CHAPTER V

THE ANGLICAN ADVANTAGE

An Unlikely Foundation

If an alternative to "Christianity and Civilization" did occur in Victorian English mission, one is still left with the perplexing matter of the precise role of Anglicanism in the development of this approach to mission. Anglicanism was, after all, a religious tradition founded in theological compromise and characterized by a certain intellectual vagueness. Although the rationalism and comprehensiveness of its eighteenth-century theologians have elicited the admiration of scholars, few, if any, claim to have found in "high and dry" Anglicanism a source of the religious enthusiasm usually regarded as essential impetus for mission. Enthusiasm, indeed, aroused considerable suspicion among the "soberly religious." And if nineteenth century Anglicanism enjoyed a revival in terms of institutional development, in the intellectual sphere it is frequently depicted as a tradition in full retreat before the onslaught of science and an increasingly secular society. Yet Anglicanism was the source of the nineteenthcentury Protestant missions that came closest to mutual transcendence. Although never spectacularly successful in the conventional sense of numbers of converts and scale of operation, these missions nevertheless continued to attract a small number of university men and retained

¹S. C. Carpenter, <u>18th Century Church and People</u> (London: John Murray, 1959), p. 28.

the loyalty of their private support networks well into the next century. The mission manifestation of High Church Anglicanism in fact is one aspect of an important, albeit rather neglected, feature of nineteenth-century intellectual history; the efforts of thoughtful men, convinced of the efficacy and value of Christianity to restate their faith in terms that recognized the validity and utility of new knowledge without jeopardizing the essence of Christian truth. Ironically, in making this complex adjustment, the leadership of the Melanesian Mission found in the Anglican heritage much that was useful. Indeed, it does not overstate the case to see in this tradition-unsystematic, pragmatic and eclectic as it was--an intellectual and even a spiritual advantage in the business of coming to terms with a changing world. Historical circumstance had made accommodation and comprehensiveness the hallmark of Anglicanism. In the nineteenth century, men whose intellectual outlook had been to some degree formed by that tradition found they could draw comfortably, if selectively, from the fundamentals of Anglican theology, the spirituality and romantic historical perspective of the Oxford Movement, German intellectual developments, and the emerging social and natural sciences to explain both themselves and their faith and, in the mission context, the indigenous peoples they encountered.

Before examining the specifics of this process, however, it is important to emphasize the rather chaotic character of the Anglican intellectual outlook and to forestall any temptation to find in it either the basis for a systematic approach to mission or tidy cause and effect models. About all that can safely be said of the "system"

of men like Selwyn, Patteson and Codrington is that their work rested on their unwavering belief in the universality of Christian truth and the excellence of the Church of England. Any attempt to attribute to them a systematic Anglican mission philosophy and methodology would be highly contrived. Certainly, they themselves, convinced as they were of the rectitude of their approach, never made so grand a claim. The degree to which pragmatic considerations influenced mission development in Selwyn's era has already been discussed. patteson, despite his greater involvement with intellectual issues, always had the manner of a man feeling his way. "Now is the time," he wrote to John Keble from Norfolk Island, "when they (the Melanesians) are in a receptive state and now especially any error on our part may give a wrong direction to the early faith of thousands! What an awful thought! We are their only teachers, the only representatives of Christianity among them. How inexpressible solemn and fearful!" Similarly, he showed a real reluctance, even after fifteen years in the field, to comment on mission methods. When the sister of the deceased Bishop MacKenzie of the UMCA wrote for advice on mission in Africa, Patteson replied that his own work was far too tentative for him to presume to advise others. The most he could offer her was an exhortation to be patient and "cheery."3

When working in the context of nineteenth-century Anglicanism, it becomes virtually impossible to consign individuals to particular

²Charlotte Yonge, <u>Life of John Coleridge Patteson</u>, 2 vols. (London: The MacMillan Co., 1873), 2:41.

³Ibid., p. 492.

theological, intellectual or socio/economic positions and then examine their activities in the light of these categories. This chapter will, however, examine the religious focus of the Melanesian Mission and the elements of the Anglican tradition that were important to its development.

Religious Sources

As we have already seen, social and political considerations have greatly influenced mission, but it remains, fundamentally, a religious enterprise undertaken by convinced Christians. There is no reason to think that the Melanesian Mission and the other non-Evangelical Anglican missions of the Victorian Era functioned any differently in this respect. In the case of the Melanesian Mission, it could even be argued that Selwyn's commitment to the concept of Anglican mission independent of the British Empire and the upper middle-class social standing of many of its staff left it freer than most missions from "secular considerations."

Formulation of a religious explanation for the High Church
Anglican missions of the nineteenth century is still a complex matter.
In the case of Evangelical mission, by contrast, the religious circumstances that led to mission are fairly clear. "The key to the understanding of most missionary activity," as Neil Gunson succinctly puts

For a detailed analysis of the relationship of the Melanesian Mission to the British presence in the Pacific see David Hilliard, "Colonialism and Christianity," The Journal of Pacific History, 9, 1974.

it, "is revivalism." And the key to revivalism in turn lies in the conversion experience; in the sense of a "new birth" in the spirit. In the Calvinist context, eighteenth-century religious revivalism produced not only the conviction of salvation among those affected but an eagerness to provide tangible proof of redemption from guilt and sin. This development dovetailed nicely with the older Calvinist tenet of the evangelization of the world as a precondition of the coming of the Millennium. For those who identified with the Methodist component of revivalism, the conversion experience lacked this sense of certainty, but it did elicit an intense 'love to God' which, by extension, meant a new concern for the souls of His creatures. In either case, revivalism and the conversion experience provided a meaningful theological/spiritual framework for "the great century of advance" in mission. 6

While this works quite well for Evangelical missionary activity, it is virtually useless when applied to the Melanesian Mission. A dignified reticence about their religious feelings marks the writings of almost every member of the Mission, but something of the High Church distrust of religious emotionalism and dramatic conversions is clearly evident in their view of the Christianization of Melanesians. Patteson exercised extreme caution in administering the sacraments until he

⁵Neil Gunson, Messengers of Grace: Evangelical Missionaries in the South Seas, 1797-1860 (Melbourne: Oxford University Press, 1978), p. 47.

⁶Sidney H. Rooy, The Theology of Missions in the Puritan Tradition (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1965), p. 321.

had ". . . every human probability of a personal conviction and sincere desire." Codrington noted that the Bishop made a point of never speaking of religion to the sick and dying unless they themselves so requested. His own views are perhaps best reflected in his response to the emotional conversion experience of a Pitcairn Islander at a revival-style service held by a new member of the Mission in 1876. Codrington is of the opinion that the "saved" individual was merely temporarily insane. In the 1890s, Arthur Hopkins, serving on Malaita, questioned the stability of the converts of the South Sea Evangelical Mission where ". . . sensible, emotional conversion is everything."

Far from being products of revivalism and conversion experiences themselves, the European staff appears to have been drawn largely from young men from religious, often clerical, homes, who had been intent on the ministry almost since childhood. Their reasons for undertaking mission, to the extent that they talk about them at all, center on the inspiration of missionaries in the field or the influence of others interested in the work. Patteson apparently had some idea of mission service from his Eton days when he first heard Selwyn preach. Hopkins cites both his own early hero worship of the martyred Patteson and

⁷Yonge, 2, p. 546. ⁸Ibid., p. 320.

⁹Robert Codrington Papers, Rhodes House Library, Oxford, series 4.

Arthur Innes Hopkins, "Autobiography," Church of Melanesia Archives, Honiara, Solomon Islands. Australian National University microfilm, "The Melanesian Mission, 1900-1925," p. 109.

the influence of a blind clergyman with an intense interest in mission whom he served as a curate in England. ¹¹ Charles Fox, himself the son of an Anglican priest, became intrigued with the Melanesian Mission when a missionary brought a team of Melanesian cricket players to his New Zealand school. ¹²

If the Protestant revivalist/conversion explanation is less than satisfactory in terms of establishing the religious basis of High Church mission, there seems to be equally little to be said for an institutional commitment on the order of Roman Catholic mission. Although Protestant in many features, the Church of England had retained episcopacy and at least the appearance of institutional independence and authority. In theory, the institutional Anglicanism, meeting in Convocation, might have made a commitment to mission, assigned personnel, and determined strategy and method. In practice, the Church of England had little independence and was in a state of institutional disarray in the formative period for English mission.

It is true, as a number of historians of the Victorian Church have pointed out, that there was a considerable effort at institution revitalization as the nineteenth century progressed. 13 But in

¹¹Ibid., p. 8.

¹²Charles Fox, "History of the Melanesian Mission," Bishop Patteson Theological Centre Library, Kohimarama, Solomon Islands. AJCP #M80-M806.

