

# Charles Hale and the Russian Church: The Biography of Innokentii<sup>1</sup>

by J. Robert Wright and Edward Kasinec

IT WAS THE historical misfortune of Innokentii Veniaminov (1797-1879) to succeed Filaret Drozdov as Metropolitan of the premier diocese of the Russian Empire.<sup>2</sup> In one breath both reviled and venerated by his contemporaries, Filaret was one of the most prolific and well published theologians and churchpeople of his time. The books and articles that were written about him are great and many. Innokentii, by contrast, was for much of his long life an active pastor, not a theologian, of the Russian Orthodox church. Historiographically he is overshadowed by his predecessor. He wrote and published little (although his translations of Holy Scripture into Alaskan tongues are certainly noteworthy), and he was the subject of only one major biographical study. An earlier biographical work, brief and of lesser significance but of considerable interest in its own right and for its own point of view, is the first American biography of Innokentii, which has been described as “*the first biography*” of him.<sup>3</sup> It was written by an Episcopalian, Charles Reuben Hale, and published privately in New York in 1877,<sup>4</sup> two years before the death of

---

<sup>1</sup>The authors would like to thank, in alphabetical order, Michael Barlowe, Kathy Burnside, David Cobb, Mark Duffy, David Green, Charles R. Henery, Glenn Johnson, Wayne Kempton, Betty Leinicke, Laura Moore, Ned Morris, F. Garner Ranney, Newland Smith, Urs von Arx, and others.

<sup>2</sup> Filaret died in 1867. From that point on to 1917, the fiftieth anniversary of his passing, the literature published by and about this important hierarch was very great. Through much of the Soviet period, what was published on Filaret was unfairly critical. In the post-Soviet period, both the scholars of the Moscow Patriarchate and representatives of the historical establishment have rediscovered Filaret. In 1994 he was canonized by the Russian Orthodox Church, and Innokentii in 1997. Both Filaret and Innokentii were buried next to each other in the Church of the Holy Spirit at the Trinity-Sergius Monastery at Sergiev Posad near Moscow.

<sup>3</sup> *A Good and Faithful Servant: The Year of Saint Innocent (Fairbanks, 1997)*, 33.

<sup>4</sup> *Innocent of Moscow, The Apostle of Kamchatka and Alaska*. (New York, 1877, 23 pp.; reprinted from the *American Church Review* 29 (July 1877), 402-19; also reprinted Davenport, Iowa, 1888; also reprinted Willits, California, 1978). The copy in the General Theological Seminary, New York City, which was studied for the writing of this essay, is the signed gift of Hale, its author, to Bishop William Rollinson Whittingham, the first St. Mark's Professor of Ecclesiastical History there, with whom Hale corresponded and collaborated and for whom he frequently made purchases of books in the fields of church history, liturgy, and the Eastern churches. The 1888 reprint of Hale's treatise ends with the transcription of a letter from Benjamin Bosworth Smith, Bishop of Kentucky and

this Russian missionary bishop and now (since 1997) a canonized saint. Charles Hale's biography of Innokentii is brief, published in English and, truth be told, not especially informative to the specialist today. It might even be called an "occasional" piece, written more to convince than to reason, to provoke rather than to inform. But herein may lie its intrinsic interest. What were the reasons for its publication and the motivations for its composition? And who was this largely forgotten author? And why was he interested in a Russian missionary bishop born over two centuries ago?

## THE AUTHOR

Charles Reuben Hale (1837-1900) was certainly among the more learned of the American Episcopalian clergy of the nineteenth century. His life and ecclesiastical career were essentially coterminous with the century's second half.

The basic facts of his life and clerical service in the Episcopal Church are as follows. Born in Lewistown, Pennsylvania, the son of Reuben C. Hale (a lawyer) and Sarah Mills,<sup>5</sup> he graduated in 1858 from the University of Pennsylvania, and was then ordained to the diaconate on 8 January 1860 by Alonzo Potter, bishop of Pennsylvania. On 17 October 1861, he was ordained to the priesthood by the same bishop, and for the following two years served in Pennsylvania as curate at Christ Church, Germantown, and at All Saints' Church in Lower Dublin. At the time of the Civil War and for the next seven years, 1863-70, he served as a chaplain in the U.S. Navy, and for a year and a half during hostilities also taught mathematics at the Naval Academy (then for safety moved from Annapolis to Newport, Rhode Island). It was also in this period that he made his first visit to Russia and began his study of the Russian language, in which he was self-taught. In 1871 he married the former Anna McKnight. The same year he became the rector of St. John's Church in Auburn, New York, and was also chosen secretary of the Episcopal Church's official "Russo-Greek Committee," a remarkable group about which more later. In 1873, he left for New York City and engaged in the establishment of an Episcopalian mission for Italians, said to have been

---

Presiding Bishop, written to Metropolitan Innokentii in 1877 for the purpose of congratulating him upon his eightieth birthday, in which its author (Smith) remarks that "With the exception of the Bishop of Rome and the Bishop of Mississippi, we are, perhaps, the only Bishops of the Historic Church who were born in the last century—you in 1797 and I in 1794."

