

OF RECEIVING FOR OTHERS.

THE EIGHTEENTH ARTICLE.

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

OR that the priest had then authority to communicate and to receive the sacrament for others⁷, as they do.

[OF THE PRIEST'S SAYING MASS FOR ANOTHER.—ARTICLE XVIII. H. A. 1564.]

M. HARDING. THE FIRST DIVISION.

What you would say, M. Jewel, I wot not: what you say, I will not⁸. Verily we do not communicate ne receive the sacrament for another. Neither hath it ever been taught in the catholic church, that the priest receive the sacrament for another. (231) We receive not the sacrament for another, no more than we receive the sacrament of baptism, or the sacrament of penance, or the sacrament of matrimony one for another. Indeed the priest saith mass for others, where he receiveth that he hath offered, and that is it you mean, I guess; in which mass, being the external sacrifice of the new testament, according unto Christ's institution, the thing that is offered is such as maketh our petitions and requests acceptable to God, as St Cyprian saith: In hujus [(corporis)] præsentia non supervacue mendicant lacrymæ veniam⁹: "In the presence of this body tears crave not forgiveness in vain."

The priest receiveth not the sacrament for another.

The two hundred and thirty-first untruth. For in the church of Rome the priest receiveth for others, as it shall appear.

That the oblation of the mass is done for others than for the priest alone which celebrateth it, may sufficiently be proved by an hundred places of the fathers: the matters¹⁰ being undoubted, two or three may suffice. First, Chrysostom writeth thus in an homily upon the Acts: Quid dicis? in manibus est hostia, et omnia proposita sunt bene ordinata: adsunt angeli, adsunt archangeli, adest Filius Dei, cum tanto horrore adstant omnes, adstant illi clamantes, omnibus silentibus; et putas simpliciter hæc fieri? Igitur et alia simpliciter, et quæ pro ecclesia, et quæ pro sacerdotibus offeruntur, et quæ pro plenitudine ac ubertate? absit. Sed omnia cum fide fiunt¹¹: "What sayest thou hereto? The host is in the priest's hands; and all things set forth are in due order. The angels be present, the archangels be present, the Son of God is present. Whereas all stand there with so great fear, whereas all they stand there crying out to God, and all other hold their peace, thinkest thou that¹² these things be done simply and without great cause? Why then be those other things done also simply, both the things which are offered for the church, for the priests, for¹³ plenty and abundance? God forbid. But all things are done with faith."

In Sermone de Cena Domini.

In Acta, Hom. 21.

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Here M. Harding of the printer's negligence hath taken good occasion to refresh himself out of season, and to play merrily with these two words, "for another." Which thing would rather become some other man than a doctor, professing such a countenance of gravity as do few others. It might¹⁴ have

[⁷ For another, H. A. 1564.]

[⁸ Well I wot, 1565, 1609, and H. A. 1564.]

[⁹ Cypr. Op. Oxon. 1682. De Cæn. Dom. (Arnold.) p. 43; where *supervacua*.]

[¹⁰ Matter, H. A. 1564.]

[¹¹ Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. In Act. Apost.

Hom. xxi. Tom. IX. p. 176.]

[¹² H. A. 1564, omits *that*.]

[¹³ H. A. 1564, omits *the church, for the priests, for*. They are supplied in H. A. 1565.]

[¹⁴ Mought, 1565.]

Presence. pleased him, without any great prejudice or hinderance of his cause, to allow us some simple ability of speaking English.

But God's judgments be just. He that will scorn shall be scorned. M. Harding, that is so learned, so circumspect, so curious, and maketh himself so merry with the error of one poor syllable committed only by the printer in my book, in the self-same place, and in the next side following, hath erred five syllables together in his own book; as it may easily appear by that his friend for shame hath restored and amended the same with his pen¹.

Howbeit, as he, so favourably bearing his own errors, is so witty to play with syllables, and so sharp and ready to carp others; so in this whole article, as poor apothecaries for want commonly use to do, he serveth out *quid pro quo*, and, instead of receiving the communion or sacrament for others, he sheweth us prayers, and sacrifices, and I know not what, and so allegeth one thing for another.

Whether the priest in the church of Rome have used to receive the sacrament for others or no, (which thing M. Harding now utterly denieth, and saith it was never used nor never meant,) in the end hereof, God willing, it shall appear.

"The thing that is offered," saith M. Harding, "maketh our prayers acceptable unto God." True it is, God accepteth and mercifully beholdeth both us and also our prayers², and our whole obedience, in Jesus Christ his Son, and for his only sake; not for that he is now or can be offered verily and really by the priest, but only for that he was once offered for all upon the cross. St Paul saith: "By Christ we have access to the throne of grace." Christ himself saith: "No man cometh to my Father but by me." Irenæus saith: "Christ (being in heaven) is our altar; and upon him we must offer up and lay our prayers³." And therefore in time⁴ of the holy mysteries the deacon saith thus unto the people: "Lift up your hearts."