¹³ See Owen Chadwick, The Victorian Church, 2 vols. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1966-1970); P. T. Marsh, The Victorian Church in Decline (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1969); K. A. Thompson, Bureaucracy and Church Reform (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970).

discussing the intellectual and spiritual vitality of the Victorian Church, scholars have taken a far more pessimistic view. Faced with the challenges posed by new developments in intellectual life and the complex spiritual and social needs of the new industrial classes at home and the subject peoples of the Empire, the Church simply failed and consequently ceased to be a significant force in the life of the nation. V. W. Saffin, in his study of the role of science and relation in British education in the nineteenth century concurs. "The Establishment was fighting a battle on three fronts--on the level of their particular brand of justificatory metaphysics; a civil war within the ranks--the intelligentsia deploring the conservatism of the masses. and the masses castigating the learned for coming to terms with infidelity-- . . . and a rearguard action for supremacy against the snipings of the Nonconformists." 14 The Church, in short, could neither foster intellectual cohesion within its own ranks nor properly defend itself against either religious or rationalist attacks from outside the fold.

The essential failure of the Church on all these fronts is, in Marsh's view, confirmed by an increasing lack of interest in theological controversy or the position of the Church in national life following the uproar in the 1860s over the appropriate response to Darwinism, the disestablishment of the Irish Church, and innovations in ritual and practice. This declining interest can be summarized in Matthew

¹⁴N. W. Saffin, Science, Religion and Education in Britain, 1804-1904 (Kilmore (Australia): lowden, 1973), p. 307.

Arnold's well-known pronouncement that "... whoever treats religion, religious discussions, questions of churches and sects as absorbing is not in vital sympathy with the movement of men's minds at present ... " 15 Or as Lord Acton would write in 1887, "... ours is a time when unbelief in the shape of doubt is yielding to unbelief in the shape of certain conviction."

And yet an intense commitment and sense of responsibility is very much present in the writings of those associated with the Melanesian Mission. Occasionally that commitment is expressed in fairly standard missionary rhetoric. Bishop Selwyn, a year before his death in 1878, maintained that "no revelation of God to man can be clearer than the fore-ordained course in the conversion of the world." Patteson, at his consecration as the first missionary bishop of Melanesia, appealed for the congregation's prayers for "the conversion of the poor islanders . . . that the Spirit of Christ will mightily sway their hearts to turn them from darkness into light "18 But far more often, in the letters, memoirs and lectures of members of the Mission, commitment is expressed in terms of the universality of the Christian

¹⁵ Letters of Matthew Arnold, 1848-1888, 2, quoted in Marsh, The Victorian Church, p. 65.

¹⁶Gertrude Himmelfarb, Lord Acton, 1952, quoted in Franklin Baumer, Modern European Thought (New York: Macmillan Publishing Co., 1977), p. 353.

¹⁷ George Selwyn, "The Church of England's Missionary Duty" in The Missionary Church of England: Six Sermons Preached at St. James's Piccadilly (London: SPCK, 1877).

¹⁸Codrington Papers, series 8.

message and the need of men everywhere for the knowledge and solace it offered. "I can talk to you by the hour," Patteson wrote to his sisters in 1867, "upon the simple and natural character of Christian teaching and customs as applied to people not thinking and living as we do, but after a manner far more crude and primitive . . . much might be mere speculation. Nevertheless Christianity does meet human instincts. . . . It is not easy to think of Christianity dealing with the wants, feelings, circumstances, habits of thought . . . of men throughout the world. We conceive of it dealing with us, till we are forced to try to see its efficacy upon others differently situated. But it meets the necessities of man as man. And I do believe that in many of these unknown islands excellent proofs may be found of these wants existing which Christianity alone can relieve or satisfy." Or, as Arthur Hopkins put it, "Christianity is for all men everywhere . . . [because] it meets our common humanity." 20

K PARTY 18

For Robert Codrington, the universality of Christianity formed both its greatest innovation and the theological basis of mission.

Mission, in fact, becomes a critical 'proof' of one of Christianity's most essential truths—its universality:

The question is not whether these men all receive and believe the gospel and carry it out in life, but (1) whether there is anything belonging to these men's natural qualities and powers to themselves, not to the circumstances in which they live, which makes them incapable of receiving the gospel and (2) whether there is anything in the gospel itself when it is

¹⁹Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, 1867.

²⁰Hopkins, "Autobiography," pp. 15-16.

presented prevents its acceptance by any men
But truly as the world opens [if] any race of men are really found who cannot be Christians, the universality of Christianity as a religion can no longer be held to belong to it in fact though it may still remain in idea. And if so what becomes of the truth of it? For the universality of the gospel is essential ... Failure in this is failure in truth, as well as failure in accomplishment.21

The universality of Christianity had, of course, always been a necessary assumption of mission, but in the context of nineteenth-century High Church Anglicanism, it takes on new dimensions. It became a critical element in the development of the Melanesian Mission's methodology as well as its theological point of departure. "It is sometimes," Patteson wrote, "a consequence of our national self-conceit, sometimes of want of thought that no consideration is shown to the characteristic native way of regarding things. But Christianity is a universal religion and assimilates and interpolates into its system all that is capable of regeneration and sanctification anywhere." 22

Christianity, in other words, in its universal character, not only met universal spiritual needs of a diverse humanity but could itself incorporate much of the cultural diversity that humanity produced. Clearly "all that is capable of regeneration and sanctification" is a significant caveat. No Victorian missionary of any persuasion, including those of the Melanesian Mission, was prepared to push cultural relativism to the point of countenancing infanticide, polygamy, cannibalism or religious practices of a specifically pagan

²¹Codrington Papers, series 30, 31.

²²Yonge, 2, p. 351.

nature. In many other areas, however, the Mission exhibited a real reluctance to interfere with traditional practice. When it did do so, it showed considerable unease over the wisdom of its decisions. Patteson, for example, felt that the secret societies so vital to Melanesian culture were ethically marginal institutions in that they encouraged distinctions and castes. Since, however, he was not convinced that they had a specific religious content which would have brought them into direct conflict with Christianity, he left them intact. Association was, after all, a universal human instinct, and he saw little point in attacking its Melanesian manifestations. 23

By the 1890s, Bishop Cecil Wilson had come to feel that the secret societies did contain religious conflicts and were directly responsible for the lapses in Christian practice on certain islands. But he issued his condemnation with regret, recognizing that these associations had played a valuable role in teaching social responsibility and facilitating the circulation of wealth. ²⁴ In this case, too, other members of the Mission voiced an objection to change which had first appeared in the Patteson era: the folly of attacking or prohibiting any indigenous practices before alternatives were firmly established and clearly understood. ²⁵ "I am sure," wrote Patteson's protege, Joseph Atkin

²³Ibid., p. 265.

²⁴Cecil Wilson, The Wake of the Southern Cross (London: John Murray, 1932), pp. 81-83.

 $^{^{25}}$ Fox, "History of the Melanesian Mission." AJCP microfilm #M802-M806.

in 1870, "that nothing is to be done in a hurry; a good and zealous man in ignorance and haste might do more harm in one year than could be remedied in ten. I would not root out a single superstition until I had something better to put in its place, lest if all the weeds were rooted up, what had before been fertile should become desert, barren and disbelieving in anything. Is not the right way to plant the true seed and nourish it that it may take root, and outgrow and choke the weeds?"²⁶

The universality of Christianity, then, had the function of providing a theological rationale for mission and, even in the nineteenth century, the basis for a m ssion methodology capable of recognizing the validity of at least some elements of indigenous culture.

Traditional Anglicanism and Mission: The Role of Hooker and Butler

The importance the concept of universality assumed for the Melanesian Mission owed a great deal to nineteenth century intellectual developments and the degree to which the Mission's leadership was attuned to them. For a man such as Patteson, however, comfortable with a religious tradition closely associated with family, public school and university, and personally given to theological speculation, the writings of the Anglican thinkers constituting much of that tradition might also be expected to be important.

²⁶Yonge, 2, p. 429.

But, again, such an influence--that of orthodox Anglican thought on an ordained member of the Anglican clergy--cannot be seen as axiomatic. Although in the mid-nineteenth century almost all ordained clergy were still either Oxford or Cambridge graduates, formal theological training at the undergraduate level hardly existed. This peculiar arrangement grew out of the old assumption that Divinity. as the queen of the sciences, could only be approached after a proper grounding in humane studies. The formal study of theology remained, therefore, a matter for the higher faculty, and religious training, even for those determined on the clerical profession, was left to individual tutors in the colleges. Under this rather casual arrangement, the education a future clergyman received did not differ from that of any other undergraduate, and that, until quite late in the nineteenth century, remained largely classical. Thus, although the universities were in some respects well-equipped for the training of clergy in that they possessed substantial libraries, chapels, statutory religious observances and largely clerical faculties, in practice ordinands continued to present themselves for the required Bishop's examination woefully ignorant of the intellectual content of their own faith. 27 Thomas Secker, Archbishop of Canterbury (1758-1768) complained of this failing in 1766, urging the clergy ". . . to complete yourselves in all proper knowledge; not merely the introductory kinds, which unhappily are often almost the only ones taught the candidates

^{27&}lt;sub>L</sub>. S. Sutherland and L. G. Mitchell, eds., The History of the University of Oxford, 5 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1984-86), 5 (1986):403.

for holy orders."²⁸ And despite a growing awareness of the need for a better knowledge of theology among candidates for ordination, a church commission reporting on their qualifications in 1907 was still unequivocally of the opinion that "Universities, as such, do not provide a professional training for Holy Orders. They are places of Higher Education, not Higher Religious Education."²⁹

The usual preparation for a university graduate intending to take Holy Orders consisted of a year or two of private study prior to taking the Bishop's Examination, usually undertaken while the candidate held some other position. George A. Selwyn, for instance, studied for ordination while acting as a private tutor at Eton, and Patteson undertook his ordination preparation while serving as a fellow of Merton College, Oxford. For the future bishop of Melanesia, however, ordination preparation was anything but a proforma exercise. "This is the way," he wrote to his sisters in 1852, "I hope soon to set really to work upon theology, reading Church history, etc. to illustrate the main questions showing what was the opinion of great thinkers, and the practical expression of forms of belief in the community at various times." In this pursuit, he continued the intensive language studies he had begun on a continental tour taken after completing his B.A. degree and added an extensive study of biblical commentaries. 1

²⁸Ibid., p. 401.

