgar Spanish tongue, and that no man should be found to have the same translated in any wise. These and the like be the reasons and considerations which have moved many men to think the setting forth of the whole bible and of every part of the scripture in the vulgar tongue, for all sorts of persons to read without exception or limitation, to be a thing not necessary to salvation, nor otherwise convenient nor profitable, but contrariwise dangerous and hurtful.

#### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

The story of Valdo is here brought in upon the report and credit of friar Alfonsus<sup>8</sup>. Touching which Valdo, whether he were learned or unlearned, it Alphon de forceth not greatly. Origen saith: Vide quam prope periculis sint hi, qui negli- cap. xiii. gunt exerceri in divinis literis: ex quibus solis hujusmodi examinationis agnoscenda Ad Rom. discretio est<sup>9</sup>: "Mark how near unto danger they be that refuse to exercise them-xvi. selves in the scriptures; for thereby only the judgment of this trial must be known." If he were learned, then is this no true report: if he were unlearned, then was God's work so much the greater; who, as St Paul saith, oftentimes 1 cor. i. "chooseth the weak things of the world to condemn the strong, and the foolish things of the world to reprove the wise."

The greatest heresies that he maintained stood in reproving the idolatrous Alphon de worshipping of images; of extreme unction; of exorcisms and conjurations; of Barthol. ear-confessions; of unseemly singing in the church; of feigned miracles; of the Abram Cret. idle and slanderous lives of priests and bishops; of the lives and manners of the Ferrar. church of Rome; of the outrage and tyranny of the pope; of monks, friars, pardons, pilgrimages, and purgatory 10. And, notwithstanding the reproving hereof were then judged heresy, yet sithence that time infinite numbers of godly men have received it as God's undoubted truth, and M. Harding in part hath yielded unto the same.

He added farther: Out of this well-spring of Valdo issued forth the anabaptists and the Swenkfeldians. I marvel M. Harding can either speak so unadvisedly, or so soon forget what he hath spoken. For immediately before he wrote thus: "Out of Luther have sprung three divers heresies, the anabaptists, the sacramentaries, and the confessionists." If the anabaptists sprang out of Valdo, and were so long before Luther, how could they then afterward spring out of Luther? If they sprang first out of Luther, how were they then before Luther? By this report the father is younger than the child, and the child was born before the father. These be mere monsters in speech, and contradictions in nature. the one of these reports be true, the other of necessity must needs be false. But M. Harding taketh it for no great inconvenience, whatsoever may help to deface the truth.

[7 This passage is almost literally from Alfonso de Castro.]

[8 Alfons, de Castr. adv. Omn. Hær. Col. 1539. Lib. 1. cap. xiii. foll. 27, 8.]

[ Orig. Op. Comm. in Epist. ad Rom. Lib. x. cap. xvi. Tom. IV. p. 684; where proximi periculo flant hi qui exerceri in divinis literis negligunt.]

[10 See Alfons, de Castr. adv. Omn. Hær. under

the articles named.

Barthol. Abramus set forth the acts of the Council of Ferrara in Latin. See his letter to the archbishop of Ravenna in Crabb. Concil. Col. Agrip. 1551. Tom. III. pp. 372, 3; in which he mentions purgatory and other matters discussed at the council. Conf. Quæst. de Purg. ibid. pp. 376, 7.]

The proclamation of Ferdinandus and Elizabeth, the kings of Spain, for not translating the bible into the Spanish tongue, as it is of very small authority, being made within these threescore and ten years, that is to say, well near fifteen hundred years after Christ; so it is likely it was first devised, not against the christian people of that country, but only against the renegade Jews there; who, by dissimulation and fear of the law being become Christians, afterward returned again to their old errors, and both by their example, and also by misunderstanding of certain places of the scriptures, hardened and confirmed others in the same 1. Against whom also was devised the Spanish inquisition, and that by the same princes, and at the same time. So Julianus, the renegade emperor, thought it good policy to suffer no christian man's child to be set to school 2. So the wicked princes Antiochus and Maximinus, for like policy, burnt the books of God, to the intent the people should not read them.

Script.
Sozom. Lib.
v. cap. xviii.
l Macc. i.

Fur. Bonon. de Trans.

But the godly and first christened emperor Constantinus caused the bible to be written out, and to be sent abroad into all kingdoms, countries, and cities of his dominion. King Adelstane, the king of England, caused the bible to be translated into the English tongue. St Hierome translated the same into the Sclavon tongue<sup>3</sup>; Ulphilas likewise into the Gotthian tongue. Whereto Socrates addeth also these words: *Instituit barbaros*, ut discerent sacra eloquia<sup>4</sup>: "He gave occasion to the barbarous people of that country to learn the scriptures."