<sup>5</sup> Information taken from the article by Guy Emery Sipler in the *Dictionary of American Biography* (vol. vii, 97-98; New York, 1932), and from other sources listed in footnote 7 below.

the first church in America for Italians who were not Roman Catholics. At the Episcopal Church's General Convention of 1874, he was a member of the Joint Committee on the Standard Prayer Book and of the Joint Committee on the Spanish Version of the American Book of Common Prayer; in a few years he would publish his pocket-sized *Mozarabic Collects* (in translation) intended for actual use by Episcopalians.<sup>6</sup> In 1875, he was called to be rector of the Church of St. Mary the Virgin, in Baltimore, which he served for about one year. From 1877-85 Hale was assistant at St. Paul's Church, Baltimore, leaving to become dean of Trinity Cathedral in Davenport, Iowa. He served there from 1886-92, even receiving a letter of gratitude from the Countess Tolstoi for his connection to a Russian relief project, and also giving occasional lectures at Nashotah House in Wisconsin.

On 26 July 1892, Hale received episcopal consecration in the Davenport cathedral to be assistant or coadjutor to George Franklin Seymour, bishop of Springfield, Illinois, with the title "Bishop of Cairo."<sup>7</sup> In 1898, he was made an honorary canon of St. George's Collegiate Church in Jerusalem. His wife, Anna, had already died in 1884, leaving no children, and Hale himself died on Christmas Day of 1900, at the age of 63. He was buried from St. Mark's Church in Philadelphia, the interment being in the Laurel Hill Cemetery. Much of his extensive personal library was destroyed by fire<sup>8</sup>, but some of it, including service books of the Eastern churches inscribed and given to him, as well as missionary journals published in various Russian dioceses, survives at the Seabury-Western Theological Seminary in Evanston Illinois, where he was a

---

<sup>6</sup> A copy of this work inscribed to William Reed Huntington "from his sincere friend and admirer, Charles R. Hale," was among the volumes in the personal library of the late Rev. Professor H. Boone Porter. Further on Hale's interest in Hispanic Christianity and liturgy, see "Hispanic Influences on Worship in the English Tongue" by H. Boone Porter, chapter 11 of *Time and Community*, ed. J. Neil Alexander (Washington, 1990), esp. 177-78.

<sup>7</sup> Hale was consecrated assistant-bishop of Springfield with the title "Bishop of Cairo" [Illinois] because at that time there was a plan to divide the Episcopal Diocese of Springfield in half and to establish him as the ordinary of the southern half with his see city in Cairo, where he did establish his episcopal residence, at the junction of the Ohio and Mississippi Rivers. The plan for a diocese of Cairo never materialized, although Hale did regularly sign his name with the title "Bishop of Cairo" and also used it in his will. He regularly described the Church of the Redeemer there as his "Bishop's Church." For further biographical information see William Stevens Perry, *The Bishops of the American Church Past and Present...* (New York, 1897), 339; *The Church Eclectic* 20:2 (October 1892), 627-28; and *The Living Church*, (30 January 1886), 661-62, and 24:10 (5 January 1901), 376. His official acts as bishop are recorded in the annual journals of the diocese of Springfield from 1892 to 1900.

<sup>8</sup> At the Cairo Hotel, where he lived after his wife's death and where his library had occupied an entire floor.

member of the board of trustees.<sup>9</sup> He was awarded two honorary doctorates, a D.D. from Hobart College in 1876 and an LL.D. from Griswold College in 1889. In his last will and testament he bequeathed the residue of his estate to endow and establish within the Episcopal Church the series of “Hale Lectures” on such subjects as liturgies and Eastern churches. Now delivered at Seabury-Western Seminary, and totaling 39 volumes to 1997, these have included *The Ethiopic Liturgy* by Samuel A.B. Mercer, *Some Aspects of Contemporary Greek Orthodox Thought* by Frank Gavin, *The National Church of Sweden* by John Wordsworth, and *Men and Movements in the American Episcopal Church* by E. Clowes Chorley. Another series established by him at the same institution in memory of his wife is called the “Hale Memorial Sermons.”