²⁹ Robert Towler and A. P. M. Coxon, The Fate of the Anglican Clergy: A Sociological Study (London: The Macmillan Press, 1979), p. 25.

³⁰Yonge, 1, p. 86. ³¹Ibid., p. 99.

was, he felt, a clergyman's duty to be as well-informed as possible on theological issues in order to guide and direct others. Moreover, theological controversies fascinated him. Throughout his life, no matter how demanding his missionary duties, he would find time to stay apprised of these issues. The pursuit of this interest never, however, appears to have seriously disturbed Patteson's faith in the ability of the Church of England, free as it was from both Roman corruption and the extremism of continental Protestantism, to embody a spirit of "moderation and quiet consistence." 32

This moderate, accommodating spirit permeates Patteson's own thinking from this early date. The issue of freedom and independent thought and the need for authority and discipline, for example, might appear to be irreconcilable in theory, but in practice, where charity and humility were present, nothing was insurmountable. "If one may suppose," he wrote to his father in 1852, "that at all times a spirit of free enquiry has existed in however small a degree, alongside of a quiet spirit of submission and obedience, of willingness to accept what has already been accepted, so soon as this long accepted authoritative teaching has become manifestly corrupted, the spirit of enquiry not in itself, but (as it were) by opposition to the abuse of the spirit of acquiescence in traditional teaching, appeared true and honest and right and employing itself negatively only in reforming corruptions, approved itself to sincere and honest men." Inquiry, in other words, had a moral, corrective function, but that function need only come

³²Ibid., p. 88. ³³Ibid., p. 102.

into play when authority had become so corrupt that obedience could no longer be constituted a virtue.

Significantly, some of Patteson's greatest inspiration in formulating this approach appears to have come from those most venerated and orthodox Anglican theologians, Thomas Hooker and Joseph Butler. Exposure to these particular divines represented nothing out of the ordinary. Hooker's Ecclesiastical Polity and Butler's Analogy of Religion formed an important part of the Anglican canon and appeared in the ordination preparation of most Anglican clergy. Selwyn read them both in the course of his ordination preparation in 1832. 34 and they appear again on the reading lists of William Edgell who was ordained in Melanesia in 1897. For Patteson, however, they represented considerably more than an academic exercise. Until the end of his life, he praised the excellence of both Butler and-Hooker, solicited extra copies of their works for the Norfolk Island school, utilized them in training his own European ordinands and included readings from Hooker in the curriculum of his senior Melanesian pupils. Although he consistently advocated openness in theological discussion, he confessed that the Anglican divinity of Hooker had the most personal appeal for him, and he staunchly defended its relevance. "What is it in the eyes of men who can and do read Hooker & Butler . . . that they should accept Mill [John Stewart] and others as guides, except that the

³⁴Henry Tucker, Memoir of the Life and Episcopate of George Augustus Selwyn, 2 vols. (London: Williams Wells Gardner, 1879), 1:19.

³⁵William Edgell Diary, private collection. ACJP microfilm #M721.

assumed [superiority] of our generation (intellectually) is accepted by all alike?"³⁶ Of Butler, he wrote shortly before his death in 1871, "I do really and seriously think that a great and reverently-minded man, conscious of the limits of human reason—a man like Butler—would find his true and proper task now in presenting Christian teaching in an unconventional form, stripped of much error that the terms which we all employ when speaking doctrine seem unavoidable to carry with them."³⁷

Although Patteson had little quarrel with the Anglican orthodoxy represented by Butler and Hooker, his comments suggest that he found in them, not a refuge from change and difficult questions, but justification and support for the central theme of his mission--"Presenting Christian teaching in an unconventional form." What exactly did a Victorian missionary bishop find germane in the theology of a sixteenth-century defender of the Elizabethan Church and an eighteenth-century Christian apologist?

Thomas Hooker's essential thought is contained in the five volumes of Ecclesiastical Polity written as a response to Walter Travers, Hooker's Puritan contemporary. In 1584, when Hooker was appointed Master of the Temple in London, the Elizabethan Church was under heavy attack from radical Puritanism. This strain of English Protestantism which, as one scholar puts it "out-Calvined Calvin," grew out of the Marianist Exile when those Anglican clerics unable to come to terms

³⁶Yonge, 2, p. 204.

³⁷Ibid., p. 537.

with the re-instatement of the Roman faith had fled abroad. ³⁸ In a manner fairly typical of emigré communities for whom compromise is no longer a political necessity, their position on theological matters became increasingly narrow and rigid. When, on Queen Mary's demise, these extreme Calvinists returned to England, they brought with them a revolutionary program for the English Church; a program designed to eradicate every vestige of the old order. Any ceremony or usage not specifically mentioned in the Bible represented to the Puritan an unnecessary encumbrance if not a positive evil.

The Puritan position took on scholarly form in Travers's Explicatio (1573) which called for the end of the Church's authority in ordination and the use of excommunication to purge the Church of ungodly theology. In formulating a systematic response to this powerful polemic, Hooker unwittingly gave the first complete expression to an Anglican theology; one that could still be appreciated by John Coleridge Patteson three centuries later. ³⁹ Ironically, in doing so he utilized the same techniques as the principal thinkers of the more extreme Protestant cause, Martin Luther and John Calvin; the new Biblical exegesis developed by Renaissance humanists. This "literal method" as opposed to the elaborate system of metaphorical exegesis favored by medieval theologians, sought to establish the meaning of Biblical authors at the time they actually composed the texts. The view espoused by the creators of this approach was that Biblical authors spoke to men of

³⁸ John S. Marshall, Hooker and the Anglican Tradition (Sewanee (Tennessee): The University Press at the University of the South, 1963), p. 23.

³⁹Ibid., pp. 34-41.

their own age and tailored their writings for specific situations just as God accommodates His revelation to the particular conditions of men at particular times.

But whereas Luther and Calvin utilized this form of exegesis to elevate Scripture as the sole authority in the lives of men, Hooker's view was much more expansive. Clearly the Scriptures have primacy over the authority of the Church in matters of doctrine and morals.

Nevertheless, the Church, with its cumulative wisdom, has the authority to develop and interpret the implications of Scripture for each succeeding generation. Scripture, moreover, provides neither its own methodology of interpretation nor a knowledge of matters available through science, philosophy and experience. Inasmuch as it does not reveal its own "truth," it must be interpreted.

In Hooker, then, not only is the importance of the role of the Church reaffirmed, but the claims of other, non-scriptural knowledge are considered. Hooker even recognized, in natural law, an alternate source of moral knowledge. As to how knowledge is acquired, Hooker again took the wider view, advocating the use of reason as well as mystical revelation and Scriptural authority. In short, the relationship between moral and natural philosophy and religion should properly be one of completion rather than conflict. 40

As for man and society, Hooker expressed himself in terms of human potential and human creativity. Whereas Puritan thought saw man as a creature destroyed by sin and in dire need of God's mercy and

⁴⁰Ibid., pp. 45-54.

forgiveness, Hooker saw him in terms of unrealized potential. That man does not always achieve his own realization can be attributed to the perversity engendered by original sin. But that does not, in Hooker's view, obviate God's original vision of man as good. His self-realization through religious insight, reason, and an understanding of natural law therefore remains a distinct possibility. But Hooker does not expect man to manage this transformation on his own. The Church is there to provide, through its ministry and the sacraments, support in restoring him to his rightful, natural place in God's original scheme. Once the process is underway, man becomes a creative agent in the building of society. Variety in civilization struck HOoker, not as a threat, but as part of the richness of human potential. 41

Hooker was thus the source of a broad, developmental view of morality that became an important strain in Anglican theology. It requires no great stretch of the imagination to realize the intellectual uses a careful reader of Hooker—a reader such as the first bishop of Melanesia—might find in the mission field for Hooker's views on the value of tradition, the possibility of multiple sources of truth, the primacy of reason, and, above all, the realization of human potential and the value of human cultural variety. When, for example, Patteson spoke of the sort of missionary he envisioned for Melanesia, he dwelt on the need for "strong religious common sense," for men who could successfully adapt Christianity to local practice without

⁴¹ Ibid., pp. 107-118.

The relationship between Melanesians and missionaries, as Patteson saw it, was less that of the Elect pointing out the error of their evil ways to wretched sinners than that of reasonable, spiritual men helping God's creatures realize themselves more fully. This could be accomplished through the slow and undramatic exercise of sound learning, reason, patience, and the ministrations of the Church. The imposition of forms which might signify "progress" to outsiders (e.g., Sabbath observance, the wearing of clothes, the abolition of dancing and other local practices) had, in fact, little relevance for indigenous peoples themselves.