Alphons, de Hær. Lib. i. cap. xiii.

Socrat. Lib. iv. cap. xxxiii.

### M. HARDING. THE FOURTEENTH DIVISION.

Yet it is not meant by them that the people be kept wholly from the scripture, so as they read no part of it at all. As the whole, in their opinion, is too strong a meat for their weak stomachs; so much of it they may right wholesomely receive and brook, as that which pertaineth to piety and necessary know-the scriptures ledge of a christian man. Wherein they would the examples of the old the people to holy fathers to be followed. St Augustine hath gathered together into one book all that maketh for good life out of the scriptures, which book he intituled Speculum<sup>6</sup>; that is to say, a mirror or a looking-glass, as Possidonius witnesseth in his life. St Basil hath set forth the like argument almost, in his fourscore moral rules pertaining altogether to good manners. St Cyprian also hath done the like in his three books Ad Quirinum. Such godly books they think to be very profitable for the simple people to read.

## THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Here M. Harding alloweth the people to read the scriptures; howbeit, not what they list, but with restraint, and at delivery; that is to say, not cases of question, or pertaining to knowledge, but only matters belonging to manners and order of life. And so he reserveth knowledge to himself and his brethren, and leaveth good life unto the people. Touching the books of St Augustine, St Basil, and St Cyprian, it is untrue that they were written namely and purposely for the unlearned: or if they were, why are they not translated? why are they not delivered unto the people, for whose sakes they were written?

Moreover, it is untrue that in these books is contained only matter of life and manners, and nothing pertaining to religion. For the first words in this

<sup>[</sup>¹ Fuit... versa sacra scriptura in Valentinam linguam: et...iterum iisdem literis elegantius multo impressa: quam populo interdixit Inquisitorum (quos vocant) societas et ordo hoc nomine, quod Judæis aliquot, qui de centum et viginti millibus ex Hispania exactorum supererant, dicerent, se intelligere, ipsos ritus, cærimonias, et sacrificandi genus ab ipsis bibliis desumere. Itaque ita vetitum est eam legi, ut iis qui originem nullam a Judæis haberent, legi liceret, aliis non item.—Frid. Fur. Cær. Valent. Bonon. Basil. 1556. pp. 111, 2.]

<sup>[&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Sozom. in Hist. Eccles. Script. Amst. 1695-1700. Lib. v. cap. xviii. p. 506.]

<sup>[3</sup> Alfons. de Castr. adv. Omn. Hær. Col. 1539. Lib. 1. cap. xiii. fol. 28, 2.]

<sup>[4</sup> Socrat. in Hist. Eccles. Script. Lib. Iv. cap. xxxiii. p. 206.]

<sup>[5</sup> Into to one, H.A. 1564. H.A. 1565 omits the to.]

<sup>[6</sup> August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. Tom. III. Pars 1-cols. 681-818.]

<sup>[7</sup> Id. August. Vit. Auct. Possid. cap. xxviii.
Tom. X. Post-Append. col. 277.]
[8 Basil. Op. Par. 1721-30. Tom. II. pp. 234-

<sup>318.]
[9</sup> Cypr. Op. Oxon. 1682. pp. 17-91.]

book of St Augustine called Speculum are these: Non facies tibi sculptile 10: "Thou shalt make to thyself 11 no graven image;" which is now a special case of religion. And the greatest part of St Cyprian's book Ad Quirinum containeth a full disputation of Christ's incarnation, nativity, and passion, and other like cases of religion against the Jews. Touching St Basil, as he wrote this book of morals concerning manners, so he had written another book before concerning faith, and both these books for the people. He maketh his entry into his morals with these words: Cum de sana fide in præcedentibus sufficienter ad præsens dictum esse putemus, &c.12: "Forasmuch as I think I have entreated sufficiently in my former books concerning faith, &c." Therefore this assertion was untrue, and so no firm ground for M. Harding to stand upon. Neither did any of the old fathers ever withdraw the people from the universal and free reading of God's word, and restrain them only to such short collections. St Basil saith: "The scriptures are Basil in like unto a shop full of medicines for the soul, where as every man may freely take, not only one kind of salve, but also a special and a peculiar remedy for every sore 13." And Irenæus saith: De omni ligno paradisi manducate; id est, ab Iren Lib. v. omni scriptura divina manducate 14: " Eat ye of all the fruit of paradise; that is to say, eat ye (not only of matters concerning manners, but also) of every part of the holy scriptures." Howbeit, by M. Harding's judgment, the people may learn the ten commandments, but may not meddle with their creed.