But St Cyprian saith: "*In hujus [corporis] præsentia*⁵: "In the presence of this body." Howbeit, St Cyprian saith not, In the local presence of this body: for such presence M. Harding himself hath already refused. He meaneth only the presence of faith, and the virtue and power of Christ's body. And in this sense St Augustine saith: *Rerum absentium præsens est fides; et rerum, quæ foris sunt, intus est fides*⁶: "Of things that be absent faith is present: of things that be without faith is within." Again he saith: *Accedamus ad Jesum, non carne, sed corde; non corporis præsentia, sed fidei potentia*⁷: "Let us approach unto Jesus, not with our flesh, but with our heart; not with presence of body, but with power of faith." Likewise again: *Habes Christum... in præsentia, et in futuro: in præsentia per fidem; in præsentia per signum; in præsentia per baptismatis sacramentum; in præsentia per altaris cibum et potum*⁸: "Thou hast Christ both in the time present and also in the time to come: in the time present by faith; in the time present by the sign (of the cross in thy forehead); in the time present by the sacrament of baptism; in the time present by the meat and drink of the altar (or communion-table)." St Hierome, writing the epitaph of Paula unto Eustochium, saith thus: *Paula ingressa in stabulum, me audiente, jurabat cernere [se] oculis fidei infantem pannis involutum, [et] vagientem in præsepi Dominum*⁹: "Paula, entering into the stable (at Bethlehem), affirmed with an oath, in my hearing, that with the eyes of her faith she saw (Christ, as) an infant in his swathing-clouts, and the Lord crying in the manger like a child." So mighty is the power of faith. That virtuous lady Paula saw by faith that indeed she saw not. She saw Christ

[¹ See the preceding page, note 13.]

[² Also all our prayers, 1565, 1609.]

[³ Est ergo altare in cælis; illic enim preces nostræ et oblationes diriguntur.—Iren. Op. Par. 1710. Contr. Har. Lib. iv. cap. xviii. G. p. 252.]

[⁴ In the time, 1565.]

[⁵ Cyp. Op. De Cæn. Dom. (Arnold.) p. 43.]

[⁶ August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. De Trin. Lib. xiii. 3. Tom. VIII. col. 928.]

[⁷ There appears to be an error in the reference

given; as the words quoted do not appear in the Tractat. adv. Jud. They may be found, however, Contr. Faust. Lib. xxxiii. cap. viii. Tom. VIII. col. 468; where *accedant*.]

[⁸ Id. in Johan. Evang. cap. xii. Tractat. l. 12. Tom. III. Pars II. col. 633.]

[⁹ Atque in Bethleem ingressa...postquam vidit...stabulum...me, &c.—Hieron. Op. 1693-1706. Ad Eustoch. Epist. lxxxvi. Tom. IV. Pars II. col. 674.]

Fol. 172. b.
line 19.

Heb. iv.

Johan. xiv.

Iren. Lib. iv.
cap. xxxiv.

Cyp. de
Cæn. Dom.

August. de
Trin. Lib. iii.

August. adv.
Jud. cap. i.

August. in
Johan.
Tract. 51.

Hieron. ad
Eustoch. de
Epitaph.
Paul.

as an infant in his swathing-clouts; and yet then Christ was neither infant, nor swathed in clouts, nor in corporal presence indeed and verily present there. Therefore St Augustine saith: *Absentia Domini non est absens. Habe fidem, et tecum est, quem non rides*¹⁰: "The absence of our Lord is not absent. Have faith; and he whom thou seest not is present with thee." Likewise St Ambrose saith: "St Stephen, standing in the earth, toucheth the Lord being in heaven"¹¹.

Presence.

Thus saith St Cyprian: "Christ's body is present at the holy communion, not by any corporal or real presence, but by the effectual working and force of faith." In like sort Eusebius Emissenus saith: *Ut perennis illa victima viveret in memoria, et semper præsens esset in gratia*¹²: "That that everlasting sacrifice might live in our remembrance, and evermore be present in grace." He saith not, that the sacrifice of Christ's body should be present locally, really, verily, or indeed, but in remembrance and in grace. Germanus hereof writeth thus: *Non amplius super terram sumus; sed in throno Dei regi assistimus in cælis, ubi Christus est*¹³: "We are no longer upon the earth; but we are assistant unto the king in the throne of God in heaven, where Christ is." For that Lamb's sake, whom we thus see and thus have present, whatsoever we pray, our tears beg not in vain. For he is our Advocate and Mediator, and evermore maketh intercession for us. Whatsoever we desire the Father in his name, shall be done unto us.

Ambros. Serm. 58. De Magd.

De Consecr. Dist. ii. Quia corpus.

German. in Rer. Eccles. Theor.

I John ii. Rom. viii. Heb. vii. John xvi.

Thus "the angels and archangels," as Chrysostom by way of amplification saith, "lifting up, and shewing forth, and presenting unto God in heaven that body of Christ, make their prayers for mankind, and thus they say: For them we pray, O Lord, whom thou lovedst so tenderly, that for their salvation it pleased thee to suffer death, and to yield thy soul upon the cross: for them we pray, for whom thou hast given thy blood, and offered up this body"¹⁴.

Chrysost. de Incomp. Dei Nat. Hom. 3.

This certainly is the meaning of Chrysostom's words. And therefore he saith again: "Whether we pray for the church, or for the ministers, or for the increase of the earth, our prayers are acceptable unto God only in Christ and for his sake"¹⁵.