All of this seemed so basic to Patteson even at the outset of his work in Melanesia that ordinary mission methods completely appalled him. "... the almost inconceiveable ignorance or neglect of these basic truths underlies I am satisfied the systematic teaching of some missionary societies. It seems as if common sense and ordinary observation were to be regarded as 'unspiritual leaning on the arm of flesh'; as if the knowledge of the human heart and the application

⁴²Yonge, 1, p. 405. ⁴³Ibid., 2, p. 78.

of religious truth to the unspiritual man all came somehow by divine inspiration but could never be practically taught and learned. The old Puritan failure to recognize variety and potential, to underplay reason and practical knowledge of man, and to confuse form and substance were, for Patteson, the main sources of mission failure everywhere. The Anglican tradition as embodied in Hooker's writings, by contrast, provided a world-view in which natural law and reason as well as Scripture and revelation served as sources of truth. The possibility had to be entertained, then, that an indigenous culture could have, even without the benefits of Christianity, created something worthwhile. The role of Christianity was to complete and enhance; it did not always need to replace or destroy.

The eighteenth-century divine, Bishop Joseph Butler, actually addressed the issue of mission. His sermon for the anniversary meeting of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in 1738 stressed the need for patience and steadfastness in the absence of the spectacular successes critics of mission appeared to demand. The bare establishment of the faith was in itself important. "Progress" in mission ultimately depended on Providence far more than on the schemes of men. ⁴⁵ Patteson, who shunned publicity for the Mission out of fear of the public demand for "results," must have found this comforting. But his affinity for Butler was based on far more than Butler's rather marginal concern with mission.

⁴⁴Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, 1869.

The Sermons and Remains of the Right Rev. Joseph Butler. Ed. Rev. E. Steere (London: 1862).

Butler's place in Anglical thought reseted on the definitive response to the deist attack on Christianity he presented in The Analogy of Religion Natural and Revealed to the Constitution and Course of Nature (1736). In this treatise, he sought to establish the analogy of natural and revealed religion with what is observable in Nature. 46 So impressive was Butler's carefully reasoned arguments that the deist challenge to the concept of a moral deity, actively involved with His creation was effectively silenced, and the Analogy came to be regarded as the most important Christian apologetic and perhaps the most important English theological statement of the day. 47 By the middle of next century, however, thoughtful men questioned whether Butler's arguments, based as they were on the assumption of an intelligent deity, any longer served their original purpose. "It [The Analogy] has the effect . . . " wrote Matthew Arnold, "of a stately and severe fortress, with thick and high walls, built of old to control the kingdom of evil; -- but the gates are open and the guards gone. "48 Significantly, Oxford University dropped the Analogy from its required reading list in 1860.49

Patteson would hardly have had any quarrel with Butler's a priori assumption of the existence of deity. Agnosticism and atheism were

⁴⁶F. L. Cross, ed., <u>The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church</u> (London: Oxford University Press, 1958), p. 47.

⁴⁷James Downey, The Eighteenth Century Pulpit (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1969), pp. 31-32.

⁴⁸ Matthew Arnold, Works, vol. 9, quoted in Downey, The Eighteenth Century Pulpit, p. 32.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

hardly common traits among Victorian missionaries. But he was also far too close to the intellectual life of his own time to base his admiration of Butler on a wholesale acceptance of an orthodox theological position. In fact, however dated Butler's theology might have been, in his approach to changing conditions and new challenges and in his ethical theory there remained much to appeal to the Victorian Christian. For Butler provided the best Anglican example of what Hans Frei has called "mediating theologians."

These men--and Frei includes in this group such diverse figures as John Locke, Ernst Schleiermacher and Rudolf Bultman--espouse the view that for religion to be meaningful it has to be understood through general human experience. While the unique truth of Christianity depends on divine revelation, this "miracle" has to be appropriate to the human condition. In other words, it must speak to the major concerns of human existence. The role of the mediating theologian [or for that matter, the missionary] is not so much to "prove" the Gospel as to point out its meaningfulness and to mediate between the direct experience all people recognize and the specifics of Christian thought. 50

In Butler, the method of mediation centered on analogy or the process of applying the understanding of the familiar to an unfamiliar concept/object which has, nonetheless, some points of similarity.

Again, the possibilities for the application of this hallowed Anglican

⁵⁰ Hans W. Frei, The Eclipse of Biblical Narrative: A Study in 18th and 19th Century Hermeneutics (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1974), pp. 128-129.

intellectual position to mission methodology are quite apparent. Christian understanding must be built on the familiar, on existing belief. The Gospel must be presented in such a way that its relevance is apparent to general human conditions. "What I try myself to do," wrote Codrington, "is to make them [Melanesians] see a reason for believing in one God . . . also to make them see that they themselves, without any teaching from us, know and recognize the distinctions of right and wrong and feel the need of some higher association than their own." 51

An even stronger case for Butler's influence can be found in a consideration of his ethical system or, more precisely, in his view of man's moral sense or moral feeling. In contrast to the rationalist, utilitarian approach in which self-interest determined human ethical behavior, Butler felt that the empirical evidence supported the concept of a separate faculty, conscience, with the capacity to discern moral goodness. In his system, man responds to physical and emotional drives, benevolence or ational concern for others, and self-love or rational concern for self. But he also responds to the reigning authority of conscience. Without this faculty, no case can be made for disinterested actions or disinterested motivations, and yet empirical evidence for both abounds. Moral sense/feeling or the ability to make judgements of right and wrong is not, for Butler, a matter of rational distinction but an innate human faculty. ⁵²

 $^{^{51}}$ Robert Codrington, in <u>The Island Voyage</u> (Ludlow: The Melanesian Mission, 1875), p. 27.

⁵²Downey, <u>The 18th-Century Pulpit</u>, p. 37.

For members of the Melanesian Mission, the assumption of the innate ability of all men to make moral distinctions was fundamental. It is important, moreover, to realize that this view was not acquired after a long exposure to indigenous peoples but formed part of their intellectual assumptions when they arrived in the field. In 1856, shortly after his arrival in New Zealand, Patteson was already firmly of the opinion that "the capacity for the Christian life is there; though overlaid it may be with monstrous forms of superstition or cruelty or ignorance, the conscience can still respond to the voice of the Gospel of Truth." 53

That being the case, the concept of "savage" had little meaning.

Neither the moral failings nor the moral successes of islanders differed in any essential way from those of Europeans. "It is strange to be living so peacefully among nations accounted savage and fighting each other," Patteson wrote after three years in the mission field, "while you highly educated and civilized individuals act your barbarism on a more exaulted scale and with a far greater refinement. It is very savage indeed to spear 3 or 4 men, but exceedingly valient to leave about 3000 dead on a field slain by the Enfield rifle What scene in Melanesia ever exceeded the horrors of the sack of a town by British troops?" 54

This fundamental perception of moral consciousness may also have influenced the Mission's approach to teaching and, ultimately, the

⁵³Yonge, 1, p. 298.

⁵⁴The Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, 1859.

concept of an indigenous clergy. For if islanders failed to recognize Christian truth, the fault did not rest with them. They had the capacity to make moral judgements, and if they did not do so, the Mission could not explain their failings away as the limitations of savages. Occasionally, their failings were attributed to the harshness of Melanesian living conditions. Richard Comins, for example, reporting on bigamy and infanticide in the Solomon Islands in 1886, urged his readers to consider the marginal economy and the depressed status of women in creating these evils rather than assume depravity and perversity in Melanesians. Far more often, failure is tied to inappropriate presentation of Christian truth.

Patteson railed against standard Evangelical mission methods in this regard. In a letter to his sister in 1858, he noted how little Christianity appeared to have affected the lives of the Maori even years after their initial conversion, a problem stemming from the superficiality of early Evangelical mission teaching. ⁵⁶ He was never, however, certain his own approach ever accurately conveyed the essence of the message. Melanesians, he felt, demonstrate that they think perfectly well if principles can be put in terms they understand. ⁵⁷ Despite the Mission's use of Mota and other Melanesian languages, its sensitivity to existing belief, and the patient, long-range nature of its goals, he was never certain a European missionary could bridge the gap in communication.

⁵⁵ Richard Comins in The Island Voyage, 1886, p. 38.

⁵⁶Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, 1858. ⁵⁷Yonge, 2, p. 469.

The indigenous clergy, however, was another matter. George Sarawia, the first ordained Melanesian clergyman, had, in Patteson's view, a decided advantage, based not just on language ability, but on his mastery of such cultural subtleties as the language of gesture and expression. She Alfred Penney, a Cambridge man who served the Mission from 1875-1886, spending most of his time on island stations, attributed any success enjoyed by Christianity in the islands solely to the use of islander teachers and islander clergy. And Richard Comins, who served the Mission from 1877-1912, maintained that training "an army of native teachers" had to remain the Mission's first priority; a concept which, he noted, did not seem to commend itself to other missionary groups. 60

In Hooker's comprehensive approach to sources of religious truth and civilization and Butler's reliance on analogy to general conditions, then Patteson and other members of the Melanesian Mission had access, in orthodox Anglican tradition, to ideas which could provide the intellectual basis for a mission methodology of respect for and the utilization of indigenous tradition. And in Butler's concept of a moral sense, a philosophical, as well as a pragmatic, basis for the Mission's reliance on indigenous teachers and clergy is clearly evident.

