

# Travels in America: Aelred Carlyle, His American “Allies,” and Anglican Benedictine Monasticism

Rene Kollar

Saint Vincent Archabbey, Latrobe, Pennsylvania

**I**N FEBRUARY 1913, Abbot Aelred Carlyle and a majority of the Benedictine monks of Caldey Island, South Wales, renounced the Anglican Church and converted to Roman Catholicism.<sup>1</sup> For years, the Caldey Island monastery had been a show piece of Anglo-Catholicism and a testimony to the catholic heritage of the Anglican Church, but when Charles Gore, the Bishop of Oxford, tried to regularize their status within Anglicanism by forcing Carlyle and the monks to agree to a series of demands which would radically alter their High Church liturgy and devotions, the monks voted to join the Church of Rome. The demands of the Great War, however, strained the fragile finances of the island monastery, and during the spring of 1918, Abbot Carlyle traveled to America to solicit funds for his monastery. “And it was indeed sheer necessity that took me away from the quiet shores of Caldey,” he told the readers of *Pax*, the community’s magazine, but “Caldey has suffered grievously through the war.”<sup>2</sup> Abbot Carlyle saw a possible solution to his problems. “In our need we turned to our Catholic Allies in the United States, and my duty seemed obvious that I should accept the invitation I had received to go to New York to plead in person the cause of Caldey there.” Carlyle had not forgotten lessons from the past. During his years as an Anglican monk, the American connection proved to be an important asset in the realization of his monastic dreams.

Early in his life, Carlyle sought to revive Benedictine life in the Anglican Church. His early attempts in the East End of London, Gloucestershire, Dorset, and an early stay on Caldey Island in 1901 proved fruitless. Carlyle’s dreams, however, did attract some attention. In 1898, the Archbishop of Canterbury, Frederick Temple, authorized and sanctioned the young Carlyle’s religious profession as an Anglican monk, and his enthusiasm and apparent stability of purpose caught the attention of Charles Lindley Wood, Lord Halifax. In 1902, Lord Halifax invited Aelred Carlyle, recently elected as Abbot by his small group of followers, to settle at Painsthorpe in Yorkshire as his guest. While enjoying Halifax’s hospitality, Carlyle’s Anglican Benedictines caught the hostile

---

<sup>1</sup> For a history of Abbot Aelred Carlyle’s revival of Benedictine monasticism in the Anglican Church, see P. Anson, *Abbot Extraordinary. A Memoir of Aelred Carlyle Monk and Missionary 1874-1955* (London: The Faith Press, 1958) and R. Kollar, *Abbot Aelred Carlyle, Caldey Island, and the Anglo-Catholic Revival in England* (New York: Peter Lang Publishing Inc., 1995).

<sup>2</sup> A. Carlyle, “The Abbot’s Letter,” *Pax* 9 (Winter, 1917-18): 201-02.

attention of both the Roman Catholic and Low Church newspapers, but on the other hand the patronage of Lord Halifax and other prominent Anglo-Catholics and the favorable reports in the columns of the *Church Times* tended to dismiss critics and gave Carlyle some credibility. Nonetheless he still did not enjoy any official ecclesiastical position within the Anglican Church. But his questionable status changed with the visit of Charles Grafton, the Bishop of the American Diocese of Fond du Lac, Wisconsin, to Painsthorpe.

Charles Grafton (1830-1912) had always recognized the importance of religious communities within the Anglican Church, and in 1865 he became one of the founding members of the Society of St. John the Evangelist.<sup>3</sup> In Boston, Grafton devoted his energy to the foundation of the Sisterhood of the Holy Nativity, and when he became Bishop of Fond du Lac in 1889, he moved the mother house of this community to this Wisconsin city. He also had strong ideas about the importance of communities of men and their significant contributions to the church. Grafton's projected brotherhood had to be American in nature and spirit, and not merely a copy of English or European communities. It must also address the needs of North America, such as work among "the former slaves in the South, among the impoverished in the rural areas, and also among the destitute in the urban slums..."<sup>4</sup> Moreover, the community would not develop independently of proper ecclesiastical supervision. One experiment in conventual life, St. Dunstan's Abbey, did enjoy a short existence in Grafton's diocese, but did not survive long after his death in 1912. Bishop Charles Grafton's influence on the growth of the religious life, however, also extended across the Atlantic.

