

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

Santa Barbara

The Choir School in the American Church:  
*a study of the choir school and other current chorister training  
models in Episcopal and Anglican parishes.*

A supporting document submitted in partial satisfaction of the  
requirements for the degree Doctor of Musical Arts

by

Daniel James McGrath

Committee in charge:

Professor Michel Marc Gervais, Chair

Professor Dolores M. Hsu

Professor Michael Ingham

June 2005

Reproduced online through Project Canterbury  
<http://anglicanhistory.org>, 2006

The document of Daniel James McGrath is approved.

---

Professor Michel Marc Gervais

---

Professor Dolores M. Hsu

---

Professor Michael Ingham

*To Josephine and Danny*

The Choir School in the American Church

Copyright © 2005

by

Daniel James McGrath

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks to the members of my committee: Professor Michel Marc Gervais, Professor Dolores M. Hsu, and Professor Michael Ingham, for their assistance during the process of preparing this document. I would like to thank the professional church musicians who shared their time and expertise with me in many combined hours of interviews and observation. I particularly wish to thank Dr. Jeffrey Smith, of Grace Cathedral, San Francisco, John Scott, of St. Thomas's 5<sup>th</sup> Ave., New York, and Michael McCarthy of the National Cathedral for their depth of knowledge and insight into this subject. Finally, I wish to thank my wife, son, and parish family for their patience and support.

## VITA OF DANIEL JAMES MCGRATH

June 2005

### EDUCATION

D.M.A., Choral Conducting  
University of California, Santa Barbara

S.T.B., Bachelor of Sacred Theology  
St. Joseph of Arimathea Anglican Theological College, Berkeley, CA  
2002

M.M., Vocal Performance  
Cleveland State University  
2000

B.A., Music, *magna cum laude*  
Cleveland State University  
1998

### PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

- 2005-present Rector, St. Bartholomew's Anglican Church, Redmond, WA
- 2002-2005 Vicar, Anglican Church of Our Saviour, Santa Barbara, CA
- 2003-2004 Teaching Assistant, University Singers, Department of Music,  
University of California, Santa Barbara
- 2001, 2002 Ordination to the sacred ministry: ordained a deacon, November  
28, 2001; ordained a priest June 9, 2002, in the Anglican Province  
of Christ the King.
- 1999-2000 Program Notes Writer, Gala Concert Series, Cleveland Museum of  
Art.
- 1997-2000 Peer Advisor, College of Arts & Sciences, Cleveland State  
University
- 1999-2000 Tenor, Old Stone Presbyterian Church Choir, Cleveland

1995-1999 Tenor, Trinity Episcopal Cathedral Choir, Cleveland

## PAPERS AND PUBLICATIONS

Article: "The Hymnal, 1940: an historical introduction", in the bi-monthly journal of the American Prayer Book Society, January/February, 2006.  
First in a series of six articles on the hymnal.

Paper: "*Sean nós Singing: unique fusion of poetry and music.*" Presented at the College Music Society meeting, November 2000.

## HONORS

2002 Chancellor's Fellowship, University of California, Santa Barbara  
2000 National Dean's List  
1999 College of Arts & Sciences Outstanding Achievement Award

## FIELDS OF STUDY

Major Field: Choral Conducting

Studies in choral conducting with Michel Marc Gervais and Betsy Burleigh

Secondary Major field: Vocal Performance

Studies in voice with Noriko Fujii Paukert, Amanda Abbott, Dr. Gary Funk

Tertiary Major field: Sacred Theology

Studies in sacred theology at St. Joseph College, Berkeley, CA

Minor Field: Organ performance

Studies in organ with Daniel Hathaway and David Gell

Minor Field: Information Systems

Studies in information systems in the Business College of Cleveland State  
University

## ABSTRACT

### The Choir School in the American Church

by

Daniel James McGrath

The choir school and choir of men and boys are well known as institutions that have been developed and fostered within the Anglican tradition. The strength of this particular church tradition that makes it well-suited as a home for the choir of men and boys stems from its hierarchical structure, its liturgical heritage, and the strength and generosity of its institutions: the monarchy, the cathedrals and the universities with their collegiate chapels. Although the Anglican Church is now well-established throughout the world, the potential of the choir of men and boys and choir school have yet to be fully developed outside of England.

In this document, the author investigates the history and current state of this tradition in America, while examining the possibilities for its renewal and further development. Part I of the document explores the nature of the church, the liturgy and the choir from a historical perspective. Part II focuses on existing models of boy chorister training in the American Church, including the after-school program, the parochial school and the choir school. Part III explores some topics related to the possibility of renewal and contains some suggestions for assembling a new choir.

The traditional model of the choir school is a residential school for boys situated at a cathedral or collegiate chapel, providing room, board and a liberal arts



education for the choristers. These choristers, along with adult male singers, are engaged to sing the regular choral worship services of the church. Previous research into American men and boy choirs has centered upon those programs which most closely follow the traditional model. However, serious chorister training has long been a part of regular parish life where there is no formal choir school, and research into this field until the present has been neglected.

In this document, two current models of chorister training (the after-school chorister program and the parish day school) are investigated alongside the only remaining Anglican choir school in America. The purpose is to explore the various methods used in recruitment, training, staffing and funding of the choirs. Chorister programs included in the study have maintained a traditional choir of men & boys, and in some cases have also developed parallel girl &/or adult choirs.

The purpose of this study is to report to the academic community on current trends within Anglican choir training programs in America and to assemble information that may be used in the planning and formation of a new choir. The information in the document was gathered through visits to several programs of the after-school, day school and choir school variety. The supporting data includes personal interviews of leading staff members as well as on-site observation of course work, rehearsals and performances. Also examined in the research are such written materials about the choirs as could be obtained: histories, journal articles, brochures, charters, bylaws and syllabi.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction.....	9
Part I: Historical Survey.....	13
The Church.....	14
The Liturgy .....	24
The Choir .....	40
Part II: Chorister Training in the American Church Today .....	63
The After-School Program.....	64
The Parochial School with Boy Chorister Training Program.....	85
The Choir School .....	102
Part III: Restoration.....	117
Restoring the tradition.....	118
Forming a new choir on an after-school basis .....	130
Concluding Thoughts.....	133
Bibliography .....	135
Appendices.....	140

## Introduction

The choir of men and boys, vested in cassock and surplice and seated antiphonally in the chancel of a gothic-revival church has become the accepted symbol of Anglican choral music to the rest of the world. This is due in large part to the enormous popularity enjoyed by the cathedral and collegiate chapel choirs of England during the past century. Every Christmas Eve for example, a world-wide audience tunes its radios to a Festival of Nine Lessons and Carols broadcast from the Collegiate Chapel of King's College, Cambridge. A trip to your local records store will reveal a burgeoning market of CD recordings featuring English Cathedral men and boy choirs singing Hymns, Anthems, Motets, Chant, Choral Evensong and even large-scale choral/orchestral works.

In spite of this generally accepted image of the Anglican choir of men and boys, and in spite of its attendant commercial success, most people would be surprised to learn that this tradition remains largely undeveloped among parishes of the Anglican Way beyond the borders of England. Out of 7,500 or so parishes in the USA, for example, less than 30 have a choir of men and boys, and only one can boast a formal choir school. It will be noted that during the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century the choir school and choir of men and boys were more common in America, but that the tradition did not take root in the culture of the American Church and has since declined. The reasons for this decline have been attributed to many factors including lack of financial resources, lack of interest, changing goals for parish music, and even the rejection of what is perceived by some as an elitist or sexist organization.

Today's choirs of men and boys are produced in the cradle of three different training models that I investigate in my research for this document: the Choir School, the Parish Day School with Choir Program, and the After-School Choir Program. The full-fledged Choir School is the most successful model for developing a high quality choir of men and boys, and the approach most commonly associated with the Anglican choral tradition. The Parochial Day School, which is often a college preparatory program, accommodates the performing schedule of the choristers' and offers tuition assistance. The After School Choral Program, or "neighborhood choir", is a program which has no relation to a particular school. In this model, chorister training is undertaken by the organist/choirmaster at the parish church in the afternoons, and is supplemented by a summertime choir camp.

In each model, the end result is a group of boy choristers that have attained a sufficient level of training to enable them to perform with adult choir men in regular choral services of the church. The church in question is either a cathedral or parish church (we do not have a system of Collegiate Chapels such as they do in England), and the number of regular services at which the choir performs ranges anywhere from twice a month, to five times a week. In addition to church services, the choirs often perform concerts in local venues, and appear with popular singers, orchestras, or other ensembles.

It is hoped that this document will be a contribution to the discussion of this great tradition, and that it will give rise to some hopes for its renewal. The information that I have accumulated and set forth might provide ideas or useful

information to someone who wishes to form a new choir school or choral program for a choir of men and boys.

The first task for me is to provide the reader with a contextual sense of the Anglican Church tradition. Within that context I can then say something about the importance of the choir of men and boys as a purveyor of that tradition, and demonstrate how it continues to be beneficial not only to an elite few but also to the overall enrichment of church culture. Once an understanding of the church tradition has been gained, and an appreciation of the need for such a choir has been established, we will be ready to explore the models that currently exist for the organization and training of the choir of men and boys.

The method employed in preparing the material for this document involves a survey of the historical literature about the tradition, sources for which can be found in the bibliography. The research method also involves on-site investigation of living examples of the three different models of chorister training mentioned previously. At the institutions I visited, I interviewed the organist or choirmaster in charge, and where possible I also attended some of the activities of the choir. These activities include rehearsals, music classes, coaching sessions, services and, of course, performances. In each place I also assembled such official publications as might be available: rules, curricula, schedules, histories and recordings. Most of the parishes I visited post a fair amount of information regarding their music program on the internet, and I was able to enrich my supply of information about their programs from that source.

Unfortunately I was not able to visit every American parish where there is a choir of men and boys, but in the course of choosing several specific examples of chorister training models, I believe to have found a cross section which is representative of what goes on throughout the church today generally. Conclusions drawn from my historical surveys and on-site work go into Part III, on "Restoration". This chapter, together with a list of some resources for the Anglican Choirmaster will hopefully be of some assistance to someone who wishes to begin new choir. Also contained among the appendices is a list of active choirs of men and boys in American parishes that are known to me.

## Part One: An Historical Introduction

## The Church

Although it is not possible or perhaps even desirable in the context of this document to set forth a highly detailed account of the history of the Anglican tradition, it will be useful to consider some general features of the church, especially those that pertain to its structure, liturgy and music. In the course of this introduction, a picture emerges of unique church tradition in which the choir of men and boys has been developed and fostered. The church in turn profits from the choir of men and boys as an historic institution that develops and purveys its most sacred traditions.

### *Anglican Heritage*

Anglican and Episcopalian parishes in America are descended from the Church of England, often referred to historically as the *Ecclesia Anglicana*,<sup>1</sup> from which the word “Anglican” is derived. The lengthy history of the *Ecclesia Anglicana* begins in 1<sup>st</sup> century Roman Britannia. Although the exact origins of the Church remain a cause for speculation, the most commonly reported explanation is the story that was maintained by the monks at Glastonbury Abbey<sup>2</sup> for many centuries, that their community had been founded by Joseph of Arimathea.<sup>3</sup> As early as 200 A.D., a theologian named Origin, writing in the eastern part of the Roman Empire, noted wryly that Britain had eluded the control of the Roman legions but had been conquered by Christ.<sup>4</sup> By the year 314 A.D., this Church was well enough

---

<sup>1</sup> Latin: “English Church”.

<sup>2</sup> Reginald F. Treharne, *The Glastonbury Legends* (London: The Cresset Press Ltd., 1967), 5.

<sup>3</sup> A wealthy and evidently well-respected disciple of Jesus, mentioned in the Gospels, who lent a tomb for his burial after the crucifixion. (Matthew 27:57ff; Mark 15:42ff; Luke 23:50ff; John 19:38ff.)

<sup>4</sup> John R.H. Moorman, *A History of the Church in England*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition (Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse Publishing, 1980), 3.



established to send its own bishops to a Church Council at Arles, France.<sup>5</sup> After the Romans began to withdraw from Britannia, the Britons were swept away westward by an invasion of pagan Anglo-Saxons, who settled the south and east of Britain.<sup>6</sup> The Church was largely lost in these parts but reappeared after 597 A.D., when a missionary delegation from Rome led by St. Augustine reestablished the Church in the southeast.<sup>7</sup>

The Church in England remained within the sphere of Roman Catholic influence until the Reformation, although a strongly Celtic mode of Christian spirituality thrived in the indigenous British Church and in the religious communities founded by Irish missionaries such as St. Columba.<sup>8</sup> The Roman and Celtic sides came together at the Council of Whitby (664), to see whether there might be a chance of unity. This council provided the opportunity for a synthesis of Celtic and Roman practice that would foster the distinctive spirituality of the English Church.<sup>9</sup>

The status quo of the church began to be altered in the Reformation, when changes in the administration of the church and various other reforms were initiated by English monarchs from Henry VIII to Charles II. During this time the church asserted its national independence from the immediate jurisdiction of the Roman papacy while attempting to retain its identity as a part of the Catholic Church in

---

<sup>5</sup> Williston Walker, *A History of the Christian Church*, 4<sup>th</sup> edition (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1985), 221.

<sup>6</sup> *Ibid.*, 222.

<sup>7</sup> Bede, *The Ecclesiastical History of the English People*, eds. Judith McClure and Roger Collins, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994), 41.

<sup>8</sup> Moorman, 11.

<sup>9</sup> Martin Thornton, *English Spirituality* (Cambridge, MA: Cowley Publications, 1986), 149ff.

essential matters of faith and order.<sup>10</sup> The Reformation was a pivotal point in the development of the choir of men and boys in the England. This choral tradition which had begun to appear toward the end of the 15<sup>th</sup> century in the context of monasteries and chantries, by the end of the 16<sup>th</sup> century would have taken on a new life in the cathedrals, collegiate chapels and parishes of the reorganized English Church.<sup>11</sup>

The way the Reformation unfolded in England was different than in most other parts of Europe, in the sense that the basic hierarchical structure of the church remained unchanged, and the new liturgy that was adopted, though reformed, drew heavily on liturgies of the past and could still be recognized as a catholic liturgy.<sup>12</sup> To this day it is recognized that “the term ‘Anglican’ ... implies recognition of the unique validity, for sacramental purposes, of the apostolic succession through a hierarchy of bishops, priests and deacons: this belief, along with the use of a prescribed liturgy, distinguishes Anglicans and Episcopalians from most other protestant sects”.<sup>13</sup>

The most significant changes brought to Church life that might have been apparent to English churchgoers during the Reformation were the gradual suppression of the monasteries under Henry VIII and the introduction of a new book of services in

---

<sup>10</sup> This view was developed at length by Anglican theologian Richard Hooker, in his *Of the Laws of Ecclesiastical Polity* (1594), and Bishop John Jewel in his *Apologia Ecclesiae Anglicanae* (1562). See Moorman, 215-216.

<sup>11</sup> Edmund H. Fellowes, *English Cathedral Music* (London: Methuen and Co., Ltd., 1969), 6.

<sup>12</sup> Moorman, 189.

<sup>13</sup> Nicholas Temperly, “Anglicanism and Episcopalianism”, in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Ed., 29 vols., ed. Stanley Sadie, (London: Macmillan Publishers Ltd., 2001), 658.

the English language under Edward VI.<sup>14</sup> In some cases, a monastery that had been suppressed was refounded as a secular (non-monastic) church. This symbolized the Reformation shift in English spirituality away from monastic life, where it was previously centered, to a new center in cathedral or in parish life. Monasteries that were refounded as cathedrals were now governed by a dean and chapter of married parochial clergy rather than by an abbot and chapter of celibate monks.<sup>15</sup> At the same time the choir of men and boys which had previously been identified with the worshiping community of the monastery, now took on a new life among the reformed clerical communities of the cathedrals, collegiate chapels and parish churches.

It has been noted that there was no sudden creation of a new church in England, but rather a period of gradual reforms extending from approximately 1534-1662.<sup>16</sup> The end result of this reforming period was a church body that was independent of the immediate legal jurisdiction of Rome, which had a distinctly English-catholic liturgy, and the institutions in place which were capable of nurturing that liturgy and developing it into a distinctive choral tradition. Complete and final separation from the Roman hierarchy occurred in 1570 during the reign of Elizabeth I, when any English person who recognized her authority or who remained within the *Ecclesia Anglicana* incurred excommunication by order of Pope Pius V.<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>14</sup> Ibid., 659.

<sup>15</sup> David Edwards, *The Cathedrals of Britain* (Andover, U.K.: Pitkin Unichrome Ltd., 1989), 31.

<sup>16</sup> The time from the King Henry VIII's Act of Supremacy (1534) to the final revision of the *Book of Common Prayer* in 1662. See Kenneth Long, *The Music of the English Church* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1971), 19.

<sup>17</sup> Moorman, 205.

The English nation and its Church achieved a new maturity and self-confidence during the reign of Elizabeth I and her successor James I. Legislation introduced into parliament by Queen Elizabeth I gave the English monarch the qualified title of “supreme governor” of the Church in England, and her Act of Uniformity established the Book of Common Prayer as the only official liturgy for use in the English Church.<sup>18</sup> Queen Elizabeth’s carefully diplomatic approach to divisive church issues, known today as the “Elizabethan Settlement”, helped to quell the partisan strife between Romanists and Puritans that at times threatened the unity of the church.<sup>19</sup>

Elizabeth’s successor, King James I, sponsored a fresh English translation of the Bible, which became known as the Authorized Version (AV) or King James Version (KJV). This undertaking ensured that the text of the church’s Holy Scriptures would be accessible to England’s parish churches in a beautiful and readable style. Happily, these works which would become so characteristic of the Anglican Church were crafted during a time in which the standards of English prose were at their highest level.<sup>20</sup> The King James Bible and the Book of Common Prayer came to form the core spirituality of Anglican choirs of men and boys, as week-by-week they sang the great services of the church in the powerful and poetic language of the greatest era of English literature.<sup>21</sup> These books would shape the language of public worship for English speaking Christians outside the Anglican Church as well.

---

<sup>18</sup> Walker, 494-495.

<sup>19</sup> *Ibid.*, 543.

<sup>20</sup> Long, 25.

<sup>21</sup> Brian Taylor, “Men and Boy Choirs: Another Aspect of Preserving Anglican Tradition”, *The Mandate*, Vol. 21, No. 2, (Philadelphia: The American Prayerbook Society, 2000), 7.

For example, even though Anglicans have long been a religious minority in America, their KJV Bible has historically been the single most prevalent and unifying feature in American churches of every denomination.<sup>22</sup>

The existence of an international communion of churches descended from the Church of England coincides with the history of the development of Great Britain into an international empire. As English influence spread to various continents, the *Ecclesia Anglicana* also became present in new places in order to serve English citizens abroad.<sup>23</sup> This presence, combined with intensive missionary activity in Africa and Asia, resulted in a worldwide communion of national churches based upon the post-Reformation English model and united by similarities in structure and liturgy.<sup>24</sup> Even though most churches have developed traditions of worship that are characteristic of their own region, there are always a few cathedrals, such as in Lagos (Nigeria) and Cape Town (South Africa) that continue to have fully choral Anglican services sung by a choir of men and boys.<sup>25</sup> One of the great ironies of the Anglican tradition today is the fact that there are more Anglicans in Nigeria than in England, and more on the continent of Africa than in England, America, Canada and Australia combined.<sup>26</sup> Some have even noted that English has now become the second

---

<sup>22</sup> Alister McGrath, *In the Beginning* (New York: Doubleday, 2001), 294.

<sup>23</sup> Moorman, 404.

<sup>24</sup> *Ibid.*, 428.

<sup>25</sup> Temperley, "Anglicanism", 670.

<sup>26</sup> Robert Prichard, *A History of the Episcopal Church* (Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse Publishing, 1999), 305.

language of the Anglican World, although the word “Anglican” continues to denote a history rooted in English Catholicism.<sup>27</sup>

Anglican provinces around the world are fully autonomous, but they continue to regard the ancient See of Canterbury with respect. The Archbishop of Canterbury holds a position of historical and cultural significance, and invites the majority of Anglican bishops from around the world to a consultation (called the Lambeth Conference) once every ten years at his palace in England.<sup>28</sup> American parishes of the Anglican tradition today are identified primarily by their polity and by their liturgy rather than by a formal relationship with the Archbishop of Canterbury, which will be explained more fully in the next section on the American Church.

#### *The American Church*

Anglicans were strongly represented among English settlers in various American colonies, especially in Virginia, Maryland and New York.<sup>29</sup> However, the Church did not have the monopoly on spiritual life that had been enjoyed in the Mother Country, since many of the English settlers fleeing to America came for the very purpose of escaping what they regarded as the intolerable hegemony of the Church of England. Many settlers who thus came seeking religious freedom were either Puritan or Roman dissenters, a feature that made America into one of the most diverse religious populations in the world from the start.<sup>30</sup> The Revolutionary War dealt a further blow to Anglicans in America. As members of the Church of England,

---

<sup>27</sup> Ibid., 307.

<sup>28</sup> Moorman, 430.

<sup>29</sup> Prichard, 38.

<sup>30</sup> Ibid., 14, 15.

they suffered by association with the English establishment. Some Anglican clergy were chaplains to British troops in America, and following the outcome of the war, many loyalist churchmen fled to Canada, fearing for their lives.<sup>31</sup> Those who remained found themselves without a monarch, without bishops (none had yet been consecrated for America) and in possession of an outmoded liturgy containing prayers for King and Parliament in a country that now had a President and Congress.<sup>32</sup>

The Church would remain in a weak position until it had resolved its need for an American episcopate and an American liturgy. The situation changed with the consecration of Samuel Seabury of Connecticut by the bishops of the Scottish Episcopal Church, and William White of Pennsylvania by bishops of the Church of England.<sup>33</sup> Once the Americans had their own bishops who could carry on the apostolic ministry and lead the church locally, they proceeded to authorize a prayer book that would serve as the unifying expression of faith and worship throughout the United States. At the general convention of 1789, a Book of Common Prayer was adopted that was modeled on the English 1662 book and the Scottish 1637 book, with various slight changes making it suitable for American use.<sup>34</sup> This book in its 1789, 1892 and 1928 editions is known generally as the American Prayerbook. American Anglicans organized themselves into a “Protestant Episcopal Church”, which over time would devolve into a mainline American sect, the Episcopal Church USA (–or

---

<sup>31</sup> Ibid, 75.

<sup>32</sup> Christopher Webber, *Welcome to the Episcopal Church* (Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse Publishing, 1999), 8.

<sup>33</sup> Prichard, 86-88.

<sup>34</sup> Ibid., 96.

ECUSA), a number of smaller provinces of traditional Anglicans,<sup>35</sup> and a few “Anglican-rite” parishes among the Roman Catholics and the Orthodox.

#### *American Church Structure*

The word *Episcopal* (gr. επισκοπος = overseer) describes a manner of church polity, which is to say that this kind of church is led by bishops, rather than by a presbytery (a body of elders, i.e. Presbyterian Model) or by the lay members of a congregation (i.e., the Congregational Model). An Anglican bishop is consecrated in the apostolic succession by the laying on of hands, a tactile succession that is believed to originate in Christ’s ordination of the Apostles and subsequently carried on through each generation of catholic bishops.<sup>36</sup>

In many Anglican Churches around the world, as in some provinces of the American Church, one senior bishop is elevated to the rank of archbishop, a position which denotes primatial status as “chief pastor” among a college of bishops.<sup>37</sup> One notable difference between the American Church and the Church of England due to the separation of church and state provided for in our country’s constitution is that the secular authority (such the President or Congress) has no involvement in the governance of the American Church. While In England the Queen is still officially the church’s supreme governor, the American Church has no higher authority than the bishops, clergy and laity acting in synod.<sup>38</sup>

---

<sup>35</sup> Ibid., 148, 265.