Touching that he writeth further of the presence and assistance of angels and heavenly powers, it is the ordinary manner and course of Chrysostom's eloquence, and serveth him both to beautify the matter, and also to stir up and inflame the hearers' minds; and that not only in the time of the holy mysteries, but also at all other holy assemblies and public prayers. For thus he saith unto the people: *Angeli sunt ubique, et maxime in domo Dei adsunt regi, et omnia plena sunt incorporeis illis virtutibus*¹⁶: "The angels of God are every where, but specially in the house of God. They are assistant unto the king; and all places are full of spiritual powers." In like manner of amplification he saith: "The martyrs are here present in the church. If thou wilt see them, open the eyes of thy faith, and thou shalt see a great company"¹⁷.

Chrysost. Hom. 15. ad Heb.

Chrysost. in Hom. de Ascens.

So saith St Basil: "The angels of God are present amongst us, and mark and register them that keep their fast"¹⁸. So saith Tertullian: "Let no man

Basil. de Jejun. Hom. 2. Tertull. de Baptism.

¹⁰ August. Op. Serm. cccxxv. In Dieb. Pasch. vi. 3. Tom. V. col. 990; where *non est absentia*, and *habeto*.]

¹¹ Stephanus in terris positus Christum tangit in cælo.—Maxim. Taur. Hom. ad calc. Leon. Magni Op. Lut. 1623. De Sep. Dom. et de Mar. Magdal. Hom. iv. col. 612. See before, page 499, note 10.]

¹² Euseb. Emiss. in Corp. Jur. Can. 1624. Decret. Gratian. Decr. Tert. Pars, De Consecr. Dist. ii. can. 35. col. 1927; where *et perennis victima illa*.]

¹³ German. Constant. Rer. Eccles. Contempl. in Biblioth. Vet. Patr. Stud. Galland. Venet. 1765-81. Tom. XIII. p. 225.]

¹⁴ ... οὕτω δὴ καὶ οἱ ἄγγελοι τότε ἀντὶ κλάδων ἑλαιῶν αὐτὸ τὸ σῶμα τὸ δεσποτικὸν προτεινόμενοι, τὸν Δεσπότην παρακαλοῦσιν ὑπὲρ τῆς ἀνθρωπίνης φύσεως, μονονουχὶ λέγοντες, ὅτι ὑπὲρ τούτων δέομεθα, οὐς αὐτὸς φθάσας οὕτως ἀγαπήσαι κατηξί-

ωσας, ὡς τὴν ψυχὴν ἐπιδοῦναι τὴν σεαυτοῦ ὑπὲρ τούτων ἐκχέομεν τὰς ἰκετηρίας, ὑπὲρ ὧν αὐτὸς τὸ αἷμα ἐξέχεας, ὑπὲρ τούτων παρακαλοῦμεν, ὑπὲρ ὧν τὸ σῶμα τοῦτο κατέβυσας.—Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. De Incomp. Dei Nat. Hom. iii. Tom. I. p. 470.]

¹⁵ The passage referred to is that quoted in p. 739.]

¹⁶ Id. in Epist. ad Hebr. cap. ix. Hom. xv. Tom. XII. p. 156.]

¹⁷ Καὶ γὰρ καὶ ἄγγελοι πάρεισιν, ἀγγέλων καὶ μαρτύρων ἡ σύνοδος γέγονε σήμερον. καὶ εἰ βούλει ἰδεῖν καὶ μάρτυρας καὶ ἀγγέλους, ἀνοιξον τῆς πίστεως τοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς, καὶ ὄψει τὸ θέατρον ἐκεῖνο.—Id. In Ascens. Dom. Hom. Tom. II. p. 448.]

¹⁸ Ἄγγελοί εἰσιν οἱ καθ' ἑκάστην ἐκκλησίαν ἀπογραφόμενοι τοὺς νηστεύοντας.—Basil. Op. Par. 1721-30. De Jejun. Hom. ii. Tom. II. p. 11.]

be hard to believe that the holy angel of God is present, and tempereth the water to the salvation of man¹."

This is it that Chrysostom meaneth by his vehement exornation of the presence of angels.

And whereas M. Harding saith he hath passed over an² hundred authorities and more that might be alleged to like purpose, this is one of his accustomed colours, and an artificial shift of his rhetoric. Verily, hitherto he hath not found one authority to prove that thing that is in question.

M. HARDING. THE SECOND DIVISION.

St Ambrose, in his funeral oration of the death³ of Valentinian the emperor, calling the sacrament of the altar the holy and heavenly mysteries and the oblation of our mother (by which term he understandeth the church), saith that he will prosecute the holy⁴ soul of that emperor with the same⁵. This father, writing upon the 38th Psalm, exhorteth priests to follow Christ, that, as he offered for us his blood, so priests offer sacrifice for the people. His words be these: Vidimus Principem sacerdotum, &c.⁶: "We have seen the Prince of priests coming unto us: we have seen and heard him offering for us his blood. Let us that be priests follow as we can, so as we offer sacrifice for the people, though weak in merit, yet honourable for the sacrifice," &c.

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

This objection is easily answered. St Ambrose saith that in the congregation, and in the time of the holy mysteries, he would offer up unto God praises and thanksgiving for that godly emperor Valentinian. But he saith not that he would offer Christ the Son of God unto God his Father, or receive the sacrament for the emperor. Therefore M. Harding might well have passed this authority over among the rest.

