

METACOSMESIS:
THE CHRISTIAN MARXISM OF FREDERIC HASTINGS SMYTH
AND THE SOCIETY OF THE CATHOLIC COMMONWEALTH

By Terry M. Brown

Dissertation

**Submitted to the Historical Department of the Toronto School
of Theology, University of Toronto, in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Theology.**

March 10, 1987

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	iii
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. THE MAKING OF A CHRISTIAN MARXIST	20
1. Early Formation (1888-1910)	20
2. The Scientist (1910-25)	27
3. The Dilettante (1925-1929)	34
4. Return to Christian Faith (1929-31)	42
5. Christian Marxist (1932-39)	49
III. THE SOCIETY OF THE CATHOLIC COMMONWEALTH	82
1. American Christian Marxists (1939-48)	82
2. Revolutionary Cells (1947-58)	112
3. Decline and Disappearance (1955-67)	135
IV. CHRISTIAN MATERIALISM	168
V. CHRISTIAN DIALECTICS	232
VI. THE CHRISTIAN CELL	284
VII. EVALUATION AND CONCLUSION	346
VIII. BIBLIOGRAPHY	382

PREFACE

This dissertation began eight years ago with a plan to write a book on F. Hastings Smyth and the Society of the Catholic Commonwealth. Initial reading of primary sources and research by correspondence took place during my last three years of teaching at Bishop Patteson Theological Centre in the Solomon Islands. I continued the research for three years at Trinity College, Toronto, where the book turned into a doctoral dissertation. The last two years of writing have taken place in the midst of my work as Asia/Pacific mission coordinator of the Anglican Church of Canada.

There are many people to whom I would like to express appreciation for their cooperation and support in the writing of this dissertation.

First, this dissertation clearly would not have been possible without the cooperation and openness of Elmer J. Smith of Prince William, New Brunswick, last superior of the Society of the Catholic Commonwealth. His decision to give me access to and then long-term loan of the archives of the Society of the Catholic Commonwealth (including Smyth's personal papers) made writing on Smyth and the S.C.C. both feasible and exciting. I am also thankful for the many hours he has spent with me and his fine example as a priest.

Second, almost all of the living former members of

the Society of the Catholic Commonwealth (some have died since my interviews with them) have cooperated in providing archival material, recollections and encouragement for this dissertation. Their names occur throughout the text and in the footnotes. I must especially thank Marjorie and Cyril Powles, Alice and Dan Heap, Anne and Bruce Mutch, Mary and John Wagland, David Rigby, Margaret and Jack Adam, Margaret and Edgar Assels, Robert Wild, Robert Crouse, Carman Carson and George Parker of the Canadian cells; Bros. Paul and Francis, O.I.W., Ed Seldon, Herbert Cahoon, Marshall Swan, Reed and James Pfeufer, Al Putnam, Peter Ruderman, Hugo Munsterburg, Henry Veatch, Frank Carthy, Fred Jansen, William Van Meter, Dieter Goetze, Alden Powers, Archer Torrey, Helen and Roger Ray, Nadine Pendleton, Jonathan Bayliss and Tim and Linda Hall of the American cells; Isabel and John Rowe, Sherry and Tom Waldon and Valerie Richards of the English cell; and Reiko Shimada, Christopher Yazawa and David Tsukada of the Japanese cells.

Smyth's family members, friends and early associates of the Oratory were also cooperative. I am especially grateful to Smyth's cousins, Alice Smyth Creighton, Charles P. Smyth, Henry De Wolf Smyth and Carol Mott Butler, for material on Smyth's early years; Mary Balmer, T.M. Parker, Michael Scott and Herbert Rees for material on Smyth's years in England; David Cochran, Philip V. Rogers, Edgar B. Graves, George Nesbitt, John M. Moore, J.A. Rockwell, H.

William Foreman, Dudley Dennison and Robert L. Jacoby for material on the Clinton oratory; Henry Knox Sherrill, William N. Dale, John R. Watt, Paul Haldeman, Joseph Fletcher, Frank Touchet and Anson B. Stokes for material on the Cambridge oratory. Many others have also provided material and recollections. I am grateful to all of them.