On returning from a trip to Russia in October 1903, Charles Grafton decided to pay a visit to his old friend, Lord Halifax, and Grafton thus had the occasion to meet Aelred Carlyle and become acquainted with the Benedictine monks of Painsthorpe. Lord Halifax wanted the American Bishop to bless Carlyle as Abbot of the small community then living on his estate. Some negotiations had already taken place between Halifax and the Archbishop of York, William Maclagan, but the Archbishop had expressed some reservations about conferring this token or symbol of Anglican approval on Carlyle. Eventually, however, Archbishop Maclagan gave his approval to Bishop Grafton to bless Aelred Carlyle as a Benedictine Abbot. On October 30, 1903, "by permission of the Archbishop of York" Grafton "conferred the Abbatial Benediction on Brother Aelred Carlyle, and installed him as Abbot of Painsthorpe."<sup>5</sup> Lord Halifax described the scene as "a most impressive ceremony . . . [when] the Bishop of Fond du Lac, with the Archbishop of York's permission blessed Fr. Aelred and installed him as Abbot."<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> For Charles Grafton's support of religious life within the Anglican Church and the American Episcopal Church, see R. Kollar, "Charles Grafton's Dream for Religious Life in the American Episcopal Church: The Influence of the Monastic Revival in the Church of England," *Studia Monastica* 33 (1991): 133-143.

<sup>4</sup> R. Kollar, "Bishop Charles Grafton's Dream for Religious Life in the American Episcopal Church: The Influence of the Monastic Revival in the Church of England," 142.

<sup>5</sup> W. R. Shepherd, ed., *The Benedictines of Caldey Island* (Caldey Island: The Abbey, 1906), 32.

<sup>6</sup> Halifax to Hill, 31 October 1903, Halifax Papers, Borthwick Institute, York.

Bishop Grafton also ordained Carlyle a subdeacon, an order abolished during the Reformation.<sup>7</sup> By this episcopal action, Abbot Aelred Carlyle obtained some standing, although weak, in the Anglican Church. Ordination to the priesthood would confer a sense of permanence and official ecclesiastical status.

Carlyle correctly realized that his position within the Established Church and the success of his Benedictine revival depended on his reception of Holy Orders. His church did not recognize the rank or office of Abbot. Abbot Carlyle had tried to obtain Holy Orders previously, but he could not meet the educational and academic requirements. Bishop Charles Grafton agreed, however, to perform the ceremony in America if Carlyle could obtain Archbishop Maclagan's permission, and "without the usual formalities, provided that the Archbishop of York raised no objections."<sup>8</sup> Archbishop Maclagan gave his approval and suggested that Abbot Carlyle take advantage of Grafton's offer, but he also made Carlyle promise to keep the ordination and the circumstances surrounding it a secret. Archbishop Maclagan "practically made it a condition of my ordination," the Abbot later recalled, "that nothing should go out to the public."<sup>9</sup> Archbishop Maclagan guaranteed Bishop Grafton that "the work which he is carrying on is one for which there is a real need, and that he is endeavouring to discharge his duties in a devout spirit and in true loyalty to the Church of England."<sup>10</sup>

On October 19, 1904, Abbot Aelred Carlyle and one of his monks left for America and the private ordination ceremony. "A dear friend of our community," Carlyle told the readers of *Pax*, "undertook to pay all our expenses, so I feel free to come."<sup>11</sup> A letter from the Archbishop of York to Bishop Grafton, which explained the Archbishop's thoughts on the American ordination, accompanied Carlyle. In it, Archbishop Maclagan told Grafton that on "his return I will very gladly welcome him as a clergyman in Colonial Orders, and I do not suppose that the requirements of the Colonial Clergy Act need put any impediment in his way, so long as he remains in his present position."<sup>12</sup>

---

<sup>7</sup> There was no public announcement or press report concerning the ceremony at Painsthorpe.