While at the University of Pennsylvania, Hale already displayed talent as a linguist and translator, and was appointed by the Philomathean Society to a committee of three to translate the Rosetta Stone. By the year 1886 he was described as reading nearly a dozen languages and conversant in several of them. Over his life Hale turned all these skills into effect as a student, translator, and published scholar of liturgy, church history, and the history of ecumenical relations among the Anglican, Protestant, Old Catholic, and Eastern Orthodox churches.<sup>10</sup> In retrospect, it may well be in this latter area, both in writing and in practical ecumenical activity especially with the Russian Orthodox and the Old Catholics, that Hale made his most lasting contribution. On his travels and in his addresses, he never lost an opportunity to speak on the Eastern Orthodox churches, especially that of Russia. Most of his writing, as the Archival Report that follows this essay attests, was done before his consecration to the episcopate in 1892. During his years as bishop he did serve as a vice-

---

<sup>9</sup> Interested in liturgies western as well as eastern, Hale himself owned a copy of the very first Anglican Prayer Book (1549), and from it, though in failing health near the end of his life, he celebrated its 350<sup>th</sup> anniversary on 21 May 1899. Hale’s copies of many liturgical texts including this book are in the library of Seabury-Western Seminary.

<sup>10</sup> The Special Collections of St. Mark’s Library in the General Theological Seminary, New York City, and The New York Public Library contain an extensive selection of Hale’s printed scholarly works, including materials relating to his biography. In addition, there are at General Seminary sixteen manuscript items by Hale dating over the period from 1885 to 1897, and in the Maryland Diocesan Library (Baltimore) there are some 68 original manuscript letters of Hale, mostly addressed to Bishop William Rollinson Whittingham over the period 1871-79, with whom Hale frequently collaborated on matters relating to the Eastern churches. For a listing of his published works, see the Archival Report also published in this issue.

president of the English Church Union and of the St. Paul's Ecclesiological Society.

## THE CONTEXT

In terms of his interest in the Eastern churches, Hale was at once both symptomatic of his time, as well as an active participant in the burgeoning Anglican dialogue with the Orthodox of his day. Among Anglicans, and especially but not limited to those of the Anglo-catholic persuasion, interest in the Eastern Christian churches, particularly the Orthodox, dates back to at least the beginning of the seventeenth-century and became official and corporate by the nineteenth. The "Russo-Greek Committee" was founded in 1862 by the General Convention of the Episcopal Church, officially charged "to consider the expediency of communication with the Russo-Greek Church, to collect authentic information bearing on the subject, and to report to the next General Convention."<sup>11</sup> This committee was the first corporate attempt of any non-Orthodox church body to establish official ecumenical relations with any of the churches of the Orthodox tradition, and in time it even persuaded Orthodox hierarchs to enter correspondence with the General Convention (printed in its 1874 report). Its records appear within the *Journal* of the Episcopal Church's General Convention from 1862 through 1874 (especially its four reports of 1865, 1868, 1871, and 1874).<sup>12</sup> Hale became a member of this committee sometime in the late sixties, serving as its secretary from 1871; at least some of its reports were "Privately printed" at his own expense.

Anglican interest in the Orthodox was further heightened in Hale's own day by the founding in England in 1864 of the Eastern Churches Association, which followed by two years and was inspired by the Russo-Greek Committee. After the Russo-Greek Committee was superseded in 1874 by the Episcopal Church's newly formed Joint Commission on Ecclesiastical Relations, Hale became its corresponding secretary (by 1877) with particular responsibility for the Oriental churches, the Moravian Church, and foreign chaplains.

The Russo-Greek Committee included among its early members some of the most prominent figures of the Episcopal Church in New York at that time, a number of whom were also travelers to Russia and the

---

<sup>11</sup> *Journal of the General Convention*, 1862, 109, 161.

<sup>12</sup> The authors of the present essay are preparing a reprint of the papers of this committee (New York: Norman Ross Publishing, 2001).

Christian East.<sup>13</sup> Among the early members were such prominent figures as the bishop of Long Island, A.N. Littlejohn (1824-1901); its first secretary and soon bishop of Florida, John Freeman Young (1820-1885); the attorney Samuel Bulkley Ruggles (1800-1881); the bishop of Western New York, Arthur Cleveland Coxe (1818-1896); the bishop of New Jersey, William Henry Odenheimer (1817-1879); the bishop of Maryland, William Rollinson Whittingham (1805-1879); and the latter's successor as professor of ecclesiastical history at the General Theological Seminary, Dr. Milo Mahan (1819-1870). Young and Ruggles were among the first members of this group to visit Russia in the early 1860s, and Young in that decade held the position of secretary of the Russo-Greek Committee, a position that was later held by Hale, who had succeeded him as secretary by 1871 after Young was made Bishop of Florida. Young's visit of 1864 is also documented, in both western archives and Russian sources.