<sup>36</sup> Vernon Staley, *The Catholic Religion* (Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse Publishing, 1996), 13.

<sup>37</sup> The Anglican Province of Christ the King, *The Canons of the Anglican Province of Christ the King* (Berkeley, CA: American Church Union, 2002), 3.

<sup>38</sup> Webber, 107.



In addition to bishops, the ministry of the church includes priests (sometimes called ‘presbyters’, gr. πρεσβητερος = elder) and deacons (gr. διακονος = servant), completing a three-fold pattern for ministry which can be observed in the New Testament and which has been accepted as standard catholic practice since the earliest times.<sup>39</sup> The bishop is the chief pastor of a *diocese*, or regional body of parishes, while the priests and deacons carry on his apostolic ministry at the local parish level. The priest of a parish is known as the *Rector*, if it is a self-sustaining parish, or the *Vicar* if it is a mission relying on the diocese for financial support. The priest in a parish may be assisted in the ministry by associate priests or deacons, and is assisted in administrative affairs by a *Vestry* of elected lay members.<sup>40</sup> In parishes with a school and music program, the headmaster of the school and the choirmaster/organist is normally employed by the rector and the vestry.

The monastic tradition was largely lost to Anglicans during the Reformation, and did not appear in the American Church until the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Although there has been a limited revival of Anglican religious communities, the spiritual center of the church continues to be located in the cathedral and parish church. Anglican clergy (bishops, priests and deacons) together with the vested choir of men and boys, have long formed the characteristic worshipping community for the performance of the offices of the church, essentially taking over a major function of the monastic community. For this reason, among others, it has often been observed that the choir

---

<sup>39</sup> “Preface to the Ordinal”, *The Book of Common Prayer, 1928 edition* (New York: Oxford University Press), 529.

<sup>40</sup> Webber, 104.

is thus a training ground for future priests and bishops in the church, as the boys live and breathe the routines of church life, and absorb its liturgy into their souls.<sup>41</sup>

## The Liturgy

Anglicans use a written liturgy for worship, which is to say that the mode of public worship is read from prescribed forms which have been the common practice of the church for many centuries. The Anglican liturgy is contained in the Book of Common Prayer, first sponsored in 1549 by Thomas Cranmer who was Archbishop of Canterbury during the time of Henry VIII and Edward VI.<sup>42</sup> Subsequent revisions of the Church of England prayer book took place in 1552, 1559, with a final revision in 1662 when it took its present form.<sup>43</sup> Until the 1970's, most Anglicans throughout the world used a prayer book that was derived from the 1662 Book of Common Prayer of the Church of England, adapted to local use.<sup>44</sup> The American Book of Common Prayer (1789, 1892 and 1928 editions) is based upon the English book of 1662, with some additions from the Scottish Episcopal Church prayer book of 1637 and with some modifications pertaining to use in America.

The principle worship services of the Church contained in the Book of Common Prayer are the Office of Holy Communion (commonly called Eucharist or Mass), and the Daily Office of Morning and Evening Prayer (commonly called

---

<sup>41</sup> Brian Taylor, 7.

<sup>42</sup> Donald Jay Grout and Claude V. Palisca, *A History of Western Music*, 5<sup>th</sup> edition, (New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 1996), 248.

<sup>43</sup> Louis Tarsitano and Peter Toon, *Neither Archaic Nor Obsolete: the Language of Common Prayer and Public Worship* (Philadelphia: The Prayerbook Society of the U.S.A., 2003), 32.

<sup>44</sup> *Ibid.*, 34.

Matins and Evensong). These offices, combined with private personal devotions, form the classic spirituality of Anglicans.<sup>45</sup> Also contained in the prayer book: the Litany; the Psalter (which is the entire Book of Psalms arranged for reading through on a 30-day cycle); the Order of Service for Baptism, Confirmation, Matrimony, Anointing of the Sick, and Burial of the Dead; the Ordinal, (which is the “Form of Making, Ordaining, and Consecrating Bishops, Priests, and Deacons); two short catechisms for teaching the basics of the catholic faith; the 39 Articles of Religion; some short forms of daily prayer for use in families.<sup>46</sup>

#### *16<sup>th</sup> Century Rationale for the Book of Common Prayer*

By the time of Edward VI, the Latin Rites in use in the church in England had become so complex that no fewer than nine different books (namely the *Missal*, the *Gradual*, the *Breviary*, the *Antiphonary*, the *Processional*, the *Manual*, the *Pontifical*, the *Primer* and the *Consuetudinary* -- some bound in multiple volumes!) were required to properly conduct the liturgy.<sup>47</sup> Reading the services of the church had become so complicated a matter, that a directory known as the *Pie* was needed to index the other books. One can sense the frustration of Thomas Cranmer, then Archbishop of Canterbury, who noted in his preface to the first Book of Common Prayer that “the number and hardness of the Rules called the *Pie*, and the manifold changings of the Service, was the cause, that to turn the Book only was so hard and

---

<sup>45</sup> Thornton, 258.

<sup>46</sup> The Book of Common Prayer, 1928 edition.

<sup>47</sup> Kenneth Long, *The Music of the English Church* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1972), 23ff.

intricate a matter, that many times there was more business to find out what should be read, than to read it when it was found out".<sup>48</sup>

Adding to the difficulty of the situation was the fact that different 'Uses' of the liturgy also existed in different parts of the country, whether that might be in York, Salisbury, Lincoln or a number of other localities.<sup>49</sup> Reformers desired a liturgy that would be simple and accessible, that would be universal throughout the English realm, and which would also allow the words of Holy Scripture to be heard and understood directly by the English people.<sup>50</sup> The title 'Book of Common Prayer' says something about the intention of Archbishop Cranmer that all people of the English realm would pray in 'common' from the same rite, a rite which was to be simple, user-friendly, catholic and reformed, all at once.<sup>51</sup> Choirs of men and boys which formerly sang the liturgy conforming to the sundry books of the medieval rites, now sang the reformed liturgy contained in the Book of Common Prayer. Instead of singing the Mass and the Monastic Offices in monasteries and chantries, they sang the Anglican Holy Communion service and Daily Office in cathedrals, collegiate chapels and parish churches.<sup>52</sup>

With the implementation of the Book of Common Prayer in 1549, the Latin rites of the church began to be suppressed. The first Act of Uniformity of January 21, 1549 ordered that 'the Book of Common Prayer and none other' was to be used in

---

<sup>48</sup> Cranmer's preface to the Book of Common Prayer, 1549.

<sup>49</sup> Long, 25.

<sup>50</sup> Ibid., 22.

<sup>51</sup> Ibid., 25.

<sup>52</sup> See Appendix A, for a comparison of the Medieval and the Anglican Daily Offices.

English parishes beginning Whitsunday, June 9.<sup>53</sup> This left only six months in which to undertake an ambitious program of phasing out the settings of the mass, motets and other sacred music in Latin and to implement music for the new Anglican Rite.

This potentially disastrous situation was mitigated in part by the fact that some English-text settings of the Mass ordinary had already existed for some time. The *Wanley Part-Books* of the Bodleian Library (dating from 1546-47) show that the change from Latin to English had been anticipated by some church musicians.

“These books include between eighty and ninety musical compositions set to English words, including the morning and evening canticles, two harmonized settings of the plainsong of the Litany, a large number of anthems, and, what is still more remarkable, ten English settings of the Office for the Holy Communion, complete with *Kyrie, Credo, Gloria in excelsis, Sanctus, Benedictus* and *Agnus dei.*”<sup>54</sup>

Important composers such as Christopher Tye (c.1500-1573), Thomas Tallis (c.1505-1585) and William Byrd (c.1543-1623) wasted no time in adding to the depth and quality of the new repertoire.<sup>55</sup>

The Daily Office and the Holy Communion Service from the Book of Common Prayer have now served as the standard of public worship among Anglicans for more than 450 years, making this one of the great liturgical traditions of western Christianity. During this time a large body of Church music has arisen to support the liturgy of the prayer book. Great English composers from Thomas Tallis to Benjamin

---

<sup>53</sup> Edmund Fellowes, *English Cathedral Music* (London: Butler and Tanner Ltd., 1969), 6.

<sup>54</sup> *Ibid.*, 7.

<sup>55</sup> Long, 66.

Britten have composed Service Music and Anthems for the Anglican Rite. Most have written settings of the service for Holy Communion, as well as the Canticles for the Daily Office, and these compositions presently make up a rather large canon of repertoire for Anglican choirs of men and boys.

### *The Daily Office*

The Anglican Daily Office of Matins and Evensong was crafted by Archbishop Thomas Cranmer out of the eight medieval monastic offices, thereby creating a simplified means of daily corporate prayer that could be carried on at the local level by parish clergy.<sup>56</sup> Provided for in the context of the new offices was a disciplined course of readings from Holy Scripture, in which the Old Testament was read through once and the New Testament three times during the course of each church year.<sup>57</sup> Recitation of the Psalter was retained as the center of the Daily Office, but “whereas previously the entire psalter had been recited or sung through once a week [by monks], from now onwards its recitation was to be spread over a month”.<sup>58</sup> Cranmer gracefully compressed parts of the monastic offices of Matins, Lauds and Prime into Anglican Matins, and parts of the monastic offices of Vespers and Compline to form Anglican Evensong. The underlying assumption was that the new Offices could be sung and enjoyed corporately by the clergy and people of a village parish where the houses were often clustered around the church.<sup>59</sup> This illustrated the shift of the center of worship from the exclusive monastic setting where the offices

---

<sup>56</sup> Thornton, 266.

<sup>57</sup> Long, 23.

<sup>58</sup> Ibid.

<sup>59</sup> Thornton, 273.

are read in the chapel of the enclosed monastic community, to the more public setting of the parish church. Located in Appendix A is a general comparison of the cycle of the Daily Office in the Book of Common Prayer with the cycle of the Monastic Offices that had been in use previously.

Upon examination, the order for the Daily Office as it appears in the 1928 American Book of Common Prayer is essentially the same as one might find in the 1662 Church of England book (see Appendix B). The terms ‘Matins’ and ‘Evensong’ no longer appear in the prayer book, revisers showing a preference for ‘Morning Prayer’ and ‘Evening Prayer’ instead, but in common parlance the traditional names are often used.<sup>60</sup>

In choral settings of the Daily Office, the canticles normally sung for matins are the *Te Deum laudamus* and the *Benedictus*, while in the Office of Evensong, the *Magnificat* and *Nunc dimittis* are generally sung. Settings of the Canticles range from simple plainsong to elaborate polyphonic settings. The Versicles/Responses, the Psalter, the Creed and the Lord’s Prayer are normally sung to plainsong or to Anglican Chant.<sup>61</sup>

#### *Office of Holy Communion*

As with the Daily Office, the Anglican service of Holy Communion designed by Cranmer reflects its catholic heritage. The mass ordinary (*Kyrie, Gloria, Credo, Sanctus, Benedictus* and *Agnus dei*) was retained in the 1549 book, and other features

---

<sup>60</sup> Massey Shepherd, *The Oxford American Prayerbook Commentary* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1950), 3-5.

<sup>61</sup> E. C. R. Lamburn, *Ritual Notes* (London: W. Knot & Son Limited, 1964), 236ff.

of the Church Year, such as the mass proper (Collect, Epistle, Gospel) were also retained with some minor modifications and translation into English. At the same time, the Holy Communion service was reformed to make possible increased participation by lay persons and to avoid any suggestion of medieval beliefs that had been rejected in the English Reformation, such as the invocation of saints, the propitiatory sacrifice of the mass, and the doctrine of transubstantiation. Although it has historically been a matter of importance to Anglicans that the liturgy be sung in a language “understood of the people”,<sup>62</sup> this did not prevent the mass ordinary or motets from being sung in Latin at the collegiate chapels of Cambridge and Oxford, where Latin was the language of scholarship.<sup>63</sup> This flexibility allowed a wealth of pre-Reformation and counter-Reformation polyphony to continue being performed by Anglican choirs.

The Office of Holy Communion as it appears in the 1928 American Book of Common Prayer closely follows the 1662 English prayer book, with some interpolations from the 1637 Scottish book. The *Gloria in excelsis* appears at the end of the service, meaning that when a pre-Reformation setting of the mass is used, a decision has to be made whether to sing the mass setting in the original order of the Latin Rite, in which the *Gloria* follows the *Kyrie*, or to preserve the rhythm of the service as Cranmer envisioned it, with the *Gloria* coming at the end of the service. See Appendix C for a list of the parts of the Office of Holy Communion from the American Book of Common Prayer, 1928 edition.

---

<sup>62</sup> Article XXIV of the “Articles of Religion”, *The Book of Common Prayer*, 1928 edition, 607.

<sup>63</sup> Long, 22.



In most Anglican cathedrals and collegiate chapels, the service for Holy Communion is sung by the choir at least once a week, and the Daily Office (Evensong only) up to six days a week. Services of choral matins have become increasingly rare,<sup>64</sup> and the only remaining Anglican cathedral in the world known to this writer that still claims to offer choral matins on a daily basis is the Cathedral of St. Patrick, Dublin, of the Church of Ireland.<sup>65</sup>

*Anglican Choral Music: the Service, the Anthem and Anglican Chant*

The choral foundations of the English Cathedrals, both those established by Henry VIII and those that predated his reign, would ensure that organists and choirs were provided for during and after the changes of the Reformation. This safe environment permitted several uniquely Anglican choral forms to arise which together constitute the repertoire for the choirs of men and boys.<sup>66</sup> An Anglican *Service* is a complete choral setting of the services for one day, beginning with the canticles of Matins, continuing with the mass ordinary parts of Holy Communion, and ending with the canticles for Evensong. Occasionally choral settings of shorter prayers are included in those services, such as the opening Versicles and Responses of the Daily Office, the Creed, the Lord's Prayer and a choral "Amen" after the sung collects. When a choral setting is written only for one of the offices, it is generally known as an 'Evening Service' or a 'Morning Service'. "A *Great Service* is one whose music is contrapuntal and melismatic; a *Short Service* has music that is chordal

---

<sup>64</sup> Long, 387.

<sup>65</sup> Sarah Noon, *From Highest Heaven*, Saint Patrick's Cathedral Choir, compact disc notes, (Dublin: Saint Patrick's Cathedral, 1996), STPC 2001.

<sup>66</sup> Fellowes, 10.

and syllabic—there is no difference in content between the two. One of the finest specimens of Anglican church music is the *Great Service* of Byrd.”<sup>67</sup> Many of the *Services* are composed for double chorus, named *cantoris* or *decani*, depending on which side of the chancel the choirs are seated.

The *Anthem* is the English counterpart of the Latin motet. It is an extra-liturgical setting of the words of scripture, poetry, prayers or hymns. A *full anthem*, such as Byrd’s *Sing joyfully unto God*, is generally written in contrapuntal style for unaccompanied chorus throughout. The *verse anthem*, commonly associated with Henry Purcell or George F. Handel, employs one or more solo passages with instrumental accompaniment, alternating with passages for full chorus.<sup>68</sup> The *full anthem* experienced resurgence in the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries, and a wealth of repertoire of varying styles has continued to flower.

*Anglican Chant* is a formula used for singing psalms and canticles which essentially amounts to a harmonized form of plainchant, related to the continental *falsobordone*.<sup>69</sup> Composed for SATB chorus, the chant has a reciting tone (which is actually not just a single tone, but a 4-voice chord), a mediant (usually resembling a half-cadence) and a final cadence (usually a perfect-authentic cadence).<sup>70</sup> The first part of a single chant leads to the mediant by a progression of between three and five chords, the second part leads to the final cadence by a progression of between five and nine chords. In a ‘double chant’, the formula is repeated once, and in a

---

<sup>67</sup> Grout and Palisca, 248-249.

<sup>68</sup> *Ibid.*, 249.

<sup>69</sup> Nicholas Temperley, “Anglican Chant”, in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2<sup>nd</sup> Ed., 29 vols, Stanley Sadie, editor (London: Macmillan Publishers, Ltd., 2001 ), 672.

<sup>70</sup> The Hymnal, 1940.

‘quadruple chant’ it is repeated three times.<sup>71</sup> *Anglican Chant* arose in the choral practice of the post-reformation royal peculiars (the Chapel Royal, Westminster Abbey and St. George’s, Windsor), from which it circulated to the cathedrals and parish churches.<sup>72</sup> Several Psalters exist which contain ‘pointing’ in the text which corresponds to the chant formula. These include *The Parish Psalter*, *The Oxford Psalter* and *The New Cathedral Psalter*.<sup>73</sup> *The Oxford American Psalter* (first published 1936) contains Anglican Chant pointing for the Psalter of the American prayer book of 1928.<sup>74</sup>

### *The Hymnal*

The rubrics of the American Book of Common Prayer authorize and encourage the singing of hymns and anthems with the official services of the church. “Hymns set forth and allowed by the authority of this Church, and Anthems in the words of scripture or of the Book of Common Prayer, may be sung before and after any Office in this Book, and also before and after Sermons”.<sup>75</sup> The first American Prayerbook of 1789 was bound with a metrical psalter and 27 hymns (without tunes) for use in congregational singing.<sup>76</sup> This part of the book, known as the *Hymnal*, was subsequently enlarged and printed as a separate volume in the editions of 1826, 1871, 1892, 1940 and 1982. “In 1927, acting under authorization of the General

---

<sup>71</sup> Temperley, “Anglican Chant”, 672.

<sup>72</sup> Ibid.

<sup>73</sup> Ibid.

<sup>74</sup> Leonard Ellinwood, *The History of American Church Music* (New York: Morehouse-Gorham Co., 1953), 82.

<sup>75</sup> The Book of Common Prayer, viii.

<sup>76</sup> *The Hymnal 1940 Companion*, 3rd Revised Edition (New York: The Church Pension Fund, 1951), xix.

Convention of the Episcopal Church, the Joint Commission on Church Music published *The Choral Service*, followed in 1936 by *The American Psalter* and *The Plainsong Psalter*, thus providing Anglican and plainsong settings for both choir and congregational participation in ‘sung’ services.”<sup>77</sup> The *Hymnal 1940* is a valuable resource for the choir of men and boys, containing 600 hymn settings and also music for choral services. The greater part of *The Choral Service* was originally included in the *Hymnal 1940*, together with Anglican Chant settings for various Psalms from Prayer book offices, and no less than four sung settings of the Holy Communion. The first of these is the 1550 plainsong setting of John Merbecke; the second is *Missa de Sancta Maria Magdalena*, a unison setting with organ accompaniment by Healy Willan (1928); the third is *Mass of the Quiet Hour*, composed for mixed voices by George Oldroyd (1938); and the fourth is known as *Missa Marialis*, a medieval plainsong setting that is usually associated with Feasts of the Blessed Virgin Mary.<sup>78</sup> Also included in the *Hymnal, 1940*: portions of services by S. S. Wesley, Edward Bairstow, John Stainer, Thomas Tallis, T. Tertius Noble, T. Fredrick H. Candlyn, an Old Scottish Chant setting of the *Gloria in excelsis*, and other ancient settings of the Lord’s Prayer, the *Sursum Corda* and the Nicene Creed.

The *Hymnal, 1940* was updated in 1961 and again in 1976, with four additional settings of Holy Communion being added. These settings were written by Leo Sowerby, William Bodine, Charles Waters and Martin Shaw. Also included in the updated edition were some additional Anglican Chant tunes, several new hymns, a

---

<sup>77</sup> Ellinwood, 82.

<sup>78</sup> *The Hymnal 1940 Companion*, 359-363.

few supplemental tunes for existing hymns, and a new liturgical index. An important new development in the update of 1976 was the inclusion of all eight settings for the *Benedictus*, a part of the mass ordinary which had previously been omitted.

Three important volumes produced in the 20<sup>th</sup> century that together form an indispensable music library for an American choir of men and boys today are *The American Psalter* (Anglican Chant), *The Plainsong Psalter*, and *The Hymnal, 1940*. For parishes using contemporary-language liturgies, the best companion is *The Hymnal, 1982*. Although the focus of *The Hymnal, 1982* is decidedly congregational rather than choral singing,<sup>79</sup> one can find quality examples of Anglican chant in 20<sup>th</sup> century musical idioms. For parishes using the traditional Book of Common Prayer, *The Hymnal, 1982* may also be useful as a supplemental performing resource, but one will take note that its texts do not conform to the Anglican prayer book tradition as do the texts of *The Hymnal 1940*.

#### *Contemporary Anglican Liturgies*

In the latter half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century a variety of new liturgies appeared which featured a new utilitarian prose style and a new shape that broke up familiar patterns of Anglican worship.<sup>80</sup> During this time American Anglicans, as well as Christians of many other denominations were encouraged to address Almighty God in public worship using the same register (tone) they would use to approach the clerk at the grocery store, or their buddy walking down the street. This style of liturgy is often

---

<sup>79</sup> Temperley, "Anglicanism and Episcopalianism", 669.

<sup>80</sup> Prichard, 251ff..

accompanied by what is considered to be popular or ‘folk’ music.<sup>81</sup> This approach to Christian worship is gently ridiculed by Garrison Keillor in his memorable speech on “The Power of Choral Singing”, where he compares church hymnology of the seventies to the music of commerce. “A lot of...modern Christian hymnology...sounds a great deal like commercials—has that commercial sound to it. ‘God is my friend...he watches over me...he takes care of me...he gives me a Coke’...is what I get from this.”<sup>82</sup>

In the ECUSA, the new style was most evident in a book of services published in 1979, which included the option of ‘traditional’ language or ‘contemporary’ language rites. Although this book was published under the title of “The Book of Common Prayer, 1979”, extensive changes were made to the services of the church as they had been known in the prayer book tradition begun by Archbishop Thomas Cranmer.<sup>83</sup> One fundamental difference stems from the fact that the most important feature of the new liturgy was deemed to be its ‘shape’, or pattern, rather than its content.<sup>84</sup> This was a departure from the Common Prayer tradition, in which it was believed that the entire church ought to pray the same content ‘in common’ with one another. With the new emphasis being placed on ‘shape’ however, individual parishes not only had many different optional texts at their disposal, but were even

---

<sup>81</sup> Long, 433-439.

<sup>82</sup> Garrison Keillor, “The Power of Choral Singing”, *Choral Journal*, Vol. 41, No. 5, (2000), 43.

<sup>83</sup> Prichard, 253.

<sup>84</sup> Louis R. Tarsitano and Peter Toon, *Neither Orthodoxy nor a Formulary* (Philadelphia: The Prayer Book Society of the U.S.A., 2004), 29.

permitted to create their own texts, as long as they followed what had been deemed by experts to be the proper shape of the liturgy.<sup>85</sup>

This development has had a devastating impact on American choirs of men and boys because their repertoire uses the words of the classic Anglican liturgies, and thus the content of the liturgy, rather than the shape, is of greater importance. Some choirmasters of this era argued that it was “inconceivable” that four and a half centuries of great choral repertoire would have to be abandoned just because the priest was saying something new at the altar.<sup>86</sup> However, music and the liturgy are so closely intertwined in the Anglican tradition that it is difficult to see how there could be any other outcome.

It has also been noted that generations of boys internalized the majestic Anglican liturgy through the “language of immersion”, and that this experience has been as memorable for them as it was formative.<sup>87</sup> One wonders whether the texts and music of the seventies (noted more for their banality than their beauty) could ever be as memorable, inspiring and formative for choirboys as the powerful and poetic Book of Common Prayer tradition has been.