<sup>8</sup> P. Anson, *Abbot Extraordinary*, 85.

<sup>9</sup> Carlyle to Gore, 4 November 1912, Carlyle Papers, Pluscarden Abbey Archives, Elgin, Scotland.

<sup>10</sup> "Letter Dimissory," Maclagan to Grafton, 26 September 1904, Carlyle Papers, Prinknash Abbey Archives, Cranham, Gloucester. "On his return," the Archbishop promised Bishop Grafton, "I will very gladly welcome him as a clergyman in Colonial Orders, and I do not suppose that the requirements of the Colonial Clergy Act need put any impediment in his way as long as he remains in his present position." This 1874 Act (37 & 38 Vic. c. 77) set down the conditions under which a cleric ordained for the colonies might minister publicly in England. The written permission of the appropriate Archbishop and the usual assent to the Book of Common Prayer and the 39 Articles were required of the candidates for orders.

<sup>11</sup> A. Carlyle, "Community Letter," *Pax* (December 1904), 43.

<sup>12</sup> Maclagan to Grafton, 26 September 1904, Carlyle Papers, Prinknash Abbey Archives. This letter, along with others dealing with Carlyle's official standing in the Anglican Church and the events surrounding the conversion of the Caldey monks in 1913, appears in a collection of documents entitled *A Correspondence*. Carlyle published these letters after his conversion to explain the reasons behind decision to seek admission into the Roman Catholic Church.

Moreover, Maclagan continued, "I feel well assured . . . that the work which he is carrying on is one for which there is a very real need; and that he is endeavouring to discharge his duties in a devout spirit and in true loyalty to the Church of England."

In addition to his priestly ordination, another reason behind Carlyle's decision to travel to America was an invitation from Bishop Grafton who wanted to establish a brotherhood based on Benedictine principles in his diocese of Fond du Lac. "The Abbot," Grafton told the press, who "is a gentleman by birth and a humble Christian, is making a visit to America for a needed rest. It is possible that a house of a somewhat similar order may . . . be established at Fond du Lac."<sup>13</sup> *The Lamp* reported that the Bishop of Fond du Lac " . . . offered him [Carlyle] 30 acres of land and a church in his diocese as an inducement to establish an American branch."<sup>14</sup> And another sympathetic American paper reported that Abbot Carlyle also hoped to raise £3,000 for the construction of a new and spacious monastery in England "so that they may be able to take six American postulants for training next year."<sup>15</sup>

Despite the Archbishop of York's desire for secrecy, Abbot Aelred Carlyle did not seek the cover of anonymity or avoid the limelight during his American journey. His flamboyant personality, medieval religious garb, and his interesting comments attracted the attention of the curious American public. Immediately after his arrival in New York, the *New York Herald* drew the attention of its readers to the presence of the two Anglican monks, "clean shaven and tonsured," whom the paper described as wearing " . . . long white robes, over which were black capes, flat, wide brimmed hats and low, coarse shoes."<sup>16</sup> As soon as he set foot on American soil, Abbot Carlyle spoke about his grand dream of establishing a branch house of his Anglican Benedictines in the Diocese of Fond du Lac because of the requests of some interested parties and others desirous of becoming Benedictines.<sup>17</sup> The American novices, however, would spend their probationary or novitiate period at Abbot Carlyle's English monastery. "It is my idea, as head of the order," he told the press, "to keep the English and American branches separate, and so the superior of the Wisconsin house who will be sent over, will be American."<sup>18</sup> After a short stay at the Holy Cross monastery in West Park, New York, Carlyle began his journey across the country to meet Bishop Grafton.

Once in Fond du Lac, Carlyle continued to capture the attention of the interested American public. The November 12 edition of *Commonwealth* painted a flattering picture of the young Anglican Abbot and emphasized the plans to establish a "branch

---

<sup>13</sup> *Commonwealth* (Fond du Lac, Wisconsin), 12 November 1904.

<sup>14</sup> *The Lamp* (New York), December, 1904.

<sup>15</sup> *The Living Church* (Milwaukee), 29 October 1904.

<sup>16</sup> *New York Herald*, 29 October 1904.