#### M. HARDING. THE FIFTEENTH DIVISION.

But how much and what part 15 of the scripture the common people may read for their comfort and necessary instruction, and by whom the same may be translated, it belongeth to the judgment of the church; which church hath already condemned all the rulgar translations of the bible of late years, (210) for that The two they be found in sundry places erroneous and partial in favour of the heresies tenth unwhich the translators maintain. And it hath not only in our time condemned only of dethese late translations, but also hitherto never allowed those few of old time; I mean shander. St Hierome's translation into the Dalmatical tongue, if ever any such was by him made, as to some it seemeth a thing not sufficiently proved; and that which, before St Hierome, Ulphilas an Arian bishop made, and commended to the nation of the Goths, who first invented letters for them, and proponed the scriptures to them translated into their own tongue; and, the better to bring his ambassage 16 to the emperor Valens to good effect, was persuaded by the heretics of Constantinople, and of the court there, to forsake the catholic faith, and to communicate with the Arians. making promise also to travail in bringing the people of his country to the same sect, which at length he performed most wickedly.

#### THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

M. Harding alloweth the people to read certain parcels of the scriptures for their comfort, but yet he alloweth them no translation: that is to say, he alloweth them to eat the kernel, but in no wise to break the shell. By these it appeareth that of sufferance and special favour the simple ignorant people may read the word of God in Latin, Greek, or Hebrew, but none otherwise.

The church, saith M. Harding, for the space well near of sixteen hundred years, never yet allowed any manner translation in the vulgar tongue. Yet notwithstanding it is certain that the church, not only in the primitive time, under the apostles and holy fathers, but also long sithence hath both suffered and also used the vulgar translations in sundry tongues. Whereof we may well presume that the church then allowed them.

<sup>[10</sup> August. Op. Specul. De Exod. Tom. III. Pars I. col. 682.]

<sup>[11</sup> Theeself, 1565.]

<sup>[12</sup> Basil. Op. De Fid. 6. Tom. II. p. 229.]

<sup>[18</sup> Πασα γραφή θεόπνευστος...δια τοῦτο συγ-"Υραφείσα παρα τοῦ Πνεύματος," ϊν', ὥσπερ ἐν **«οιν**ῷ τῶν ψυχῶν ἰατρείω, πάντες ἄνθρωποι τὸ laμα του οίκείου πάθους εκαστος εκλεγώμεθα.-

Id. Hom. in Psalm. i. Tom. I. p. 90.]

<sup>[14</sup> Ab omni ergo ligno paradisi escas manducabitis, ait Spiritus Dei; id est, ab omni scriptura dominica manducate.-Iren. Op. Par. 1710, Contr. Hær. Lib. v. cap. xx. 2. p. 317.]

<sup>[15</sup> Parts, H. A. 1564.]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Ambassade, 1565, 1609, and H.A. 1564.]

Hieron. in Epit. Paul.
Basil. in Epist. ad Neoc.
Sulp. in Vit. Mart. Lib. i.
Isidor. de Eccles. Offic. cap. x.

And that the scriptures were not only in these three tongues, Greek, Hebrew, and Latin, it appeareth by St Hierome, that saith, the psalms were translated and sung in the Syrian tongue<sup>1</sup>; by St Basil, that affirmeth the same of the Palestine, Theban, Phenic, Arabic, and Libyc tongues<sup>2</sup>; by Sulpitius, in the life of St Martin, that seemeth to say, the lessons and chapters were translated and read openly in the churches of France in the French tongue<sup>3</sup>; and by Isidorus, that avoucheth the like of all christian tongues<sup>4</sup>.

M. Harding misliketh the translation of Ulphilas into the Gotthian tongue; for that the author was an Arian. Notwithstanding it appeareth not that ever the church misliked it. But by this rule he may as well condemn all the Greek translations whatsoever, of Symmachus, of Aquila, of Theodotion, and of the Septuagints, and the whole Exaplus<sup>5</sup> of Origen: for there is not one of all these but may be challenged in like sort.

Touching St Hierome's translation of the bible into the Sclavon tongue, M. Harding seemeth to stand in doubt. Howbeit Hosius, his companion, saith: In Dalmaticam linguam sacros libros Hieronymum vertisse constat<sup>6</sup>: "It is certain and out of doubt that St Hierome translated the bible into the Sclavon tongue." The like whereof is reported by Alphonsus<sup>7</sup>. Neither can M. Harding shew us any error or oversight in that whole translation of St Hierome; and therefore he seemeth to condemn that godly father, and yet knoweth no cause why.