Neither did St Ambrose think that the emperor Valentinian was in purgatory, whereas M. Harding imagineth he might be relieved; but contrariwise he presumeth him undoubtedly to be in heaven. For thus he writeth of him: *Quenam est hæc anima, &c.⁷*: "What is this soul that looketh forth as the day-star, beautiful as the moon, chosen as the sun? O blessed soul, thou lookest down from above upon us, being here beneath: thou hast escaped the darkness of this world: thou art as bright as the moon: thou shinest as the sun." Further he saith: *Cum fratre conjunctus æternæ vitæ fruitur voluptate. Beati ambo⁸*: "Being now with his brother, he enjoyeth the pleasure of everlasting life. Blessed are they both." Therefore the sacrifice that St Ambrose made was not a propitiatory, or satisfactory, or other like mass, whereby M. Harding thinketh himself able to bail souls out of purgatory; but only a sacrifice of thanksgiving for that godly emperor, being now in heaven.

The other place of St Ambrose, as it nothing toucheth this question, so it is already answered fully and at large, Artic. VI, Divis. 7, and Artic. XVII, Divis. 12.

[¹ Ne quis durius credat angelum Dei sanctum aquis in salutem hominis temperandis adesse.—Tertull. Op. Lut. 1641. De Baptism. 5. p. 258.]

[² A, 1565, 1609.]

[³ Made of the death, H. A. 1564.]

[⁴ Godly, H. A. 1564. But H. A. 1565 has *holy*.]

[⁵ Date manibus sancta mysteria, pio requiem ejus poscamus affectu. Date sacramenta cœlestia, animam nepotis nostris [*al. animam piam matris*] oblationibus prosequamur. Extollite populi mecum manus in sancta, ut eo saltem munere vicem ejus

meritis rependamus.—Ambros. Op. Par. 1686-90. De Obit. Valent. Consol. 56. Tom. II. col. 1189.]

[⁶ Id. in Psalm. xxxviii. Enarr. 25. Tom. I. col. 853. See before, page 490, note 5, and page 729, note 12.]

[⁷ Quenam est hæc prospiciens sicut diluculum, speciosa ut luna, electa ut sol?...Prospicis nos igitur, sancta anima, de loco superiore, tamquam inferiora respiciens. Existi de tenebris istius seculi, et ut luna resplendes, ut sol refulges.—Id. De Obit. Valent. Consol. 64. Tom. II. cols. 1190, 1.]

[⁸ Id. *ibid.* 77, 8. col. 1194.]

M. HARDING. THE THIRD DIVISION.

That the oblation of the mass is profitably made for others, St Gregory witnesseth very plainly, homilia 37, expounding the place of St Luke, cap. xiv.: Alioqui...legationem mittens, ea quæ pacis sunt postulat: "Else he sendeth forth an ambassade, and sueth for peace." Hereupon he saith thus: Mittamus ad Dominum...legationem nostram, flendo⁹...sacras hostias offerendo. Singulariter namque ad absolutionem nostram, oblata cum lacrymis et benignitate mentis, sacri¹⁰ altaris hostia suffragatur¹¹: "Let us send to our Lord our ambassade, with weeping, giving alms¹², and offering of holy hosts. For the host of the holy altar (that is, the blessed sacrament) offered with tears, and with the merciful bounty of our mind, helpeth us singularly to be assoiled." In that homily he sheweth that the oblation of Christ's body in this sacrament present, which is done in the mass, is help and comfort not only to them that be present, but also to them that be absent, both quick and dead, which he proveth by example¹³ of his own knowledge.

Whoso listeth to see antiquity for proof hereof, and that in the apostles' time bishops and priests in the dreadful sacrifice offered and prayed for others, as for every state and order of men, and also for wholesomeness of the air, and for fertility of the fruits of the earth, &c., let him read the eighth book of the Constitutions of the Apostles set forth by Clement¹⁴.

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Prayer for the dead is none of those articles that M. Harding hath taken in hand to prove. And therefore, as his manner is, he sheweth us one thing for another. This kind of prayer, although it be mere superstitious, and utterly without warrant of God's word, yet I confess it was many wheres received and used, both in Gregory's time and also long before, and is avouched of Gregory by a number of vain and childish fables. Touching the sacrifice of the holy communion he saith: "In this mystery Christ suffereth again for our sake: in this mystery Christ dieth: we offer up the sacrifice of his passion: we renew again his passion unto ourselves¹⁵." As Christ suffereth and dieth, and as his passion and death is renewed in the holy communion; even so is he offered and sacrificed in the same, that is to say, as Gregory expoundeth himself, by representation and by memory, and not verily, really, or indeed.

Touching the matter itself that standeth in question, Gregory saith not, neither here nor elsewhere, either that the priest receiveth the communion for the rest of his parish, or that one man's receiving is available for another.

The sacrifice that he nameth is no more the sacrifice of the priest than the sacrifice of any other of all the people. For thus he writeth in the same fable: *Toties mariti vincula solvebantur in captivitate, quoties ab ejus conjuge oblata fuis-* sent *hostiæ pro ejus animæ absolutione*¹⁶: "The husband being taken prisoner had his gyves loosed from him as often as his wife offered up sacrifice for his soul."