<sup>17</sup> *American Church* (New York), 29 October 1904.

<sup>18</sup> *New York Herald*, 29 October 1904.

community" in the city, which would be under the supervision of Bishop Grafton.<sup>19</sup> The Bishop also commented on the purpose of Abbot Carlyle's visit, and told the press that he had visited the monks in England, and their life and dedication had impressed him. After outlining a brief history of Carlyle's accomplishments, Grafton offered some comments on the proposed American foundation. The order "embraces both clergy and laity," he noted, and "there may be a number, especially of the latter, who might be called to lead a devoted, or, as it is called, consecrated life." The American foundation, moreover, "would be independent of England." The paper asked Bishop another question: Did he plan to ordain Abbot Carlyle a priest, as rumored, at a ceremony already scheduled to take place in three days? Grafton responded that "It is a mistake that the Abbot is to be ordained here." On the same day that this disclaimer appeared in the press, however, Bishop Grafton did ordain Abbot Aelred Carlyle a deacon at St. Peter's Church in Ripon.

Three days later, on November 15, the same paper conducted an interview with Carlyle before he began a tour of Wisconsin. The possibility of the American branch or foundation naturally became a subject of interest. Asked why he planned to leave the area so soon, Carlyle laughed and responded to the reporter's naive question. "That is so like you Americans," he replied, "When you hear that anything is to be done you expect it to be closed up in five minutes."<sup>20</sup> It would take at least two years to select and train suitable candidates. His other comments appeared to be rude or insensitive. Suggesting that "Americans live too fast," Carlyle pointed that "you are inclined to squabble," and he also noted that Americans "don't seem to take kindly to religious orders in this country." Abbot Carlyle argued that the United States needed the help and assistance of religious orders such as his Benedictines, and they could accomplish the most good if situated in the country and not in the large cities. He ended his words for the press on a critical and sarcastic note. Americans "are too devout worshippers of the almighty dollar," Carlyle told the reporter, and moreover they "are too anxious to secure the fruit of their labors for their own consumption." This tendency tended to create superficiality. "It causes the erection of such ugly buildings as these, (waving his hand in the direction of the main street vista)." This devotion to practicality, Abbot Carlyle concluded, often takes precedence over lasting qualities such as beauty and art.

The same day that the Fond du Lac newspaper published this interview with the visiting English Abbot, another more important event took place, but went unnoticed and unreported. On November 15, 1904, Bishop Charles Grafton ordained Abbot Aelred Carlyle a priest in the same church where he had conferred the order of deacon three days previously.<sup>21</sup> In accordance with the directive from the Archbishop of York, Grafton

---

<sup>19</sup> *Commonwealth*, 12 November 1904.

<sup>20</sup> *Commonwealth*, 15 November 1904.

<sup>21</sup> For the circumstances surrounding Abbot Carlyle's ordination to the priesthood in America and the deviations from normal church custom and practice, see P. Anson, *Abbot Extraordinary* and R. Kollar, *Abbot Aelred Carlyle*.

preserved the secrecy of the ceremony. During an interview about Carlyle and his brotherhood which appeared several days later in the local paper, Bishop Grafton said nothing about the Abbot's recent ordination, emphasizing instead the independent and American character which the new Benedictine foundation would enjoy and telling the readers that Carlyle's community "has shown its loyalty to the Anglican church [*sic*] by placing itself under the supervision of the episcopate and obtaining its sanction."<sup>22</sup>

Carlyle, now a priest, again agreed to take part in an interview for the local paper before he left Fond du Lac for a tour of Chicago, Boston and New York. Either buoyed up by his clerical orders or feeling a new sense of self-confidence, Abbot Carlyle candidly addressed issues dealing with American culture and the possible future of a Benedictine brotherhood in the state. Carlyle pointed out that Wisconsin impressed him most favorably, but, according to the paper, he "was not . . . going into ecstasies over America, although he was frank to admit it was a great country. . . ."<sup>23</sup> The English Abbot disliked the straightforward nature of some people whom he had met, and he had nothing positive to say about American cities. He also noticed that "you Americans are very much more addicted to the drug habit than the English are." The reason, Carlyle believed, was the hurried pace of the life. He did, however, recognize an area "in which you are much better than England." "There is not nearly the amount of drunkenness here that there is in England," Abbot Carlyle pointed out, and "You do not see drunken women on the streets in this country, while in England it is a common sight." Surprisingly, he spent little time discussing the future establishment of his Benedictines in Fond du Lac beside stating that it could not be rushed since the superior would have to receive some training in England and that several local men had already expressed an interest in the project.