A dynamic and living tradition is one that is open to change and is able to express itself in new ways that reflect the best of current trends. Such is the way in which the Anglican choral tradition has adapted to 20<sup>th</sup> century musical idioms.

Today one can enjoy Anglican Chant, Anthems and Service Music in strikingly avant

---

<sup>85</sup> The Book of Common Prayer, 1979 edition, p. 400ff.

<sup>86</sup> Steven E. Hendricks, “The Washington National Cathedral Boy Choir: Musical, Spiritual, and Academic Training of the Choristers Through the Twentieth Century” (Doctor of Arts diss., Ball State University), 61.

<sup>87</sup> Ibid.

garde musical language, and this is rightly seen as legitimate progress and development of a great choral tradition. However, the Anglican choral tradition must continue to have access to its standard repertoire in order to hold its place among the plethora of varying worship styles in America today.

Sudden, abrupt, or iconoclastic change does not serve the purpose of developing the choral tradition, but rather contributes to its demise. This can be seen during the Reformation under Henry VIII and Edward VI, with the dissolution of the monasteries and the introduction of a new liturgy. In this instance, however, one must remember that provision was made by Henry VIII for the continuation of the choral tradition, and that a great new liturgical tradition was created that inspired and fostered great music. Abrupt, iconoclastic change also took place under Oliver Cromwell (discussed further in the following section) but in this case the choral tradition was not valued by those in positions of power, and the tradition very nearly ceased to exist.

The Anglican liturgies of the prayer book tradition (1549-1928) have been almost completely phased out of use in the ECUSA today, and the liturgies of the seventies mandated for use in most parish churches.<sup>88</sup> The same has not happened in the Church of England, even though contemporary alternatives to the Book of Common Prayer are permitted. It is interesting to note that a new book of services introduced in England in the early 1982 was entitled more appropriately the

---

<sup>88</sup> Prichard, 254.



*Alternative Service Book*,<sup>89</sup> (and more recently a variation on the ASB, *Common Worship* has also been introduced). Yet the Book of Common Prayer is still not only permitted for use by parishes in England, but in fact remains the official liturgy of the Church of England.<sup>90</sup>

The American Prayerbook remains in use mainly by smaller Anglican provinces throughout America, and is also heavily relied upon in ECUSA parishes that have a choir of men and boys. In spite of enduring a period of near iconoclastic liturgical change, choirs of men and boys today still rely on the texts of the classic Book of Common Prayer tradition (1549-1928) when singing Service settings or performing the Psalter.<sup>91</sup> One must not forget that a vast body of choral music has been written for the classic texts of that tradition by the greatest English composers of history. The choir of men and boys was the specific instrument for which the repertoire was written, and there is thus an enduring relationship between the liturgy and the choir. In English cathedrals today, the 1662 prayer book is retained for the daily choral services.<sup>92</sup> In some American parishes the 1662 Church of England Prayerbook is occasionally used for Evensong,<sup>93</sup> but in normal circumstances, the 1928 American book and its attendant resources are still the closest relatives in use on this side of the Atlantic.<sup>94</sup>

---

<sup>89</sup> Tarsitano and Toon, *Neither Orthodoxy Nor a Formulary*, 94.

<sup>90</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 95.

<sup>91</sup> Andrew Mead, "Epilogue by The Rector", in *St. Thomas Church Fifth Avenue*, by J. Robert Wright, (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2001), 240.

<sup>92</sup> Temperley, "Anglicanism and Episcopalianism", 667.

<sup>93</sup> Mead, 240.

<sup>94</sup> Peter Toon, *Which Rite is Right?* (Swedesboro, NJ: Preservation Press, 1994), 115.

## The Choir

The 15<sup>th</sup> century witnessed something of a revolution in English choral practice. Prior to 1400, choral music in the Church had consisted mostly of small groups of adult male soloists singing plainchant. By the end of the fifteenth century, polyphonic music for chorus had emerged as one of the principal features of church practice in England, involving the voices of the boys as well as those of the men.<sup>95</sup> The monks of English abbeys began to call on boys to assist in the singing of daily choral services using the new polyphonic repertoire. At first the number of boys in comparison to men was rather small, but as the tradition took hold in English abbeys and churches, the number of boy choristers began to grow, and choirmasters began to be retained for the special purpose of training them.<sup>96</sup>

Chorister training at the time was practical, rather than academic, and the focus of the choirmaster was on improving the boys' performance of the liturgy through participation.<sup>97</sup> Musical training was only a part of the educational arrangement. "In addition to musical skills, choristers learned to read and write English and Latin, and morals based on Christian teaching. This education prepared boys not only for musical careers, but also for many other careers, outside as well as inside the Church."<sup>98</sup> The musical skills the choristers were expected to attain seem to have been introduced by progressive levels of difficulty, beginning with plainsong

---

<sup>95</sup> Roger Bowers, "To chorus from quartet: the performing resource for English Church polyphony, c. 1390-1559," in *English Choral Practice, 1400-1650*, ed. John Morehen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 1.

<sup>96</sup> *Ibid.*, 31.

<sup>97</sup> Jane Flynn, "The Education of Choristers in England During the Sixteenth Century", in *English Choral Practice, 1400-1650*, ed. John Morehen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 180.

<sup>98</sup> *Ibid.*

and then moving on to *pricksong* (mensural music), *figuration* (rhythmic music), and *discant* (counterpoint).<sup>99</sup> The training and expertise demanded of the adult singers of the time required that they be trained, salaried professionals, and for that purpose many such choirs were richly endowed by wealthy patrons or by the monarchy. As the tradition matured, there came to be a growing number of adult singers who had formerly been boy choristers and had attained a lifetime of experience, thus making possible new repertoire of increasing difficulty.<sup>100</sup>

Beginning in 1535, Henry VIII began a gradual, systematic suppression of the monasteries, thereby enriching the royal treasuries with centuries of accumulated monastic wealth, and causing the secularization (i.e., transfer to parish ministry), retirement or even in some cases execution of the monks.<sup>101</sup> The great majority of choral music in England during the first half of the 16<sup>th</sup> century was performed in the monasteries, and there is no question that the suppression of the monasteries under Henry VIII dealt a crushing blow to many church musicians of the day. “Assuming, at a conservative estimate, that out of a total of some six hundred monastic establishments suppressed, considerably more than two hundred were equipped with [a full complement of professional musicians], it will be recognized that a very large number of singing-men, and a corresponding number of trained musicians as their choirmasters, must have been thrown out of employment.”<sup>102</sup>

---

<sup>99</sup> *Ibid.*, 182

<sup>100</sup> Bowers, 33.

<sup>101</sup> Moorman, 173ff.

<sup>102</sup> Fellowes, 7.

However, Henry's suppression of the monasteries did not cause the death of the English choral tradition, but merely effected its transfer to a new arena that fit the ideals of the Reformation more closely. Some of the suppressed monasteries were reconstituted by Henry VIII as cathedral churches, and these came to be known as 'new foundation' cathedrals. These included Canterbury, Winchester, Durham, Oxford, Chester, Gloucester, Worcester, Rochester, Norwich, Ely, Peterborough and Carlisle.<sup>103</sup> Westminster Abbey was suppressed and then reconstituted as a Royal Peculiar. The musical forces of the new foundation churches continued to perform during and after the Reformation, as did many of the remaining 'old foundation' (i.e., dating from before Henry VIII) churches, and collegiate chapels. Some of those musicians who had been thrown out of work by the closing of the monasteries were fortunate to find positions in new foundation churches. One famous musician who found himself searching for a job was Thomas Tallis. He had been employed at Waltham Abbey when it was suppressed, but he then found employment at Canterbury Cathedral and later at the Chapel Royal.<sup>104</sup>

The choral foundations that endured through the Reformation played a central role in the creation and development of music for the new English liturgy. As it has been noted previously, the protective quiet and stability of the established English cathedrals and their choir schools began to foster several uniquely Anglican musical idioms, including the Anthem, the Service (a setting of canticles and service music) and the Anglican method of chanting the Psalms (Anglican Chant). The perpetuation

---

<sup>103</sup> Ibid, 6.

<sup>104</sup> Ibid., 7.

of professional choral music in the cathedrals, royal peculiars and collegiate chapels, came to be the nucleus of a healthy tradition ensuring that the choir of men and boys would continue to be a part of the living heritage of the Church of England.<sup>105</sup>

During an unhappy chapter of English history, the Puritan iconoclast Oliver Cromwell was granted control of England (from 1649-1658), and subsequently embarked on a program of dismantling the monarchy and converting the Church of England over to the presbyterian model. “In January 1643 Parliament passed a bill ‘for the utter abolishing and taking away all archbishops, bishops...deans and chapters...and all vicars choral and choristers, old vicars and new vicars of any cathedral or collegiate church...out of the Church of England’.”<sup>106</sup> The choral services in cathedrals were stopped altogether, and with frantic zeal the puritans demolished many organs, destroyed entire libraries of choral music containing irreplaceable part-books, disbanding the choirs.<sup>107</sup>

The Cromwellian hiatus in the choral tradition of the English church could have been the end of the choir of men and boys, because it is a rather fragile tradition that requires continuous cultivation. The nine years of Cromwell were a very long time in the life of English choirs, during which no new boys were recruited, the choir men did not sing, the organists did not perform, and many were forced to take up other occupations in order to survive.<sup>108</sup>

---

<sup>105</sup> Temperley, “Anglicanism and Episcopalianism”, 659.

<sup>106</sup> Ian Spinks, *Restoration Cathedral Music* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995), 3.

<sup>107</sup> Long, 206.

<sup>108</sup> Long, 207.

The choral tradition was renewed and consolidated in the restoration of the monarchy under Charles II in 1660. A new revision of the Book of Common Prayer was adopted, and church music returned to familiar patterns. For the first time, a rubric was added to the Daily Office of the prayer book, which specifically called for the singing of an Anthem 'In Quires and Places where they sing'.<sup>109</sup> King Charles II reestablished the Chapel Royal, and some choirboys from the newly reconstituted Chapel choir would grow up to become the great composers of the 'Restoration School' of English Church Music.<sup>110</sup> John Blow (1649-1708), Henry Purcell (1659-1695), Jeremiah Clarke (c. 1673-1707) and others of the Restoration school contributed a new wealth of choral services to the repertoire, and the English Anthem especially would mature and flower during this era.<sup>111</sup>

The 18<sup>th</sup> and early 19<sup>th</sup> centuries have been generally regarded as a low point in the life of the English Church, during which spiritual fervor was lacking, many abuses of the wealth and privilege of the Church occurred, and the monarchs were not much interested in the welfare of the Church.<sup>112</sup> The quality both of composition and performance was allowed to degenerate to a very low degree and there was virtually no music composed for *a capella* choir during this time.<sup>113</sup> Conditions at the choir schools began to sink to an appalling level, the boys being poorly educated and even ill-treated in some cases. Although English choirs were richly endowed, the best positions were often awarded to those with good connections rather than skill as

---

<sup>109</sup> Spinks, 4.

<sup>110</sup> Long, 211.

<sup>111</sup> Spinks, 20.

<sup>112</sup> Long, 317.

<sup>113</sup> Fellowes, 9.

musicians. Some choirs were reduced in number to a level where they could not adequately perform the liturgy.<sup>114</sup>

However, some positive aspects can be found in this era, particularly the long period of stability during which there were no major disruptions to the church or to the liturgy. The revision of the Prayerbook that had been adopted by parliament in 1662 would be the final revision for the Church of England.<sup>115</sup> Composers from the continent would arrive in England and make a name for themselves for their contributions to the choral repertoire. G.F. Handel's *Messiah*, the libretto of which employs the text of the 1611 AKJV Bible to great effect, was premiered in 1741 by members of the combined choirs of the Anglican cathedrals of Dublin: St. Patrick's and Christ Church.<sup>116</sup> Also of note among the many great works of Mr. Handel, are his verse anthems written for the coronation of King George II.<sup>117</sup> The lack of large numbers of highly skilled choral forces during this time is perhaps one factor that led to a proliferation of Anthems for small groups of soloists with instruments.

By the early 19<sup>th</sup> century, European societies under the sway of Romanticism began to experience a renewed interest in the music of the past. This included a revival of Gregorian chant and the 16<sup>th</sup> century *a cappella* style of polyphony in the church.<sup>118</sup> The Cecilian movement revived liturgical music in the Roman communion, and this trend eventually appeared in the Protestant and Anglican

---

<sup>114</sup> Long, 321.

<sup>115</sup> Ibid., 211.

<sup>116</sup> Bara Boydell, *A History of Music at Christ Church Cathedral, Dublin*, (Rochester, NY: The Boydell Press, 2004), 121.

<sup>117</sup> Grout and Palisca, 431.

<sup>118</sup> Ibid, 621.

Churches as well.<sup>119</sup> A renewed interest in the great choral traditions of the Church of England largely came about through the influence of the Oxford Movement (c.1833-1854). The Tractarians (as members of the Oxford Movement were also called) had a high view of the Church as a divinely ordered institution, and believed its sacraments contained the means for diffusing the grace of God to the surrounding culture, helping to alleviate the miseries of early industrial society. They sought to restore the dignity of the Eucharist, and they often encouraged the use of music, vestments and ceremonial in the services of the Church in order to reinforce that sense of dignity. More will be written about the Oxford Movement in the next section on music in the Parish Churches.

#### *Music in the Parish Churches*

While much has been said and written about the cathedral choral tradition, it must be remembered that the English cathedrals represent a very small fraction of the total number of churches in England. The influence of the cathedrals has waned in modern public life and they no longer exist to fill their pre-Reformation role as educational centers. They tend to operate in isolation from societal changes, secure in their massive endowments and sustained by the weight of lengthy traditions. This tranquility has certainly ensured the perpetuation of the cathedral choral tradition, but the same could not be said about the more volatile realities of musical life in the average English parish church.<sup>120</sup>

---

<sup>119</sup> Ibid.

<sup>120</sup> Nicholas Temperley, *Music in the English Parish Church*, Vol. 1 (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 1.



First of all, the choir in the parish church might be said to serve a different function, i.e. to lead the singing of the congregation, rather than to give a performance of the liturgy as a choir does in the cathedral tradition.<sup>121</sup> Like the cathedrals, the parish churches benefited from the pre-Reformation surge in choral music. The years prior to the Reformation saw an increase in the number of parish churches which “were endowed with organs and chantries by devout and wealthy parishioners.”<sup>122</sup> In many places choral polyphony was sung by professional chantry priests, and as early as 1500 some of the wealthier churches began to acquire a large staff of full-time musicians, called ‘clerks’. The clerks were formed into adult male choirs, and in some churches there were also choirboys available for services in honor of the Virgin Mary.<sup>123</sup>

Shortly after Edward VI came to the throne in 1548, a reform was enacted by parliament which suppressed the chantry system. Similar to the suppression of the monasteries under King Henry VIII, the suppression of chantries ended the careers of many parochial church choirmasters, clerks and organists.<sup>124</sup> Some wealthy parishes were able to carry on providing for a small choir of trained musicians, but most were reduced to a state that made choral polyphony impossible. All that remained in many cases was a parish priest to chant the liturgy and a single parish clerk to lead the

---

<sup>121</sup> Long, 30.

<sup>122</sup> Temperley, 7.

<sup>123</sup> Ibid., 8.

<sup>124</sup> Ibid., 13.

responses of the congregation with the assistance of whatever volunteer singers could be assembled.<sup>125</sup>

When the 1549 Book of Common Prayer was mandated for use by Edward VI's Act of Uniformity, those cathedrals with endowed choirs were able to call upon existing choral settings of the mass in the English language, and begin to develop a new body of choral works. For the average parish, however, which by this time usually lacked a choir, the best hope for a sung liturgy came in the form of a plainsong setting written expressly for congregational use by John Merbecke (c. 1510-1585). Mr. Merbecke, organist at St. George's Chapel, Windsor Castle, created his *Booke of common praier noted*<sup>126</sup> at the request of Archbishop of Canterbury for use with the 1549 Book of Common Prayer. The word "noted" that occurs in the title is true of the book in one sense, because literally one musical note is affixed to each syllable of the text. His musical settings consisted partly of adapted plainsong and partly of original melody in a similar style,<sup>127</sup> but in the spirit of the reformation, he rejected the more florid style of medieval chant writing in favor of the simple musical formula of one-note-per-syllable.

In the best cases, the simple plainsong setting of the liturgy came to be standard musical fair in the parish churches, and in the worst cases the service

---

<sup>125</sup> Ibid.

<sup>126</sup> Long, 30.

<sup>127</sup> Temperley, 15.

degenerated into “weekly recitations of Morning and Evening Prayer shared between parson and clerk, expansive sermonizing, and noisy psalmody”.<sup>128</sup>

Although the spoken dialogue between the priest and parish clerk, with little congregational participation became the rule in much of England, congregations did not lack other outlets for musical expression. The Reformation had introduced the popular practice of hymn singing and the use of metrical psalms in parish congregations.<sup>129</sup> Despite the slump in liturgical life of English Cathedrals that occurred throughout the 18<sup>th</sup> century, the parish churches experienced what has been called a “golden age of English Hymnody”.<sup>130</sup> “Inspired by Isaac Watts and immensely popularized by the Wesleys, hymn-singing was found to satisfy a human need long unfulfilled.”<sup>131</sup> Over time however, the practice of having a liturgy sung by professionals, whether as a performers or as leaders of worship, became increasingly rare in parish churches. Even the parish clerk, sole survivor of the musical staff of earlier times, was hardly expected to sing any more. A revival of the once great choral tradition, the seeds of which yet remained in the cathedrals and some collegiate chapels, would not come until many years later, under the influence of the Oxford movement.

---

<sup>128</sup> Bernarr Rainbow, *The Choral Revival in the Anglican Church* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1970), 14.

<sup>129</sup> Temperley, 19ff.

<sup>130</sup> Long, 287.

<sup>131</sup> *Ibid.*, 287.

### *The Oxford Movement and the Anglican Choral Revival*

“The surpliced choir of men and boys occupying facing stalls on either side of the chancel is accepted today as a distinctive traditional feature of Anglican parochial worship. Yet as recently as the beginning of the nineteenth century such an institution was unknown in England outside the cathedrals and a handful of college chapels.”<sup>132</sup>

Bernarr Rainbow’s striking assessment of the choirs in England at the turn of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, describes a situation that resulted from the long period of decline and stagnation during the 18<sup>th</sup> and early 19<sup>th</sup> centuries. The revival, when it came, was part of a larger renewal of awareness within the church of the greatness of its traditions and of its role in society. A group of Oxford scholars began to write powerfully about the unique place occupied by the Church of England as a *Via media* (middle way) between what they regarded as the superstitions of Rome and the errors of radical Protestantism.<sup>133</sup> These men came to embody what was eventually called the “Oxford Movement”. They were also referred to as “Tractarians” because they published a series of ‘tracts’ containing their ideas on church reform.

A renewed sense of self-confidence in the church inspired the revival of traditions which had fallen into disuse, including the daily reading of the Offices of Morning and Evening Prayer and weekly celebration of Holy Communion. “The Tractarians rediscovered the church as a God-made institution with the communion as its Christ-given service. Slowly the church was to begin to take itself seriously, to use its missionary powers not only abroad but at home. Parish churches everywhere

---

<sup>132</sup> Rainbow, 3.

<sup>133</sup> Ibid., 6.

formed surpliced choirs, cluttered their chancels with choir-stalls and organs and set about aping the cathedral service”.<sup>134</sup> The renewed interest in vestments, ritual and music did not merely stem from a desire to return to a romanticized ideal of medievalism, but was part of an honest effort to inspire greater piety in congregations which had become lax in their performance of the liturgy.<sup>135</sup> Renewed interest in music stimulated “congregational chanting of the psalms and responses—sections of the service which had hitherto been read”.<sup>136</sup>

Ritual and music were not the only things on the minds of the Tractarians: they were also concerned with outreach to the poor families who lived in the poverty and squalor of early industrialized England.<sup>137</sup> The revival of the choral tradition coincided with the ideals of the church at this time because it provided an opportunity to reach out to the boys of poor families, offering them musical training and a vocation in the church.<sup>138</sup>

At this point the focus of this document must necessarily shift to the scene in the American Church, for the development of the choral tradition there is directly related to the influence of the Oxford Movement.<sup>139</sup> Suffice it to say, however, that the revival precipitated by the Tractarians helped create a culture in the English church that would give rise to a new golden age for sacred choral music. The tradition of the choir of men and boys continued to be consolidated and perfected

---

<sup>134</sup> C. Henry Phillips, *The Singing Church* (London: Faber and Faber, 1968), 162.

<sup>135</sup> Geoffrey Rowell, *The Vision Glorious* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 128.

<sup>136</sup> Rainbow, 5.

<sup>137</sup> Rowell, Geoffrey, 139.

<sup>138</sup> Rainbow, 18, 19.

<sup>139</sup> Ellinwood, 76.

from around 1850-1950, reaching a height in England unparalleled since the Tudor period.<sup>140</sup> During this time, one could take note of a veritable constellation of impressive English composers born and bred with the tradition: John Ireland, Charles Wood, Edgar Bainton, William Harris, Edward Naylor, Charles V. Stanford, Edward Elgar, Herbert Howells, Gustav Holst, R. Vaughan Williams, Edward Bairstow, Benjamin Britten, Kenneth Leighton and William Walton, to name a few. These men continued to write for the choir, adding a large and diverse body of 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> century repertoire to the canon.

*The Choir School and Choir of men and boys in the American Church*

The American Church in its infancy was blessed to merely achieve some sort of coherence and to adopt an official liturgy after enduring the deprivations of colonial life and the disruptions of the American Revolution. A luxury item (relatively speaking) such as a choir school, or a surpliced choir of men and boys would have been the furthest thing from the minds of most American churchmen of the time. The well-endowed choral foundations that exist in England to provide for the maintenance of choirs and choir schools were unknown of in largely frontier America.

Taking this into consideration, and adding to it the general lack of musical education in America, the low level of 18<sup>th</sup> century churchmanship, and the now well-established practice in parishes of singing a small body of familiar metrical psalms

---

<sup>140</sup> Long, 385.

and popular hymns, all together reduced the likelihood of there being widespread performances of quality choral music in parishes.<sup>141</sup>

“In at least two Episcopal churches, however, boy choirs were established during the course of the eighteenth century for the purpose of singing the metrical Psalms and the chants of Morning Prayer.”<sup>142</sup> From 1739, Trinity Church, New York began to train boys from its “charity school” to sing the Psalms. The foundation of a municipal orphanage in Charleston, South Carolina led the rector of St. Michael’s, Charleston to form a choir along the lines of the English cathedral tradition from this ready source of boys.<sup>143</sup> In some parish churches, the customary execution of services as a dialogue between priest and clerk continued on as a holdover from the old country, while other parishes began to use choirs of adult men and women led by the clerk.<sup>144</sup> The most popular approach to choral performance in the early nineteenth century was known as the “quartet choir” in which a volunteer chorus was built around four strong solo voices, although some parishes opted to keep the quartet and dispense with the chorus.<sup>145</sup>

The Oxford Movement, while principally a theological movement in the Church of England, began to have a profound impact on early nineteenth century American clergy and theologians as well. Like their English counterparts, American Episcopal Churches began to hold more frequent celebrations of Holy Communion

---

<sup>141</sup> Ellinwood, 18, 19.

<sup>142</sup> Ibid., 42.

<sup>143</sup> Ibid., 42, 43.

<sup>144</sup> Ibid., 72.