The words of this supposed Clement, by whom M. Harding would seem to claim a shew of great antiquity, nothing touch the thing that is demanded. For thus only he saith: *Offerimus tibi, Regi et Deo, &c.*¹⁷: "We offer up unto thee, our

De Consecr.
Dist. 2.
Quid sit.
Iterum in
hoc mysterio
moritur.
Gregor. in
Evang. Hom.
37.

Gregor. in
Evang.
Hom. 37.

⁹ Flendo, tribuendo, sacras, H. A. 1564. But H. A. 1565 omits *tribuendo*.]

¹⁰ Sacris, 1609, 1611.]

¹¹ Gregor. Magni Papæ I. Op. Par. 1705. In Evang. Lib. II. Hom. xxxvii. 6, 7. Tom. I. cols. 1630, 1; where *alioquin, rogat ea quæ pacis sunt, and mittamus ad hunc*.]

¹² Almose, 1565, and H. A. 1564.]

¹³ Examples, 1565, and H. A. 1564.]

¹⁴ Constit. Apost. Lib. VIII. capp. xii. xv. in Concl. Stud. Labb. et Cossart. Lut. Par. 1671-2. Tom. I. cols. 482, 6.]

¹⁵ ... quia is qui in se resurgens a mortuis jam

non moritur, adhuc per hanc in suo mysterio pro nobis iterum patitur. Nam quoties ei hostiam suæ passionis offerimus, toties nobis ad absolutionem nostram passionem illius reparamus.—Gregor. Magni Papæ I. Op. In Evang. Lib. II. Hom. xxxvii. 7. col. 1631. Conf. Corp. Jur. Canon. Lugd. 1624. Decret. Gratian. Decr. Tert. Pars, De Consecr. Dist. II. can. 73. col. 1953.]

¹⁶ Id. ibid. 8. ibid.; where *cujus toties vincula, and animæ ejus*.]

¹⁷ ...προσφέρομέν σοι τῷ βασιλεῖ καὶ Θεῷ κατὰ τὴν αὐτοῦ διάταξιν τὸν ἄρτον τούτου καὶ τὸ ποτήριον τοῦτο εὐχαριστοῦντές σοι δι' αὐτοῦ.—Const.

God and King, according to Christ's institution, this bread and this cup, by him rendering thanks unto thee." And, lest M. Harding happen to say this sacrifice was propitiatory to relieve the souls that were in purgatory, this Clemens saith further: *Offerimus tibi pro omnibus, qui a seculis tibi placuerunt, sanctis, patriarchis, prophetis, justis, apostolis, martyribus*¹: "We offer unto thee for all holy saints that have been from the beginning of the world, patriarchs, prophets, just men, apostles, and martyrs." I trow, M. Harding will not say all these were in purgatory.

Clem. Apost.
Const. Lib.
viii.

And touching the receiving of the communion he saith thus: *Postea recipiat episcopus, &c.*²: "Then let the bishop receive, and after him the priests, the deacons, the subdeacons, the readers, the singers, the religious, the women deacons, the virgins, the widows, the children, and the whole congregation in order, with sobriety and reverence without confusion." By this record of this Clemens it appeareth that the whole congregation received the holy communion all together, each man for himself, and not one man for another.

Now, whereas M. Harding utterly denieth that ever any man in his church received the sacrament instead of others, as somewhat misliking the open folly of the same, for short trial hereof I remit him both to the very practice of his mass, and also to the most catholic doctors of all his school.

In his *requiem* he singeth thus: *Pro quorum memoria corpus Christi sumitur, &c.*³: "For whose remembrance the body of Christ is received." If he can happily devise some veil to shadow this, yet his doctors be both so plain that they cannot be shifted, and also of so good credit that they may not be refused. Certainly they have been evermore thought to teach the catholic doctrine of the

Biel. Lect. 81.

church. Gabriel Biel saith thus: *Sicut os materialis corporis, &c.*⁴: "As the mouth of our material body not only eateth for itself, but also receiveth sustenance for the preservation of all other members, which sustenance is divided throughout the whole body; even so the priest receiveth the sacrament, and the virtue thereof passeth into all the members of the church, and specially into them that are present at the mass." Likewise saith Vincentius de Valentia: "The whole Christianity is one body knit together by faith and charity and having in it sundry members; and the priest is the mouth of this body. Therefore when the priest receiveth the sacrament, all the members are refreshed⁵." Again he saith: [*Nos*] *communicamus ore sacerdotis, audiendo missam*⁶: "We hearing mass do communicate or receive the sacrament by the mouth of the priest." Likewise Doctor Eckius saith: *Populus bibit spiritualiter per os sacerdotis*⁷: "The people drinketh spiritually by the mouth of the priest." These words be plain, and truly reported. Which being true, it must needs appear that M. Harding's avouching the contrary is untrue.

In Sermon. 2.
de Epiph.

Eck. de
Utraq. Spec.

Chrysost. in
1 Cor. Hom.
40.

So Chrysostom saith, the old heretics called *Marcionitæ* used to baptize some that were living in the behalf and stead of others that were dead⁸. And from thence it seemeth they that now would be counted catholics have derived their doctrine in this point. And that M. Harding may the rather believe that such folly hath been used, let him remember that in his church the bishop, when he createth a reader, giveth him evermore this commission: *Accipe potestatem*

Apost. Lib. viii. cap. xii. in Concil. Stud. Labb. et Cossart. Lut. Par. 1671-2. Tom. I. col. 482.]