Hale's first visit to Russia<sup>14</sup> was in a slightly different key, although his ultimate hopes were no doubt similar. It was less assertive than Young's, and more in the nature of collecting information and establishing contacts. He prepared well. Unlike Young, Hale was able to communicate in Russian and was able to utilize vernacular Russian sources, although his particular choices of sources and people are yet to be evaluated. Nonetheless, the individuals that he met were very similar to those encountered by Young. Even a partial listing of those Russians mentioned as acquaintances in Hale's various writings can include such figures as Vladimir Karlovich Sabler (1847-1923), who would become the chief legal advisor of the Synod and then its chief prosecutor; Prince Aleksandr Ivanovich Ourousoff (1843-1900), a notable defense attorney and defender of the freedom of artistic expression; Archpriest Vasillii Aleksandrovich Prilezhaev (1832-1887), priest of the Russian Church in Nice and later in Paris; and Archpriest Iosif Vasilevich Vasilev (1821-1881), who wrote a study on papal supremacy, was the official Orthodox representative in Paris at the time of the Crimean War, and was also the publisher of the journal *L'Union Chrétienne*. Two others, each of whom he would meet again and describe as an "old friend" at the Old Catholic Congress of 1894 in Rotterdam, include General Nikolai Aleksandrovich Kireev (1833-1910), general publicist and prominent Slavophile, from

---

<sup>13</sup> Other members of the committee were R.M. Abercrombie, and Henry E. Pierrepont. The biographies of many of these individuals are found in *The National Cyclopaedia of American Biography*. (New York, 1906). See also the *Report of the Joint Committee of the General Convention [Baltimore, 1872]: On Communication with the Russo-Greek Church*. (Hartford, 1872).

<sup>14</sup> The precise date of this journey has proven elusive.

1862-1890 an adjutant to the Grand Duke Konstantin Konstantinovich, Viceroy of Poland, and Secretary to the Society of the Friends of Religious Enlightenment, and Ioann Leontévich Ianyshév (1826-1910), Russian theologian, writer, and preacher.

Three more of Hale's acquaintances in Russia were Ivan Terentevich Osinin (Ossinine) (1835-1887), writer on female education and the ecumenical movement; Professor Aleksandr L'vovich Katanskii, well known for his works on dogmatic theology, writer on church archaeology and liturgy, the history of the church, and religious journalism, and one of the editors of *Tserkovnyi vestnik*; and Professor Ilarion Aleksandrovich Chistovich, (1828-1893), who studied and later taught at the St. Petersburg Theological Academy and also taught philosophy at the Imperial School of Law. For the most part, all these individuals were associated with the bureaucracy of the Holy Synod of the Russian Orthodox Church; and they were either high ranking prelates, "white" (married) clergy, or laymen who were connected with what were then considered ecumenical or inter-confessional activities.<sup>15</sup>

At the same time, Hale's interests and publications were also embracing the "Old Catholic" movement, which had become prominent on the Episcopal Church's ecumenical agenda following the First Vatican Council of 1869-70. In 1871 he became clerk to the commission of the House of Bishops for correspondence with the Old Catholics, and soon he would publish translations of the Swiss Old Catholic eucharistic liturgy from the German language. As a priest Hale attended the Old Catholic Congresses at Baden-Baden in 1880 and at Krefeld in 1884, and later as a bishop he would attend the Old Catholic Congresses at Rotterdam in 1894 and at Vienna in 1897.<sup>16</sup> The Episcopal Church often sent representatives

---

<sup>15</sup> Hale also made the acquaintance of Dr. J.J. Overbeck (1821-1905), a former Roman Catholic priest and convert to Orthodoxy, who was attempting to create a kind of Western-rite Orthodoxy in the West and some of whose works Hale translated from Russian.

<sup>16</sup> *Der siebente Altkatholiken-Congress in Baden-Baden im Jahre 1880 [11.-14. September]. Stenographischer Bericht. Offizielle Ausgabe.* (Baden-Baden, 1880, 148). *Der achte Altkatholiken-Congress in Crefeld im Jahre 1884 [29.-31. August]. Stenographischer Bericht. Offizielle Ausgabe.* (Crefeld, 1884, 68 and vii). *Der dritte internationale Altkatholiken-Congress in Rotterdam vom 28. Bis 30. August 1894. Stenographischer Bericht. Offizielle Ausgabe.* (Bern, 1894). *Bericht über den vierten Altkatholiken-Congress in Wien, 31. August bis 3. September 1897*, compiled by Eduard Herzog (Bern, 1897). References kindly supplied by Prof. Urs von Arx. In 1900, the very year and only a few months before he died, Hale was in Germany again, at Bad Nauheim north of Frankfurt, a famous health resort for persons with heart diseases and with circulatory and rheumatic troubles. He dated a letter from there to Bishop Grafton of Fond du Lac on 5 June 1900, describing himself as "very weak," under the care of a

to these congresses, and Hale, having attended four of them, holds the attendance record for the nineteenth century. Relations with the Orthodox were high on the Old Catholic agenda as well, so Hale would have seen these interests as complementary and not in competition.<sup>17</sup> His dominant preoccupation, however, remained with the Orthodox and with Russia.