All late translations, saith he, have been made in favour of heresies, and therefore they may worthily be mistrusted. But will these men never leave these childish colours, and deal plainly? If there be errors, and such errors in these late translations, why do they not descry them? If there be none, why do they thus condemn them? But the greatest heresy that can be holden, and that toucheth them nearest, is the revealing of the usurped authority and tyranny of the church of Rome. For so it is determined by pope Nicolas: Qui...Romanæ ecclesiæ privilegium...auferre conatur, hic proculdubio in hæresim labitur, et...est... dicendus hæreticus\*: "Whosoever attempteth to abridge the authority of the church of Rome falleth doubtless into an heresy, and ought to be called an heretic."

M. HARDING. THE SIXTEENTH DIVISION.

As for the church of this land of Britain, the faith hath continued in it thirteen

hundred years until now of late, (211) without having the bible translated into the vulgar tongue, to be used of all in common. Our Lord grant we yield no worse souls to God now, having the scriptures in our own tongue, and talking so much of the gospel, than our ancestors have done before us! "This island," saith Beda Hist Eccles. (speaking of the estate the church was in at his days), "at this present, Lib. is according to the number of books that God's law was written in, doth search and confess one and the self-same knowledge of the high truth, and of the true height, with the tongues of five nations, of the English, the Britons, the Scots, the Picts, and the Latins; Quæ meditatione scripturarum ceteris omnibus est facta communis 10: Which tongue of the Latins," saith he, "is for the study and meditation of the scriptures made common to all the other." Verily, as the Latin tongue was then common to all the nations of this land, being of distinct languages, for the study of the scriptures, as Beda reporteth; so the same only hath always until our time been

Alphons. de Hær. Lib. i. cap. xiii.

Dist. 2.

Omnes.

Hos. de Sacr. Vernac. Leg.

The two hundred and eleventh untruth. For sundry parts of the bible were translated into the English tongue by king Alured, by Cedman, and by Beda, as shall appear.

<sup>[1</sup> Hieron. Op. Par. 1693-1706. Ad Eustoch. Epist. lxxxvi. Epit. Paul. Tom. IV. Pars 11. cols. 687, 8. See before, page 268.]

<sup>[\*</sup> Basil. Op. Par. 1721-30. Ad Cler. Neoc. Epist. cevii. Tom. III. p. 311. See before, page 290.]

<sup>[3</sup> Sulp. Div. Mart.Vit. ad calc. Abd. Apost. Hist. Par. 1571. Lib. 1, foll. 193, 4. See before, page 298.]

<sup>[4</sup> Isidor. Hispal. Op. Col. Agrip. 1617. De Offic. Eccles. Lib. 1. cap. x. p. 393. See before, page 289.]

<sup>[5</sup> Examples, 1611.]

<sup>[6</sup> Hos. Op. Col. 1584. De Sacr. Vernac. Leg. Tom. I. p. 664. See before, page 270, note 3.]

<sup>[7</sup> Alfons. de Castr. adv. Omn. Hær. Col. 1539.

Lib. 1. cap. xiii. fol. 28. 2.]

<sup>[8</sup> Nicol. Papa II. in Corp. Jur. Canon. Lugd. 1624. Decret. Gratian. Decr. Prim. Pars, Dist. xxii. can. 1. col. 100.]

<sup>[9</sup> H. A. 1564 has not this reference. It appears in H. A. 1565.]

<sup>[10]</sup> Hæc in præsenti, juxta numerum librorum quibus lex divina scripta est, quinque gentium linguis, unam eamdemque summæ veritatis et veræ sublimitatis scientiam scrutatur et confitetur, Anglorum videlicet, Brittonum, Scottorum, Pictorum et Latinorum, quæ meditatione scripturarum ceteris omnibus est facta communis.—Bæd. Hist. Eccles. Cant. 1722. Lib. 1. cap. i. p. 41.]

common to all the countries and nations of the occidental or west church, for the same purpose, and thereof it hath been called the Latin church.