[¹ Id. ibid.]

[² ... και μετά τούτο μεταλαμβάνετω ὁ ἐπίσκοπος. ἔπειτα οἱ πρεσβύτεροι, καὶ οἱ διάκονοι, καὶ ὑποδιάκονοι, καὶ οἱ ἀναγνώσται, καὶ οἱ ψάλται, καὶ οἱ ἀσκηταί, καὶ ἐν ταῖς γυναῖξιν αἱ διακόνισσαι, καὶ αἱ παρθένοι, καὶ αἱ χῆραι· εἶτα τὰ παιδιά, καὶ τότε πᾶς ὁ λαὸς κατὰ τὰς ἐν μετὰ αἰδούς καὶ εὐλαβείας ἀνευ θορύβου.—Id. ibid. cap. xiii. col. 483.]

[³ Manual. ad Us. Eccles. Sarisb. Rothom. 1555. Miss. pro Defunct. fol. 141. 2.]

[⁴ Sicut os materialis corporis comedit, non solum pro se, sed pro salute omnium membrorum sumit cibum; qui per totum corpus diffunditur et membris singulis incorporatur, ut salvetur in sua

subsistentia naturali: sic sacerdos sumit sacramentum, cujus virtus transit in omnia ecclesie membra hujus cibi spiritualiter susceptiva, et singulariter in eos qui missæ intersunt officio.—Gab. Biel. Can. Miss. Expos. Basil. 1515. Lect. lxxxi. fol. 238.]

[⁵ Tota christianitas est unum corpus fide et caritate conjunctum, habens multa membra. Sacerdos est os hujus corporis. Cum ergo sacerdos communicat, omnia membra reficiuntur.—Vincent. Serm. Hyemal. Antv. 1572. In Epiph. Dom. Serm. ii. p. 203.]

[⁶ Id. ibid.; where *sacerdotum*.]

[⁷ Joh. Eck. Enchir. Loc. Com. Col. 1532. cap. x. fol. E. 5. 2. See before, page 213, note 7.]

[⁸ Chrysost. Op. Par. 1718-38. In Epist. 1. ad Cor. Hom. xl. Tom. X. p. 378.]

*legendi evangelium...tam pro vivis, quam pro defunctis*⁹: "Receive thou power to read the gospel, as well for the quick as for the dead." Therefore M. Harding, so earnestly denying this, denieth the manifest and known truth, and defaceth the credit of his own doctors.

To conclude, I may well say as before, that M. Harding, having nothing to allege touching the matter that lieth between us, and instead thereof filling up his papers with matters impertinent, of prayer and sacrifice, hath somewhat abused the patience of his reader, and shewed him one thing for another.

[⁹ Pontifical. Rom. Antv. 1627. De Ord. Diac. p. 39; where *accipite*.]

OF APPLICATION.

THE NINETEENTH ARTICLE.

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

OR that the priest had then authority to apply the virtue of Christ's death and passion to any man by mean¹ of the mass.

[OF THE APPLICATION OF THE BENEFITS OF CHRIST'S DEATH TO OTHERS BY MEAN OF PRAYER IN THE MASS.—ARTICLE XIX. H.A. 1564.]

M. HARDING.

The virtue of Christ's death and passion is grace and remission of sins, the appeasing of God's wrath, the reconciliation of us to God, deliverance from the devil, hell, and everlasting damnation. Our adversaries, imputing to us as though we said and taught that the priest applieth this virtue, effect, and merit of Christ's death to any man by the mean of the mass, either (232) belie us of ignorance, or slander us of malice. Verily we say not so. Neither doth the priest apply the virtue of Christ's passion to any man by the mean of the mass. He doth but apply his prayer and his intent of oblation, beseeching almighty God to apply the merit and virtue of his Son's death (the memory whereof he celebrateth at the mass) to them for whom he prayeth.

It is God, and none other, that applieth to us remission of sin: the priest doth but pray for it, and, by the commemoration of his Son's death, moveth him to apply: so as all that the priest doth is but by way of petition and prayer, leaving all power and authority of applying to God; which prayer is to be believed to be of most force and efficacy when it is worthily and devoutly made in the mass, in the which the priest beareth the person of the whole church, and offereth his prayer in the sacrifice, wherein the church offereth Christ, and itself through Christ to God. Which his (233) prayer and devout service he beseecheth to be offered up by the hands of angels unto the high altar of God, in the sight of the divine Majesty. Of what strength prayer made at the mass is, the holy bishop and martyr St Cyprian witnesseth (that in all his books never once named the mass) where he saith: "In the presence of this sacrament tears crave not in vain, and the sacrifice of a contrite heart is never denied his request²."

THE BISHOP OF SARISBURY.

Neither have we of ignorance belied M. Harding's doctrine, nor have we of malice slandered it, but plainly and truly have reported the same; even as both he and his late doctors have taught it, and as the people in the church of Rome hath every where received it at their hands.