⁵⁸Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, 1867.

⁵⁹Alfred Penney, <u>Ten Years in Melanesia</u> (London: 1887), p. 210.

⁶⁰ Richard Comins in The Island Voyage, 1878, p. 28.

The Oxford Movement

However useful these pillars of Anglican orthodoxy may have proved in providing a philosophical foundation for mission attitudes and methods, they have their explicative limitations. The exercise of mission on the part of individuals requires an element of imagination and emotional commitment that one would be hard-pressed to discover in the cool, common sense reasoning of Hooker and Butler. Indeed, much of the nineteenth century criticism of Butler centered on the short-shrift he gave the transcendental side of religion, the source of just those emotional, imaginative elements. "Butler's writings," as one scholar has expressed it, "are stoic to the core." It has already been established that the emotional energy for mission generated by revivalism and the conversion experience was, in the eyes of most High Church Anglican missionaries, a highly suspect phenomenon. But that does not remove the necessity of accounting for the "determined Christianity" of the High Church missions. Such determination hardly seems a likely by-product of the "High and Dry" Anglican tradition with its emphasis on the sensible and the sober, its defense of Establishment, and its deep suspicion of religious enthusiasm. 62 From the 1830s, however, the Anglican High Church tradition was itself transformed, or as some would have it, corrupted, by that most amorphorus of religious developments, the Oxford Movement.

⁶¹ Ieuan Ellis, Seven Against Christ: A Study of Essays and Reviews (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1980), p. 273.

⁶²Owen Chadwick, The Mind of the Oxford Movement (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1960), p. 30.

In a period dominated by public demands for the institutional reform and the correction of existing abuses, the Church of England was widely viewed as spiritually ineffectual, corrupt and dominated by the state. Spurned by the immediate threat to its prerogatives occasioned by the proposed Irish Church 3ill of 1832 that sought to partially dismantle establishment Anglicanism in Ireland and recognizing the need to find new justification for an institution they valued. a small group of Oxford-based clergy began constructing a defense of the Church based on both emotional and historical appeals. The point of departure for the Oxford or Tractarian Movement as it came to be called is usually taken to be John Keble's Assize Sermon at Oxford in 1832. Keble, the author of an immensely popular collection of devotional poetry, The Christian Year, along with John Henry Newman and Edward B. Pusey, formed the Movement's leadership. All had been fellows of Oriel College, Oxford, the first college there to elect its fellows on the basis of intellectual merit. By the 1820s, Oriel had become the center of a revival of rigorous training in logic and patristic studies. 63 This scholarly background would serve the Tractarian leaders well in the formulation of their sophisticated defense of their beloved, embattled Church.

In the 1830s and early 1840s, the publication of the writings of the Movement's leaders and their disciples in the <u>Tracts for the Times</u> and their dramatic sermons kept Oxford in particular and High

⁶³Geoffrey Faber, Oxford Apostles: A Character Study of the Oxford Movement (London: Faber and Faber, 1933).

Church Anglicanism in general in a religious uproar. With Newman's conversion to Roman Catholicism in 1844, its momentum slacked, but variations of its concerns continued to exert a major influence on the course of Anglican Church in the nineteenth century. Tractarian emphasis on worship and the sacraments, for example, sparked a revival of interest in matters of ritual and Church design. One off-shoot, the Cambridge Camden Society, undertook extensive work in Church design and restoration and had a considerable role in the Gothic revival in Victorian church architecture. And by the fact that it made High Church Anglicanism much more conscious of its own identity, the Oxford Movement served to widen the gap among the Church parties with the Anglican communion.

Yet for all its influence, the Oxford Movement remains extremely difficult to define; a fact that may stem from its essentially emotional and aesthetic rather than theological and intellectual character. In the view of Owen Chadwick, the Movement in fact combined two critical elements: the traditionalism of the old "High and Dry" Anglicanism which had always retained a certain reverence for the authority of the Church fathers and episcopacy based on Apostolic succession and the emphasis on feeling of nineteenth-century Romanticism. It is this high regard for the mystery and poetry of religion that, in Chadwick's view, distinguishes the Oxford Movement. 64

⁶⁴Chadwick, The Mind of the Oxford Movement, p. 30.

The Movement's leadership is, therefore, perhaps best characterized by what one scholar has called their "renewed awareness of transcendent power to a transcendent goal." 65

Such a claim could, of course, be made for many religious persuasions in the nineteenth century. Evangelicals, for example, clearly had in the revival/conversion experience, a transcendent goal. But. in the Oxford Movement, this transcendence was much more a matter of "corporate holiness" than a highly individualized religious experience. 66 In short, where Evangelicals sought spiritual revival by appealing to an emotional response by the individual to the doctrine of justification by faith alone, the Tractarians depended on an emotional response to the sacred rituals of the Church, particularly the Eucharist. 67 The spiritual wisdom and experience of the entire community of the faithful could be found in the Church and its traditions. Thus the believer, however much his world might be changing, had in the Church a complete and sufficient guide. A thorough understanding of what constituted Christian belief and practice in the early Church became, therefore, an essential feature of the Oxford Movement, and from its inception it was less a movement of religious thought than an attempt

⁶⁵ Eugene Fairweather, The Oxford Movement (New York: Oxford University Press, 1964), p. 10.

⁶⁶Horton Davies, Worship and Theology in England from Watts and Wesley to Maurice, 1690-1850 (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1961), p. 243.

⁶⁷ Elie Halevy, A History of the English People in the Nineteenth Century. Trans E. I. Watkin and D. A. Brooke, 6 vols. (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1961. First published 1913-48) 3:147-48.

to rediscover the religious disciplines and modes of worship and devotion capable of sustaining the believer in the modern world.

For Keble, that attempt centered on the tradition of pastoral care he believed he discerned in the practice of the early Church. The individual believer left entirely on his own, was, in Keble's view, far too subject to error. He required the discipline of practice as well as faith to sustain him. It behooved the Church and its clergy, therefore, to understand and define practice and in general to be as strong as possible in order to provide for the faithful. To understand fully its role and function, the Church needed to understand its own historical models, specifically that of the early Church. But, for Keble, this use of tradition was more innovative than reactionary. Reverence for tradition involved not the blind preservation of every detail of present practice, but a corrective process by which the purity and vitality of the early Church could be resurrected and the institution could assume again a critical role in the lives of men. ⁶⁸

Keble never doubted that the English Church, corrupt as it was, stood in the most direct relationship to the primitive ideal and held the best hope for its revitalization. Until the spiritual and intellectual crises which led Newman to regard the Roman Church as the true heir of the corporate Christian ideal, the Tractarians consistently held that the establishment of the Anglican Communion by

⁶⁸Chadwick, The Mind of the Oxford Movement, pp. 35-37.

Henry VIII represented not a rupture from the Church, but its preservation from the corruptions of Rome and the extremes of Protestantism. ⁶⁹

In addition to its pastoral and historical elements, the Oxford Movement, largely through the efforts of Newman, focused on the role of faith. This was an understandable reaction to the prominent role assigned to reason and logic by eighteenth century Anglican thinkers. Reason, in the sense that Newman used it, meant analytical thinking and demonstration. For religious purposes, it had limited value. For while reason might test or verify faith, it could not create it. Faith, for Newman, was much more a principle of action than a matter of intellectual assent to a demonstrated truth. 70 Nor can reason be the guardian of faith. That rests with the conscience or what Chadwick calls "a right state of heart." Faith, then, is "a movement from something known to something unknown, kept in the narrow path of truth by the Law of dutifulness which inhabits it, the Light of heaven which animates and guides It is perfected not by mental cultivation, but by obedience."72 Reason and faith did not stand in contradiction to each other. They were simply distinct and independent functions and to make one a precondition of the other was to confuse

⁶⁹Halevy, The History of the English People in the Nineteenth Century, 3, pp. 147-48.

⁷⁰ Chadwick, The Mind of the Oxford Movement, p. 43.

⁷¹ Ibid., p. 44.

⁷² John H. Newman quoted in Owen Chadwick, The Mind of the Oxford Movement, p. 45.

the issue. "No analysis," Newman maintained, "is subtle and delicate enough to represent adequately subjects of belief, as they are presented to our thoughts." 73

Edward Pusey, in turn, added to the Tractarian vision of the Church and the believer's relationship to it elements of the mystical and ecstatic. Of all the Tractarian thinkers, he exhibited the most interest in the devotional disciplines enabling the soul to achieve union with God. Those disciplines included self-denial, obedience, prayer, and meditation, all of which had been well understood in the former practice of religious life but which had, with the abandonment of monasticism, fallen into abeyance in Protestant religious usage. Pusey, in his fervent belief in the responsibility of individuals in the choice between good and evil, placed a high value on the assistance these disciplines could offer in that struggle. He translated and adapted continental devotional books for English usage and was closely connected with the revival of monastic life within the Anglican communion. 74 In the exercise of these disciplines in his own devotional life, Pusey bordered on the extreme. Self-denial extended to abstinence from wine, the use of a hard chair and bed, no gloves in cold weather and even the use of a hair shirt. 75 The Oxford Movement, then, while closely connected to emotional and aesthetic responses in religion also had a disciplined, demanding aspect. "Religion," wrote Newman,

⁷³Ibid., p. 102. ⁷⁴Ibid., pp. 48-50.