Wherefore, to conclude, they that shew themselves so earnest and zealous for the translation of the scriptures into all rulgar and barbarous tongues, it behoveth them. after the opinion of wise men, to see, first, that no faults be found in their translations, (212) as hitherto many have been found. And a small fault, com-thundred hundred mitted in the handling of God's word, is to be taken for a great crime. Next, and twenth that, forasmuch as such translations pertain to all christian people, they be referred joined with a to the judgment of the whole church of every language, and commended to the laity there were by the wisdom and authority of the clergy, having charge of their souls. Further-M. Harding more, that there be some choice, exception, and limitation of time, place, and persons, would open them in par and also of parts of the scriptures, after the discreet ordinances 11 of the Jews; ticular. amongst whom it was not lawful that any should 12 read certain parts of the bible before he had fulfilled the time of the priestly ministry; which was the age of thirty years 13, as St Hierome witnesseth. Lastly, that the setting forth of the scriptures in the common language be not commended to the people as a thing utterly necessary to salvation, lest thereby they condemn so many churches that hitherto have lacked the same, and so many learned and godly fathers that have not procured it for their flock14, finally, all that have gone before us, to whom in all virtue, innocency, and holiness of life, we are not to be compared. for me. inasmuch as this matter is not yet determined by the church, whether the common people ought to have the scriptures in their own tonque to read and to hear, or no, I define nothing. As I esteem greatly all godly and wholesome knowledge, and wish the people had more of it than they have, with charity and meekness; so I would that these hot talkers of God's word had less of that knowledge which maketh a man to swell and to be proud in his own conceit; and that they would deeply weigh with themselves, whether they be not contained within the lists of the saying of St Paul to the Corinthians: "If any man think that he knoweth l Cor. viii. any thing, he knoweth nothing yet as he ought to know." God grant all our knowledge be so joined with meekness, humility, and charity, as that be not justly said of us, which St Augustine in the like case said very dreadfully to his dear friend Alypius: Surgunt indocti, et cœlum rapiunt; et nos cum doctrinis nostris sine corde, ecce ubi volutamur in carne, et sanguine 15! "The unlearned and simple arise up, and catch heaven away from us; and we with all our great learning, void of heart, lo, where are we wallowing in flesh and blood?"

## THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

M. Harding seemeth secretly to grant that thing which without blushing no man can deny; that is, that the scriptures long sithence and in old times have been translated into the natural speech of this country. But he addeth withal a The bible in poor exception, that, notwithstanding the translation were in English, yet it English, and yet not for served not for English people. And yet for what people else it should serve, it English were not easy to conjecture. Doubtless, if they had meant as these men do, to bar the English people from God's word, they would have kept it still as it was before, in Latin, Greek, or Hebrew, and would not have suffered any such translation.

But Beda himself, that wrote the story of this island, in these very words that M. Harding hath here alleged, seemeth to witness that the scriptures were then translated into sundry tongues, and that for the better understanding of the For thus he writeth: Hec [insula]...quinque gentium linguis...scrutatur \*mam, eandemque...scientiam veritatis 16: "This island searched 17 out the knowledge of one truth with the tongues of five nations." It is not likely he would have written thus of five several tongues, if the scriptures had been written then only in one tongue. In like manner and to like purpose he writeth thus: Quicunque Bed in Hist.

Angl. Lib. i. cap. i.

<sup>[11</sup> Ordinance, H.A. 1564.] [12 Any man should, H.A. 1564.]

<sup>[18</sup> Hieron, Op. Explan. in Ezech. Proph. Prolog. Tom. III. cols. 697, 8.]

<sup>[14</sup> Flocks, H.A. 1564; flock, H.A. 1565.]

<sup>[15</sup> August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. Confess, Lib. viu. cap. viii. 19. Tom. I. col. 152.]

<sup>116</sup> Bæd. Hist. Eccles. Lib 1. cap. i. p. 41. See before, page 692, note 10.]

<sup>[17</sup> Searcheth, 1565, 1609.]

The Scriptures in English.

gentium linguis unam eandemque veritatis scientiam scrutantur1: "Whosoever they be that search the knowledge of one truth" (not only in the Latin tongue, as M. Harding saith, but) gentium linguis, that is, "in the natural and vulgar tongues of this country." Doubtless, it were very much to say, that the mere Englishman, or Scot, or Pict, or Briton, that understood no Latin, was able nevertheless to read and search the scriptures in the Latin tongue.

But to leave conjectures, Beda saith expressly and in most plain words, that one Cedman, an English poet, translated the creation of the world, and the whole Bed. in Hist. Angl. Lib. v. story of the Genesis and the Exodus, and sundry other stories of the bible into English rhyme<sup>2</sup>. Likewise, as it is said before, king Adelstane, about nine hundred Adelstane. years past, caused the whole bible to be translated into English. Trevisa saith, that Beda himself turned St John's gospel into English<sup>3</sup>.

Johan. Trev. Lib. v. cap. Johan. Trev. Lib. vi. cap. i.

again he saith, that king Aluredus caused the psalter to be turned into English 4. And until this day there be divers such translations yet remaining to be seen, which for many causes bear good proof of great antiquity. Therefore, that this island hath continued thirteen hundred years without having the scriptures in English, it can bear no manner appearance or shew of truth. But being admitted and granted for true, if prescription of want may make

good proof, then may we say, this island stood and continued four thousand whole years not only without the English bible, but also without any knowledge of Christ or God. Likewise we may truly say, the gospel and the truth of God stood and continued in this island for the space of many hundred years without either the supremacy of Rome, or transubstantiation, or private masses, or any other like fantasies.