<sup>145</sup> Robert Stevenson, *Protestant Church Music in America* (New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 1966), 112.

and the Daily Office. The liturgical revival that accompanied this movement led to a renewed interest in choral services, boy choirs and vestments.<sup>146</sup> William Augustus Muhlenberg (1797-1877), one of the early clergymen to be identified with the movement, introduced daily (rather than weekly) offices, weekly (rather than quarterly) celebrations of the Eucharist, and instituted the first permanent vested boy choir in New York City at his Church of the Holy Communion.<sup>147</sup> In 1855 Edward Hodges installed a choir of men and boys at the Church of the Advent, Boston.<sup>148</sup> Once it had begun, the renewed interest in the tradition quickly gained impetus among other urban parishes in the northeast. By October, 1861 a choir festival hosted by Trinity Church, New York, featured five choirs of men and boys from various New England parishes. The festival program consisted of Anglican chant, music by Handel and an anthem written by Henry Cutler, the hosting organist.<sup>149</sup>

The liturgical renewal movement spread to parishes in the Midwest and beyond, reaching its peak some time in the last decade of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Most cities of any size had several boy choirs by that time, while New York and Brooklyn together had no less than twenty by 1895.<sup>150</sup> Most boy choirs from the beginning of the movement had been neighborhood choirs that rehearsed at the parish church. In the absence of “special schools or scholarships in other private schools available for

---

<sup>146</sup> Ellinwood, 76.

<sup>147</sup> Moorman, 150.

<sup>148</sup> Ellinwood, 77.

<sup>149</sup> Ibid.

<sup>150</sup> Ibid., 78.



boys, the usual practice [was] to pay them a small weekly fee as a reward for regular attendance, and to send them to summer camp for several weeks every year”<sup>151</sup>

The next step toward the development of full-fledged choir schools would be the parochial school from which a choir could be drawn to sing the services of the church. The Boys’ School of St. Paul’s Baltimore was founded in 1849 as a day school, and in 1870 the rector of the parish instituted a boy choir, providing scholarships for twenty choristers.<sup>152</sup>

Given the strong interest in boy choirs among Anglicans in America at the height of the liturgical reform movement, it was only a matter of time before an attempt was made to found a full-fledged choir school on the English model. The first special choir school where the boys would receive their schooling with daily rehearsals and church services integrated into their schedules was attempted by Canon Knowles (c.1870) at the Cathedral of SS. Peter and Paul in Chicago. The attempt failed prematurely due to a tragic fire that destroyed the cathedral the following year, and his dream never came to fruition.<sup>153</sup>

Others would eventually succeed where Canon Knowles had failed. At Grace Church, New York, a “choir and school were started by the Reverend William R. Huntington and his organist, James M. Hilfenstein, in 1894. They moved into their own school building in 1899, with provision for sixteen boarders.”<sup>154</sup> This

---

<sup>151</sup> Ibid., 80.

<sup>152</sup> Ibid., 79.

<sup>153</sup> Ibid.

<sup>154</sup> Ibid., 80.

arrangement continued until 1934, when the school was reorganized as a 12-grade parish day school, at which the choir boys continued to receive their education.<sup>155</sup>

Other choir schools established in the same era were the schools at the Cathedral of St. John the Divine, New York (founded in 1901), St. Peter's, Philadelphia (1905), the Washington National Cathedral (1909), and St. Thomas Church, New York (1919). Of these four, only the choir school of St. Thomas Church continues to function as a traditional choir school today. The school at Cathedral of St. John the Divine has been converted to a co-educational day school with children's choir; St. Peter's School had to close due to financial difficulties, and the St. Alban School for Boys of Washington National Cathedral has shifted its focus to become primarily a boys' college-preparatory academy, although a choir of boys singing for cathedral services continues to receive significant scholarships to attend the school.<sup>156</sup> At Grace Cathedral, San Francisco, a day school for boys was founded in 1957 with the intention that choristers recruited from its ranks would sing in the Cathedral Choir.<sup>157</sup>

Continued expansion of the choir of men and boys proved to be unsustainable in 20<sup>th</sup> century America. The choral revival generated by the fervor of the Oxford Movement had led to the existence of well over a hundred such choirs by the 1890's, but without time-honored and financially secure institutions such as the English

---

<sup>155</sup> Ibid.

<sup>156</sup> Paul Criswell, *The Episcopal Choir School and choir of men and boys in the United States* (Doctor of Philosophy diss., University of Maryland), 75.

<sup>157</sup> Criswell, 84.

choral foundations, the revival began to lose its steam as early as the 1920's.<sup>158</sup> The decline was well-pronounced by 1953, when Canon Leonard Ellinwood, a member of the chapter of Washington National Cathedral, noticed that changing demographics, economic strains and "the increased competition of the public schools for the leisure time of their pupils, through the many school-sponsored musical activities" were causing a decrease in the number of parishes with vested boy choirs.<sup>159</sup> Attempts at the establishment of new choir schools among Anglicans in America came to a halt, and the only church-related choir school established in America during the latter half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century has been at the Roman Cathedral of the Madeleine, in Salt Lake City, Utah.<sup>160</sup>

Some encouraging developments of lasting importance to the tradition did take place in the period between World War I and the 1950's. The revision of the Book of Common Prayer that was undertaken in 1928 is generally recognized as the classic Anglican liturgy for use in the American church. The growing popularity of liturgical music led to the publication in 1927 of *The Choral Service*, followed in 1936 by *The American Psalter* and *The Plainsong Psalter*, thus providing both Anglican chant and Plainsong settings for American choirs and congregations.<sup>161</sup> *The Choral Service* was eventually adopted and published in *The Hymnal, 1940*, a hymnal which contains numerous plainsong and Anglican chant settings of services.<sup>162</sup> *The*

---

<sup>158</sup> Ellinwood, 81.

<sup>159</sup> Ibid.

<sup>160</sup> James Frazier, "A New Choir School at the Roman Catholic Cathedral of the Madeleine in Salt Lake City", *The American Organist*, Vol. 33, No. 3 (1999), 56-58.

<sup>161</sup> Ellinwood, 82.

<sup>162</sup> *The Hymnal, 1940*, 699.

*Hymnal, 1940* supports the choral tradition in a number of ways, including an index of “Hymns Suitable Also for Use as Anthems”, inclusion of *The Choral Service* and eight sung settings of Holy Communion. Some hymns and service settings apparently presuppose a choir of men and boys, containing rubrics which indicate that some verses or parts should be sung by the ‘Boys’, some by the ‘Men’ and some by the ‘Full Choir’.<sup>163</sup>

Official sanction of the choir of men and boys through the publication of liturgical resources alone could not halt the gradual disappearance of the tradition, however. The decline has accelerated since the 1950’s due in large part to iconoclastic social and liturgical trends in the church. Single-sex institutions began to be regarded unfavorably, and in some cases the choir of men and boys was sacrificed in a gesture of the way the church of the 1970’s was willing to change in order to appear accommodating of feminism.<sup>164</sup> Fundamental changes in liturgical language and practice already described in this document caused the choir of men and boys to seem obsolete and anachronistic. Prayerbook and Hymnal revision turned the focus of the liturgy toward the laity, and away from the clergy and choir. The revised prayer book of 1979 “recognized the ‘ministry of lay persons’, encouraging a breakdown of barriers between rehearsed choirs and congregations”.<sup>165</sup> If the *Hymnal 1940* had favored the Anglican Choral tradition, the pendulum swung in the opposite direction with the *Hymnal 1982* of the ECUSA, in which the emphasis “was firmly on

---

<sup>163</sup> For example, #'s 97, 102, 712, 719, 723, 724 in *The Hymnal, 1940*.

<sup>164</sup> Brian Taylor, 6.

<sup>165</sup> Temperley, “Anglicanism and Episcopalianism”, 669.

congregational singing” and moderate advances were made in the direction of multicultural and popular music.<sup>166</sup>

A further change in the church had to do with the way children were viewed in parish life. Since medieval times, the choir of men and boys had been regarded as a means of raising the level of the boys’ knowledge and skills through participation with adults in the liturgy. This longstanding tradition was dismissed by seventies-era iconoclasts, and replaced by efforts to reach children at levels deemed appropriate to them. Brian Taylor, organist and choirmaster of St. John’s Church, Savannah sums up this sea-change as follows. “The philosophical change in religious and artistic instruction and nurture called for having children participate in things that they could understand. Singing sacred classical music that used words and music beyond the immediate comprehension of the student was considered inappropriate. This philosophy claimed that the child had to understand the liturgy and the music in which he participated. The philosophy that guides a traditional men and boy choir is that the child begins by participating and then allows understanding to grow and flower.”<sup>167</sup>

By 1989, Paul Criswell would note in his University of Maryland doctoral dissertation that the American choir of men and boys had mostly shrunk to three areas of the country where communities could still be found that had the will and the financial ability to support it: New York, Washington D.C. and San Francisco.<sup>168</sup> He

---

<sup>166</sup> Ibid.

<sup>167</sup> Taylor, 7.

<sup>168</sup> Criswell, 145.

did consider however, that a resurgence of interest in the tradition was evident, pointing out that some cathedrals and parishes were making attempts to revive their choirs of men and boys.<sup>169</sup> Some choirmasters by this time were optimistic that the decline of the men and boy choral tradition had stabilized, and that the new development of vested girl choirs was a hopeful sign for a renewal of the choral tradition.<sup>170</sup>

In the course of my research for this document, I visited some of the same places written about in Mr. Criswell's 1989 dissertation, namely St. Thomas' Church, 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, New York, the Cathedral of Sts. Peter and Paul, Washington, D.C., and Grace Cathedral, San Francisco. Since then, the cast of characters has changed as new bishops, deans, rectors, choirmasters and organists have entered the scene, but the choral programs remain in place, signaling a new sense of stability in the tradition.

In other places, the choral tradition has been revived after a long hiatus. In the case of St. Paul's parish, K Street, Washington, D.C., the choir of men and boys founded in 1869 was the first of its kind in the District of Columbia. It continued in operation until the early 1970's, when it was terminated. In 1994 the parish reestablished its choir of men and boys under the direction of organist/choirmaster Jeffrey Smith and at the same time invested a new Girls Choir.<sup>171</sup>

---

<sup>169</sup> Ibid., 147.

<sup>170</sup> Ibid., 148.

<sup>171</sup> Jeffrey Smith, director, "Show Yourselves Joyful, Music from St. Paul's Parish K Street, Washington, D.C., compact disc notes, Pro Organo CD 7068, © 1997.

It would be worth mentioning an organization that has become very influential in American church music in recent years, and which actively fosters the tradition of the vested choir. The Royal School of Church Music was founded in England in 1927 for “the maintenance and enhancement of the choral tradition.”<sup>172</sup> Today it has more than 11,000 members world-wide (including an American chapter of over 700 affiliated parishes) and provides various valuable resources that would be especially helpful to after-school and parochial school programs.<sup>173</sup> The RSCM’s *Voice for Life* training scheme provides structure, curriculum and supporting materials for the training of choristers. Topics covered in this modular scheme include music theory and notation, healthy vocal technique, music history and analysis, responsibilities of the choir member and the context of the choir.<sup>174</sup> A choirmaster who is pressed for time and is not able to create his own training scheme will benefit from this program. The RSCM also sponsors summer choir training courses around the country by region, publishes a newsletter, Members’ Handbook and a listing of affiliated American parishes.<sup>175</sup>

### *Conclusions*

During the first part of this document, I have attempted to provide the reader with the sense of a unique church tradition, (historic, hierarchical and liturgical) which has fostered the choir of men and boys in a way that no other tradition has.

---

<sup>172</sup> Temperley, “Anglicanism”, 667.

<sup>173</sup> The Royal School of Church Music in America, “Welcome to the RSCM America”, <http://www.rscmamerica.org/>

<sup>174</sup> The Royal School of Church Music, brochure, “Voice for Life: a structured guide to choral training”

<sup>175</sup> <http://www.rscmamerica.org/>

This seems to have been made possible for more reasons than simply because the English cathedral choirs were well-endowed. It has been shown, for example, that the vested choir of men and boys performs a central function in the life of the Anglican worshipping community, bringing boys into the leadership of the church through participation, instilling in them a sense of the sacred and of good taste through a majestic liturgy. It is now time to begin turning our focus from broad themes to specific, from history to the present, from books about the choral tradition to the actual choirs of today. In the next section I hope to provide the reader with a ‘snapshot’ of the tradition as it is in the year 2004-2005 A.D. Along the way, I will develop and comment on the themes of structure, liturgy and choir that I have hitherto introduced.



## Part II: Chorister Training in the American Church Today

The After-school Program: *Grace Church, Newark; St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego; St. Paul's, K Street, D.C.; St. Stephen's, Timonium, MD.*

### *Introduction*

The concept of an after-school program is a new way of looking at an old tradition, a way which takes into account the advent of universal public education. Today the assumption is made that boys will spend the main part of their day in school, whether public, private or parochial, and that they might be interested in an enriching after-school activity such as soccer or choir. The level of interest depends in large part on the extra-curricular resources (or lack thereof) in their particular school systems.

The after-school program of today resembles most closely the first programs for vested boy choirs which were undertaken on a part-time basis by the priest or organist/choirmaster of a parish, such as the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century neighborhood choirs of New York and New England. These choirs operated on the basis of a few afternoon rehearsals during the week or on Saturday at the parish church, which together with a summer choir camp were considered sufficient to train a group of choir boys who were not connected with a particular school.<sup>176</sup> This long-standing chorister-training model has a great deal of flexibility and is relatively inexpensive to operate compared to other models. Although it is not a perfect system for creating a quality boy choir, it is probably the most realistic model for most parishes that want to start a new program today.

---

<sup>176</sup> Ellinwood, 80, 81.

However, the advantages of the after-school program such as flexibility and cost-effectiveness are partly outweighed by a set of unique problems in the areas of recruitment, discipline and musical quality. Without the existence of a choir school or at least a parochial school from which to draw choristers, the after-school program has to work much harder at recruiting new boys. Recruiting from the public schools is discouraged or prohibited out of deference to the separation of church and state, while parochial and private schools are very likely to have their own choir programs, and therefore tend to look upon outside recruitment with disfavor.

While a choir school may take in a new class of boys that are the same age, an after-school program often takes in new boys of all ages and levels of maturity in an effort to keep its numbers at a good level. The difference in age and the resulting disparity of learning abilities can exacerbate behavior problems. There is also the logistical problem of getting the boys from one place to another, a problem that doesn't exist in a traditional choir school at which all of the boys are resident. The fact that most boys will have to travel to the rehearsal at the end of their day when school is over, relying on parents or other adults to get them to the church, drastically reduces the likelihood that there will be regular rehearsals that every boy can attend simultaneously. Lack of sufficient rehearsal time can lead to poor quality in an after-school choir's performance.

Another problem linked to lack of adequate rehearsal time is that most choirmasters in after-school programs that I observed do not have time to undertake systematic music theory or vocal instruction. The unfortunate result is that the choirs

tend more toward rote-learning rather than true music literacy. However, it must be noted that some after-school programs have developed a variety of effective solutions for facing the various problems mentioned above.

### *Grace Church, Newark, NJ*

Grace Church was founded in the 1837 as the “standard-bearer for Anglo-Catholicism” amidst the fervor of the catholic revival stimulated by the Oxford Movement.<sup>177</sup> It is no surprise that a choir of men and boys would be founded in the parish a decade or so later, and it remains today one of the oldest such choirs in the country. The 1848 church building, located in downtown Newark, was designed by Richard Upjohn and is a Registered National Landmark. The 19<sup>th</sup> century English Tractarians would probably approve of the fact that Grace Church presently ministers to an urban, mostly poor population living in public housing and whose children are at risk from a number of social ills.<sup>178</sup>

The socio-cultural dynamics of a place like Grace Church, Newark are fascinating, and would most likely hold the interest of a sociologist for a long time. The choir is 100% poor, urban, African-American boys, some wearing “do-rags” on their heads and carrying on in tough-guy street-talk. This group comes together at a 19<sup>th</sup> century gothic-revival church building, where they don cassocks and surplices and sing the best of music by Henry Purcell, Thomas Morely and Robert Parsons... a truly American story that is better than fiction.

---

<sup>177</sup> Grace Church, Newark, “Introduction to Grace Church”, <http://www.gracechurchinnewark.org/>

<sup>178</sup> Grace Church, Newark, “Outreach Ministries of Grace Church in Newark”, <http://www.gracechurchinnewark.org/outreach.htm>

Recruiting boys for Grace Choir takes place mostly by word of mouth and by the reputation of the choir. Being situated in a densely populated area helps to keep the number of boys relatively high, but choirmaster James McGregor still faces the usual recruiting problems endemic to an after-school church choir program, and constantly remains on the lookout for new potential. The choir boys make their own way to the church via public transportation after spending the first part of their day in the public school system. Their schedule at the church includes rehearsal time with the choirmaster, as well as supervised homework time with a meal. The choirmaster dispenses bus fare money to the boys at the end of rehearsal so they will be able to get home.<sup>179</sup>

Weekly Schedule for Choir at Grace Church						
S	M	T	W	Th	F	S
Breakfast 8:00am Rehearsal 8:30am Mass 10:00am	Homework Club 3-5:00pm (Food is Served)	Choir Rehearsal 3-5:00pm	Homework Club 3-5:00pm (Food is Served)	Choir Rehearsal 3-5:00pm	Choir Rehearsal 3-5:00pm	Choir Rehearsal 11- 12:15pm

The difficulty recruiting, motivating, training and retaining the boys of an after-school program is such a task that the organist/choirmaster is often loathe to relinquish his well-trained young singers after their voices change. This is evident in the Grace Choir where six of the seventeen boys who sing soprano have gone through

---

<sup>179</sup> James McGregor (Organist and Choirmaster, Grace Church, Newark), in interview with the author. December 2004.

their voice change and now actually sing in falsetto. Mr. McGregor often transposes pieces down to a lower key in order to accommodate his young countertenors singing the soprano line.<sup>180</sup>

Choral pedagogy at Grace Church has followed a remarkably similar pattern since the 1890's. This includes regular attendance at rehearsal, rewarded by a small weekly fee, and a summer choir camp for several weeks every year.<sup>181</sup> In recent years, rather than take the boys away to summer camp, Mr. McGregor has offered a day camp at the church instead. As with the majority of choirmasters in this kind of program, he only has time to address musicianship and vocal skills in the context of learning new repertoire, rather than in a systematic fashion. McGregor constantly works to reinforce good rhythm, pitch accuracy, music reading skills and an understanding of musical symbols throughout the rehearsal. From year to year the body of choral repertoire follows a repeating pattern to some degree, with occasional variation and introduction of new repertoire. Repetition of repertoire from one year to the next is one way of keeping the level of performance higher, since the older boys are already somewhat familiar with the music and they can help lead the younger boys in learning.<sup>182</sup>

For this group of boys, maintaining discipline during rehearsal is a constant struggle. The choirmaster has to continuously exhort, cajole, encourage and rebuke the boys in order to keep them focused. This challenge would almost certainly reduce

---

<sup>180</sup> Ibid.

<sup>181</sup> Ellinwood, 80, 81.

<sup>182</sup> McGregor, interview.

a lesser man to tears, but Mr. McGregor has a truly courageous and compassionate heart. He is philosophical about the behavior of boys, and even notices a sort of weekly pattern. The boys' ability to focus and rehearse well tends to peak by around Tuesday, and then tends to get progressively worse until Thursday, the lowest point of the cycle.<sup>183</sup>

There are several effective strategies that McGregor employs to help maintain discipline in rehearsal. He holds to the rule that if a boy starts chatting with his neighbor after a piece has been started, everyone has to stop and begin again. He also offers positive reinforcement and financial incentives. A choir boy starts each service or rehearsal with 10 credits, each worth 10 cents. If everything goes well, a boy can earn up to \$1 per service; if behavior is bad, then fines are imposed that can severely cut into one's earnings.<sup>184</sup> I noticed an Infraction Sheet hanging up on a wall of the choir room with a list of the boys' names, and specific infractions, such as "walking around outside", "fighting in church", and "late", each with appropriate fines attached.

The boys sing weekly at the main Sunday morning service. They are encouraged to arrive by 8:00 a.m., and are given money to purchase something for breakfast from a nearby deli. The Sunday morning rehearsal begins at 8:30, giving them an hour and a half to work and get vested for the 10:00 service. Being known as a parish of the "high church" tradition, the Sunday service is almost completely sung by the clergy and choir. The basis of the liturgy being used is the contemporary-

---

<sup>183</sup> Ibid.

<sup>184</sup> Ibid.

language rite from the 1970's, together with the 1982 Hymnal.<sup>185</sup> Mr. McGregor writes many of his own Psalm settings and service music for the choir, thus providing a hopeful illustration of the possibilities for performing contemporary liturgies in a tasteful way with a traditional choir of men and boys.

### *St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego, CA*

St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego is an impressive church situated near downtown San Diego, CA. The choral environment at St. Paul's is quite vibrant, with several choirs sharing the responsibility for the various choral services, of which there are many. The *Cathedral Choristers* is the choir of men and boys; the *St. Cecilia Choir* is a choir of men and girls; the *Cathedral Schola* is a small chamber ensemble that sings a late evening service of Compline, and during the summer months sings the Sunday Evensong service as well; the *Cathedral Choir* is an adult choir which normally sings the main Sunday morning service. Also affiliated with St. Paul's is the *Pacific Academy for Ecclesiastical Music* (PACEM), an adult choral society that studies and performs church choral repertoire, and *Cappella Gloriana*, described as the "ensemble in residence".<sup>186</sup>

The staff of the music program includes one full-time organist/choirmaster, who is given the title *Canon for Music*. Mr. Martin Green presently holds this position, having started out as a boy soprano at St. Paul's and studied as an organ scholar under his predecessor, Mr. Edgar Billups. Presently Canon Green is assisted

---

<sup>185</sup> McGregor, interview.

<sup>186</sup> St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego, Brochure: "Cathedral Music presents...Evensong, Concerts, Recitals, 2004-2005 Season"



by his own organ scholar, Mr. Kevin Kwan, an organ performance student from a nearby college. Three professional singing men, paid by the hour, serve as section leaders for the choir of men and boys, while the rest of the choir men are volunteers. Largely the same group of men sings the lower parts with both the girl choir and the boy choir.<sup>187</sup>

The music program at St. Paul's is not endowed, but the dean and chapter of the cathedral are very supportive of choral music, and are able to fund the choirs out of the general cathedral operating budget. Although wryly noting that the music budget is "never enough", Canon Green is still amazed with the quality of work that can be achieved on a very small budget. One encouraging recent development has been his creation of a funded program for choral scholars. These are young men of High School and College age, who are given a small scholarship as section-leaders-in-training. Having faced a great deal of difficulty in finding competent adult male section leaders in the San Diego area, Green has now resorted to training his own.<sup>188</sup>

Boys join the *Cathedral Choristers* at age seven by audition, and stay until their voices change. In the course of a typical audition, boys are assessed on their ability to match pitches, sing scales and alter vowel colors. Canon Green uses the audition to ascertain the starting point of each boy, but he never rejects anyone from singing in the choir. Normally a new boy spends a minimum of 3 months as a probationer, attending rehearsals and performances but not singing with the choir.

---

<sup>187</sup> Martin Green, (Canon for Music, St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego) in interview with the author, November 2004.

<sup>188</sup> Ibid.