Before he left Wisconsin, Abbot Carlyle informed his supporters back in England about the progress of his American trip through the pages of the community magazine, *Pax*. Carlyle told the readers that Bishop Grafton had invited him to visit the Diocese of Fond du Lac in order " . . . to see what possibilities there were in this country of [*sic*] the establishment of a Community of our Rule—the Bishop of Fond du Lac greatly desiring such a foundation."<sup>24</sup> But Carlyle recognized the problems associated with such a dream. "Everything here is so new, and on so vast a scale; the plentifulness of money, the incessant call for workers, the rush and excitement inevitable in the opening up of a great Continent, all militate against the apparent usefulness, the quiet regularity and slow growth of Community Life."<sup>25</sup> The state of Wisconsin's large population of immigrants with their respective religious creeds, he believed, tended to make the task of the

---

<sup>22</sup> *Commonwealth*, 18 November 1904.

<sup>23</sup> *Commonwealth*, 29 November 1904. *The Chicago Record Herald*, 9 December 1904, printed some of Abbot Carlyle's remarks about drugs and alcohol under the heading, "Abbot of Painsthorpe Declares Nation Is Addicted To Sedatives, While Britons Are Liquor Users."

<sup>24</sup> A. Carlyle, "Community Letter," *Pax* (December 1904), 43.

<sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*, 44.

Anglican Church “well nigh surmountable.” Abbot Carlyle also identified other obstacles which might hinder the growth of Anglican monastic life in the United States: the fast and hurried style of life, the sense of independence and individualism, and the current political climate. According to Carlyle, “The people, too, on account of the growth of Communism in this country, lack the historic sense, which is a certain factor in the Revival of the Religious Life on the ancient lines. On the other hand, several Americans had already expressed an interest in the Benedictinism. Although they would have to come to England for training, this new community must be American in membership and outlook. Carlyle’s letter, however, failed to inform his supporters that he had recently been ordained a priest by Bishop Grafton.

Abbot Carlyle gave some public talks on the revival of Benedictine life in the Anglican Church before departing for England, and one presentation, given at the Church of the Advent in Boston, received particularity good publicity. The *Boston Globe*, which complimented its report by publishing an attractive photograph of the young tonsured Abbot in monastic garb, described him as “a reincarnation of the old-time religieuse that inhabited the monasteries of Europe when Christianity was very young.”<sup>26</sup> Speaking on the theme of religious life, Carlyle told the parishioners that God certainly had a plan for every person, and some are called to the life of a monk, a person who “resigns all of the world’s legitimate pleasures and happiness in exchange for the three vows of poverty, obedience and chastity.”<sup>27</sup> The monastic vocation is noble, but he pointed that “it is no higher” than other professions or trades. The Abbot then went on to describe the differences between the contemplative and active types of monks, noting that both are based on the life of Christ, and he argued that the world needed people dedicated to the consecrated life of a religious. Authentic monks, Carlyle pointed out, would stand in stark contrast to the “pleasure, luxury-loving age as the present.”

Abbot Carlyle set sail for England and his Yorkshire monastery on December 7, 1904, and for several years all contact with Bishop Grafton and America ceased. Carlyle’s involvement in the foundation of a Benedictine brotherhood in the Diocese of Fond du Lac also came to a halt, although a monastery, St. Dunstan’s, was eventually established in Grafton’s diocese.<sup>28</sup> Abbot Carlyle’s revival in Great Britain appeared to be successful: the monks moved to Caldey Island in 1906, an ambitious building program commenced, applicants for the monastic life arrived, and he enjoyed the backing and support of the Anglo-Catholic party. For some time, however, the Abbot’s status in the Anglican Church had drawn some attention. Why, some queried, was Abbot Carlyle’s

---

<sup>26</sup> *Boston Globe*, 5 December 1904.