In 1884, while still an assistant priest at St. Paul's Church in Baltimore and not yet a bishop or even a dean, Hale traveled again to Russia<sup>18</sup> and published a *Brief Narrative* of the journey (16 printed pages). Innokentii having died in 1879, Hale met a new Metropolitan of Moscow, Ioann (1882-1891), whom he regarded as "a man of vigorous intellect" with whom he was "very much pleased." Hale recounted that the Metropolitan asked him many questions about Anglican Orders, to which he replied that "there was no clergy in the world who thought more of the Divine Gift in Ordination than did Anglicans." He also had conversations with the Metropolitans of St. Petersburg and Kiev and with Protopresbyter Ianyshv and Professor Osinin and others, and exchanged many gifts of books. At the Moscow Metropolitan's invitation, he also attended the first consecration of a new Russian bishop to be held in the newly completed Cathedral of Christ the Saviour (later destroyed at the behest of the Soviet government but now reconstructed), where he saw the altar that Innokentii had consecrated in 1876, and then dined with the Metropolitan and other bishops. On the same trip he also visited Kiev and elsewhere in Russia, and then "Constantinople," Smyrna, Ephesus, Athens, Alexandria, and Jerusalem and elsewhere in the Holy Land.<sup>19</sup> In 1885 Hale became one of the earliest Anglican priests, if not the first, to celebrate the eucharist in the Chapel of Abraham above Calvary within the Church of the Resurrection (Jerusalem), by permission of the Greek Patriarch, Nicodemus.<sup>20</sup>

---

"celebrated physician" there, and of the opinion that his work on earth was "very nearly over." (Original letter in Fond du Lac diocesan archives).

<sup>17</sup> See J. Robert Wright, "Anglican and Old Catholic Theology Compared," chapter 9 of *Old Catholics and Anglicans 1931-1981*, ed. Gordon Huelin (Oxford University Press, 1983), 125-140.

<sup>18</sup> In London on the way, in the company of Bishop Doane of Albany, he met Archbishop Benson of Canterbury on 6 November 1884. Benson in his diary described Hale as "lovely in spirit. He is learned in parties, factions, movements, and all hopeful." Arthur C. Benson, *The Life of Edward White Benson, Sometime Archbishop of Canterbury* (2 vols., London, 1899) 2:36.

<sup>19</sup> His curiosity also extended to the Church of Sweden, which he visited, presumably on the way back, in 1886. See A. Nicholson, *The Apostolic Succession in the Church of Sweden* (London, 1880).

<sup>20</sup> "There he saw the sun rise over Olivet on Easter morning, standing with the Patriarch, with whom he afterwards breakfasted." *The Living Church*, 30 January 1886, 661-62.



## THE ALASKA CONNECTION

The activities of the Russo-Greek Committee, Hale's travels to the East, and his writings on the Eastern churches had all coincided with a heightened interest of Americans, and especially of Episcopalians, in Russia and in the fate of the vast Russian American territories sold by the Empire to the United States in 1867. Both before and after this date, Russian military and political delegations visited a number of cities in the United States, New York most prominent among them. In 1871, the son of the Emperor Alexander II, Aleksei Alexandrovich, visited New York to the popular acclaim of the city's elite.

There was of course an ecclesiastical dimension to all these activities, and one that was not lost on the members, associates, and successors of the Russo-Greek Committee and on Hale in particular. The issue turned on the future relations between the Orthodox and Episcopal churches in those areas that were once Russian and now American. Literally dozens of Eastern Orthodox parishes on the west coast and in Alaska were now part of the United States. Hale and others who thought like him considered this vast territory of Alaska to be ripe for fruitful ecclesiastical contact and ultimately, cooperation of some sort, but not merger or proselytism. The challenge of providing pastoral care for Episcopalians now emigrating to Alaska was not unrelated to these concerns, especially in view of the Russian bishop and some forty Orthodox clergy already serving there; indeed, the 1868 Episcopalian General Convention had already appointed a special committee of bishops to confer with the Holy Synod in Moscow concerning potential relations of the two churches in the Alaska territory. In the minds of Hale and some of his colleagues, one major impediment that stood in the way of such cooperation was the prejudice and ignorance on the part of many western clergy and laypersons of the traditions and positive contributions of the Eastern churches to the Christian tradition. Hale saw as his task meliorating this ignorance and documenting the vigor of Eastern Christian missionary zeal--most especially in its Russian Orthodox embodiment.