True it is, our fathers of late years have been led in ignorance, and have been violently forced from the scriptures. But the examples and wants of our concil chale, fathers are not always sufficient rules of faith. The heretic Eutyches said: Sic a progenitoribus meis accipiens credidi:...in hac fide genitus sum, et consecratus Deo:...et in ea opto mori5: "This faith have I received from mine ancestors: in this faith was I6 born and baptized; and in the same I desire to die." the same faith was an error, and no faith. So said the Arian heretic Auxentius:

Quemadmodum ab infantia edoctus sum, ita credidi, et credo 7: "As I have been

wise the idolatrous Jews said unto the prophet Hieremy: Sic fecimus nos, et patres

nostri, reges nostri, et principes nostri; et saturati sumus panibus, et bene nobis

taught from my childhood, so I have believed, and so I believe still."

Epist. Auxent. Jer. xliv.

Hilar. ln

erat: "Thus have we done, and our fathers before us, and our kings, and our princes. And we had store and plenty of all things, and a merry world, and did full well." But God saith unto them: In statutis patrum vestrorum nolite ambulare, &c. Ego Dominus Deus vester: "Walk not in the statutes of your fathers ;... I am the Lord your God."

2 Tim. ii.

Ezek. xx.

Howbeit, we sit not in judgment to condemn our fathers; God only is their Exod. iii. Dan. vi. Dan. iii. Exod. xiv.

St Paul saith: Solidum Dei fundamentum stat, habens hoc signaculum, Novit Dominus qui sint sui: "This foundation standeth sound, having this seal, The Lord knoweth who be his own." God was able to preserve the bush in the midst of the flame, and Daniel in the cave in the midst of the lions, and the three children in the midst of the furnace of flaming fire, and his people of Israel in the midst of the Red sea: even so was he able to preserve his own in the midst of that deadly time of darkness. St Cyprian saith: Ignosci potuit simpliciter erranti....Post inspirationem vero, et revelationem factam, qui in eo, quod

[1 See page 692, note 10.]

[2 Canebat autem de creatione mundi, et origine humani generis, et tota Genesis historia, de egressu Israel ex Ægypto et ingressu in terram repromissionis, de aliis plurimis sacræ scripturæ historiis, de incarnatione dominica, passione, resurrectione, et ascensione in cœlum, de Spiritus sancti adventu, et

apostolorum doctrina .- Id. Lib. Iv. cap. xxiv. p. 171.] [3 Polycron. (Englished by Trevisa) Southw. 1527. Lib. v. cap. xxiv. fol. 217.]

sawter in to Englysshe/ but he translated vnnethe. the fyrste parte before his deth .- Id. Lib. vi. cap. i.

[5 Libell. Confess. Eut. in Concil. Calched. Act. 1. in Concil. Stud. Labb. et Cossart. Lut. Par. 1671-2. Tom. IV. cols. 133-6.]

[6 I was, 1565, 1609.]

[7 ... ex infantia, quemadmodum doctus sum, sicut accepi de sanctis scripturis, credidi, et credo, &c.-

Hilar. Op. Par. 1693. Lib. contr. Auxent. 14. col.

[4 At laste he auentred hym too translate the

erraverat, perseverat...sine venia ignorantia peccat. Præsumptione enim atque obstinatione...superatur8: "He that erreth of simplicity (as our fathers did) may be pardoned; but, after that God hath once inspired the heart, and revealed his truth, whose continueth still in his error offendeth without pardon of ignorance. For he is overborne by presumption and wilfulness."

Upon these words of Beda M. Harding concludeth thus: The Latin tongue for the study of the scriptures was common to all the nations of this realm; ergo, the scriptures were not translated into English. A very child may soon see the simplicity and the weakness of this reason. For even now, notwithstanding the whole bible be translated into the English tongue, extant in every church, and common to all the people, yet the Latin tongue is nevertheless common to all the nations of this land, for the reading of old commentaries and the ancient doctors, and so for the meditation and study of the scriptures.

Now let us weigh M. Harding's considerations in this behalf. First, if there 1. had any faults escaped in the English translation, as he untruly saith there have many, he would not thus have passed them uncontrolled. He lacked neither

eloquence nor good-will to speak, but only good matter to speak of.

Secondly, the scriptures translated into English have been delivered unto the 2. people by such bishops and other spiritual guides as indeed have had a care for their souls, and have given their lives and blood for their sheep. bishops of M. Harding's side can only espy faults in translations; but they can amend none. They have burnt a great number of bibles; but they have hitherto translated none. Christ's words are rightly verified of them: "Neither do you<sup>9</sup> enter yourselves, nor will you suffer others, that would enter." For the highest principle of their religion is this: "Ignorance is the mother of true religion."