⁷⁵Faber, The Oxford Apostles, p. 400.

"is in itself at first a weariness to the worldly mind, and it requires an effort and a self-denial in everyone who honestly determines to be religious." 76

For all this, most scholars of the movement continue to place its major influence in the realm of religious practice and do not dwell extensively on its intellectual contributions which are seen as decidedly limited. The however, the movement's permanent influence has been somewhat less than profound in theological terms, it had tremendous interest for contemporaries, partly because of the seriousness with which Victorians regarded both religious and secular matters, partly because the question of the true nature of the Established Church had very real political ramifications, and partly because the movement's intense religious concerns had considerable dramatic impact in a religious tradition which had historically relied on compromise, reason, and a rather comfortable piety. The movement of the serious intense religious tradition which had historically relied on compromise,

Serious High Churchmen could hardly avoid the issues raised by the Tractarians even though the numbers of those who identified completely with their aims remained small. Although the early Tractarian writers took little specific notice of mission, it would be both misleading and incomplete to study any High Church mission

⁷⁶ Newman quoted in Chadwick, The Mind of the Oxford Movement, p. 152.

⁷⁷ See Owen Chadwick, The Mind of the Oxford Movement and Raymond Chapman, Faith and Revolt (London: Weidenfeld and Nicholson, 1970).

⁷⁸Chadwick, The Mind of the Oxford Movement, p. 14.

without reference to it. Moreover, its most fundamental features—intensified religious feeling and an almost mystical devotion to the Church—had obvious implications for mission which had, historically, always attracted religious enthusiasts.

The development of self-consciousness stemming from the movement's emphasis on the institutional Church and its autonomous moral authority has also led some scholars of the Victorian High Church missions to posit direct links between the Oxford Movement and these missions.

David Neave, in his examination of the Universities Mission to Central Africa points to Bishop George Augustus Selwyn as a sterling example of the new type of "churchman militant" whose vision of an expanded mission role for the Church had its origins in the corporate, autonomous view of the Church emphasized in Tractarian writings. The And in her group portrait of the European missionaries in Papua between 1874 and 1914, Diane Langmore suggests that the new perception of Anglican mission as an institutional responsibility can be tied, through the Anglo-Catholicism that was one product of the Movement, to continental Catholicism and a conscious copying of its institutional models.

A measure of caution, however, must be exercised in establishing the links between the Melanesian Mission and the Oxford Movement. Clearly, those links existed, on a personal as well as a religious

⁷⁹ David Neave, "Aspects of the Universities' Mission to Central Africa, 1885-1900," M.S. Thesis, University of York, 1974, pp. 13-15.

⁸⁰Diane Langmore, "European Missionaries in Papua, 1874-1914," PhD Thesis, Australian National University, 1981, p. 2.

basis. Patteson had been at Oxford in the late 1840s when the excitement of the Movement had, with Newman's defection to Rome, abated. Still, he heard Pusey preach on penance and absolution in 1846 and was, according to a letter to his sister, favorably impressed. With Keble, he enjoyed a personal relationship based on a family friendship close enough for Patteson's sisters to be the occasional houseguests of the Kebles. Patteson himself carried on a correspondence with Keble from Melanesia, and Keble contributed (as did Pusey) to the building of the Southern Cross. 82,83

More to the point, Patteson was thoroughly familiar with Tractarian literature, some of which he held in high esteem. Pusey's books, he wrote from Melanesia, provided one of his chief delights. ⁸⁴ On reading the whole of Newman's <u>Apologia</u> for the first time in 1866, he professed his astonishment at the profundity of Newman's thought. ⁸⁵ But it was Keble, whom he called "one of the Saints of God," ⁸⁶ who attracted him most. <u>The Christian Year</u> along with the <u>Meditations</u> of Thomas a Kempis formed the core of his own devotional reading, and he fantasized over the intellectual delight of having Keble to himself for a couple of days in order to question him to his heart's content. ⁸⁷

⁸¹ Yonge, 1, p. 54. 82 Ibid., 2, pp. 567-68.

⁸³Codrington too may have had a personal association with Keble. At any rate, Patteson expressed a desire in 1867 for a walking stick, noting that Codrington had a very satisfactory one, a gift from Keble. Patteson Papers, SPG Collection. 1867.

⁸⁴Yonge, 2, p. 53. ⁸⁵Ibid., 2, p. 177.

^{86&}lt;sub>Patteson Papers</sub>, SPG Collection, 1867. 87_{Yonge}, 2, p. 52.

In particular, he shared the Tractarian sense of the role of devotion and worship and the limits of reason in religious understanding. The Bible must be read, he maintained, for devotional as well as intellectual and theological reasons. Reason alone could never accomplish the surrender of the will he associated with spiritual growth. Only a year before his death, he continued to chastise himself for his own self-consciousness and introspection. "I see how I was all along making self the centre, and neglecting all kinds of duties, social and others in consequence . . . I mean there is a want of brightness, cheerfulness, elasticity of mind about the conscious man or woman. He is prone to have gloomy, narrow, sullen thoughts, to brood over fancied troubles and difficulties; because, making everything refer to and depend on self naturally can get none of that comfort which they enjoy whose minds naturally turn upwards for help and light."

Patteson also proved extremely sensitive to the aesthetics of Anglican worship. Faced for the first time with the relative austerity of worship in the colonial Church, he expressed his renewed appreciation for "... the wondrous beauty of our Church services, calming all feeling of excitment and irreverent passionate zeal, and enabling one to give full scope to the joy and glory of one's heart, without, I hope, forgetting to rejoice with reverence and moderation." And of his experiences with Australian Churches, he wrote, "One often loses the spirit when the form is withdrawn and I surely long for the 'worship

of God in the Beauty of Holiness', and my mind reverts to Ottery Church [the Patteson family church in Devon], college chapels and vast glorious Cathedrals."91 By contrast, the lofty, ecclesiastical church with a raised altar and a surpliced choir presided over by a Rev. Walsh in Sydney delighted him. 92 With reference to the mission field, opposed as he was to the imposition of inappropriate forms on islanders, he still hoped to have, someday, "a small but exceedingly beautiful Gothic chapel." In that "a really noble Church is a wonderful instrument of education," Patteson saw no incongruity in this desire. 93 Ironically, the Patteson Memorial Chapel, consecrated in 1880 in remembrance of the martyred bishop and built with funds contributed by his family and admirers in England, was just such an edifice. Gothic in design, it contained stained class windows by William Morris and Burne-Jones, shafts of Devonshire marble, and an organ, a gift of Patteson's biographer, Charlotte Yonge. The latter caused Codrington no end of trouble to transport and install. 94

But despite his sensitivity to the central role of aesthetics in worship, Patteson distrusted the growing interest in ritual in Tractarianism and the rigidity on matters of both practice and doctrine in that they tended to widen the distance between Church parties.

Newman's hair-splitting over the Monophysite heresy, the issue leading

⁹¹ Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, undated fragment.

⁹²Ibid., 1856. ⁹³Yonge, 2, pp. 78-79.

⁹⁴Sir John Gutch and the Revd. John Pinder, eds., "Patteson Memorial Chapel, Norfolk Island." Published privately, 1980.

to his abandonment of the English Church and his conversion to Roman Catholicism, struck Patteson as completely beside the point. ⁹⁵ From the perspective of the mission field, "it isn't High or Low or Broad Church, or any other special name but the longing desire to forget all distinctions, and to return to a simpler state of things that seems naturally to result from the very sight of heathen people." ⁹⁶ The introduction of more and more elaborate ritual and the tendency of some of the clergy to make independent decisions concerning proper usage struck him as a threat to the simplicity and unity constituting the Church of England's best claim to be the authentic heir of the primitive Church. In this regard, he even questioned the wisdom of Pusey and Keble, who, although they did not initially focus on ritual, had become its staunch defenders by the 1850s. ⁹⁷ Ritualism, in short, threatened to undermine the quiet, steady progress of the Church. ⁹⁸

If it is therefore inaccurate, as David Hilliard maintains, to describe the Melanesian Mission as Tractarian, it is still necessary, in view of Patteson's close intellectual and personal ties to the Movement, to carefully assess its possible influence. ⁹⁹ For while Patteson consistently avoided a doctrinaire stance, the Movement provides important clues to an understanding of individual motivation in undertaking mission, the attitudes involved in the development of the Mission's methodology, and especially in the Mission's image of

^{95&}lt;sub>Yonge</sub>, 2, p. 177. 96_{Ibid.}, 1, p. 302.

⁹⁹Hilliard, God's Gentlemen, p. 14.

of itself and its role. It is certainly conceivable, for example, that the Movement's emphasis on the devotional religious life influenced the decision of individual Anglicans to enter the mission field. For with the appearance of this new element, High Church Anglicanism had an avenue for the expression of emotion and intensity of religious feeling that one would be hard-pressed to discover prior to the 1830s.