After that time, at the discretion of the choirmaster, a boy may begin performing with the choir. If a new boy has a great deal of difficulty matching pitch, Green spends some extra time with him before each rehearsal, or requires a longer probationary period for him as needed. He is satisfied with small steps, noting that after several months in the choir, one of his new boys was only just beginning to sing at pitch with the other boys on a few phrases.<sup>189</sup>

Unlike the other after-school choirs in this chapter, the boys of St. Paul's Cathedral do not have a weekly performance commitment, but sing only three services a month: two Evensong services and one Holy Communion service. The choir has also appeared in concert performances with other San Diego institutions such as the opera. The choir rehearses one night a week on Tuesdays from 4:30-7:00 p.m. with a 10-minute break in the middle. This is a fifty percent reduction from the two-night-a-week rehearsal routine that was in place until just a few years ago. The change was brought on by the fact that most parents had to drive their children a fairly long distance to the church, and two weekday rehearsals was becoming a significant hardship. After meetings with parents, it was decided that one mandatory night a week would become the norm. This helps keep the number of boys involved in the program somewhat higher than was possible before, and makes possible more time with the whole choir together.<sup>190</sup>

Canon Green leads the choir rehearsals, with organ scholar Kevin Kwan serving as accompanist. As with the choir at Grace Church, Newark, musicianship

---

<sup>189</sup> Ibid.

<sup>190</sup> Ibid.

training and vocal pedagogy take place within the weekly rehearsal and a summertime choir camp only. Once again, some repetition of a select body of choral repertoire is necessary in order to maximize the level of performance in as little rehearsal time as possible. Canon Green occasionally prepares a handout on some music theory topic, but notes that he is forced to devote his already minimal amount of rehearsal time mostly to learning the repertoire. He estimates that most boys achieve around 50% music literacy after two years in the program, which is significant if one factors in the age of the boys, some of whom are still struggling to read text, let alone music.<sup>191</sup>

Weekly Schedule for Boy Choir at St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego						
S	M	T	W	Th	F	S
4:00 pm tutti rehearsal						
5:00 pm Evensong Service (twice monthly)			Boys 4:30- 7:00pm			

At this point, something should be said about the Royal School of Church Music training structure for choirs, since the St. Paul's choir follows the RSCM program quite closely. *Probationers* are the new boys in the choir, and wear a cassock (but not surplice) in services. They attend weekly rehearsals and sit with the more advanced choristers, who are expected to assist them with all aspects of

---

<sup>191</sup> Ibid.

training. Probationers simply observe the first few services, eventually being asked to participate a little at a time. *Novices* are invested by the cathedral dean at a special service, and then don a white surplice over their cassock. They participate fully in the service, taking their places with the choristers. The mature singers, known as the *Choristers*, are expected to be fully proficient and experienced themselves, and help to train the probationers and novices. They are awarded a medal with a blue-ribbon, denoting their rank. The *Prefects* are the most musically advanced choristers, and are usually the most senior members of the choir. They have proved themselves to be good section leaders, and are awarded a special medal with a red ribbon. The *Head Chorister* is the top boy, appointed by the choirmaster to help maintain discipline and assist with organizational duties.<sup>192</sup>

At St. Paul's Cathedral, the boys are compensated for their services with a small stipend, depending on the boy's level and age when he entered the choir. A typical junior boy (probationer-novice) earns \$4 or 5 a month, while more senior boys (choristers & prefects) earn closer to \$7 or \$8 a month. Though obviously not a great deal of money, it does give the boys the satisfaction of performing a professional service while earning some pocket money.<sup>193</sup>

At around twenty boys, this choir is the largest after-school program that I visited. Canon Green, who sees his work with the boys as a ministry, never turns a boy away even in the case of boys with attention-deficit-disorder or other behavioral

---

<sup>192</sup> St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego, "St. Paul's Cathedral Boy and Girl Choristers Handbook, 2004-2005".

<sup>193</sup> Martin Green, interview.

problems. This makes for a very lively, squirming troupe of boys, but they seemed to have a lot of fun being in the choir, and related to their choirmaster and to the music very well. As with the boys at Grace, Newark, the choirmaster must continually plead for order and focus, with more success at some times than at others. Canon Green is philosophical about this, noting that the goal of his program is not just to have perfect performances, but to give all his boys a good chance at learning to how to sing.<sup>194</sup>

*St. Paul's, K Street, D.C.*

St. Paul's, K Street, D.C. is an urban parish situated in the renowned financial district of Washington, D.C. The location of the church near the Foggy Bottom Metro stop, makes the parish accessible for boys traveling on their own by the 'Metro', but most are driven to the church by their parents as they happen to live in Arlington, VA or other D. C. suburbs. The leadership of the music program was in a state of transition when I visited, and the parish was anticipating the arrival of a new Director of Music in time for Advent, 2004. I interviewed Mr. Charles Burks, former Associate Director of Music and current Interim Director of Music, serving in between the departure of Dr. Jeffrey Smith for Grace Cathedral, San Francisco and the arrival of Mr. Mark Dwyer from All Saints Cathedral, Albany, NY.<sup>195</sup>

The vested boy choir of St. Paul's, K Street is part of a longstanding tradition begun in 1866 by organist Edgar Priest, the first such choir in the District of

---

<sup>194</sup> Ibid.

<sup>195</sup> Charles Burks, (Interim Organist and Choirmaster, St. Paul's, K Street), in interview with the author, September 2004.

Columbia. The choir tradition was interrupted in the 1970's, but revived in 1994 by organist/choirmaster Jeffrey Smith, newly arrived from Christ Church Cathedral, Lexington, KY.<sup>196</sup> Around the same time, a girls' choir was formed by Dr. Smith as a roughly parallel performing organization to the boys' choir. The girls sing a weekly Holy Communion service on Sundays at 9:00 a.m., while the boys sing weekly Evensong on Sundays at 6:00 p.m.<sup>197</sup> Both choirs appear in other venues and with other performing organizations as well. The choristers "have performed with the National Symphony Orchestra at the Kennedy Center under the baton of such luminaries as Rafael Fruhbeck de Burgos, Leonard Slatkin and Christopher Hogwood".<sup>198</sup>

Weekly Schedule for Choir at St. Paul's, K Street						
S	M	T	W	Th	F	S
5:00 pm Tutti Rehearsal 6:00 pm Evensong Service	Boys 4:30- 6:30pm		Boys 4:30- 6:30pm		Boys 4:30- 6:30pm	

This choral program is a smooth and well-organized operation, readily apparent from the professionalism of the boys, their good behavior, the scope and

<sup>196</sup> "Show Yourselves Joyful: Music from St. Paul's Parish, K Street, Washington, D.C.", compact disc notes, (1997).

<sup>197</sup> Burkes, interview.

<sup>198</sup> St. Paul's, K Street, Brochure, "Music for Children at St. Paul's Parish".

difficulty of the repertoire undertaken, and the apparent popularity of the Choral Evensong services which are well attended by a devoted congregation. Although the number of boys in the choir normally fluctuates between 12 and 16, at the time that I visited in September, 2004, the number was at a low ebb (eight choristers and one probationer) due to 4 voice changes in the past year. This is a phenomenon that became very familiar to me in the course of my visits to various boy choir programs. Regardless of whether it is a relatively poor after-school choir program or a well-endowed cathedral choir, Mother Nature acts with impunity in depriving choirmasters of their best-trained boys without warning. St. Paul's, K Street had nothing to worry about, however, for the remaining choristers formed an extremely solid nucleus to which it was anticipated that the new organist/choirmaster would begin adding upon the assumption of his duties.<sup>199</sup>

The choir is funded from the parish general operating budget as well as a special Evensong Fund that comes from a collection taken at the weekly Evensong service. The music budget (estimated at around \$100,000.00) supports a full-time Director of Music (organist/choirmaster), a part-time Assistant Director of Music, and up to five professional singing men, paid by call.<sup>200</sup> “A small stipend is paid each chorister, based on leadership and performance, underscoring the seriousness of his commitment.”<sup>201</sup> The boys start out earning \$.50 per call, payable at the end of the year, and this increases with seniority.<sup>202</sup>

---

<sup>199</sup> Burkes, interview.

<sup>200</sup> Ibid.

<sup>201</sup> Brochure, 3.

<sup>202</sup> Burkes.

Recruitment of boys occurs by word of mouth, by the publication of a brochure and by distribution of compact disc recordings of the St. Paul's Choirs. Boys ages 7 to 11 are accepted, and may enter the choir at any time. The amount of time that new boys spend on probation is relative to their aptitude and background, and the probationers are expected to spend one-half of their time in rehearsal and the other half in lessons with the Director or the Assistant. In lessons the probationers are taught basic music theory, vocal technique and church-service etiquette.<sup>203</sup>

Unlike the other programs I visited, music theory and choral/vocal pedagogy are strongly emphasized at St. Paul's, and the music literacy of the boys is readily apparent in the skill and confidence with which they perform. Former Director of Music Dr. Jeffrey Smith had put in place a system of teaching music literacy which utilizes the renowned method of Zoltan Kodaly. In this system, boys learn to sing the music on solfege syllables paired with accompanying hand signals.<sup>204</sup> Further pedagogy and rehearsal are offered at the summer choir camp, held at nearby Washington Cathedral. This camp is described as "a week of daily singing, energetic activity, and community building".<sup>205</sup> Many of the choristers also attend affiliated sleep-away choir camps at other locations in the country, an experience which becomes a treasured part of their memory.<sup>206</sup>

Rehearsals take place three times a week for two hours; the boys and their parents choosing at least two rehearsals to attend. The parents are particularly

---

<sup>203</sup> Ibid.

<sup>204</sup> Ibid.

<sup>205</sup> Brochure, 1.

<sup>206</sup> Ibid.



supportive in this choir, perhaps because some of them are musicians themselves, and this parental support and involvement makes all the difference.<sup>207</sup> The young interim director, Mr. Charles Burkes, challenges the boys to think intellectually, spiritually and historically about the repertoire in addition to being able to read and perform the notes.<sup>208</sup> This well-rounded approach has contributed to a much better understanding of the purpose and meaning of the repertoire, and no doubt led to much better performances as a result.

### *St. Stephen's, Timonium, Maryland*

St. Stephen's is unique as the only 'country parish' that I visited in the course of my research. Winding down a narrow, leafy Maryland lane just outside Baltimore, I turned into a spacious yard, in the middle of which lay a small wooden church and tower. I had the chance to engage in a brief conversation with the Rector of the parish, the Rev. Guy Hawtin, before choir rehearsal. I was curious to know how a small parish manages to afford a choir of men and boys. "With great difficulty", was his reply.<sup>209</sup> He pointed out that it is not easy for a parish of only around 400 or so total members to manage the costs of a full-time organist/choirmaster and choir of men and boys (which he estimated at around \$60,000.00 a year). However, the choir of men and boys fits in very well with the priorities of the parish, a traditional Anglican parish using the 1928 Book of Common Prayer and *The Hymnal, 1940*

---

<sup>207</sup> Burkes, interview.

<sup>208</sup> Ibid.

<sup>209</sup> Rev. Guy Hawtin, (Rector of St. Stephen's Traditional Episcopal Church), in interview with the author, September 2004.

exclusively, and it is therefore considered to be well worth the cost and effort involved.<sup>210</sup>

St. Stephen's has one full-time musician, organist/choirmaster Mr. David Riley, who is highly regarded in the surrounding region for his work with the boys. The choir at St. Stephen's normally consists of around 12 boy choristers as well as six to eight young men of high school and college age who sing the lower parts and are paid on a fee-per-service basis.<sup>211</sup>

Rehearsals take place on weekdays at the boys' convenience, and Mr. David Riley, the organist/choirmaster goes to great lengths to make sure they all get a chance to rehearse. He makes himself available 5 days a week, Monday through Friday from 4-6:00p.m., and whichever boys can make it will appear on at least two of those days for a rehearsal with him. In some cases there may be several boys, or as it happened on the day that I came to visit, one boy by himself. On Thursday evening, the choir men rehearse from 7-9:00 p.m., and on Sunday morning the full choir rehearses together for 1 hour before the 11:15 a.m. service. Monetary compensation is one reward for singing, but a choirmaster has to be sensitive to other needs as well. On the evening that I was present, Mr. Riley provided sandwiches from a local deli for the choir men, most of whom were likely unable to rush home for dinner between work and the rehearsal.<sup>212</sup>

---

<sup>210</sup> Hawtin, interview.

<sup>211</sup> David Riley, (Organist and Choirmaster of St. Stephen's Traditional Episcopal Church), in interview with the author, September 2004.

<sup>212</sup> Ibid.

The choir sings the main service each Sunday during the school year. This service is Holy Communion on the 1<sup>st</sup> Sunday of the month, and Matins on the remaining Sundays. In addition, the choir sings choral Evensong on the 4<sup>th</sup> Sunday of the month at 5:00 p.m. Mr. Riley maintains that in order to develop the sense of ownership and responsibility the choir must perform at least once a week, and have responsibility for the main service. The choir is known to also appear in other local parish churches to perform concerts or choral Evensong.<sup>213</sup>

Weekly Schedule for Choir at St. Stephen's						
S	M	T	W	Th	F	S
Tutti 10:00 a.m. Rehearsal 11:15 a.m Service	Boys 4-6:00pm	Boys 4-6:00pm	Boys 4-6:00pm	Boys 4-6:00pm Men 7-9:00pm	Boys 4-6:00pm	

Mr. Riley's approach to pedagogy is to use rehearsal time and the repertoire as the context and the occasion for teaching. He does not use any particular curriculum for music theory or other topics, preferring to address those issues in rehearsal rather than separately in a systematic way. He is quick to address mistakes in reading, intonation and vowel color, and also personally demonstrates the sound he has in mind for the choir.<sup>214</sup> As with other choirmasters in his type of situation, once Mr. Riley has well-trained boys, he hangs on to them as long as possible before their voices change. One boy that I observed was 14 years old, and seemed to me to be

---

<sup>213</sup> Ibid.

<sup>214</sup> Riley, interview.

around six feet tall, but still had a fine soprano voice. A certain amount of repetition of choral works from year one to the next also increases the likelihood of having an excellent performance despite a minimum amount of rehearsal time. I noticed in the course of rehearsal that the repertoire was mostly familiar already, and therefore could be drawn out and “dusted off” for performance fairly quickly.

The issue of recruitment is even more difficult in a small-town or country parish than it is for an urban parish. Whereas urban parishes have a large population to draw upon, and whereas the boys might get themselves to the church via public transit, St. Stephen’s is rather more limited in its ability to recruit new boys because of the lack of either population density or public transit. Mr. Riley recruits by word of mouth mostly, and the heat was on the St. Stephen’s choir when I visited in the fall of 2004. The choir was down to 4 boys, and all of them expected to go through a voice change fairly soon. Mr. Riley posted a handwritten sign over the rehearsal area in the church, offering a reward of \$100.00 to any choir member who brings in a new boy that ends up staying. One understands his predicament, since the work of training new boys is compounded a number of times if a choirmaster has to start from scratch. A choir with seasoned boy choristers can always rely on them to exercise leadership and mentorship, thus taking a considerable burden off the choirmaster’s shoulders.

### *Conclusions*

The after-school programs that I visited reveal their flexibility and cost-effectiveness, with the number of staff ranging from one full-time, to one full-time

with one part-time assistant. The boys are able to rehearse either one day a week, or more than one day with some options as to which day they choose. They are able to perform regular services, the number ranging from three services per month to one weekly service. All perform with outside organizations, and some even produce high-quality recordings.

These programs show their vulnerability in the areas of recruitment and depth of musical training. There is no simple solution to the problem of recruitment, and a great deal of precious energy and ingenuity must be invested by the rector, choirmaster and parish in order to bring in new boys. Regarding pedagogy, I couldn't help but notice that the choir program which seemed to invest the most time in systematic pedagogy also had the most pleasant rehearsals and the most successful performances. It would be worth the effort for choirmasters to find a simple curriculum schema, such as the Royal School of Church Music currently offers, to provide the structure for systematic pedagogy.

The Royal School of Church Music was mentioned by all of the after-school choirmasters as having an influence on their programs. However, while some of them made use of a ranking and medal system based on the RSCM, they mostly did not implement the curriculum or testing procedures provided. It seems to this writer that a lot of the work of developing a pedagogical system has been done for after-school programs already, and that if choirmasters only invested a little of their time in systematic musical and vocal instruction, even if it is only the first 15 minutes of each

rehearsal, this time spent would be repaid in full, with dividends, in time saved from having to teach the boys their music by rote.

The repetition of choral repertoire was found to be an effective way of getting the music into the boys' minds and voices from one year to the next, but it also severely limits the number of pieces from the canon that can be performed. The Summer camp is a very effective way of gearing up for the first services of a new year, and also a way of building friendships and community within the choir, and this approach can be developed more fully. Networking with other choirs at a joint Summer Camp for example, would be a very efficient way of sharing with other choir programs the burden of funding and staffing a sleep-away summer camp.

The Parochial School with Boy Chorister Training Program (*Old St. Paul's Parish, Baltimore; Grace Cathedral, San Francisco; The Cathedral of Sts. Peter and Paul, Washington, D. C.*)

#### *Introduction*

The next chorister-training model for our consideration is the parochial school which is home to a boy choir. The size and sophistication of this sort of choir usually is on a much higher level than the after-school program, with up to thirty boys involved, as many as four full-time staff persons and the number of performances extending up to several times each week. There is some overlap here with the after-school program, because although the chorister training does not necessarily take place only after school, it is at least undertaken at some time that is agreeable to the school and hopefully to the choir. As an established institution, a parochial school usually has much more stability and more appeal to the surrounding community than an after-school program. The school provides a ready ground for recruitment, and since the financial incentives offered are much more substantial (including scholarships to pay school tuition) it is rare that a choirmaster would have to go outside the school in order to recruit for the choir.

A parochial school that offers a training program for boy choristers is identical to a traditional choir school in the sense that choristers receive their musical training at the same institution where they are receiving their liberal arts education. While the boys are usually 'day boys' -which is to say that they spend the daytime hours at school, returning home in the evening- the transportation problem that is endemic to

after-school programs is reduced because chorister training takes place at the same location as their other classes.

The features of the parochial school that set it apart from a traditional choir school mostly stem from philosophical differences. For instance, if a parochial school is conceived primarily as a college-preparatory program, then the fact that a few of the boys happen to sing in the cathedral or parish choir will be treated as only one part of this overall vision. Thus it will be regarded as of equal importance (and in some cases less important) with all other disciplines in ensuring the overall objective, which is to land the boys at a top college sometime in the future. At this point the choirmaster often finds that he has to contend with teachers from all other disciplines for an adequate amount of class time and for the optimum times of the day. Whereas the primary function of the traditional choir school is to train a professional-level ensemble to perform the services of the church, and the daily routine of the school is molded around this objective, the choristers at a parochial school can find that the reverse is true. Often their rehearsal time is relegated to odd nooks and crannies of the day in order to make life convenient for the rest of the faculty and students.

### *Old St. Paul's Parish, Baltimore, Maryland*

The parish of St. Paul's, Baltimore is one of the oldest parishes in the American Church, founded in 1692, and is considered the area's most "venerable" parish.<sup>215</sup> The basilica style, red-brick building on Cathedral Street was designed by Richard Upjohn, and completed in 1856. Among the long-standing traditions of St.

---

<sup>215</sup> Old St. Paul's Parish, Baltimore, Brochure, by the Vestry and People of St. Paul's Parish, 2003), 1.



Paul's, the school for girls (founded 1799) and the school for boys (founded 1849), were originally conceived to provide an education for those with limited financial means.<sup>216</sup> Both schools were originally located near the church, but in recent years have been moved to the Baltimore suburb of Brooklandville, about forty minutes' drive from downtown. The vested choir of men and boys was introduced in 1873 by Dr. John Sebastian Bach Hodges, who sought to raise the music of the parish to the level of a "holy office", and his vision has been maintained by a notable succession of organist/choirmasters through the succeeding years.<sup>217</sup>

The choral program of St. Paul's today is led by two full-time musicians, the organist/choirmaster and an assistant organist/choirmaster, who share administrative, teaching and performing duties. The two must travel out to the Brooklandville campus early in the morning each day in order to rehearse the choristers before school begins. I spoke to Mr. Daniel Fortune, current organist/choirmaster, about the activities of the St. Paul's choir today. When he came to St. Paul's in 1999, it was to a choral program that had almost completely collapsed. The previous organist/choirmaster left St. Paul's abruptly after a disagreement with the Rector over the future of the choir, and all but one boy chorister left along with him, taking up residence in another Baltimore-area parish. When I spoke to Mr. Fortune in the fall of 2004, he had managed to rebuild the boy choir to twenty choristers and also simultaneously introduce a new girl choir of fifteen choristers. A group of around fourteen choir men sing the lower parts for both choirs. The choir men are

---

<sup>216</sup> Ibid., 11.

<sup>217</sup> Ibid., 5.

professional singers from the Baltimore area as well as a few graduate students from the nearby Peabody Institute, who serve as choral scholars on a fee-per-service basis.<sup>218</sup>

The boys for the choir are drawn from the school for boys, and the girls are drawn from the school for girls. All of the choristers, boys and girls receive a stipend for their singing. The boy and girl choristers alternate singing the main Sunday morning Holy Communion service at 10:30 a.m., as well as one Choral Evensong a month on Sunday at 4:00 p.m.<sup>219</sup>

Funding for the choir comes mainly from the parish operating budget, but a small music endowment helps to pay for special projects, such as the hiring of an orchestra to play in the annual Thanksgiving service. The choir boys receive a scholarship for St. Paul's School beginning with \$1,000.00 their second year in the choir and increasing to \$2,500.00 by their fourth year. Choristers also earn a small stipend for their work in the choir, starting at \$9 a month for new choristers and increasing by \$4 a month each year of seniority. The Head Chorister receives an additional \$10 a month, and the Deputy Head Chorister receives an additional \$5 a month. While the choristers are well compensated for the effort they put into the choir, much is expected of them in terms of their professional behavior.<sup>220</sup>

---

<sup>218</sup> Daniel Fortune (Organist and Choirmaster of Old St. Paul's Parish, Baltimore), in Interview with the author, September 2004.

<sup>219</sup> Ibid.

<sup>220</sup> Ibid.

Music pedagogy for the choirs takes place mostly in rehearsals and the four-day summer camp in August of each year. St. Paul's School also has a general music program, which covers such diverse topics as music notation, history and listening.

The Choir Schedule at St. Paul's, Baltimore						
S	M	T	W	Th	F	S
	7:20-7:55 Treble Rehearsals (younger boys until 8:15)	7:20-7:55 Treble Rehearsals	7:20-7:55 Treble Rehearsals	7:20-7:55 Treble Rehearsals		
9:15-10:15 Tutti Rehearsal						
10:30 Holy Communion (twice a month)						
3:00 pm. Tutti Rehearsal						
4:00 p.m. Evensong (once a month)						
				7:00-9:00 p.m. Men's Rehearsal		

The choirs rehearse simultaneously each morning before school begins, which means that both Mr. Fortune and his assistant are needed at the same time at the school. Boys rehearse in the chapel of the boys' campus from 7:20-7:50 a.m., (with

the new boys receiving an additional twenty-five minutes from 7:50-8:15 a.m.). Regrettably the middle school recently began opening at 8:00 instead of 8:30, meaning that the choirmaster suddenly lost thirty minutes of daily rehearsal time with his older boys. The fact that each group of choristers sings only two or three services a month alleviates some of the pressure on the choirmaster to be ready for performance, but the loss of this much rehearsal time is still nothing short of catastrophic. The choir men rehearse on Thursday evenings from 7-9:00 p.m. at the church. The choirs (men/boys or men/girls) rehearse together before the Sunday morning service, from 9:15-10:15 a.m.<sup>221</sup>

### *Grace Cathedral, San Francisco, California*

The Grace Cathedral School for Boys, founded in 1957, was the first Episcopal Cathedral School of its kind on the west coast. It is considered by many to be one of the premier boys' schools in San Francisco, with a student body of around 250, kindergarten through grade eight. From its foundation, the school existed to educate any boy who met the entrance requirements whether or not they would become choristers, but it was understood that the school would have a close relationship with the Cathedral Choir.<sup>222</sup> The school is situated on the north side of the cathedral close, a campus that covers a city block atop Nob Hill between California and Sacramento Streets. The offices for the music staff, as well as the choral library and rehearsal room are situated in Choir House, just off the apse of the

---

<sup>221</sup> Ibid.