<sup>27</sup> *Ibid.* The *Boston Herald* also carried extracts from Abbot Carlyle’s Sunday morning sermon at the Church of the Advent.

<sup>28</sup> For a short history of St. Dunstan’s monastery, see P. Anson, *The Call of the Cloister. Religious Communities and Kindred Bodies in the Anglican Communion* (London: SPCK, 1964), 192-93. Apparently little or no contact existed between Carlyle’s brotherhood and his American counterpart.

name omitted from the official directory of the Anglican Church, *Crockford's Clerical Directory*?<sup>29</sup> A crisis eventually broke out during the summer of 1912. Carlyle wanted some of his monks ordained priests, but the Archbishop of Canterbury, Randall Davidson, demanded abbatial assurances that the liturgical and devotional guidelines of the Anglican Church, especially the exclusive use of the Book of Common Prayer, would be followed by these candidates for the priesthood. Hoping to avoid a confrontation with Lambeth Palace, Carlyle turned to his old friend, Bishop Charles Grafton, and asked him to ordain these monks for liturgical services exclusively within the Caldey monastery, and this, in Carlyle's mind, would free them from the obligation to use the Anglican Prayer Book.

Abbot Carlyle wrote a lengthy letter to Bishop Charles Grafton on July 24, 1912. The Abbot gave a brief history of recent events on Caldey Island, especially the struggle the monks were facing about remaining within the Anglican Church. For the present, he told Bishop Grafton, they would stay Anglican. Carlyle then moved to the chief point of the letter: "The question I put to your Lordship is therefore to ask if you can see your way to ordain these two Monks to the Priesthood for work in the Monastery, provided that the Archbishop of Canterbury [Randall Davidson] offers no opposition."<sup>30</sup> Carlyle did not fail to mention the past kindnesses of the Bishop toward his Anglican Benedictines. "You have been so good to us and are yourself so deeply and practically interested in the revival of the Benedictine Life, that I feel sure you will at least consider this request, and grant it if it seems proper to you to do so." Following his own example, the Caldey monks would journey to the Diocese of Fond du Lac to receive Holy Orders.

Grafton responded and told Carlyle that he would certainly ordain the monks if the Archbishop of Canterbury gave his approval. Consequently, Carlyle approached Archbishop Davidson for the permission to send the two monks to America. In reply, the Archbishop of Canterbury informed Carlyle that Bishop Grafton had suddenly died on August 30, and the issue of the ordination of the Caldey Benedictines" . . . must in any case be postponed for the present."<sup>31</sup> Abbot Carlyle then wrote to Grafton's episcopal successor at Fond du Lac, Reginald Weller, sent him copies of his correspondence with

---

<sup>29</sup> See P. Anson, *Abbot Extraordinary* and R. Kollar, *Abbot Aelred Carlyle* surrounding the omission of Carlyle's name from *Crockford's*. Abbot Carlyle did not possess the required license to function as an Anglican priest. During his last years as an Anglican, Carlyle attempted to procure the license from the Archbishop of Canterbury, Randall Davidson. Davidson demanded that Carlyle must first agree to the appointment of an episcopal Visitor who would study the life on Caldey Island and then report back to the Archbishop. The Visitor, Charles Gore, the Bishop of Oxford, demanded several changes in Caldey's devotional life, which were Roman Catholic in letter and spirit, in order to bring the monks back within the comprehensiveness of the Anglican Church. Abbot Carlyle's refusal to accept Gore's demands was the cause for the conversion of the Caldey monks to Roman Catholicism in February 1913.

<sup>30</sup> A. Carlyle to Grafton, 24 July 1912, Carlyle Papers, Prinknash Abbey Archives. The correspondence with Grafton and his successor, Reginald Weller, is contained in *A Correspondence*.

<sup>31</sup> Davidson to Carlyle, 5 September 1912, Carlyle Papers, Prinknash Abbey.