Although the mystical and ecstatic aspects of devotion form an important part of this new expression, it is the sternness and discipline of the religious life in the Tractarian conception which has particular bearing on the High Church missions. Religion, according to the Movement's leaders, was not meant to be a comfortable thing. Self-denial became an important test of religious earnestness and discipline, extending, in the case of Pusey and Newman to even simply daily pléasures. 100 If self-denial was what was required in religious earnestness, the mission field offered golden opportunities. In the UMCA, Neave maintains, the celibate, Anglo-Catholic missionary priest for whom hardship and deprivation served as points of pride had grown into a conscious ideal by the mid-1870s and remained so until the mid-twentieth century. 101 The Anglican Mission in Papua, according to Langmore, also maintained a degree of austerity the other Protestant missions in the area found neither necessary nor desirable. 102

¹⁰⁰ Charles E. Mallet, A History of the University of Oxford, 3 vols. (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1968. First published 1924) 3:236.

¹⁰¹ Neuve, pp. 111-12.

¹⁰² Langmore, "European Missionaries in Papua," p. 124.

But, again, the case of the Melanesian Mission is rather more complex. Patteson, perhaps because of his horror of the image of the self-righteous missionary, tended to play down the hardships of mission life. "It is," he exclaimed in 1857, "the happiest life a man can lead, full of enjoyment, physical and mental, exquisite scenery, famous warm climate, lots of bathing, yams and taro and coco-nut . . . and such loving gentle people." 103 His trials, he maintained, were nothing compared to those sustained by the clergy working in the slums of London. But in fact, except for perhaps those times when the members of the Mission were in residence on Norfolk Island, mission life was difficult, uncomfortable, and often dangerous. Patteson, a man who confessed that he did not "disrelish handsome rooms and furniture and pictures and statues and endless real works of art in really good taste" 105 found life aboard the Southern Cross, where the greasy food and general dirt and discomfort aggravated his tendency to headaches and seasickness, particularly difficult. In his early days in New Zealand, he routinely rose at 4:30 a.m. and did not usually retire until after midnight after an endless round of teaching, nursing the sick, managing the school, and assisting Selwyn with the European community. His lack of intellectual companionship, prior to Condrington's arrival in 1866, appears to have weighed particularly heavily on him. 106 His health had begun to fail well before his fortieth birthday.

¹⁰³ Yonge, 1, p. 301. 104 Ibid., 2, p. 295. 105 Ibid., p. 155.

¹⁰⁶ Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, 1866.

Nor did matters improve much in the years between Patteson's death at the hands of his "gentle, loving people" in 1871 and the end of World War I. Occasionally, mission reports from the period read like segments of a juvenile adventure series. Charles H. Brooke, whose literary style was a source of aesthetic pain to both Codrington and Patteson, spoke cheerfully of trooping through the mud to give concertina concerts for islanders and the pleasures of the odd tin of Fortnum and Mason potted lobster eaten somewhere on the edge of a swamp in darkest Melanesia. 107 But members of the Mission with fewer literary pretensions spoke in terms of catch-as-catch-can meals, rats, mosquitoes, dirt, and the sheer fatigue of moving from school to school and island to island, frequently traveling in open whale boats. 108 Added to these discomforts were the sheer frustration of not knowing whether anything at all had been accomplished and, sometimes, real danger from the Melanesians themselves. As late as 1911, the boys at St. Michael's School on San Cristoval in the Solomon Islands had to be guarded at night against the incursions of neighboring hill tribes still practicing cannibalism. These nightly patrols with a shotgun did not, Charles Fox reported, "leave one fresh for school next day."109

¹⁰⁷Charles Brooke in <u>Mission Life</u>, 5 (London: Rivingtons).

¹⁰⁸Charles Bice and Arthur Brittan, "Journal of Residence in the New Hebrides, S.W. Pacific Ocean" (Trueoro, 1887).

¹⁰⁹ Charles Fox, Lord of the Southern Isles (London: A. R. Mowbray, 1958), p. 231.

Patteson's correspondence and diaries convey the sense that had the missionary's lot been an easy one, it would have had limited value in furthering religious growth. That growth was clearly important to him. Although he managed to set aside some time each day for his own devotional life, he worried that he never had enough time to pray as he ought, and he remained unconvinced that he was progressing in his own spiritual development. Were his deprivations in the mission field really the mark of spiritual progress? Were his motives sincere? "I know," he wrote to his father early in his mission career, "He can use any instrument to His glory. I know that and that He will not let my sins and shortcomings hinder His projects . . . to these Melanesian Islanders; but as far as purity of motive, and a spirit of prayer and self-denial do go for anything in making up the qualification on the human side for such an office----in so far, do they exist in me? You will say I am over sensitive and expect too much. That, I think, very likely may be true." 110

But it is important to observe that while Patteson questioned the sincerity of his own motives, he never undervalued the role of self-denial in spiritual growth, and he exercised this discipline with care and deliberation. He had, for example, a particularly strong attachment to his father and two unmarried sisters, even by Victorian standards of sentiment. Yet he consistently refused to return to England on leave, although home leave was a common practice in mission work. During a particularly acute bout of homesickness, he wrote to

¹¹⁰Yonge, 1, p. 442.

his sister, "But now, don't you see, Fan, how good this is for me? If you think impartially of me as you recollect me, you will see how soft and indolent I was, how little I cared to exert myself and try and exercise the influence a clergyman may be supposed to possess . . . I think that is the best training to make it so. I think that I ought to be gaining strength of purpose, resolution, energy of character, under these circumstances." Security from trouble and anxiety became almost worrisome. When Norfolk Island had become a well-established mission center, Patteson expressed his concern that "life here is so free just now from anxieties heaping on me that it requires a special effort to think at all as one ought." Is seem to be too comfortable---too free from anxieties."

The Mission's founder, Bishop George Augustus Selwyn, provided, perhaps, the best insight into the role of self-denial and mission. If, Selwyn maintained, by self-denial one meant asceticism and with-drawal from the world, one was dangerously close to self-indulgence. Why did those who complained of the lack of expression of self-denial in the Church of England not "... throw themselves into the dark wastes of our manufacturing towns, or upon the millions of the unconverted heathen (where they may practice without observation and without reproof all the austerities which may best express their sense of

¹¹¹Ibid., p. 254.

¹¹² Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, Feb. 2, 1868.

^{113&}lt;sub>Ibid</sub>.

bearing of the daily cross)."114 Anything less smacked of hypocrisy, for surely self-denial was as well practiced in missionary life as in a monastery. In short, Selwyn articulated the precise relationship of self-denial, one of the key contributions of the Oxford Movement to Victorian Anglicanism, to the world of Christian activism. For churchmen like Selwyn and Patteson, suspicious of the ascetic and ritual extremes of the Movement but mindful of its insights and contributions, the merger of action and self-denial in mission proved a fortuitous outlet for their own "determined Christianity."

The case for the influence of another of the 'rediscoveries' of the Oxford Movement is even sounder. The so-called Doctrine of Reserve, a critical feature of Tractarianism, provided important support for both the renewal of devotional life and the enhanced importance of both the institutional Church and its clergy. But its arguments also almost certainly figured in the methodology and style developed by Patteson in Melanesia. The Doctrine of Reserve itself was most fully expressed by Issac Williams, a disciple of Keble's, who published his explanation of it as Tract 80 in 1837. Through his patristic studies, Williams had become concerned with what he perceived to be a "holding back" or reserve in the Jewish and Christian tradition of communicating religious knowledge. "... there appears," he wrote, "in God's manifestations of Himself to mankind, in conjunction with an exceeding desire to communicate that knowledge, a tendency to conceal and throw

¹¹⁴ John Evans, Churchman Militant: George Augustus Selwyn, Bishop of New Zealand and Lichfield (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1964), p. 20.

a veil over it, as if it were injurious to us, unless we were of a certain disposition to receive it." This hidden wisdom is of a moral, not an intellectual, nature. Indeed, the speculative mind may be something of a handicap. Knowledge, in this realm, flows from love which, in turn, comes from obedience. For evidence, Williams had at his disposal the collective wisdom of a host of sacred and profane moral writers ranging from Aristotle to Pascal. "All speak of a state of probation, as being one of increasing moral light, or of increasing darkness; that a good life is, in some special sense, one of advancement in knowledge, and an evil life of growing and progressive ignorance."116 But without this reserve, there is a want of true. deep feeling. 117 Moreover, Williams maintained, those who are themselves morally advanced are the first to recognize their own inadequacy in conveying their own knowledge. Humility and retirement characterize the true purveyors of religious insight far more than an aggressive persuasion. "This is contrary to human calculation, in the same way that no one would have thought beforehand that the coming on of night would open to us more glorious objects than the light of day." 118

Although Patteson never mentioned Tract 80 specifically, he was familiar with the main body of Tractarian writing in which the Doctrine of Reserve figured prominently. And it is possible that he knew Tract 80 firsthand. Certainly, his mission methodology as it developed in

¹¹⁵ Issac Williams, "On Reserve in Communicating Religious Knowledge" in Tracts for the Times (New York: AMS Press, 1969. First published 1833-1844) 4:132.

¹¹⁶ Ibid., p. D-1. 117 Ibid., p. 51. 118 Ibid.