<sup>222</sup> Criswell, 84.

cathedral itself. Choir House is accessible from Jones Street, and conveniently located only a few steps away from the Cathedral School.<sup>223</sup>

The cathedral music program today is staffed by a Canon Director of Music, a Principal Organist, an Assistant Organist/Choirmaster (currently vacant), and a Music Department Administrator. These four, full-time positions relate directly to the functions of the music of the cathedral, and two additional music personnel operating within the school only include a general music teacher and an instrumental teacher. Newly appointed Canon Director of Music, Dr. Jeffrey Smith, is both an organist and a choirmaster by training, but his musical duties pertain mostly to the choir and the administration of the program, while Principle Organist Dr. Susan Matthews shoulders most of the responsibility for playing the organ.<sup>224</sup>

The Cathedral Choir consists of thirty boys drawn from the Cathedral School and fourteen professional singing men from the San Francisco Bay Area. The boys who sing in the choir receive a significant scholarship to attend the Cathedral School, making a chorister position a coveted prize for many families. Although probationers do not earn a scholarship for the first year of their involvement in the choir, the scholarship awarded during the second year increases with each subsequent year as a boy achieves seniority. The men earn a fee-per-service for their work at the cathedral, and all hold day jobs as well since they would not be able to support themselves in the Bay Area just by singing at Grace. Funding for the choir comes

---

<sup>223</sup> Grace Cathedral, San Francisco, "Visitors' Guide"

<sup>224</sup> Jeffrey Smith (Director of Music, Grace Cathedral, San Francisco) in interview with the author, November 2004.

from the cathedral's annual operating budget, derived from the pledges of the members of the cathedral, from community fundraising efforts conducted by a professional firm, and a small portion from ticketed concerts and the sale of CD recordings.<sup>225</sup> Not to be overlooked are the proceeds from a Pete's Coffee & Tea's coffee stand located by the Grace Bookshop under the south transept of the cathedral, to which I contributed generously one day in November, 2004.

Dr. Jeffrey Smith holds auditions for new boys in their 3<sup>rd</sup> grade year at the school, and they may continue with the choir until their voices change. The pool of possible new recruits is limited to the 25-30 boys who start in the 3<sup>rd</sup> grade class each year, since boys enter the Cathedral School at the kindergarten level, and there is essentially no participation by the choirmaster in their selection at that level. While this system may seem to severely limit the supply of potential number of new boys for the choir, it seemed to me that Dr. Smith had plenty of raw talent to work with anyway. In a typical audition at Grace, a boy is assessed on his ability to match pitches, read text, focus and maintain his composure. The audition is an opportunity to interview and assess the suitability of the boy's parents as well. Committed choir parents are an important factor in the selection of new boys, and they must be willing partners with the choirmaster by consistently accommodating the choir's performing schedule.<sup>226</sup>

Music pedagogy is undertaken in a very systematic way at Grace, with time divided between rehearsal time and applied instruction. The boys rehearse together

---

<sup>225</sup> Ibid.

<sup>226</sup> Ibid.

first thing in the morning on most days, and then come back to the choir room later on in the day for instruction by grade level.<sup>227</sup>

A Typical Weekly Choir Schedule at Grace Cathedral, San Francisco						
S	M	T	W	Th	F	S
	8:00-8:45 Treble Rehearsal	8:00-8:45 Treble Rehearsal	8:00-8:45 Treble Rehearsal	8:00-8:45 Treble Rehearsal	8:00-8:20 Treble Rehearsal	
	9:30-10:00 8 <sup>th</sup> grade	9:30-10:00 5 <sup>th</sup> grade	9:30-10:00 5 <sup>th</sup> grade	9:30-10:00 6 <sup>th</sup> grade	9:30-10:00 7 <sup>th</sup> grade	
10:00 boys then 10:15 Tutti Rehearsal		10:00 4 <sup>th</sup> grade	10:00 4 <sup>th</sup> grade			
11:00 Choral Eucharist	11-11:40 5 <sup>th</sup> grade	11-11:40 5 <sup>th</sup> grade	11-11:40 5 <sup>th</sup> grade			
		12:20 to 1 p.m. 8 <sup>th</sup> grade				
		2:35-3:15 7 <sup>th</sup> grade				
3:00 Choral Evensong (Men)						
	7 <sup>th</sup> grade 4:30-5pm			4:30 boys then 5:00 Tutti Rehearsal	8 <sup>th</sup> grade 4:30-5pm	
				5:15 Choral Evensong (Men & Boys) Dinner at 6 7-8 tutti rehearsal, 8:15-9:15 men only		

<sup>227</sup> Ibid.

The choral warm up in the morning begins with a prayer, recited in unison by the choristers. An extensive vocal warm up follows, with routines that reinforce correct posture, good breathing technique, proper vowel formation and musical phrasing. As he did at St. Paul's, K Street, Dr. Smith uses elements of the Kodaly Method of instruction as a way of building music literacy. At the conclusion of around twenty-minutes of warming up and technique-building, the boys begin to work on repertoire. This includes the hymns, descants, Anglican Chant, service music, and anthems for the upcoming services of the week. It is not uncommon for the Grace boys to sing through their music on solfege a couple of times first to reinforce their understanding of the piece before combining text and music. One feature of Dr. Smith's rehearsal technique that was very pleasing to this writer is that he does not dominate the rehearsal with the piano. The piano is used to give a harmonic framework, but generally not to play the vocal line that the boys are expected to sing.<sup>228</sup>

The quality of the choir men was mentioned as having a very high priority for Dr. Smith, and for various good reasons. The first is that a choirmaster has to spend most of his time training, educating and managing the boy choristers, and needs to expect that the men of the choir will not require too much of his attention. Besides this fact, Dr. Smith believes that the boys constantly look to the men as role models. If the men are models of appropriate behavior and musical professionalism, the boys will inevitably be better choristers too. Although the men of the Cathedral Choir are

---

<sup>228</sup> Grace Choir Boys' Rehearsal with Dr. Jeffrey Smith, DVC recording, November 2004.



not required to be Episcopalians, they are expected to conduct themselves in a manner that is not less professional or devout in the execution of their duties because of it. Fortunately for the Cathedral Choir, there is a relatively good supply of able choir men to be found in the Bay Area, including the countertenors that are so rare in most other parts of this country.<sup>229</sup>

The schedule of weekly services traditionally sung by the Cathedral Choir throughout the school year includes Choral Evensong on Thursday evenings, Holy Communion on Sunday mornings, and Choral Evensong on Sunday afternoons. Currently, however, the choir boys only sing the Thursday Evensong and not the one on Sunday. This is something that Dr. Smith hopes to change after he has had a chance to consolidate and rebuild this choral program that had languished without a permanent music director for several years. One of his objectives for the choir is to eventually increase the number of regular services that they sing at the cathedral. He believes that there is a correlation between the skill level of the choir and the number of weekly services they have to perform. For example, a choir that sings weekly is forced to develop to a higher level than a choir that sings monthly, and a choir that performs daily will have to work at an even higher level.<sup>230</sup> Other special musical events at the cathedral involving the choir include seasonal concerts. In Christmas 2004, for example, the Cathedral Choir accompanied by orchestra and organ gave a series of six ticketed Christmas Concerts.<sup>231</sup> The choir has produced a number of

---

<sup>229</sup> Smith, interview.

<sup>230</sup> Ibid.

<sup>231</sup> Grace Cathedral, San Francisco, Brochure, "Concerts at Grace Cathedral, Fall & Christmas 2004".

professional recordings, and recordings of the various organists who have worked for the cathedral are available as well.

*The Cathedral of Sts. Peter and Paul, Washington, D.C.*  
*(Washington National Cathedral)*

The school for boys at the National Cathedral, known as St. Alban's School, was established in 1909 as a choir school but over time expanded into a college preparatory program within which the choir boys form a special group of scholarship students.<sup>232</sup> Scholarships for the boys come from the proceeds of an endowment created for the choir in 1903 by benefactress Harriet Lane Johnston, who envisioned the creation of a choir school at the National Cathedral and hoped that by doing so she would help to improve the state of church music in America.<sup>233</sup> St. Alban's is one of three schools associated with the cathedral, including the Beavoir School (K-3) and the National Cathedral School for Girls. St. Alban's is divided into a Lower School (grades 4-8) and an Upper School (grades 9-12). Each school is situated near the cathedral, and the boys walk a short distance to the choir room in the cathedral administration building to attend their rehearsals.

The Cathedral choirs are currently operated by four full-time staff, including a Director of Music (who is the choirmaster), an Organist/Associate Director of Music, an Assistant Director of Music/Assistant Organist, and a Music Program Administrator. In addition, the choral program retains two part-time vocal coaches

---

<sup>232</sup> Ellinwood, 80.

<sup>233</sup> Yang, Kitty Chi-Ti, *A Musical History of the Washington National Cathedral, 1893-1998*, Dissertation (Doctor of Musical Arts diss., Peabody Conservatory of Music), 12.

for the boys, and a volunteer choral librarian. Mr. Michael McCarthy was appointed Director of Music in 2003, following the resignation of Douglas Major in 2001 and an interim period under James Litton of the American Boy Choir. In a new development for the National Cathedral Choir, the head of the program is not an organist by training, but rather a professional choral singer and choirmaster who previously sang with professional ensembles such as The Sixteen and the Monteverdi Choir, and founded his own choir school.<sup>234</sup> Mr. McCarthy has the primary responsibility for the leadership of the choral program. I was able to observe him at work in several choir rehearsals and was also granted several interviews in between items on his busy agenda.

The choristers are divided into a junior/probationary choir, which consists of 3<sup>rd</sup> grade boys from the Beauvoir School or other local schools, and the regular choristers, boys who have been accepted both into the Lower School of St. Alban's and the Cathedral Choir.<sup>235</sup> The junior choir is essentially a training choir, where the boys spend one year learning musicianship skills. Upon successful completion of the program and assessment by the Directory of music, a probationer becomes a novice in the regular choir and is invested by the bishop at a special service. Choristers earn a scholarship to attend St. Alban's School that currently ranges from 25% to 29% of their total fees, depending on their rank in the choir. Although Mr. McCarthy would like to see the number of boys in the choir at least around twenty, the current reality is

---

<sup>234</sup> Michael McCarthy (Director of Music, Washington National Cathedral), in interview with the author, September 2004.

<sup>235</sup> Hendricks, 71.

that the program had almost completely lapsed in the years prior to his arrival, and he is faced with the task of rebuilding almost from the ground up. When I visited in September, 2004, there were five choristers in the choir, to which seven more were in the process of being invested from the junior choir, bringing the total number to twelve choristers. There are also twelve professional choir men, who are paid per call to sing with the boy and girl choirs.<sup>236</sup>

The course of activities at the National Cathedral and its associated schools is very complex, and great effort has to be made to avoid scheduling conflicts. Some musical pedagogy is undertaken in rehearsals, but it is also undertaken systematically as a separate activity. The boys learn some music theory through Performing Arts classes at St. Alban's and receive one hour of voice lessons per week. The choristers rehearse weekday mornings in the choir room from 10:15 to 11:15, while the probationers rehearse in the afternoon before Evensong. Mentoring is an important component in the formation of the choristers, and Mr. McCarthy takes care to place novice choristers next to more seasoned choristers who assist in training new boys. One of his goals for chorister training is to expand the probationary choir from a one-year to a two-year program. Since the boys start in the probationary choir in the third grade, the new length of training would make them relatively mature fifth graders by the time they make it to the regular choir.<sup>237</sup>

The cathedral has an extensive Rota of choral services, with five Choral Evensong Services and one Choral Eucharist each week. Sharing this burden with the

---

<sup>236</sup> McCarthy, interview.

<sup>237</sup> Ibid.

girls' choir, as the boys have done since 1997, means that the choirs can breathe a little easier in their otherwise hectic schedule. Boys sing Evensong on Mondays, girls on Tuesdays, boys and men on Wednesdays, girls and men on Thursdays. On alternating Sundays the boys or girls (with the men) will sing both the Eucharist and the Evensong, and the Evensong Service is partly a recap of either Wednesday's or Thursday's performance, depending on whether the boys or girls are slated for Sunday duty.

Some repetition of Evensong Services is necessary in a program of this scope, and upon examination of the schedule of works to be performed, one notices that services such as the Stanford in C, Sumsion in G and Cavuoti in G make frequent appearances. The combined choirs perform at least one major concert each semester, for example on the Palm Sunday, 2005 performance of the *St. John Passion* by J. S. Bach.<sup>238</sup> In addition to their work at the cathedral, the choirs have performed on numerous radio and television broadcasts, produced many compact disc recordings and undertaken extensive choir tours in this country and to other parts of the world.<sup>239</sup> A summer choir festival is offered each year at the cathedral, and boy choirs from local parishes such as St. Paul's, K Street and Old St. Paul's, Baltimore are invited to attend.

---

<sup>238</sup> Washington National Cathedral, "Choral Repertoire," <http://www.cathedral.org/cathedral/music/weekly.shtml>

<sup>239</sup> Washington National Cathedral, "History of the Choirs," <http://www.cathedral.org/cathedral/music/history.shtml>

Typical Weekly Choir Schedule at Washington National Cathedral						
S	M	T	W	Th	F	S
	7:45-8:30 Girl Choristers Rehearsal	7:45-8:30 Girl Choristers Rehearsal	7:45-8:30 Girl Choristers Rehearsal	7:45-8:30 Girl Choristers Rehearsal	7:45-8:30 Girl Choristers Rehearsal	
10:00 Tutti Rehearsal	10:15- 11:15 Boy Choristers Rehearsal	10:15- 11:15 Boy Choristers Rehearsal	10:15- 11:15 Boy Choristers Rehearsal	10:15- 11:15 Boy Choristers Rehearsal	10:15- 11:15 Boy Choristers Rehearsal	
11:00 Choral Eucharist (boys & girls alternate weeks)						
3:00 Tutti Rehearsal 4:00 Choral Evensong						
	5:00 Boys Rehearsal 5:30 Choral Evensong	5:00 Girls Rehearsal 5:30 Choral Evensong	5:00 Men/Boys Rehearsal 5:30 Choral Evensong	5:00 Men/Girls Rehearsal 5:30 Choral Evensong  Rehearsal for Choir Men 7:15- 8:30		

Apart from the chorister scholarships, which are endowed, the funding for the choirs' operating expenses comes from the cathedral's general operating budget.

Among Mr. McCarthy's goals for the choir would be the creation of a substantial

endowment in order to achieve financial independence for the cathedral choirs. He also hopes to continue rebuilding the once vibrant boy choir program, to oversee the division of the girls into junior and senior choirs, and to develop the *a cappella* polyphonic repertoire of the choirs.

### *Conclusions*

The choir programs that are based in a parochial school cover a broad range in size and complexity, from St. Paul's, Baltimore, which resembles an after-school program in some ways, to the National Cathedral, which is nearly identical to a full-fledged choir school. The physical location of the boys on the same campus where they perform (or at least where they rehearse) is of immeasurable value in keeping the program running smoothly, because it does not involve the transportation/logistical problems of the after-school program. The parochial school programs that I visited all seem to have a mandate from their school and church communities, and without such support it would be next to impossible to obtain necessary funding or rehearsal time for the choirs. Sometimes a bit of tug-of-war goes on over the choristers' schedules, and this is inevitable in an environment with so many valid interests competing for the boys' all at once. This is where the governing philosophy of a traditional choir school makes the life of the choirmaster much easier, and this is the topic I will address in the next segment.

The boy choirs in the parochial schools that I visited show signs of stability. This is apparent because each of the programs that I write about have recently undergone a major transition in leadership. In the case of Old St. Paul's, Baltimore

and the Washington National Cathedral, the choir nearly ceased to exist in the process, but has since rebounded or is currently rebounding. The fact that these choirs have not only been kept in existence, but have even begun to thrive once again, is a testament to the fact that the leadership of the churches and schools are committed to keeping up the vested boy choir tradition. A choirmaster is only one ingredient in the complex environment of the church parochial school, and his duties often span the life of the church and the life of the school in a unique way. It is necessary for both church and school leadership to be fully supportive of the choirmaster and choir in order for the program to continue on in healthy condition.

*The Choir School (St. Thomas' Church, 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, New York, NY)*  
*Introduction*

The choir school of St. Thomas' Church, 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, New York, is the only remaining choir school of the traditional model in America, and thus occupies a leading place in the American church music today. St. Thomas Choir School once existed in the company of four American choir schools, as has been noted in Part I.<sup>240</sup> The other three have since either ceased to operate or have taken on a new life as prep schools. The words "traditional model" used here refer to the philosophical underpinnings as well as to the practical features of the choir school. St. Thomas Choir School exists primarily to train choir boys to sing the services of the church with which it is affiliated. The boys are provided schooling in all the other disciplines as well, ensuring that they receive a well-rounded education. St. Thomas's is fully

---

<sup>240</sup> See page 41 of this document.



residential, and accommodates up to forty boys as well as a number of faculty and clergy. These features enable the school to maintain its rigorous weekly performing schedule and yearly concert series. The school also has more than two-dozen recordings to its credit, with a quality of performance that has invited comparisons to choir schools in England.

A vested choir of men and boys was first instituted at St. Thomas' in 1902 by organist/choirmaster William C. Macfarlane. This choir functioned along the lines of what we would think of today as the after-school model. The boys were “gathered from all parts of the city”, and a number of them had to “consume from two to three hours to come and go”, thus making frequent rehearsals next to impossible.<sup>241</sup> Early in the life of the choir, Macfarlane expressed his desire that a choir school be organized to bring permanency to the choir and to improve the quality of the singing. His dream was realized during the tenure of T. Tertius Noble, a notable English choirmaster who had been employed at Ely Cathedral and later at York Minster before accepting the post at St. Thomas'. Dr. Noble made clear from the time of his appointment that a choir school would have to be established in order to achieve the musical standard that was desired by the parish.<sup>242</sup> In 1915, Noble wrote, “The chief [difficulty facing us] is obtaining sufficient rehearsals for the boys. As far as I can see, there is only one solution of this difficult problem—a Choir School. Once this is secured...work will be very much easier, and the results far better”.<sup>243</sup>

---

<sup>241</sup> Kenneth Lohf, “The Saint Thomas Choir School”, Appendix to *Saint Thomas Church Fifth Avenue*, by J. Robert Wright (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001), 261.

<sup>242</sup> *Ibid.*, 263.

<sup>243</sup> *Ibid.*

The school officially opened on March 3, 1919, with twenty-one boys, fourteen of whom were boarding students. In the early days of the school a modest staff of two resident teachers, a house mother and Dr. Noble ran the program on a small campus comprised of two houses at 123 W. 55<sup>th</sup> Street. By the end of Dr. Noble's thirty years at St. Thomas', the number of boys had grown to forty, and a new campus included a gymnasium, a study hall, three classrooms and accommodations for all of the boys.<sup>244</sup> During his time in New York, Dr. Noble came to be recognized as one of most eminent church musicians and composers in America, and his Choir School became the leading institution in American Anglican choral music.

While the vision and leadership of T. Tertius Noble were the direct cause of the formation and operation of the choir school, the project would not have been possible without the philanthropy of a devoted benefactor, Mr. Charles Steele, a member of St. Thomas' parish and a vestryman. On the death of Mr. Steele, St. Thomas' vestry made a statement in his honor, as follows: "As patron of music, he gave in 1922 the buildings which house the Choir School, and endowed the school; he caused another building to be erected in 1939 and increased the endowment, and in his will he made a further addition to its endowment, making his gifts to this object over a million dollars. More than once did he refer to the school as the best investment he had ever made. He called the choir boys his dividends."<sup>245</sup> The endowment begun by Mr. Steele would ensure that the St. Thomas tradition would

---

<sup>244</sup> Ibid. 266.

<sup>245</sup> Ibid., 267.

remain in operation today, and it continues to provide the scholarships that enable boys to attend the school.

The St. Thomas Choir School of today is situated on West Fifty-Eighth Street between Broadway and Seventh Avenue, just one block away from Carnegie Hall and from Central Park. The campus which over the years has spanned multiple buildings is today neatly contained in one fifteen-story structure, completed in 1987. A brief tour through the building reveals a functional space that also promotes a real sense of community and comfort in the midst of its urban environment. Floors one through four contain the major working components of the school: the entry vestibule and main stair hall, recreation room, music practice rooms, school offices, parlor and dining hall, classrooms, and library. Ascending through the building one then comes to a series of floors in which are contained living and dining accommodations. These include the boys' dormitory rooms and the faculty apartments, linked in the center of the building by a three-story high great hall that provides a familial/communal atmosphere. The upper floors contain apartments for the headmaster, choirmaster and clergy. The school chapel is located on the highest floor, while the basement and lower mezzanine levels contain a gymnasium and exercise rooms. The gymnasium doubles as a rehearsal hall with a stage at the north end where the choir rehearses from within rows of opposing choir desks. This gymnasium was designed by the

architect to have a resonance similar to that of the stone vaulting at St. Thomas Church, and is a remarkable rehearsal environment.<sup>246</sup>

On my visit to St. Thomas Church and Choir School in December of 2004, I was privileged to interview the newly appointed Choirmaster and Director of Music, Mr. John Scott, and also the newly appointed Headmaster, the Rev. Charles Wallace. I attended a tutti choir rehearsal for an upcoming performance of Handel's *Messiah*, and was given a guided tour of the Choir School facilities by Fr. Wallace. Fr. Wallace, formerly chaplain at the Choir School and himself an organist, assumed the position of headmaster in the fall of 2004. The headmaster, choirmaster and rector of St. Thomas' together form a unified leadership "team of three", and they are the center around which this modern Manhattan parish community (Church, Music Program and Choir School) revolves. Whereas the choir school has seemed like a separate entity from the church at some points in its history, the ambition of Fr. Wallace, together with current Rector, Rev. Andrew Mead, and Choirmaster John Scott, is to foster an ever closer and more complementary alliance between parish and school.<sup>247</sup>

As the celebrated former organist/choirmaster of St. Paul's Cathedral, London, Mr. John Scott's arrival in New York in the fall of 2004 generated almost as much excitement in the parish as the arrival of T. Tertius Noble in 1913. Choir School aficionados have already been lauding the new sense of discipline and focus

---

<sup>246</sup> Rev. Charles Wallace, (Headmaster of St. Thomas Choir School, New York), Guided tour with the author, December 2004.