But like as in old times God commanded the Philistines to offer up golden mice and golden hæmoroids, to be kept for ever in record, and to witness against them in what sort they had been plagued for their wickedness, if at any time they should happen afterward to deny it; even so hath God specially provided that the monuments of our adversaries' old errors, whereof they seem now to be ashamed, should still remain in sure record, even in their own doctors' books, to

[¹ By the mean, H. A. 1564.]

[² In hujus præsentia non supervacue mendicant lacrymæ veniam, nec unquam patitur contriti cordis

holocaustum repulsam.—Cypr. Op. Oxon. 1682. De Cœn. Dom. (Arnold.) p. 43.]

The two hundred and thirty-second untruth. For in the church of Rome the priest presumeth to apply the merits of Christ by mean of his mass, as shall appear.

The two hundred and thirty-third untruth. For the priest prayeth that the body of Christ may be carried up by the hands of angels.

What applieth the priest unto us in the mass.

Sermon. De Cena Dom.

witness against them if they should happen, as now, upon mislike, utterly to disclaim and deny the same, and to force them to confess that they are the children of them that have deceived the people.

For, whereas M. Harding, amongst many other words wherewith he laboureth to shadow and to darken the case, saith, "It is God only, and none other, that applieth unto us the death of Christ and the remission of our sins;" Johannes Scotus, one of his most famous and most catholic doctors, saith plainly the contrary: *Non solus Deus distribuit virtutem sacrificii, sed sacerdos quoque*³: "Not only God distributeth or applieth the virtue of the sacrifice, but the priest also." And Gabriel Biel, another of M. Harding's doctors, in like sort saith: "The force and effect of the sacrifice is distributed and applied, not only by God, but also by the priest⁴." "Only" and "not only" imply a contradiction: if the one be true, the other of necessity must be false. Again Biel saith: *Sacerdotis est determinare virtutem sacrificii, ut his vel illis indigentibus præmium reddendum per hujusmodi ecclesie sacrificia conferatur*⁵: "It is the priest's office to determine and limit the virtue of the sacrifice, that the meed that is given by such sacrifices of the church may be applied to these or them that stand in need." Which thing he proveth by sufficient example in this wise: "As the pope, by right of his supremacy, hath power to divide the treasure of the church (whereby he meaneth his pardons), giving unto some full remission of all their sins, and dispensing with some other for the third part of their pains, and granting unto some pardon for certain⁶ number of days or years, as he seeth it may be most expedient for the devotion of the people; even so," saith he, "may the priest dispense and divide the merits of the church, and apply the same to this man or that man, as he shall think it may stand him in some stead⁷."

Quodlib.
Quæst. 70.

Biel. Lect. 26.

Biel. in ead.
Lect.

Ut illi vel
illi possit
applicare.

In *Summa Angelica* it is written thus: "The mass is available unto them unto whomsoever it pleaseth the priest to apply it by his intention⁸." And again: *Missa respectu operis operati, &c.*⁹: "The mass, in respect of the work that is wrought, is nothing else but the applying of the merits¹⁰ of Christ's passion."

Sum. Angel.
in Miss.

So Vincentius de Valentia, a notable catholic schoolman of M. Harding's side: *Virgo Maria solum semel aperuit cælum, &c.*¹¹: "The virgin Mary never but once opened heaven; but the priest openeth it every day and at every mass." Doctor Holcot saith: *Quid est celebrare missam principaliter pro aliquo? R. Est applicare missam Johanni, quod sit quædam satisfactio apud Deum pro anima Johannis, si indigeat*¹²: "What is it to say mass principally for any man?" He answereth: "It is the applying of the mass unto John, to be a certain satisfaction for him before God, if John stand in need of it." And withal he moveth a great doubt, whether the priest may apply one mass to two several men, and nevertheless satisfy for them both¹³.

Vinc. de
Valent. in 1
Serm. de
Corp. Christ.
Holcot. in iv.
Sent. Quæst.
3.

In ead.
Quæst.

And Biel saith that certain, the better to help the priest's memory, taught him to apply his mass throughout all the cases of declension; as for example, *nominativo*, "a mass for himself;" *genitivo*, "a mass for his father and mother;" *dativo*,

Biel. Lect. 26.

[³ ... quod bonum ibi virtute sacrificii communicandum, non solum Deus distribuat, sed aliquis minister in ecclesia.—Joan. Duns Scot. Op. Lugd. 1639. Quodlib. Quæst. xx. Art. ii. Tom. XII. p. 524.]

[⁴ ... bonum in virtute sacrificii communicandum non solum Deus distribuat: sed aliquis minister in ecclesia.—Gab. Biel. Can. Miss. Expos. Basil. 1515. Lect. xxvi. fol. 49.]

[⁵ ... etiam ipsius est virtutem sacrificii et oblationis determinare: ut illis vel illis indigentibus præmium reddendum pro hujusmodi ecclesie sacrificio conferatur.—Id. ibid.]

[⁶ For a certain, 1565.]

[⁷ Unde sicut papa ratione suprematis potestatem habet dispensandi thesaurum ecclesie, conferendo nunc plenissimam remissionem peccatorum, nunc partem tertiam pœnarum auferendo, nunc certi numeri dierum vel annorum indulgentiam conferendo secundum quod viderit ecclesie unitati et populorum devotioni expedire ... ita et in proposito recipit quilibet sacerdos potestatem ex ritu et institutione ecclesie; ut merita totius ecclesie illi vel illi possit applicare, ut pro ipsis illis aliquod bonum conferatur.—Id. ibid. fol. 49. 2.]