To limit and to diet the people, what they may read and what they ought 3. to leave, was sometime the superstitious discretion of the rabbins 10. Herein we orig. Prolog. may say as St Hilary saith: Archangeli nesciunt: angeli non audiverunt: propheta Cantic.

Nazianz. in

Nazian not heard it: the prophet hath not felt it: the Son of God himself hath revealed un to us no such thing." Certainly, now the vail being drawn aside, and our faces et Fil. being open, to behold the glory of God, St Paul saith: Omnis scriptura divinitus 2 Cor. iii. inspirata utilis est, &c.: not only one part of the scriptures, but "all and every 2 Tim. iii. part thereof is profitable, &c." And again: Quæcunque scripta sunt, ad nostram Rom. xv. doctrinam scripta sunt: " All things that are written are written for our instruction." And therefore Irenæus saith, as it is before alleged: Ex omni scriptura 1ren. Lib. v. divina 12 manducate 13: "Eat you of every part of the holy scripture."

Humility and good life, whereof M. Harding would seem to make some great account, is sooner learned of knowledge than of ignorance. Chrysostom saith: Magna Chrysost. de Lazar. Conc. 3. adversus peccatum munitio est scripturarum lectio: magnum præcipitium et profundum barathrum scripturarum ignoratio: nihil scire de divinis legibus magna salutis Ea res et hæreses peperit, et vitam corruptam invexit: hoc sursum deor-\*um miscuit omnia 14: "The reading of the scriptures is a great fence against sin; and the ignorance of the scriptures is a dangerous downfall and a great dungeon. To know nothing of God's laws is the loss of salvation. Ignorance hath brought in heresies and vicious life. Ignorance hath turned all things upside down."

Therefore the apostles of Christ and all other godly fathers have evermore encouraged the people to read the scriptures, and evermore thought the church of God to be in best case when the people was best instructed. St Paul saith: "Let the word of God dwell abundantly amongst you." Polycarpus saith to the Col. iii. people: Confido vos bene exercitatos esse in sacris literis 15: "My trust is, that ye Polycarp. ad

> other authors. The passage here cited may be found De Trin. Lib. 11. 9. col. 793.]

[18 Manducare, 1611.]

13 Iren. Op. Par. 1710. Contr. Hær. Lib. v. cap. xx. 2. p. 317. See before, page 691, note 14.]

[14 Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. De Lazar. Conc. ili. Tom. I. p. 740.]

[15 Polycarp, ad Philip, cap, xii. in Patr. Apostol. Oxon. 1838. Tom. II. p. 487.]

[8 Cypr. Op. Oxon. 1682. Ad Jubai. Epist. lxxiii. p. 204; where ignosci enim potest, and superetur.] [\* Ye, 1565.]

[10 Orig. Op. Par. 1733-59. In Cant. Canticor. Prolog. Tom. III. p. 26.

Gregor. Nazianz. Op. Par. 1778-1840. Orat. ii. **48. Tom. I. pp. 35, 6.**]

[11 Hilar. Op. De Patr. et Fil. Unit. Append.

col. 1378. This piece is compiled from Hilary and

Hom. 9.

August. in Psal. xxxiii.

Hieron, in Epist, ad Col. cap. iii.

Chrysost, in Johan, Hom.

Theodor. de Nat. Hom. Lib. v.

Orig. in Jos. Hom. 21.

Chrysost. in Op. 1mp. Hom. 44.

Tertul. in Lib. de Trin.

John iii. Amos vi.

Orig. in Lev. be well instructed in the holy scriptures." Origen saith unto his people: "Give your diligence, not only to hear God's word in the church, but also to be exercised in the same in your houses at home, and day and night be 1 studious in the law of the Lord2." St Augustine saith: "Read ye the holy scriptures. that end God would have them written, that we might receive comfort by them 3." St Hierome saith, as it is alleged before: Laici non tantum sufficienter, sed etiam abundanter verbum Dei habere debent, et se invicem docere4: "The lay-people ought to have the word of God, not only sufficiently, but also abundantly, and to instruct one another." St Chrysostom willeth the father with his child, and the husband with his wife, at home in his house to talk and reason of the word of God5. Theodoretus writeth thus: Passim videas hac nostratia dogmata &c.6: "Ye may commonly see, that not only the teachers of the people and rulers of the churches, but also tailors, smiths, and cloth-workers, and other artificers do understand the principles of our religion; and further, that not only learned women, if there be any such, but also such women as live by their labour, and sewsters, and maidservants, but also husbandmen, and ditchers, and herdmen, and graffers, can reason of the holy Trinity, and of the creation of the world, and of the nature of mankind, a great deal more skilfully than either Plato or Aristotle was ever able to do." Therefore Origen saith unto his hearers of the lay-people: Me...dicente, quod sentio, vos decernite et examinate, si quid rectum est aut minus rectum?: "While I speak that I think meet, examine and judge you whether it be well or other-Thus in old times the vulgar people, and such as M. Harding calleth swine, and rude and rash people, and curious busy-bodies, were able not only to understand the scriptures, but also to judge of their preachers. And therefore the Cyril. contr. wicked renegade emperor Julianus reproved the Christians (even as M. Harding now Julian Lib. vi. et Lib. vii. doth us), for that they suffered their women and children to read the scriptures. But the enemies of God's truth, for fear and conscience of their weakness,