<sup>247</sup> Rev. Charles Wallace, in interview with the author, December 2004.

of the choir, and are using words such as “brilliant” and “clear” to describe the new choral sound.<sup>248</sup> Trained in the heart of the Anglican choir school tradition, Mr. Scott was a boy chorister at Wakefield Cathedral, Yorkshire, and later an organ scholar at St. John’s College, Cambridge, where he assisted Dr. George Guest for four years. After working for nineteen years at St. Paul’s, London and pursuing an active recital career (during the course of which he made many recordings as an organist and as a choirmaster) Mr. Scott decided to accept the position at St. Thomas’s.<sup>249</sup> Although this may seem like an unusual career move for an eminent Church of England musician at the pinnacle of his career, one only has to look at the example of Dr. T. Tertius Noble for historical precedent. In doing so, one can see that assuming leadership of the only American choir school presents wonderful possibilities for a man with the imagination, the experience and the drive necessary to take a young tradition and make it into something spectacular.

The operation of a choir school has never been inexpensive, and it has been noted in this document that the English choir schools are maintained by ancient endowments. Most of the funding for the Music Program and Choir School at St. Thomas Church today also comes from the proceeds of endowments, such as that begun in 1922 by Mr. Charles Steele, with a very small portion of the operating budget also coming from the current parish membership. Present parish senior warden, William H. A. Wright II, reported that the yearly expenditures of St. Thomas

---

<sup>248</sup> *Saint Thomas News*, Vol. 1, No. 1 (2004), 1.

<sup>249</sup> John Scott, (Choirmaster of St. Thomas Choir School, New York), in interview with the author, December 2004.

Church and School for 2005 were budgeted at \$8 million, of which it was estimated that \$800,000.00 (only 10%) would come from the annual pledges of today's parishioners.<sup>250</sup> Within this budget, the costs of the Choir School and the Music program were each estimated at around \$2.4 million for 2005.<sup>251</sup> The total cost of educating, housing and feeding each boy in this urban environment is well over \$50,000.00 a year, but every boy is awarded at least \$40,000.00 of that amount in Financial Aid.<sup>252</sup> "Each year the Financial Aid committee awards over \$250,000.00 in outright grants to approximately 92 percent of the student body," and no boy is turned away for lack of money.<sup>253</sup>

The staffing of the choir school must be considered on a level apart from parochial school and after-school programs because the boys receive not just choir training, but all their liberal arts instruction as well. St. Thomas Choir School employs a headmaster, choirmaster, chaplain, up to nine full-time teachers of the various disciplines, two nurses, a psychologist, several part-time vocal and instrumental teachers, and a small administrative staff.<sup>254</sup> The music staff of nearby St. Thomas' Church includes the Organist and Director of Music (who is also the choirmaster of the school), an Associate Organist, an Assistant Organist and a Music

---

<sup>250</sup> *St. Thomas News*, 1.

<sup>251</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>252</sup> *St. Thomas Choir School Brochure*, (2004), 22.

<sup>253</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>254</sup> *Ibid.*, 5.

Office Coordinator.<sup>255</sup> The twelve Gentlemen of the Choir are all professional singers from the New York City metropolitan area.

Recruiting new boys is not easy for a school like St. Thomas', although this may come as a surprise to those who assume that the benefits of this sort of education would be obvious to most parents, therefore making the Choir School a popular destination for their boys. The reality is that many parents do not readily give up the large portion of their son's childhood such as the five years spent at St. Thomas's represents. Boys enter in their fourth grade year, and if everything goes well, it is expected that they will stay until they complete the eighth grade, returning home only for the Summer and for holidays. Parents are invited to visit their boys on Saturdays during term and spend time with them on outings in the city. Some overnight accommodations are available at the school for the use of parents.<sup>256</sup> However, five years is a long time in the life of a child, and Mr. Scott indicated that this is one reason why recruitment can still be a serious challenge for the school administration, and one that has to be approached in creative and systematic ways. In addition to the publicity that the school attains through public concerts, broadcasts, recordings and printed material, Mr. Scott plans to staff exhibits at several diocesan conventions of the Episcopal Church, USA in order to raise the Choir School's profile among Episcopalian constituents. As most of the students come from the northeastern states,

---

<sup>255</sup> St. Thomas Church, 5<sup>th</sup> Ave., Brochure, "Music at Saint Thomas Church, September to December 2004"

<sup>256</sup> Wallace, interview.

he will target the Choir School exhibits to ECUSA conventions in Pennsylvania, Massachusetts and New York.<sup>257</sup>

The school holds auditions for boys entering the fourth grade and admits a new class of six to eight students each fall. Although no previous musical training is required, a boy must “be able to demonstrate a trainable soprano voice and musical ear”.<sup>258</sup> After the vocal audition, each boy is also given an academic test. The decision as to whether he will be admitted to the school is based on his vocal aptitude, level of scholarship, musical ability, and emotional maturity.<sup>259</sup> The audition/selection process is a critical component to the general well-being of the program, and the parents have to be fully committed to their son’s presence at St. Thomas. Since the school only admits boys who will sing in the choir, a boy who happened to drop out or was expelled for any reason could leave a hole in the choral program for the next four years. For this reason great care is taken to avoid making mistakes when matching new parents and boys with the Choir School program.<sup>260</sup>

Although the prospect of spending several years apart from their child might discourage some parents from applying to the school, the Choir School sells itself as a family-friendly institution. “Sending a boy to St. Thomas usually brings families closer together—not the other way around”, reads a caption in the Choir School Brochure.<sup>261</sup> Some parents are willing disciples of the Choir School tradition: one parent enthuses, “To see your son singing in St. Thomas is just the most remarkable

---

<sup>257</sup> Scott, interview.

<sup>258</sup> St. Thomas Choir School, Brochure, 22.

<sup>259</sup> Ibid., 22.

<sup>260</sup> Scott, interview.

<sup>261</sup> Choir School Brochure, 23.



thing. I still can't believe he's doing it. You watch his face and can't believe how he's so engaged in the music and so involved in what he's doing".<sup>262</sup> Another parent recalls how her boy telephoned her at 6 a.m. one morning to ask her if she had heard of 'Sheppard'. "Asked by Mom whether he meant sixteenth-century John Sheppard or twentieth-century Richard, the two artists she knew of with roughly that surname, the boy replied that he wasn't sure which, but his music had voices magnificently 'tumbling all over' and was 'awesome'".<sup>263</sup>

Musical pedagogy at the St. Thomas Choir School falls primarily into three areas: theory, private instrumental instruction and choir. Music theory is taught by a music theory teacher at the various grade levels, and the general approach is to develop music literacy and compositional skills. Boys learn to play musical instruments through private instruction offered by part-time teachers and practice rooms are available at the school.<sup>264</sup>

Granted the music theory and instrumental instruction, the choir is still the primary focus of the school and absorbs most of the boys' music time. The objective of taking boys who have little or no musical experience and transforming them into professional singers in as little as two years is a lot to ask of any program. The forty boys enrolled in the choir school are divided into three choir levels: junior, middler and senior. When boys enter the school in the fourth grade, they are admitted to the junior choir. This choir rehearses every weekday morning from 8-8:30 a.m., and

---

<sup>262</sup> Quoted in Choir School Brochure, 22.

<sup>263</sup> Rev. Andrew Mead, "Epilogue by the Rector", in *St. Thomas Church Fifth Avenue*, by J. Robert Wright, (New York: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2001), 242.

<sup>264</sup> Scott, interview.



The senior choristers form the soprano section of the St. Thomas Choir, which performs at least five fully choral services each week. In addition to the weekday morning rehearsals, the senior choristers rehearse for two hours with the men at least once a week and before each performance. The full choir rehearsal has proved to be very important for the development of the younger boys, because they learn a great deal from watching the example of the senior boys and the men. All choir rehearsals are led by the choirmaster, with the exception of the morning junior choristers' rehearsal, which is led by the assistant.<sup>266</sup>

The typical weekly performing schedule of the choir includes three sung services on weekdays at 5:30 p.m. (Tuesday, Wednesday and Thursday) and two sung services on Sundays (11:00 a.m. Choral Eucharist and 4:00 p.m. Choral Evensong). The weekday evening service is normally Choral Evensong, unless a special feast day occurs, in which case the sung service is a Eucharist. St. Thomas adheres to traditional liturgies, particularly for the choral repertoire, which mostly follows the texts of the 1928 American Book of Common Prayer.<sup>267</sup> The choir performs over 400 pieces of repertoire each Church Year from the extensive canon and it is unusual that a piece of music is performed more than once.<sup>268</sup>

In addition to church services, the choir performs several times yearly on the St. Thomas' Tuesday-evening concert series. In the course of five concert appearances on the 2004-2005 series, the choir performed Handel's *Messiah* and the

---

<sup>266</sup> Ibid.

<sup>267</sup> Mead, 240.

<sup>268</sup> Scott, interview.

Bach *St. John Passion* with orchestra and soloists. An organ recital is usually featured at the conclusion of the Sunday Choral Evensong service, and the organists of St. Thomas make regular appearances in recital along with recitalists from all around the world. It is customary at St. Thomas' to host a Spring conference for organists and choirmasters on topics pertaining to church music, organ playing, or the training of the choir of men and boys. This year it has been announced that James O'Donnell, Master of the Choristers at Westminster Abbey Choir School, will be in town to work with the choristers of St. Thomas' and to lead the spring 2005 seminar.<sup>269</sup>

Among the goals that Mr. Scott has for the choir, he mentioned developing a sound for the choir that is well-matched with the acoustics of St. Thomas' Church, and developing the quality of his adult male singers. He noted that the number and quality of professional singing men available in America is somewhat lower than what one would find in England. This is due to the absence of what he called the English choir 'mill', whereby a man is trained as a boy chorister at a cathedral or collegiate chapel, develops further as a young adult singer in one of the collegiate choirs, and then returns to a professional singing career as an adult in one of the cathedrals. An English male singer who follows this path ends up learning a monumental amount of repertoire and is able to readily sight-read and perform almost anything.<sup>270</sup> Unfortunately, this phenomenon is utterly lacking in America today, and I have already been informed of a lack of qualified adult male singers that is likely

---

<sup>269</sup> Brochure, "Music at Saint Thomas Church", September – December 2004.

<sup>270</sup> Scott, interview.

much worse in other communities than it is in New York City. The only solution to this problem it would seem, except for importing English singers, would be to keep on trying to develop the American choral tradition.

The St. Thomas choir has been well-recorded on numerous compact discs, cassettes and DVD's. I asked Mr. Scott if he plans to make any new recordings with the boys during his first year at St. Thomas. He replied that it had been his intention to forgo recording during his first year to give himself time to get accustomed to his new position, but since he had been so impressed with performances given by the boys so far, a new recording might be in the works as early as spring 2005.<sup>271</sup>

### *Conclusions*

As with the parochial school programs that I visited, St. Thomas Choir School has recently undergone significant changes, including the appointment of a new headmaster and a new choirmaster. The quality of these appointments at St. Thomas Choir School is very encouraging for the future of the choir of men and boys in the American church, because the transition in this church appears to have been smooth, and the desire to maintain the tradition at this important institution very strong. St. Thomas' has long been a leader in American church music, but now seems to be poised to occupy an even greater place in the field, with a veteran English choirmaster once again in the role once occupied by T. Tertius Noble. If everything continues to go well for the Choir School at St. Thomas, this writer anticipates that it will become visible not only to an American audience, but will gain worldwide

---

<sup>271</sup> Ibid.

prominence as well. I envision the emergence of a whole new series of recordings, the development of a unique St. Thomas' sound, and a continuation of conferences and seminars aimed at promoting quality church music in America.

## Part III: Restoration

## Restoring the tradition

### *Introduction*

The men and boy choral tradition shows some signs of stability and recovery after a disastrous 20<sup>th</sup> century. Having survived the excesses of the 1970's, the church in some quarters seems to have once again gained a measure of confidence in its role in society and a willingness to revive great traditions of the past. The choral tradition potentially has just as great a role to play in church and society of today as it has at any other time in history. Boys of today would surely benefit from Anglican choral training just as much as boys from any other era and there are also many churchgoers today who would still appreciate the quality of music and sense of worship that this kind of choir can provide. To begin, let us bring up some reasons why the choir of men and boys is valuable and relevant to the American church today, and address some objections to the tradition

The benefits of music education for children are well known, and it is not necessary to go into detail about that here. Some other benefits of the Anglican boy choir tradition are worth noting here, however. A boy chorister cultivates a power of concentration and poise through performance of the liturgy which nothing else could give him at that age. He subconsciously and effortlessly acquires a taste for beautiful English by chanting the psalms and hearing the language of the King James Bible and the Book of Common Prayer.<sup>272</sup> The training of English boy choirs has long made them “nurseries of musical composition”, and many great composers have had their

---

<sup>272</sup> Fellowes, 10.



start as boy choristers.<sup>273</sup> The boy choristers of today will be the tenors and basses of the choral tradition tomorrow, and this early investment in their training will pay for itself many times over in contributions to the broader musical culture. Former boy choristers are also well-represented among leading choirmasters, organists and composers.

In today's culture, a boy needs good male role models to counter the bad ones. The males often portrayed today through television, sports and the movies are rebels or loners who engage in violent and sexually predatory behavior. In contrast, a choir of men and boys is an environment where a boy can learn to be part of a team that values cooperation with others and where he can develop refined, professional behavior. He learns that he is not the center of the universe but has a place within the larger world, and enjoys camaraderie with other boys as part of a group that is joined together in a common purpose. He learns that he is part of a great historical tradition, and that he can engage in something larger than himself in the service of God and the church. He can observe and learn good behaviors from professional choir men and trained clergy. The institution of the choir of men and boys has long been a place where boys learn to be good churchmen, where future vocations to the ministerial priesthood of the church are fostered and leaders are developed. Many a priest and bishop in the Anglican Church grew up singing the canticles for Matins and Evensong for his parish church as a choirboy.<sup>274</sup>

---

<sup>273</sup> Ibid.

<sup>274</sup> Taylor, 7.

### *Towards Renewal of the Tradition*

In order to reestablish a choral tradition that has been on the decline, it seems to this author that several ingredients are necessary. The first is *vision*, which is to say that one has knowledge of the tradition, a conviction that it represents something valuable and the desire to work for its renewal. Having said this, I must point out that even the most fervent visionaries need financial backing (the church and the arts are no exception) and the second ingredient that is needed is *money*. Regardless of the size and scope of the choral program envisioned, money is needed to pay the professionals to do their work, to purchase repertoire and curricula, to maintain choir vestments, pay stipends for the choir boys and men...and the list could go on and on. The third ingredient and perhaps the most crucial is the *choirmaster*. He is the only person who can take vision and financial backing, apply them to a group of boys and turn them into a choir that sings the liturgy.

### *The Vision*

A renewal of the men and boy choir tradition in the American Anglican churches would likely be initiated by clergy, and this section is addressed to them. The reason for this is that the hierarchical nature of the Anglican Church reduces the chance that a choirmaster on his own would be able to start a new choir. Consider for a moment that the men and boy tradition began primarily in monasteries, where it was encouraged and fostered by the monks and their superiors. At the Reformation, the choir continued to exist because of the leadership of the monarchy and the moral support of the clergy. For the American church, in the absence of either the

monarchy or of an established monastic tradition, the tradition has to be promoted by the local ecclesiastical authority, namely the rector of the parish. Nowhere is this recognized more acutely than in St. Thomas' Church, New York, where a new rector is thoroughly vetted to make sure he will continue to be supportive of the Choir School once he takes office.<sup>275</sup>

For an American parish contemplating a revival of the choral tradition, history tells us that it will likely take place at the instigation of the clergy. The 19<sup>th</sup> century revival of the choir of men and boys in the American church was instigated by the Rev. William Augustus Muhlenberg; the first attempt at founding a choir school was made by the Rev. Canon Knowles of the Cathedral of SS. Peter and Paul in Chicago; the first choir camp was founded in New Jersey by the Rev. Elliot White.<sup>276</sup> Because the choir is intimately intertwined with the performance of the liturgy, and the liturgy is generally thought of as the domain of the parish priest, a new choir will be established only if the priest welcomes it.

Among Anglican circles the priest cannot rule a parish autocratically- the congregation also influences the type of liturgy being offered- but since the priest is the leader of the flock and holds an office of teaching and moral persuasion, he is most likely in the best position to initiate something like a choral revival. If the parish priest desires a guitar mass at the principle Sunday service, then it would be unlikely that a choir of men and boys is the ensemble to fulfill that purpose. On the other hand, if he desires a traditional liturgy based in the Book of Common Prayer

---

<sup>275</sup> Fr. Charles Wallace, interview.

<sup>276</sup> Ellinwood, 76ff.

and five hundred years of incomparable choral repertoire, then a choir of men and boys will suit this purpose quite admirably. Furthermore, if the priest is looking for a venerable form of social outreach, a way of fostering music in the life of the parish and a time-proven way of educating young men, then the choir of men and boys is a very good way to do it.

### *The Financial Backing*

Support from the clergy is fundamental, but so is the financial backing that is necessary to fund such a program. Funding for a choir can come from the church budget, if the priest and parish are supportive, and this in turn comes from endowments or from the pledges of members. Funding can also come from generous benefactors, the most notable example being the English monarchs who endowed various cathedral and collegiate choirs. In America, such largess has usually come from wealthy individuals, such as Mr. Charles Steele, whose generosity made possible the foundation of the St. Thomas Choir School. Another possibility that exists today might be foundations that support the arts or programs for young people. It seems to this author that a choir of boys is well-situated to attract philanthropy from many avenues, given the interest of our society in supporting ‘the Arts’ and impacting ‘the Youth’.

### *The Expertise*

While the clergy need to desire the tradition, and benefactors are needed to support the tradition, it is the choirmaster who ultimately will make it happen. Priests and Philanthropists usually do not know how to run an audition or a conduct a

rehearsal, and therefore the choirmaster is the nexus around which the program has to revolve. It is not only necessary for him to be a good musician, but to be devout, morally sound, a good role model for the boys in every way, firmly grounded in the tradition, and in possession of a complete understanding of the significance of the work at hand.

Regarding the training of choirmasters, it has been observed that the career path to becoming a choirmaster of an Anglican choir of men and boys has traditionally been “through the organ loft”.<sup>277</sup> This may seem somewhat odd at first glance, since the playing of the organ does not translate to automatic mastery over the human voice -much less over a choir of voices. It must be remembered, however, that most English cathedral organists have grown up as choir boys, and have already ‘lived and breathed’ the air of a long-standing choral/vocal tradition.<sup>278</sup>

In the absence of such a well-established tradition in America, however, it would be worthwhile to take another look at the phenomenon of the organist-turned-choirmaster. The average American organist/choirmaster coming up outside the established English cathedral tradition might be expected to have sung in a college or church choir, has had a few voice lessons, at least a semester of conducting lessons and has attended workshops or choir festivals. Here it would be worthwhile noting that during the 20<sup>th</sup> century, the art of choral conducting in this country has been developed and refined to the point where it is now possible to earn advanced degrees in choral conducting, including the Master of Music and Doctor of Musical Arts.

---

<sup>277</sup> John Scott, interview.

<sup>278</sup> Ibid.

This type of training, together with some years of voice training, might be a good path to investigate for the future of American church choirmasters, given their responsibility not only for boy's voices but also for adult men's voices. At the Washington National Cathedral I have noted that the new choirmaster, Mr. Michael McCarthy, is a professional singer and choirmaster by training, rather than an organist. His appointment must have caused a stir among some more conservative elements of the church music scene, but I see it an encouraging step outside the tradition and one that I hope will be emulated by other American programs. Very few programs can afford to have both a choirmaster and an organist, and often a church is happy just to find a qualified organist at all. However, it is necessary to look at ways of refining and perfecting a tradition that still has far to go in order to live up to the standards of Anglican choirs in England.

#### *The Gentlemen of the Choir*

The difficulty in finding qualified adult male singers in this country has been noted several places in this document, and the problem affects all types of programs, from the after-school program to the full-fledged choir school. Once again, this problem can be attributed directly to the breakdown of the choral tradition in our culture, or perhaps the complete absence of it in the first place. The training of adequate choir men will most likely fall on the shoulders of the choirmaster, which is one reason why he now more than ever needs to be skilled in choral/vocal technique.

Regrettably, even though some singers that turn up in church choirs have received vocal training at the university or conservatory, there is not always a very

high level of music literacy among those singers. One might also question whether conventional solo-vocal training for opera arias, art song, lieder or musical theatre will necessarily translate into good choral/ensemble singing. The problem is compounded in American church choirs by the fact that many organists, unequipped with sufficient knowledge of the voice, are overwhelmed by the training of boys and are unable or unwilling to give any instruction or training on a practical level to the men. The reality of life for American choir men is that they have to rush to a church choir rehearsal from school or from their day job. Then, without the benefit of any vocal/technical orientation or warm-up, they are launched into vocally-challenging repertoire with the organist serving as the 'note-teacher'. The only solution to this problem can come from those qualified choirmasters who possess knowledge of choral and vocal techniques, who can support the adult male singers in their technical proficiency. A good choirmaster will also be involved in raising up a new crop of musically-literate, vocally aware boys, who with the benefit of further vocal training to get them through their voice-change, will be the male section leaders of tomorrow.

#### *The repertoire*

Legitimate liturgical reform ought to be able to conserve the good parts of what came before, while initiating changes pertinent to the needs of the day. On the other hand, liturgical reform of the Cromwellian-Iconoclastic model drastically overthrows the traditions of the past, abruptly replacing them with something radically new or with nothing at all. I would venture to suggest that although the liturgical movements of the seventies did not resemble precisely the Cromwellian-

Iconoclast model of reform, there has been never-the-less a startling failure to conserve and maintain some of the central traditions of the Anglican Church, including its liturgy and its choir of men and boys. We have seen how the Book of Common Prayer was abruptly suppressed in favor of radically new liturgies, and how special choral music was overtly discouraged in favor of popular music. It would be an understatement to say that these developments have accelerated the demise of the Anglican choral tradition in America.

It seems to this author that if there is to be any chance of going forward again with the Anglican men and boy choir tradition in this country, the journey will involve a return to tradition along the lines of the Restoration of 1661. At that time, Charles II restored the Book of Common Prayer and the Choral Services of the Church of England after a Puritan hiatus. Since we have nothing like the monarchy to undertake that sort of restoration in this country, it will instead take place over a much longer period of time at the grass-roots level in individual parishes and cathedrals. The leading institutions in the Anglican choral world, which have impressive resources and established traditions (such as St. Thomas, New York), will have to lead the way forward, and from that leadership a popular movement could develop. I suspect that liturgical restoration could lead to a restoration of the choir of men and boys; conversely, a revival of the choir of men and boys may lead to liturgical renewal -the two are intertwined.



*On some objections to the choir of men and boys*

I have at times heard objections to the choir of men and boys as a single-sex institution, perhaps because a choir of ‘men and boys’ appears to be a sort of bastion of sex-based discrimination. In some circles one also may hear objections to a vested choir as an ‘elitist’ organization that precludes the participation of ‘everyone’. The tradition of choral music associated with the Anglican tradition therefore suffers from the stigma of elitism on two counts: first, because it excludes women and girls; secondly, because the very existence of a Choir School or vested choir suggests that some members of the parish community will be undertaking the performance of the music of the church on a professional level to the necessary exclusion of others.

The first charge of elitism has in many cases lead to the formation of a choir of girls, which can function in a similar way to a boy choir. A girl choir addresses the need for fair treatment and the offering of opportunities to children of both sexes, and it is important to recognize that this is the most important aspect of the introduction of a girl choir. Thirty years ago, the girl choir may have been considered by some choirmasters as ‘cutting edge’ and the ultimate panacea that would save the Anglican choral tradition, but one wonders whether this has really happened. It might be better to see the introduction of the vested girl choir as the correction of a deficiency, rather than a radical breakthrough in the tradition. It is not a new phenomenon for girls to sing in an Anglican church: consider for example the so-called “charity children” (boys and girls) who sang in church and were long a part of social outreach in England. There is no theological reason why there cannot be girl choristers in a

church choir (as, for example, there are theological reasons why there is not an order of Christian priestesses) and this is the reason why the girl choir has been introduced with such success and such regularity in Anglican parishes. A vested girl choir extends many of the same benefits to girls as it does to boys and represents a very positive development in the tradition. However, the continued cultivation of the central feature of the Anglican choral tradition, the choir of men and boys, is potentially a much more unique and revolutionary contribution to a society that no longer seems to value the participation of boys in choir.