For Charles Reuben Hale, the best exemplar of the missionary vigor of Russian Orthodoxy was Innokentii Veniaminov, bishop and then archbishop of Kamchatka in Alaska from 1840 to 1868, afterwards Metropolitan of Moscow 1868-1879. In 1878, one year after his biography of Innokentii, Hale published his survey of the Orthodox Missionary Society, which Innokentii had founded. In a lecture on "The Russian Church" given in England in 1880, Hale took issue with charges that the Russian church was at that time unduly subordinated to the state, that

Peter the Great had intended harm to the church by replacing the Patriarch with a Synod, that the Russian clergy of the day were ignorant of or uninterested in the holy scriptures, and that the Russian church was lacking in missionary spirit. He hailed Innokentii as “that great missionary hero” and rejected any thought of proselytism by the Episcopal Church either in Russia or in Alaska. Hale said, “So far as relates to the people of the Russian Empire, we can leave the care of their religious instruction with those on whom God has laid the responsibility of it—the Bishops and Pastors of the Russian Church. In Alaska the two Churches might come in contact, but the American [Episcopal] Church has deemed it wiser, for the present at least, not to enter upon a field [Alaska] which the Russian Church cultivated so well while it was part of the Russian Dominions, where it still labors, and where it can work with advantage.” In the same address Hale also offered an axiom for ecumenical relations between the two churches that was based upon his own convictions as well as upon his studies of Innokentii: “Let the relations between the Church of Russia and the Churches in communion with it, on the one hand, and the Anglican Churches and their Foreign Missions on the other, be always relations of Christian charity. Whatever be one’s political views, likes and dislikes, let the followers of the one Lord, specially in matters where religion is directly concerned, endeavor to *think* kindly, to *speak* kindly, to *act* kindly towards each other.”

## HALE’S ESTIMATE OF INNOKENTII

Hale’s biography of Innokentii is written in characteristically convoluted style and based on a number of important collections of documents, many of them in Russian. Of these, Hale chose to excerpt and translate individual documents dealing with Innokentii’s early missionary activities in the Aleutian Islands and Alaska. He drew most of these documents from a miscellany compiled by the religious writer and imperial official Alexandr Sturdza.<sup>21</sup> These excerpts add little to what we know now of Innokentii’s early years, but they are sufficiently dramatic to illustrate Hale’s thesis about the heroism and the missionary vigor of Orthodoxy. Other works by Hale on the subject of modern Russian

---

<sup>21</sup> Especially see Alexandr Sturdza, ed., *Pamiatnik trudov pravoslavnykh blagovestnikov russkiikh s 1793 do 1853 goda* (Moscow, 1857), a copy of which is found in the Yale University Library; and *Question religieuse d’orient et d’occident* (Paris, 1853); also *Sbornik svedeniii o pravoslavnykh missiakh, i deiatel’nosti pravoslavnogo missionerskogo obshchestva* (2 vols., Moscow, 1872); *Ustav pravoslavnogo missionerskogo obshchestva* (St. Petersburg, 1869); and *Otchet Pravoslavnogo missionerskogo obshchestva* (Moscow, for the years 1870-1875).

Orthodoxy were written in the same vein and with the same enthusiasm for his subject. His biography of Innokentii, which demonstrated his first-hand knowledge of both Russian Orthodox and vernacular sources, came at a highpoint in Episcopalian, and especially Anglo-catholic, relations with the Russian Orthodox Church. It was an interest that resurfaced later in the relations of the Russian missionary Bishop (later Patriarch) Tikhon with Bishop Charles Grafton of Fond du Lac, and of Tikhon with the New York Episcopal diocese at the end of the nineteenth century. Such interest has once again been approached in New York under Bishop Richard Grein in the latter part of the twentieth century that is just past.

Hale's biography of Innokentii concludes with this glowing estimate: "He was not only, in his vast diocese, the chief of the missionaries, but the chief missionary; not only a spiritual governor but a model of faithfulness and zeal. We are told that he became master of six dialects, spoken in the field committed to his charge. He himself translated, and assisted others in translating, large parts of God's Word and the Liturgy of his Church for the use of the natives. For forty-five years, ten of them as Bishop of Kamchatka, eighteen more as its Archbishop, he labored on, in season and out of season."

Bishop Charles Reuben Hale's motivation for writing the first American biography of St. Innokentii was perhaps best summarized in these words of his own from an unpublished manuscript signed by Hale and dated in 1891 that is found among the Howard Chandler Robbins manuscript collection of bishops' papers in the St. Mark's Library of the General Theological Seminary in New York:

"Is it too much to hope that more Russian scholars than at present would try to learn the real facts in regard to the Anglican Church, as I have done as to the Orthodox Church? Finding how very incorrect were many of the statements commonly made as to the Eastern Churches, I more than twenty years ago studied the Russian language and familiarized myself with the modern forms of the Greek tongue, that I might study, in the originals, the doctrinal standards and the theological literature of the Orthodox East. Twice I have visited Russia to learn the facts about her Church, [and] with a like view I have spent several months in Greece and the Patriarchates. When I have heard unfavorable statements in regard to Eastern Church affairs which I could not answer, I have sought explanation from those able to give it, and, as a rule, have had the matter satisfactorily explained. I know that I have been able, both in America and in England, to utterly disprove some misstatements which had become widely current. The first step to be taken, in bringing together Christians who have

long been separated, is to make them know the exact truth in regard to each other.”