Several archives and libraries have provided very helpful material. I am particularly thankful to the Hamilton College Library, Clinton, New York; the Archives of the Episcopal Church, Austin Texas; the Geophysical Laboratory Library of the Carnegie Institution, Washington; the Beinecke Library, Yale University; the archives of Christ Church, Cambridge; the Episcopal Divinity School Library, Cambridge; the Arents Research Library, Syracuse University; and the Swarthmore College Peace Collection. I am thankful to the superior of the Order of the Holy Cross, Clark W. Trafton, O.H.C., for access to the O.H.C. archives in the Episcopal Church Archives. I must especially mention the helpful cooperation of Frank K. Lorenz of the Hamilton College Library, V. Nelle Bellamy and Elinor S. Hearn of the Archives of the Episcopal Church, Dolores M. Petry of the Carnegie Institute Geophysical Laboratory Library, and Mrs. A.L. Pike and Mrs. J.H. Chadbourn of Christ Church, Cambridge, archives.

I am thankful to the bishop of Chichester, E.W. Kemp, for providing access to Bishop George Bell's ordination candidates book; Mrs. Valerie Eliot for providing

copies of Smyth's letters to T.S. Eliot; Robert S. Russell for providing a copy of John Forbes Russell's essay on the S.C.C.; Jonathan Bayliss for his early notes for a Smyth biography; Richard Young for preserving the Van Meter S.C.C. papers; the registrar's offices of Hamilton College and General Theological Seminary and the alumni offices of Hamilton College, the Massachusetts Institute of Technology and Princeton University for providing biographical material on Smyth and Johnston.

I am grateful to James E. Frang for obtaining Smyth's and the Society's F.B.I. files under the Freedom of Information Act; Mary de Rachewiltz for help with the Ezra Pound Collection at the Beinecke Library; Teresa Thompson of the General Synod archives of the Anglican Church of Canada for advice on cataloguing the S.C.C. papers; and Tim Wainwright for proofreading the final copy of the dissertation.

I am thankful for the support and advice of my thesis director, Cyril Powles, and the other two members of the thesis committee, Lee Cormie and Roger Hutchinson. I am thankful to John Rowe for his comments on the first draft of the concluding chapter. The Historical Department of the Toronto School of Theology and the Divinity Faculty of Trinity College have also provided much encouragement.

I am also grateful for financial support given to this dissertation by the St. Augustine of Canterbury Foundation, Canterbury, England in 1983-84 and the Social Sciences

and Humanities Reseach Council of Canada in 1984-85. I am also thankful for study leave provided by the General Synod of the Anglican Church of Canada.

It is difficult to pursue a project such as this one over many years without a great deal of personal support and encouragement. I am thankful to my parents who have encouraged me throughout. Much of the day-to-day stress of graduate study and the researching and writing of this dissertation has been borne by my housemates of Eirene House; I must especially thank Cathy Goring, Nissa Basbaum, Robin Barrett, Robin Graves, Curtis Metzger, Susan Storey and Tim Wainwright. Marjorie and Cyril Powles have been a source of constant encouragement. Likewise, the small community of Toronto School of Theology graduate students has provided much support and encouragement; I am especially thankful to Chris Lind, Virginia Peacock, Robert Black, Lee Jae-Joung and Pauline Bradbrook. A great collection of other friends around the world have also encouraged me along; I must especially mention Heather Musgrove, Alice Medcof, Mary Brown Parlee, Frank Touchet, friends at Church of the Epiphany, Scarborough, Mary and Robert Hagesi and staff and former students of Bishop Patteson Theological Centre, Ellison Pogo, John Lapli, George Siru, Mostyn Anisi, Caulton Medobu, Isagani Fabito, Primo Racimo, Roniel Ostoy and many other friends in Asia and the Pacific. Finally, my colleagues at Church House have also been a source of much encouragement;

I am thankful to Clarke Raymond and John Barton for enabling my study leave, to the Asia/Pacific team for their constant support and for the daily encouragement of Barbara Newton and John Rye.

This dissertation, then, owes much to many people. I hope the effort has been worthwhile. In the end, I hope it may in some small way be helpful in promoting justice and peace in an oppressed and suffering world.

T.M.B.

Trinity College, Toronto

March 1987