Melanesia was entirely compatible with this <u>Disciplina Arcani</u> the Tractarians viewed as fundamental to early Christianity. It is difficult to imagine a better intellectual point of departure for the conditions the Mission faced in Melanesia than the principle that truth should be conveyed gradually and adapted to the particular circumstances of the hearers. Illegard "I don't for a moment mean or think," wrote Patteson, "that religion is to be taught by mere prudence or common sense. But a spiritual religion is imperiled the moment that you insist upon an unspiritual people observing outward forms which are to them the essence of the new teaching. Anything better than turning heathens into Pharisees!" To more advanced Christians, formal practice is needful but it is not where one starts. The heathen mind is already chained to the senses; the big lesson is spirituality. Mustn't distract from that."

And again and again, Patteson expressed concern over how this was to be accomplished. "If we unnecessarily place obstacles in their minds to the reception of Christianity just conceive the fearful injury that will be done to them. If we were to teach them a whole host of vague in meaning words, which, after awhile, they might themselves see to be very inadequate exponents of the truths that underlie them; or find them to be applied by us to quite different ideas from those with which they had associated them, I do not think that we shall be

pp. 31-32. W. Jones, <u>Issac Williams and His Circle</u> (London: SPCK, 1971),

fulfilling our duty to God or to them. Our duty is, as far as in us lies, to teach them the practical lessons of Christianity But the question is, how to teach it?" Given the awesome responsibility of conveying Christian truth, Patteson urged extreme caution on the part of the missionary. He must never proceed with haste and would be well advised to rely as much on the instructive of his own Christian life as on formal teaching or the imposition of complicated rules and regulations. A spirit of patience and humility is essential. "One seems," he wrote, "to be doing nothing, yet surely if no change be wrought what right have we to expect it? It is not that I look for results, but that I seek to be taught how to teach better." 124

In the Doctrine of Reserve, then, Patteson had access to additional support for the development in the Melanesian Mission of concepts of caution, limited expectations, appropriate instruction, and patience. It is, however, in the Mission's image of itself that the contribution of the Oxford Movement is most apparent. The Tractarians, in their zeal to establish the historical legitimacy of the Church of England, sought, as we have already seen, to establish direct links between Anglicanism and the Church of the first five centuries of the Christian era. The medieval Church, despite its later attraction for Victorian medievalists and those within the Movement who focused on ritual,

¹²² J. C. Patteson quoted in Charles E. Fox, "History of the Melanesian Mission," Bishop Patteson Theological Centre Library, Kohimarama, Solomon Islands. AJCP #M802-M806.

¹²³Yonge, 2, p. 254.

¹²⁴ Ibid., p. 144.

struck the early Tractarian leaders as corrupt. Quite naturally, Tractarian scholarship emphasized and glorified the early epoch of Church history; an epoch encompassing the first efforts of Christian mission. Thus Victorian High Church missions had at their disposal, through the scholarship and concerns of the Oxford Movement, historical models and images of mission very different from those favored by their Evangelical counterparts. While the Evangelical mission model everywhere stressed the Christian home and family, the High Church missions saw themselves in terms of the religious community. Visitors to the mission stations of U.M.C.A. reported the atmosphere of a college devoted to plain living and high thinking as opposed to the Evangelical Protestant stations where family life necessitated a far greater reliance on Western life-styles. 125 In the U.M.C.A. and the Anglican Mission to Papua, both heavily influenced by Anglo-Catholicism, the model extended to celibacy for the term of mission service and either no salary at all or a very limited stipend. 126

The Melanesian Mission never went quite so far. Although Patteson and Codrington never married and lived exclusively on their private incomes, other members of the Mission did marry while in service, and their wives were welcomed at Norfolk Island. They also received stipends, albeit rather Spartan ones. Patteson himself believed the best mission situation to be a combination of married and single

¹²⁵ Neuve, "Aspects of the U.M.C.A. . . . ," pp. 189-202.

¹²⁶ Ibid., pp. 108-10 and Langmore, "European Missionaries in Papua . . . ," pp. 121-24.

personnel. 127 Yet the early Church model clearly had an influence, particularly in the organization and operation of the Norfolk Island school, St. Barnabas. In describing St. Barnabas to his aunt in 1867. Codrington likened it to the ancient monasteries of England and Germany in its view of work and education. 128 The daily routine indeed had a monastic orderliness, with daily services and classes interspersed with work on the Mission farm and meals of plentiful but decidedly plain food. Melanesian scholars and the European staff shared the work, and the entire Mission sat down together for meals. 129 When discipline was required, Patteson found the example of the early Church most efficacious. A council of Melanesian communicants sat in judgments on the transgressor and determined appropriate punishments. Usually this involved banishment from services for a stated period. If the culprit was a Melanesian teacher, he might also be barred from teaching and sitting at the "high table" of the dining hall with the rest of the mission staff. While Patteson admitted that this sort of Church discipline for social behavior might not be appropriate everywhere, he found that the methods employed by the early Church worked marvelously well in Melanesia. 130

¹²⁷ Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, 1869.

¹²⁸Codrington Papers, series 4.

¹²⁹ E. S. Armstrong, The History of the Melanesian Mission (London: Isbister and Co. Ltd., 1900), p. 109.

¹³⁰Yonge, 2, p. 352.

Interestingly, this model of the disciplined religious community found further expression among Melanesian Christians. Ini Kopuria, a former St. Barnabas student from Guadalcanal in the Solomon Islands and a member of the Solomon Islands Police Force, inspired by stories of St. Francis and the monastic orders of Europe, proposed to Bishop John Steward, in 1925, the formation of what became the Melanesian Brotherhood. The Brotherhood consisted of young Melanesian men who took vows of celibacy for a term of mission service. During their service, they undertook the evangelization of areas not already under mission care, staying in a community only at its invitation and depending on it entirely for their support. Although subject to the authority of the Bishop of Melanesia, the Brotherhood controlled and organized its own affairs. ¹³¹

Patteson's view of indigenous clergy and his belief in the need for specialized knowledge of human culture also received further justification from the early Church model. He referred to the example of the early Alexandrine teachers who analyzed existing belief systems in order to discover the appropriate means of introducing Christianity; a practice he found sadly lacking in most mission practice of his own day. "It is not always easy to be patient and to remember the position which the heathen man occupies and the point of view from which he must regard everything brought before him," he maintained. 132 Yet

¹³¹ Brian Macdonald-Milne, Spearhead: The Story of the Melanesian Brotherhood (Watford: The Melanesian Mission, n.d.), pp. 7-9.

¹³²Yonge, 2, p. 152.

the earliest Christian missionaries and teachers had taken care to come to just such an understanding and thus provided a most instructive example.

Ironically, having utilized the early Church model to support the concept of sophisticated cultural understanding, Patteson also found there arguments for the effectiveness of an indigenous clergy with limited formal training. The entire matter of the training and education of the indigenous clergy was problematic. patteson shared the Oxford Movement's view of the importance of the clergy, both for their role in the administration of the sacraments and as the chief educators and spiritual leaders of their flocks. Stringent, thorough training in theology, Church history, and the languages necessary for Biblical studies assumed critical importance. In his own preparation for ordination and in that which he and Codrington provided for the European ordinands of the Mission, he insisted on rigorous standards. And both he and Codrington felt satisfied that their ordinands acquitted themselves as well or better on ordination exams as their Englishtrained counterparts. 133 But should this standard be applied to the Melanesian clergy? Despite his confidence in their ability and intelligence, Patteson thought not. Their job did not entail teaching theology to educated Christians. They had, rather, to convey the elements of Christian truth to people completely ignorant of the entire phenomenon. "If they can state clearly and forcibly the very primary

¹³³ Codrington Papers, Series 29.

leading fundamental truths of the Gospel and live as simple-minded humble Christians, that is enough indeed," Patteson concluded. 134 And again, he found his point of reference for this conclusion in the Church's earliest missionaries. Many of these men, Patteson noted, had scarcely been literate and had yet accomplished much of value. 135

Given the size of the Melanesian mission field, this view of the indigenous clergy had obvious pragmatic appeal, but Patteson saw in it something more compelling. A Melanesian clergy was the only possibe way of incurring the proper communication of Christian truth and, consequently, the proper establishment of a Melanesian Church. "We cannot be to them what a well-instructed fellow-countryman may be. He is near to them. They understand him. He brings the teaching to them in a practical and intelligible form." 136 As long as the Christian message came only from Europeans, it ran the risk of being perceived as the foreigner's religion and not as God's universal gift. Thus, in 1868, George Sarawia, after nine years with the Mission, took his ordination vows in Mota alongside Charles Bice, who took his in English. "I think," wrote Patteson, "oh! with such feelings of thankfulness, and hope too, of the first Melanesian clergyman!" 137 That he could so so was in no small degree a measure of his understanding of his own Anglican tradition.

¹³⁴Yonge, 2, p. 494.

¹³⁵ Patteson Papers, SPG Collection, 1868.

¹³⁶Yonge, 2, p. 292.

¹³⁷ Ibid., p. 324.

Indeed, without any undue strain, that tradition, in terms of the theology and ethics of both the orthodox Anglican divines of past centuries and the Tractarian "rediscoverers" of the nineteenth century, could provide the thoughtful, determined Christian with important intellectual and emotional support for missionary endeavors. The religious, education, and social background of the Mission's leadership made the full resources of High Church Anglicanism particularly accessible.