Bishop Grafton, and asked if he would ordain his two monks to the priesthood. Weller replied that he would perform the ceremony if the Archbishop of Canterbury gave permission, and this action effectively killed any possibility of the Caldey Benedictines receiving orders in America. Carlyle did not press the issue any further with Bishop Weller.

Abbot Carlyle and the majority of the monks on Caldey Island eventually converted to Roman Catholicism in February 1913.<sup>32</sup> This action received attention in America. *The New York Tribune* announced the news of the conversion and printed a short history of the community,<sup>33</sup> and *The New York Times* pointed out the American association with Caldey. The latter paper reported that "the community . . . owed its inception largely to the financial support of Americans."<sup>34</sup> *The Living Church*, a paper published in Milwaukee which had supported Carlyle during his 1904 visit to America, now heaped scorn on Abbot Carlyle. It described the conversion as the "apostasy of the English Benedictines,"<sup>35</sup> and another edition characterized Carlyle as a religious despot, ridiculed the Latin liturgy and the contemplative life of the Caldey monks, and argued that the monks did not convert because of religious principles but because "they could not have the Bishop of Oxford [Charles Gore] as episcopal Visitor to the Community on their own conditions."<sup>36</sup> "And it would seem indeed that nothing less than treachery towards the Church of God in this land has lurked in this community for some considerable time past."

As the Roman Catholic Abbot of Caldey, Aelred Carlyle continued to turn to America in times of crisis and difficulty, but his first trip back there in the spring of 1918 proved disappointing. Expecting some financial generosity from friends and supporters to help Caldey's problems, Carlyle was disappointed. His letter in *Pax* informed the readers that "vast sums of money were flowing into war channels."<sup>37</sup> He recognized the strength of Roman Catholicism in the country and its apparent wealth, but soon realized that the

---

<sup>32</sup> Before he would become the episcopal Visitor of Caldey Island, a prerequisite before Carlyle could receive the required license, Bishop Gore of Oxford demanded that the property of the community must be legally secured to the Church of England, the Book of Common Prayer must be used exclusively in the monastery's devotions, the Marian doctrines of the Immaculate Conception and the Immaculate Conception must be abandoned, and Exposition of the Blessed Sacrament, Benediction, and "Exposition of Relics" must be curtailed. The Caldey monks refused to accept Gore's demands and sought admission into the Church of Rome.

<sup>33</sup> *New York Tribune*, 22 March 1913.

<sup>34</sup> *New York Times*, 2 March 1913.

<sup>35</sup> *The Living Church*, 8 March 1913. In addition to favorable press coverage of Carlyle's tour of America, the newspaper had also printed a lengthy article, "The Benedictine Monks of Painsthorpe Abbey," in November 1904 which supported Abbot Carlyle's revival of Benedictinism within the Anglican Church. It described the history of the Anglican Benedictines, their daily schedule and work, and the general good spiritual health of Carlyle's monastery in Yorkshire.

<sup>36</sup> *The Living Church*, 22 March 1913.

<sup>37</sup> A. Carlyle, "The Abbot's Letter," *Pax* 9 (Winter 1917-18): 205.

war effort had become the immediate concern of all Americans. "Caldey's need was recognized as a true war need, and much interest expressed," Carlyle sadly wrote, "But I realized the truth of what I was told, that it would take longer than I had supposed to focus that interest in such a way to be of direct help to Caldey...."<sup>38</sup>

Although he failed in this attempt to secure funds for his monastery, Abbot Carlyle never completely severed his contact with America. In 1921, he resigned as Abbot of Caldey, and in the following year took up residence in British Columbia. In 1936, Carlyle was incardinated into the Archdiocese of Vancouver, and two years later he embarked on a tour of California, Nevada, Idaho, and Oregon, where he visited Mount Angel Abbey. Carlyle lived and worked in Vancouver until 1951, when he returned to England. He died on October 14, 1955, and was buried at Prinknash Abbey in Gloucestershire, where the Caldey community had moved in 1928. To the end of his life, Abbot Carlyle continued to remain in contact with friends and acquaintances in America.

---

<sup>38</sup> Ibid., 208-09.