Hale’s purposes in writing his biography of Innokentii, thus, may be described as esteem, scholarship, accuracy, and good ecumenism. These are purposes that still motivate the work of the Episcopal Church’s national<sup>22</sup> and New York diocesan Russia committees today, in the vastly altered circumstances of the two centuries after Innokentii was born and one hundred and twenty-five years after Hale’s biography was published.

**J. Robert Wright** is the St. Mark’s Professor of Ecclesiastical History in the General Theological Seminary, New York City, and Historiographer of the Episcopal Church. **Edward Kasinec** is Curator of the Slavic and Baltic Division of the New York Public Library. They are both members of the New York Episcopal Diocesan Russia Committee. Earlier versions of this essay were presented by Mr. Kasinec in a conference at the University of Alaska, Fairbanks, 5-7 December 1997, and by Professor Wright at the 60<sup>th</sup> anniversary banquet of St. Tikhon’s Orthodox Theological Seminary, South Canaan, Pennsylvania, 10 November 1998.

---

<sup>22</sup> The official position of the Episcopal Church towards proselytism in Russia, set by resolution of its Standing Commission on Ecumenical Relations in January 1992, expresses “strong disapproval of any efforts on the part of members of this church, clergy or laity, to convert members of the Russian Orthodox Church to the Episcopal Church or any other body or in any way to defame the Russian Orthodox Church or the pious practices of its members.”

# **Archival Report: Charles Reuben Hale (1837-1900), Bishop of Cairo and Coadjutor of Springfield 1892- 1900**

**by J. Robert Wright and Edward Kasinec**

In the course of preparing “Charles Hale and the Russian Church: The Biography of Innokentii” for publication earlier in this issue, a number of manuscript sources, works privately printed, and other publications were uncovered and they are surveyed in this essay. Additional remarks that contextualize some of these manuscripts and publications will be found in the preceding essay. It is the opinion of the present authors that sufficient material exists in these various sources for a full-scale study to be undertaken of this important and interesting figure.

## **1. Manuscript sources**

The Howard Chandler Robbins manuscript collection of bishops’ papers among the Special Collections of St. Mark’s Library in the General Theological Seminary, New York City, contains sixteen manuscript items by Hale dating over the period from 1885 to 1897. In the Maryland Diocesan Library (Baltimore) there are some 68 original manuscript letters of Hale, mostly addressed to Bishop William Rollinson Whittingham over the period 1871-79, with whom Hale frequently collaborated on matters relating to the Eastern churches. In the archives of the Diocese of Fond du Lac (Wisconsin) there are two manuscript letters by Hale addressed to Bishop Charles Grafton and dating from the year 1900. The authors of the present essay welcome any communication about additional manuscript sources that may exist.

## **2. Works printed privately or otherwise**

Those works here listed as “Privately printed” were probably printed at Hale’s own expense, as is attested in his Preface to the Report of the Russo-Greek Committee for the General Convention of 1871. Many of them do not record any place of publication. They are listed in chronological order. If a copy has been found in the collections of St. Mark’s Library of the General Theological Seminary or in the New York Public Library, this is noted by “GTS” or “NYPL.”