The trend among some parishes today is to have a music program for very young children, which then branches into independent boy and girl choirs by around age seven. One might ask whether a mixed children's choir couldn't serve the same function as a boy choir or a girl choir: the choirmasters that I spoke to in the course of this study were unanimously opposed to the vested "children's choir" in which boys and girls perform together. The reasons given for this tended to vary, but it was generally agreed that a mixed children's choir tends to become a mostly girls' choir over time.

With regards to adult female singers, they have long been an established fact in American church choirs, and will no doubt continue to be. There is no reason why there can't be a choir of men and boys in a parish church, as well as a choir of adult men and women or a choir of men and girls. We have observed in the case of St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego that a parish can sponsor several choirs by having a number of regularly sung services and by sharing responsibilities among the several

choirs. Some members of the choirs such as the tenors and basses will most likely be asked to sing with all the choirs, further underscoring the need for men who have grown up singing choral music.

With regard to the second charge of elitism (that of excluding untrained singers) fortunately the Anglican tradition is diverse enough to include the enjoyment of congregational singing (through hymns) as well as special choral music. The corporate nature of Anglican worship means that everyone worships God together through the liturgy, even though the priest is the only one reading the prayers out loud at certain times, or the choir is the only group singing the Anthem at another moment, or whether everyone is singing a hymn together.<sup>279</sup> Antagonism toward professional choral singing is simply foreign to the Anglican tradition, and although there have been groups that felt this way at some points in history (such as the Puritans) they have eventually found a church home elsewhere.<sup>280</sup>

A further note about the perception of elitism as it pertains specifically to the choir school: the traditional model for choir school is not merely another elite ‘prep school’ for boys from wealthy families, but is a form of outreach from the church to boys, regardless of their standing in society. Choir schools have traditionally educated and formed boys from all backgrounds, helping them to learn how to be good human beings, while participating in a liturgical tradition where they are needed and where they have a unique leadership role to play. Among the choral programs investigated in this document, one only has to look at Grace Church, Newark, where

---

<sup>279</sup> Long, 36.

<sup>280</sup> Ibid., 34.

the vested boy choir program serves the urban poor, or the example of the St. Thomas Choir School, Manhattan, which does not consider financial ability as a pre-requisite for admission.

### Forming a new choir on an after-school basis<sup>281</sup>

*Identify a regular service to be performed* - An Anglican choir of men and boys is different from a community children's choir in the sense that it exists to perform a regular, professional-level service for the church. The first step in implementing a new program in a parish is to decide on a regular (weekly, or as often as possible) service for which the choir will be responsible. This could be any of the public services of the Anglican Church for which choral music exists, including Matins, Holy Communion and Evensong. The more often a choir has to perform, the more quickly its skills will progress, and the more beneficial and formative the experience will be for the singers.

*Find people with the vision, the money and the skill* - The parish priest has to be committed to the project, and willing to devote spiritual leadership, mentorship and parish resources. Financial backing will need to be found as well, and this will represent a serious problem initially, but the problem should lessen over time, especially once the choir begins to make an obvious contribution to the community. A choirmaster must be found who has good moral character, an understanding of the Anglican tradition, solid vocal and choral conducting skills, and an aptitude for working with men and boys. He does not need to be an organist, although he may be

---

<sup>281</sup> Adapted from Brian Taylor, "Men and Boy Choirs", 7-10.

if the parish can only afford to provide for one musician. Often the best qualified candidates are those who have been raised in the tradition, but this is not always the case.

*Training and structure* - A very important component of a successful program is the structure of the choir and the learning scheme. A good training system can be very helpful in motivating and guiding the boys to achieve specific musical goals. Some very good systems already exist, such as the RSCM model, and there is no need for a choirmaster to waste time re-inventing the wheel. A choirmaster may, however, bring whatever unique talents and skills he possesses to the program, whether that might be the Kodaly Method or some other effective pedagogical method.

*Remuneration and support* - A schedule of remuneration for the boys should take into account local circumstances, for ex., if the boys need to travel via public transportation, they will need extra money to cover this cost. A suggested base stipend might be \$1.00 for each rehearsal and \$3.00 for each service, with \$.25 deducted for tardiness at a rehearsal and \$1.00 deducted for tardiness at pre-service warm-up.<sup>282</sup> If the program serves poor families, then it might be good to provide a meal after the rehearsal if possible. If the parish is able to provide supervised study or play time on those afternoons when there is no rehearsal, this would greatly help round out the scope of the program as well.

*Gathering the boys together*-The recruitment of boys will be the greatest challenge for those parishes which do not have a school. They will have to be drawn

---

<sup>282</sup> Taylor, 9.

from the community, which is something requiring perseverance and imagination. Potential for recruitment exists in private schools, church schools (whether catholic or protestant), home-school groups or after-school community programs. Perhaps the best way to communicate in today's world is by word of mouth: the priest, choirmaster and parishioners can communicate the news about the new program to people that they know and trust, and who are able to spread the word to families with boys who might be interested. The printing of an attractive brochure explaining the benefits and responsibilities for those who participate in the program would be very helpful. The audition will be a very important occasion at which the choirmaster, parents and boys meet each other for the first time. This needs to be a warm, friendly encounter, but it is also an important time for business. The choirmaster not only has to assess the starting-place of the boy, but must assess the parents' suitability for the program as well, and will need to make clear his expectations for the program.

*Rehearsal plan*-For a weekly performance commitment, the boys ideally should rehearse at least twice a week by themselves and once with the men before the service. Some time needs to be spent on systematic vocal instruction and music literacy, even if it is done only for a few minutes at the beginning of each rehearsal. The sooner the boys become musically literate and technically proficient, the sooner they will be able to attack more advanced repertoire. A central location for the rehearsal must be found, and the location used for services is also usually the best location for rehearsals for the sake of consistency. The boys will need to have an extended series of rehearsals to prepare them for their first service. A good way to

kick-off a new program might be a day camp toward the end of summer, where the boys come together for several consecutive days of instruction, rehearsals and activities before their first service.

*The first service* - A new group of boys who may have never heard of a choir of men and boys will probably not understand the significance of what they are involved in, until they have had their first performance of the liturgy. The choir becomes real to the boys once they perform and begin to realize what this is all about. After a routine is established and the choir develops its identity alongside the clergy and parish community, its quality will begin to improve markedly. A choir that has established its place in the community can become self-perpetuating; as soon as the initial effort is put into forming a quality program, the choir will retain and attract boys for years to come.

### Concluding Thoughts

The development of the Anglican choral tradition as we know it today is rooted in the long history of the Catholic Church in England. It was shaped by the Reformation and has been refined and developed by nearly five centuries of subsequent church history. For various reasons, the choir of men and boys has been fostered in the Anglican Church as in no other tradition. One might think of reasons such as the generosity of English monarchs, the general stability of English institutions such as the cathedrals and universities, the excellent liturgy of the Anglican Church which lends itself to high-level choral performance. The choir has also been a time-honored method of bringing up young men in the worshipping

community of the church, and thus to higher levels of its ministry and hierarchy. Attempts to dissolve the choir or suppress the liturgy have taken place throughout history, but the tradition has withstood the test of time and today more than ever seems to be a very strong part of the identity of the Anglican Church.

The American church has had comparatively few years in which to develop, and has recently undergone a crisis of identity with regards to its liturgy and its music. The American church is faced the danger of losing its collective memory of this important heritage, and a wonderful tradition that is now badly in need of restoration. The future does contain some promise of renewal –even if only because we still have at least one choir school and more than twenty choirs of men and boys. This is more than existed at the beginning of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, to be sure. From these small centers of Anglican tradition and music, a new revival can spring forth. Renewal of this unique heritage contains the potential to revitalizing the church, to enrich American culture and to positively impact a new generation of young men. Hopefully this document will serve a small role in the path to renewal. We have here considered the history and current state of the choir of men and boys in the American Church, together with its training models and resources, and we have discussed some steps for forming a new choir. May those who read it take this knowledge, and go away inspired to become engaged in the renewal of this tradition, whether as visionaries, financial backers, practitioners, or simply as aficionados.



## Bibliography

- Bede, The Venerable. *The Ecclesiastical History of the English People*, edited by Judith McClure and Roger Collins. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994.
- Bowers, Roger. "To chorus from quartet: the performing resource for English Church polyphony, c. 1390-1559." In *English Choral Practice, 1400-1650*, edited by John Morehen. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- Boydell, Bara. *A History of Music at Christ Church Cathedral, Dublin*. Rochester, NY: The Boydell Press, 2004.
- Criswell, Paul. "The Episcopal Choir School and choir of men and boys in the United States." Ph.D. Diss., University of Maryland, 1989.
- Ellinwood, Leonard. *The History of American Church Music*. New York: Morehouse-Gorham, 1953.
- Edwards, David. *The Cathedrals of Britain*. Andover, U.K.: Pitkin Unichrome Ltd., 1989.
- Fellowes, Edmund. *English Cathedral Music*. London: Methuen & Co. LTD, 1969.
- Flynn, Jane. "The Education of Choristers in England During the Sixteenth Century." In *English Choral Practice, 1400-1650*, edited by John Morehen. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- Frazier, James. "A New Choir School at the Roman Catholic Cathedral of the Madeleine in Salt Lake City." *The American Organist* 33, no. 3 (1999): 56-58.
- Grout, Donald Jay and Claude V. Palisca, *A History of Western Music*, 5<sup>th</sup> edition. New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 1996.
- Hendricks, Steven E. "The Washington National Cathedral Boy Choir: Musical, Spiritual, and Academic Training of the Choristers Through the Twentieth Century." D.A. diss., Ball State University, 2000.
- Keillor, Garrison. "The Power of Choral Singing." *Choral Journal* 41, no. 5 (2000): 43-45.
- Lamburn, E. C. R. *Ritual Notes*. London: W. Knot & Son LTD, 1964.
- Lohf, Kenneth. "The Saint Thomas Choir School." In *Saint Thomas Church Fifth Avenue*, by J. Robert Wright. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001.

- Long, Kenneth. *The Music of the English Church*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1971.
- McGrath, Alister. *In the Beginning*. New York: Doubleday, 2001.
- Mead, Andrew. "Epilogue by The Rector", in *St. Thomas Church Fifth Avenue*, by J. Robert Wright. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2001.
- Moorman, John R.H. *A History of the Church in England*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse Publishing, 1980.
- Phillips, C. Henry. *The Singing Church*. London: Faber and Faber, 1968.
- Prichard, Robert. *A History of the Episcopal Church*. Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse Publishing, 1999.
- Rainbow, Bernarr. *The Choral Revival in the Anglican Church*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1970.
- Rowell, Geoffrey. *The Vision Glorious: Themes and Personalities of the Catholic Revival in Anglicanism*. Oxford, UK: Clarendon Press, 1983.
- Shepherd, Massey. *The Oxford American Prayerbook Commentary*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1950.
- Spinks, Ian. *Restoration Cathedral Music*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995.
- Staley, Vernon. *The Catholic Religion*. Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse Publishing, 1996.
- Stevenson, Robert. *Protestant Church Music in America*. New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 1966.
- The Canons of the Anglican Province of Christ the King*. Berkeley, CA: American Church Union, 2002.
- Tarsitano, Louis and Peter Toon, *Neither Archaic Nor Obsolete: the Language of Common Prayer and Public Worship*. Philadelphia: The Prayerbook Society of the U.S.A., 2003.
- Tarsitano, Louis and Peter Toon, *Neither Orthodoxy Nor a Formulary*. Philadelphia: The Prayerbook Society of the U.S.A., 2003.

- Taylor, Brian. "Men and Boy Choirs: Another Aspect of Preserving Anglican Tradition", *The Mandate*, Vol. 21, No. 2. (2000): 6-10.
- Temperly, Nicholas. "Anglicanism and Episcopalianism", and "Anglican Chant", in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, 29 vols., Stanley Sadie, editor. London: Macmillan Publishers Ltd., 2001.
- Temperley, Nicholas. *The Music of the English Parish Church*, Volume 1. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979.
- Thornton, Martin. *English Spirituality*. Cambridge, MA: Cowley Publications, 1986.
- Toon, Peter. *Which Rite is Right?* Swedesboro, NJ: Preservation Press, 1994.
- Treharne, Reginald F. *The Glastonbury Legends*. London: The Cresset Press Ltd., 1967.
- Washburn, Benjamin M., et al., The Joint Commission on the Revision of the Hymnal. *The Hymnal 1940 Companion*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. New York: The Church Pension Fund, 1951.
- Webber, Christopher. *Welcome to the Episcopal Church*. Harrisburg, PA: Morehouse Publishing, 1999.
- Williston Walker, *A History of the Christian Church*, 4<sup>th</sup> edition. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1985.
- Wright, J. Robert. *Saint Thomas Church Fifth Avenue*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001
- Yang, Kitty Chi-Ti. "A Musical History of the Washington National Cathedral, 1893-1998. D.M.A. Diss. Peabody Conservatory of Music, 1998.

#### Discography

- Dexter, John, dir. *From Highest Heaven*. St. Patrick's Cathedral Choir. Dublin: St. Patrick's Cathedral. STPC 2001 (1996).
- Smith, Jeffrey, dir. *Show Yourselves Joyful, Music from St. Paul's Parish K Street, Washington, D.C.* Pro Organo CD 7068 (1997).

### Informally Published Material

Grace Cathedral, San Francisco, "Visitors' Guide"

Grace Cathedral, San Francisco, Brochure, "Concerts at Grace Cathedral, Fall & Christmas 2004."

St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego. "Cathedral Music presents...Evensong, Concerts, Recitals, 2004-2005 Season."

St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego, "St. Paul's Cathedral Boy and Girl Choristers Handbook, 2004-2005."

St. Paul's, K Street, Washington, D. C. "Music for Children at St. Paul's Parish." A Brochure.

St. Thomas Church, Fifth Ave. *Saint Thomas News*, vol. 1, no. 1 (2004)

St. Thomas Choir School. A Brochure.

St. Thomas Church, 5<sup>th</sup> Ave. "Music at Saint Thomas Church, September to December 2004." A Brochure

The Royal School of Church Music. "Voice for Life: a structured guide to choral training." A Brochure.

The Vestry and People of St. Paul's Parish, 2003. "Old St. Paul's Parish, Baltimore". A Brochure.

### Informally Published Electronic Material

Grace Church, Newark, "Introduction to Grace Church",  
<http://www.gracechurchinnewark.org/>

Grace Church, Newark, "Outreach Ministries of Grace Church in Newark",  
<http://www.gracechurchinnewark.org/outreach.htm>

The Royal School of Church Music in America, "Welcome to the RSCM America",  
<http://www.rscmamerica.org/>

Washington National Cathedral, "Choral Repertoire,"  
<http://www.cathedral.org/cathedral/music/weekly.shtml>

Washington National Cathedral, "History of the Choirs,"  
<http://www.cathedral.org/cathedral/music/history.shtml>

#### Unpublished Material

Burkes, Charles. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes, DVC recording. September 15. St. Paul's, K Street, Washington, D.C.

Fortune, Daniel. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes. September 18. Old St. Paul's Church, Baltimore, MD.

Green, Martin. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes, MD recording, DVC recording. November 16. St. Paul's Cathedral, San Diego.

Hawtin, Rev. Guy. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes. September 18. St. Stephen's Church, Timonium, MD.

McGregor, James. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes. December 9. Grace Church, Newark, NJ.

McCarthy, Michael. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes, DVC recordings. September 14, 18. Washington National Cathedral, Washington, D.C.

Riley, David. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes. September 18. St. Stephen's Church, Timonium, MD.

Scott, John. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes. December 9. St. Thomas Church, Fifth Ave., New York, NY.

Smith, Jeffrey. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes, DVC recording. November 23. Grace Cathedral, San Francisco.

Wallace, Rev. Charles. 2004. Interview by Daniel McGrath. Notes. December 9. St. Thomas Choir School, New York, NY.

## Appendices

### Appendix A - The Anglican Daily Office in comparison with the Medieval Monastic Office

<b>The Medieval Monastic Office</b> <i>[The Psalter read through by the monks in the monastery on a 7-day cycle]</i>	<b>The Anglican Daily Office</b> <i>[The Psalter read through by the parish priest and congregation on a 30-day cycle]</i>
Matins Lauds Prime Terce Sext Nones Vespers Compline	Matins        Evensong

### Appendix B - The Order of Service for the Daily Office in the 1928 American Book of Common Prayer

	Matins	Evensong	
Opening Sentences			Said
Confession and Absolution			Said
Opening Versicles and Responses			Sung, Plainsong or Anglican Chant
The Psalms appointed for the day	In Morning Prayer the portion of appointed Psalms is preceded by the <i>Venite, exultemus.</i>		Sung to Plainsong or to Anglican Chant
Old Testament Lesson			Read
Canticle	<i>Te Deum laudamus, Benedictus es, Domine or Benedicite, omnia opera Domini</i>	<i>Magnificat</i> , or one of the following Psalms: <i>Cantate Domino</i> , or <i>Bonum est confiteri</i>	Sung to Plainsong, Anglican Chant, or Polyphony
New Testament			Read

Lesson			
Canticle	<i>Benedictus</i> , or a Psalm, <i>Jubilate Deo</i>	<i>Nunc dimittis</i> , or one of the following Psalms: <i>Deus misereatur</i> or <i>Benedic, anima mea</i> .	Sung to Plainsong, Anglican Chant, or Polyphony
The Creed			Said or Sung
The Lord's Prayer			Sung
Suffrages			Sung
3 Collects			Sung by the minister, choir and congregation sing 'Amen'.
Anthem (optional)			Sung
Concluding Prayers			Said
Final Blessing			Said

**Appendix C** - The Office of Holy Communion in the 1928 American Book of Common Prayer.

### **Office of Holy Communion**

The Lord's Prayer  
Collect for Purity  
Decalogue (Ten Commandments), or Summary of the Law  
*Kyrie eleison*  
Greeting and Collect of the Day  
Epistle  
Gospel  
Nicene Creed  
The Homily  
Offertory Sentence  
Prayer for the Church  
Confession of Sin, Absolution and "Comfortable Words"  
*Sursum corda* (with Proper Preface when appropriate)  
*Sanctus* (and the *Benedictus* is commonly added)  
Prayer of Consecration  
The Lord's Prayer  
(*Agnus dei* is often sung here, and a setting of it is provided in the *Hymnal, 1940* although it does not appear in the American prayer book)

Prayer of Humble Access  
The Communion  
Thanksgiving  
*Gloria in excelsis*  
The Blessing

**Appendix D** - *A List of Resources for the Anglican Choral Musician*

Associations

American Choral Directors Association  
<http://www.acdaonline.org/>

Association of Anglican Musicians  
<http://www.anglicanmusicians.org/>

American Guild of Organists  
<http://www.agohq.org/>

Anglican Church Music Web Ring  
<http://www.churchmusic.org.uk/>

Royal School of Church Music in America  
<http://www.rscmamerica.org/>

The Prayer Book Society of the U.S.A.  
<http://www.episcopalian.org/pbs1928/>

Books, Scores & Recordings

Anglican Marketplace  
<http://www.anglicanmarketplace.com>

Anglican Parishes Association  
<http://www.anglicanbooks.com>

Church Publishing Online  
<http://www.churchpublishing.com/music/>

Lois Fyfe Music, Nashville  
<http://www.loisfyfemusic.com>

Oxford University Press, U.S.A.  
<http://www.oup.com/>

The Anglican Bibliopole



<http://www.anglicanbooks.klink.net/>

The Book of Common Prayer Online  
<http://www.commonprayer.org>

The Choral Public Domain Library  
<http://www.cpd.org/>

#### Choir robes

C. M. Almy  
<http://www.almy.com>

Kaufers Religious Supplies  
<http://www.kaufersonline.com/>

#### Periodicals

Church Music Quarterly  
<http://www.rscm.com/>

Choir & Organ  
<http://www.choirandorgan.com>

American Organist  
<http://www.agohq.org/>

Choral Journal  
<http://www.acdaonline.org/>

#### Professional Management

Karen McFarlane Artists, Inc.  
<http://www.concertorganists.com/>

Phillip Truckenbrod Concert Artists  
<http://www.concertartists.com>

#### Recording & Production Companies used by some American Anglican choirs

Gothic Records, Inc.  
<http://www.gothicrecords.com/>

Pro Organo  
<http://www.zarex.com/>

**Appendix E- Choirs of Men and Boys in the American Church known to the author:**

California

Grace Cathedral, San Francisco *Choir of men and boys, Cathedral School*  
Cathedral of St. Paul, San Diego *Choir of men and boys, Girls Choir, Adult Choir, Schola*

Colorado

Cathedral of St. John, Denver *St. Nicholas Choir (boys), St. Cecilia Choir (girls), Cathedral Choir (adults)*

Connecticut

Trinity on the Green, Hartford *Choir of men and boys, Choir of men and girls, Trinity Singers, Spirit Singers*

Florida

Cathedral of St. Luke, Orlando *Cathedral Choir, Cathedral Choristers (Children's), Orlando Deanery Girls' Choir, Orlando Deanery Boychoir, Orlando Deanery Men and Teen's Choir, St. Luke's Training Choir*

Georgia

Cathedral of St. Phillip, Atlanta *Cathedral Choir, Cathedral Schola, Boys Choir, Girls Choir*

St. John's, Savannah, *Parish Choir, Men & Boys Choir, Girls Choir*

Illinois

St. Luke's, Evanston *Choir of men and boys, Choir of Girls and Schola, St. Luke's Singers, Via beata (Compline Choir)*

Indiana

Christ Church Cathedral, Indianapolis *Choir of men and boys, Girls Choir, Adult Choir*

Kentucky

Christ Church, Lexington *Choir of men and boys, Girls Choir, Adult Choir*

Maryland

Old St. Paul's, Baltimore *Choir of men and boys, Girls Choir*

St. Stephen's, Timonium *Choir of men and boys*

Massachusetts

Trinity Church, Copley Square, Boston *Boy Choir, Girl Choir, Adult Choir*

Michigan

St. Paul's Cathedral, Detroit *Choir of men and boys, Girls Choir*

New Jersey

St. Peter's, Morristown *Choir of men and boys, Choir of Men and Women, Parish Choir, Girls' Choir*

Grace Church, Newark *Choir of men and boys*

New York

Cathedral of All Saints, Albany *Choir of men and boys*

Cathedral of St. Paul, Buffalo *Choir of men and boys, Girls Choir*

Church of the Transfiguration, New York *Choir of men and boys*

Grace Church, New York *Choir of men and boys, Girls Choir, Adult Choir, Choral Society*

St. Thomas' Church, 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, New York *Choir of men and boys, Choir School*  
Ohio

St. Paul's, Akron *Choir of men and boys, St. Cecelia Choir (Girls)*

Pennsylvania

St. Peter's, Philadelphia *Choir of men and boys, Girls' Choir*

Washington, D. C.

Cathedral of Sts. Peter and Paul (The National Cathedral) *Choir of men and boys, Girl's Choir, Cathedral Choral Society*

St. Paul's, K Street *Choir of men and boys, Girls Choir, Adult Choir*