have evermore used violently to take away the word of God, not only from

women and children, but also from all the whole people. Chrysostom saith: Hæretici sacerdotes claudunt januas veritatis. Sciunt enim,...si manifestata fuerit veritas, ecclesiam suam esse relinquendam, et se de sacerdotali dignitate ad humilitatem venturos popularem9: "Heretic priests shut up the gates of the truth. they know that, if the truth once appear, they must needs leave their church, and from the dignity of their priesthood come down to the state of other people,"

For Tertullian saith: Scriptura divina hæreticorum fraudes et furta facile convincit,

et detegit 10: "The holy scripture will easily bewray and confound the guiles and thefts of heretics.". Christ saith: "He that doth ill hateth the light."

therefore they say, as it is written in the prophet Amos: Tace, et ne recorderis nominis Domini: "Hold thy peace, and never think upon the name of the Lord." But miserable is that religion that cannot stand without hiding and suppressing

of the truth of God. [1 To be, 1565.] [2 Optamus tamen ut vel his auditis operam detis, non solum in ecclesia audire verba Dei, sed et in domibus vestris exerceri et meditari in lege Domini die ac nocte.-Orig. Op. Par. 1733-59. In Levit. Hom. ix. 5. Tom. II. p. 240.]

[3 Legite scripturas: ideo voluit Deus ut scriberentur, ut nos consolaremur.—August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. In Psalm. xxxiii. Enarr. ii. 17. Tom. IV. col.

4 Hieron. Op. Par. 1693-1706. Comm. in Epist. ad Coloss. cap. iii. Tom. V. col. 1074. See before, page 685, note 12.]

[δ ...καὶ μη μόνον ἐνταῦθα αὐτην ἐπιδείκνυσθαι, άλλα και οϊκοι γενομένους, τον ανδρα προς τήν γυναίκα, τὸν πατέρα πρὸς τὸν παίδα, περὶ τούτων διαλέγεσθαι.- Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. In Joan. Hom. iii. Tom. VIII. p. 16.]

[6 ... καὶ ἔστιν ἰδεῖν ταῦτα εἰδότας τὰ δόγματα, οὐ μόνους γε τῆς ἐκκλησίας τοὺς διδασκάλους, άλλα καί σκυτοτόμους, και χαλκοτύπους, και ταλασιουργούς, καὶ τοὺς άλλους άποχειροβιώτους καὶ γυναίκας ώσαύτως, ου μόνον τας λόγων μετεσχηκυίας, άλλα και χερνήτιδας, και ακεστρίδας, και μέντοι καὶ θεραπαίνας. καὶ οὐ μόνον ἀστοὶ ἀλλὰ και χωρητικοί τήνδε την γνωσιν έσχήκασι καί έστιν εύρειν και σκαπανέας, και βοηλάτας, και φυτουργούς, περί της θείας διαλεγομένους Τριάδος, καί περί της των όλων δημιουργίας, και την άνθρωπείαν φύσιν εἰδότας 'Αριστοτέλους πολλώ μαλλον καὶ Πλάτωνος.—Theodor. Op. Par. 1642-84. Græc. Affect. Cur. Serm. v. De Nat. Hom. Tom. IV. p.

[7 Orig. Op.: In Lib. Jesu Nave Hom. xxi. 2. Tom. II. p. 448; where discernite.]

[8 Cyril. Alex. Op. Lut. 1638. Contr. Julian. Libb. vi. vii. Tom. VI, pp. 206, 9, 29, 30, 4.]

[9 Chrysost. Op. Imp. in Matt. Hom. xliv. ex cap. xxiii. Tom. VI. p. clxxxvi; where januam, and eorum ecclesia est relinquenda, et ipsi de sacerdotali dignitate ad humilitatem venient popularem.]

[10 Tertull. Op. Par. 1580. Lib. de Trin. p. 505.]