### **A. Works of Eastern Christian Significance**

- ‘ *A List of Sees and Bishops in the Holy Eastern Church* (Philadelphia, 1870) (GTS, NYPL).
- ‘ *A List of All the Sees and Bishops of the Holy Orthodox Church of the East, translated and compiled from Russian Official Documents* (Hartford, Privately printed, 1872)(GTS, NYPL).
- ‘ *An Eastern View of the Second Conference at Bonn (1875); an address delivered before the St. Petersburg Section of the Society of the Friends of Religious Enlightenment, Dec. 11-23, 1875* [translated from the Russian of Ivan T. Ossinine] (Privately printed, 1876) (GTS) (reprinted from *The Church Eclectic*, July 1875).
- ‘ *Innocent of Moscow, The Apostle of Kamchatka and Alaska* (New York, Privately printed, 1877, 23 pp. (GTS, NYPL); reprinted from the *American Church Review* 29 (July 1877), 402-19; also reprinted Davenport, Iowa, 1888; also reprinted Willits, California, 1978).
- ‘ *The Orthodox Missionary Society of Russia* (Privately printed, 1878) (GTS)(reprinted from the *American Church Review* 30 for July 1878; also reprinted Willits, California, 1974).
- ‘ *Russian Missions in China and Japan* (Privately printed, 1878) (GTS).
- ‘ “An Account of the Visit of Dr. Overbeck to Constantinople in 1879” (translated from the Russian in 1880).
- ‘ *The Russian Church; A Paper Read Before the Church Congress Held at Leicester, England, under the Presidency of the Lord Bishop of Peterborough, Sept. 28th-Oct. 1st, 1880* (Privately printed, 1881) (GTS).
- ‘ *The Universal Episcopate; A List of the Sees and Bishops in the Holy Church Throughout all the World. Compiled from Official Documents and from other Trustworthy Information.* (Baltimore, 1882) (GTS).
- ‘ “England’s Duty toward Egypt” (published in the official report of the Church Congress at Carlisle, England, 1884).
- ‘ *A Brief Narrative of a Visit to the Eastern Churches in the Interests of Church Unity* (Davenport, Iowa: Privately printed, 1886) (GTS, NYPL).
- ‘ “Sophronius, Patriarch of Alexandria,” *The Nashotah Scholiast* 4 (December 1886), 45-47.
- ‘ “Eastern Churches,” “Episcopate,” and other signed articles contributed to *The Church Cyclopaedia. A Dictionary of Church Doctrine, History, Organization and Ritual, and containing Original Articles on Special Topics, written expressly for this work by Bishops, Presbyters, and Laymen*, ed. A. A. Benton (Philadelphia, 1884).
- ‘ *Missionary Relations Between the Anglican and the Eastern Churches, Together with Three Addresses on Different Subjects... Delivered Before the Missionary Conference of the Anglican Communion... London, May 28-June 1, 1894* (London, 1894) (NYPL).
- ‘ *The Holy Orthodox Eastern Churches: A Lecture delivered before the Church Club of Connecticut at Christ Church, Hartford, Feb. 27, 1896* (New Haven, 1896) (Also printed with the title “The Greek Church” in *Five Lectures upon the Church*, same publisher and date) (NYPL).
- ‘ Hale also wrote the reports of the Russo-Greek Committee to the General Conventions of 1871 and 1874, and the reports of the Joint Commission on Ecclesiastical Relations from 1877 to 1896.
- ‘ The authors of the present essay are preparing a reprint of the papers of the Russo-Greek Committee (New York: Norman Ross Publishing, 2001), in which

references to Hale appear frequently.

Hale authored many other occasional writings in various periodicals, such as *The Iowa Churchman* and *The Spirit of Missions*.

## **B. Selected Other Liturgical, Theological, and Church-Historical Works**

*The Office of Compline* (1860) (GTS).

*Italian Church Reform* (1872) (GTS).

*The Mozarabic Liturgy and the Mexican Branch of the Catholic Church of Our Lord Jesus Christ Militant Upon Earth. A Liturgical Study* (Newark, New Jersey, 1876) (reprinted from the *American Church Review*, April 1876) (GTS, NYPL).

*Mozarabic Offices and Mass* (Baltimore, Privately printed, 1879).

*An Order for the Holy Communion Arranged from the Mozarabic Liturgy* (1879) (NYPL and GTS).

*An Office for Holy Baptism, Arranged from Mozarabic and Cognate Service Books* (Baltimore, 1879) (GTS, NYPL).

*A Translation of the Order for Holy Communion, from the Gebetbuch of the Christian Catholic Church of Switzerland* (1881) (reprinted from Protestant Episcopal Church, General Convention *Journal 1880*, appendix VII.2, 423-35) (GTS: No. 6 in a volume of liturgical pamphlets by C.R. Hale).

*The Liturgy of the Mass According to the Use of the Christian Catholic Church of Switzerland Done into English* (Edinburgh, 1881, revised and abridged from the previous title) (GTS).

*Mozarabic Collects. Translated and Arranged from the Ancient Liturgy of the Spanish Church* (New York, 1881) (GTS, NYPL).

*An Address delivered by Special Invitation in St. Paul's Church, Baltimore, the Sunday before Advent, 1880; and before the Convocation of Baltimore, December 16<sup>th</sup>, 1880* ("Printed by Request," Baltimore, 1881).

*The Eucharistic Office of the Christian Catholic Church of Switzerland* (New York, 1882) (reprinted from the *American Church Review*, January 1881, 35-64) (GTS).

"The Prayer Book of the Christian Catholic Church of Switzerland" in *American Church Review* 44 (October 1884), 41-46 (GTS).

"The Book Annexed and the Bishops" (Davenport, Iowa, 1886) (reprinted from *The Nashotah Scholiast* 3 (September 1886), 210).

"The American Church and Methodism," *The Church Review* 60 (January 1891), 129-155.

Book reviews in the *American Church Review* of the 1870s and 1880s.

Annual episcopal reports in the Journals of the Diocese of Springfield from 1888 to 1901.