[⁸ ... valet specialiter si sunt in statu gratie illis qui faciunt eam dicere pro se; vel quibus prædicti vel sacerdos per intentionem applicant.—Clavas. Summ. Angel. Argent. 1513. Missa 52. fol. 208. 2.]

[⁹ ... missa respectu operis operati nihil aliud est quam applicatio meriti passionis Christi.—Id. ibid.]

[¹⁰ Merit, 1565, 1609.]

[¹¹ Vincent. Sermon. Æstiv. Antv. 1572. In Fest. Corp. Christ. Serm. i. p. 322. This author proceeds: sed sacerdos quolibet die, et in qualibet missa.]

[¹² ... expono quid voco missam celebrare principaliter pro aliquo. et videtur mihi quod celebrare principaliter est applicare, &c.—R. Holcot sup. Quat. Libr. Sentent. Lugd. 1497. Lib. iv. Quæst. iii. fol. n.]

[¹³ Id. ibid. foll. m. viii. n.]

“a mass for his founders or benefactors;” *accusativo*, “a mass for his enemies or accusers;” *vocativo*, “a mass for sinners and infidels;” *ablativo*, “a mass for his backbiters and slanderers¹.”

Of these things M. Harding seemeth now to be ashamed, notwithstanding it were of late the catholic and general doctrine of his church, universally taught by Holcot in England, by Vincentius in Spain, by Biel in France, by Angelus in Italy, or rather by all these and all others through the whole church of Rome. Hereof grew such merchandise and sale of masses, that the house of God was become a den of thieves.

Therefore M. Harding, having no other defence for all these follies, but only to cast off all that can be said of our side as malicious and ignorant surmises, sheweth himself little to have considered the state of his own church, and in the impatience of his heats to speak against us what him liketh, and so to spice his error both with ignorance and with malice.

But for resolution hereof, and some short satisfaction of the reader, it behoveth us to understand that it is not the priest, but God only it is, that applieth unto each man the remission of his sins in the blood of Christ; not by mean of the mass, but only by the mean of faith. St John saith: “He that believeth in the Son of God hath a witness in himself.” St Augustine saith: *Holocaustum dominicæ passionis . . . eo tempore offert [unus]quisque pro peccatis suis, quo ejusdem passionis fide dedicatur*²: “Then doth every man offer the sacrifice of Christ’s passion for himself, when he is dedicated in the faith of Christ’s passion.” So saith the old learned father Origen: *Siclo sancto comparandus est nobis Christus, &c.*³: “With the holy sicle we must buy Christ, that may put away our sins. The holy sicle beareth the form of our faith. For, if thou bring faith as the price, thou shalt receive the remission of thy sins.” Likewise again he saith: *Christus factus est hostia et propitiatio pro peccatis. Quæ propitiatio ad unumquemque venit per viam fidei*⁴: “Christ is made the sacrifice and propitiation for sin. Which propitiation cometh (or is applied) to each man (not by the mass, but) by the way of faith.”

This is the most certain and undoubted application of the merits and death of Christ. St Paul saith: “God hath set Christ to be our reconciler through faith by the mediation of his blood.”

[¹ Unde quidam ex ordine sex casuum grammaticalis declinationis nominum, quasi magis celebranti noto, ordinem memorandorum tradiderunt: ut a nominativo sive a recto qui primus est casuum, i. a seipso sacerdos a quo ordinata caritas incipit vivorum memoriam exordiat. Secundo genitivi, i. pro genitorum parentum ac propinquorum carnalium et spiritualium subdat memoriam. Tertio dativi, i. fundatorum patronorum offerentium ac benefactorum a quibus temporalia receperunt. Quarto accusativi, i. inimicorum: nam accusativus ex vocabuli interpretatione casus est adversariorum . . . Quinto vocativi, i. errantium infidelium et peccatorum . . . Sexto ablativi, i. eorum quibus bona animæ, corporis, aut famæ abstulimus, occasionem damni spiritualis aut temporalis dedimus.—Gab. Biel. Can. Miss. Expos. Basil. 1515.]

Lect. xxvi. fol. 51.]

[² August. Op. Par. 1679-1700. Epist. ad Rom. Expos. Inch. 19. Tom. III. Pars II. col. 937. See before, page 737, note 18.]

[³ Siclo igitur sancto comparandus nobis est Christus, qui peccata nostra dissolvat. Siclus sanctus fidei nostræ formam tenet. Si enim fidem obtuleris tanquam pretium . . . remissionem accipies peccatorum.—Orig. Op. Par. 1733-59. In Levit. Hom. iii. 8. Tom. II. p. 198.]

[⁴ Secundum hoc ergo quod hostia est, profusione sanguinis sui propitiatio efficitur in eo quod datur remissionem præcedentium delictorum: quæ tamen propitiatio ad unumquemque credentium] per viam fidei venit.—Id. Comm. in Epist. ad Rom. Lib. III. cap. iii. 8. Tom. IV. p. 515.]

1 John v.

August. in
Expos. Inch.
ad Rom.

Orig. in
Levit. Hom.
3.

Orig. in Epist.
ad Rom. Lib.
iii. cap. iii.